

IN THIS ISSUE

Diplomatic and Geopolitical  
Strategies

Students' Motivation to Learn  
Physics

Archaeology & Anthropology  
Revisited

Simulation Instruction and its  
Effects



Great Britain  
Journals Press



IMAGE: ACROPOLIS OF ATHENS,  
UNESCO WORLD HERITAGE

[www.journalspress.com](http://www.journalspress.com)

LONDON JOURNAL OF  
RESEARCH IN HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0

Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792  
DOI: 10.17472/LJRHSS





Great Britain  
Journals Press

LONDON JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0

## PUBLISHER

Great Britain Journals Press  
1210th, Waterside Dr, Opposite Arlington Building, Theale, Reading  
Phone:+444 0118 965 4033 Pin: RG7-4TY United Kingdom

## SUBSCRIPTION

*Frequency:* Quarterly

Print subscription

\$280USD for 1 year

\$500USD for 2 year

*(color copies including taxes and international shipping with TSA approved)*

Find more details at <https://journalspress.com/journals/subscription>

## ENVIRONMENT

Great Britain Journals Press is intended about Protecting the environment. This journal is printed using led free environmental friendly ink and acid-free papers that are 100% recyclable.

Copyright ©2023 by Great Britain Journals Press

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying, recording, or other electronic or mechanical methods, without the prior written permission of the publisher, except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical reviews and certain other noncommercial uses permitted by copyright law. For permission requests, write to the publisher, addressed "Attention: Permissions Coordinator," at the address below. Great Britain Journals Press holds all the content copyright of this issue. Great Britain Journals Press does not hold any responsibility for any thought or content published in this journal; they belong to author's research solely. Visit <https://journalspress.com/journals/privacy-policy> to know more about our policies.

Great Britain Journals Press Headquarters

1210th, Waterside Dr,  
Opposite Arlington  
Building, Theale, Reading  
Phone:+444 0118 965 4033  
Pin: RG7-4TY  
United Kingdom

Reselling this copy is prohibited.

Available for purchase at [www.journalspress.com](http://www.journalspress.com) for \$50USD / £40GBP (tax and shipping included)

## Featured Blog Posts

blog.journalspress.com

They were leaders in building the early foundation of modern programming and unveiled the structure of DNA Their work inspired environmental movements and led to the discovery of new genes They've gone to space and back taught us about the natural world dug up the earth and discovered the origins of our species They broke the sound barrier and gender barriers along the way The world of research wouldn't be the same without the pioneering efforts of famous research works made by these women Be inspired by these explorers and early adopters- the women in research who helped to shape our society We invite you to sit with their stories and enter new areas of understanding This list is by no means a complete record of women to whom we are indebted for their research work but here are of history's greatest research contributions made by...

Read complete here:  
<https://goo.gl/1vQ3lS>



### Women In Research



### E-learning and the future of...

Education is one of the most important factors of poverty alleviation and economic growth in the...

Read complete here:  
<https://goo.gl/SQu3Yj>



### Writing great research...

Prepare yourself before you start Before you start writing your paper or you start reading other...

Read complete here:  
<https://goo.gl/np73jP>

# Journal Content

In this Issue



Great Britain  
Journals Press

- i. Journal introduction and copyrights
- ii. Featured blogs and online content
- iii. Journal content
- iv. Curated Editorial Board Members

- 
1. Variations on Christian Mythemes and the Generalization of Free Verse in Postwar Existentialist Poetry: A Comparative Study. **1-18**
  2. We Don't Need No Education. **19-20**
  3. PhET Simulation Instruction and its Effects on Students' Motivation to Learn Physics. **21-32**
  4. Postmodernity, the Dark Ages. **33-37**
  5. Perceived effect of Practice on Secondary School Chemistry Students: The Case Study of Selected Schools in the Ovia north East Local Government Area, Edo State, Nigeria. **39-46**
  6. Approaching and Distancing: Diplomatic and Geopolitical Strategies in Russia and Türkiye Relations. **47-54**
  7. Intersectionality between Politics, Religion, and Gender During the Colombian Peace Plebiscite. **55-67**
  8. The Deontologies of the Global Journal of Archaeology & Anthropology Revisited. **69-78**

- 
- V. Great Britain Journals Press Membership

# Editorial Board

Curated board members



Dr. Prasad V Bidarkota

Ph.D.,  
Department of Economics  
Florida International University  
USA

Dr. Stephen E. Haggerty

Ph.D. Geology & Geophysics,  
University of London  
Associate Professor  
University of Massachusetts, USA

Dr. Victor J. Tremblay

Department of Economics,  
Oregon State University Ph.D.,  
Economics Washington State University

Dr. Heying Jenny Zhan

B.A., M.A., Ph.D. Sociology, University of Kansas, USA  
Department of Sociology  
Georgia State University, US

Dr. Bruce Cronin

B.A., M.A., Ph.D. in Political Science,  
Columbia University  
Professor, City College of New York, US

Dr. Adrian Armstrong

BSc Geography, LSE, 1970  
Ph.D. Geography (Geomorphology)  
Kings College London 1980  
Ordained Priest, Church of England 1988  
Taunton, Somerset,  
United Kingdom

Dr. Periklis Gogas

Associate Professor  
Department of Economics,  
Democritus University of Thrace  
Ph.D., Department of Economics,  
University of Calgary, Canada

Dr. Rita Mano

Ph.D. Rand Corporation and University of California,  
Los Angeles, USA  
Dep. of Human Services,  
University of Haifa

Dr. William Franke

Ph.D. in Comparative Literature, Stanford University,  
Second University of Naples  
Professor of Comparative Literature and Italian  
and Professor of Religious Studies,  
Vanderbilt University, US

Dr. Kaneko Mamoru

Ph.D., Tokyo Institute of Technology  
Structural Engineering  
Faculty of Political Science and Economics, Waseda  
University, Tokyo, Japan

Omonijo Ojo

Student Industrial Work Experience  
Scheme Covenant University, Ota,  
Ogun-State Obafemi Awolowo  
University Sociology of Development Covenant  
University, Ota, Nigeria

Dr. Haijing Dai

Assistant Professor Chinese University of  
Hong Kong Department of Social Work Doctor of  
Philosophy Social Work and Sociology University of  
Michigan, Ann Arbor

Dr. Alis Puteh

Ph.D. (Edu.Policy) UUM  
Sintok, Kedah, Malaysia  
M.Ed (Curr. & Inst.)  
University of Houston, US

Dr. Gisela Steins

Ph.D. Psychology, University of Bielefeld, Germany  
Professor, General and Social Psychology,  
University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany

Dr. Edward C. Hoang

Ph.D.,  
Department of Economics,  
University of Colorado USA

Dr. Danielle Riverin-Simard

B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Cognitive training,  
University Laval, Canada  
Professor Emeritus of Education and Educational  
Psychology,  
Laval University, Canada

Dr. Arturo Diaz Suarez

Ed.D., Ph.D. in Physical Education  
Professor at University of Murcia, Spain

Dr. Luisa dall'Acqua

Ph.D. in Sociology (Decisional Risk sector),  
Master MU2, College Teacher in Philosophy (Italy),  
Edu-Research Group, Zürich/Lugano

Research papers and articles

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Variations on Christian Mythemes and the Generalization of Free Verse in Postwar Existentialist Poetry: A Comparative Study

Anna Cacciola

Universidad de Murcia Plaza

## ABSTRACT

Post-war existentialist poetry is characterized by resorting to a symbolic heritage of myths and signs from the Holy Scriptures, as well as using the verse from the wisdom books of the Bible as a favorite metrical resource. Banished like the Edenic couple or the angel Lucifer, the poets find themselves figuratively and literally in an adverse and unrecognizable reality –Spain after the establishment of Francoism–, crying out to a deity that seems alien to human evil and distant. The idiosyncrasy of this style is not a rhetorical peculiarity typical of the 40s, but rather it is attached to a previous lyrical tradition that comes from the mysticism of the 16th century, but which is rooted in a certain 1990s spirituality, reaching its climax with *Rosario de sonetos líricos* (1912) and *El Cristo de Velázquez* (1920), by Miguel de Unamuno. The present work intends to trace the biblical and Unamuno traces in the main existentialist poetizations, analyzing the relationship of continuity and rupture that postwar poets establish with their primary sources, on the one hand; on the other, to demonstrate the subversive role played by biblical language, since, by virtue of its universal value, it manages to name contemporary nonconformity and unease.

**Keywords:** postwar poetry, biblical language, mythical subversion, verse, Christian mythemes.

**Classification:** LCC Code: PN865

**Language:** Spanish



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Anna Cacciola. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# Variations on Christian Mythemes and the Generalization of Free Verse in Postwar Existentialist Poetry: A Comparative Study

Variaciones de Mitemas Cristianos y Generalización del Verso Libre en la Poesía Existencialista de Posguerra: un Estudio Comparativo.

Anna Cacciola

## ABSTRACT

*Post-war existentialist poetry is characterized by resorting to a symbolic heritage of myths and signs from the Holy Scriptures, as well as using the verse from the wisdom books of the Bible as a favorite metrical resource. Banished like the Edenic couple or the angel Lucifer, the poets find themselves figuratively and literally in an adverse and unrecognizable reality –Spain after the establishment of Francoism–, crying out to a deity that seems alien to human evil and distant. The idiosyncrasy of this style is not a rhetorical peculiarity typical of the 40s, but rather it is attached to a previous lyrical tradition that comes from the mysticism of the 16th century, but which is rooted in a certain 1990s spirituality, reaching its climax with Rosario de sonetos líricos (1912) and El Cristo de Velázquez (1920), by Miguel de Unamuno. The present work intends to trace the biblical and Unamuno traces in the main existentialist poetizations, analyzing the relationship of continuity and rupture that postwar poets establish with their primary sources, on the one hand; on the other, to demonstrate the subversive role played by biblical language, since, by virtue of its universal value, it manages to name contemporary nonconformity and unease.*

**Keywords:** postwar poetry, biblical language, mythical subversion, verse, Christian mythemes.

**Author:** Universidad de Murcia, Campus de La Merced, edificio Rector J. Loustau, 30001, Murcia.

## ABSTRACTA

*La poesía existencialista de posguerra se caracteriza por acudir a un acervo simbólico de mitos y signos procedentes de las Sagradas Escrituras, así como por emplear el versículo de los libros sapienciales de la Biblia como recurso métrico favorito. Desterrados al igual que la pareja edénica o el ángel Lucifer, los poetas se encuentran figurada y literalmente en una realidad adversa e irreconocible –España tras la instauración del franquismo–, clamando a una deidad que parece ajena al mal humano y lejana. La idiosincrasia de este estilo no es una peculiaridad retórica propia de los años 40, sino que se adscribe a una tradición lírica anterior que procede de la mística del siglo XVI, pero que radica en una determinada espiritualidad noventayochista, alcanzando su clímax con Rosario de sonetos líricos (1912) y El Cristo de Velázquez (1920), de Miguel de Unamuno. El presente trabajo pretende rastrear las huellas bíblica y unamunianas en las principales poetizaciones existencialistas, analizando la relación de continuidad y ruptura los poetas de posguerra establecen con sus fuentes primarias, por un lado; por otro, evidenciar la función subversiva desempeñado por el lenguaje bíblico, ya que, en virtud de su valor universal, consigue poner nombre al inconformismo y la desazón contemporáneos.*

**Palabras clave:** poesía de posguerra, lenguaje bíblico, subversión mítica, versículo, mitemas cristianos.

## I. INTRODUCCIÓN

En el panorama lírico de posguerra, la apetencia rehumanizadora de los años treinta no desapareció con la instauración del franquismo, sino que se encarriló en un cauce estético de abolengo espiritual, que fue ramificándose en distintas vertientes estilísticas —agónica, intimista, social— y que siguió vigente hasta casi la mitad de los cincuenta. El denominador común de esas poetizaciones fue el recurso a diversas soluciones retóricas y simbólicas procedentes de la Biblia o, más genéricamente, de la mitología cristiana y su parafernalia litúrgica.

En la eclosión de libros poéticos de cariz religioso que se verificó a partir de 1939, ese peculiar código semántico se convierte en el elemento diacrítico que permite distinguir la poesía existencialista, surgida al amparo de la rehumanización neorromántica y madurada con la «revolución» de 1944<sup>1</sup>, de la propiamente «divinista», contemporánea de aquella o escasamente antecedente, de la que difiere desde el punto de vista argumental, lingüístico, métrico y hasta funcional.

La utilización de mitos y símbolos tomados de la Biblia y el empleo del versículo como canal de expresión son los elementos idiosincráticos de esa retórica peculiar que Jato define «lenguaje bíblico» (2014: 19). En efecto, para vertebrar la búsqueda personal de la divinidad, los poetas existencialistas vuelven a la vertiente religiosa de las letras españolas, pasando por la mística —recuérdese que 1942 fue el cuarto centenario del nacimiento de San Juan de la Cruz—, la lírica barroca, los rescoldos de la estética romántica y, sobre todo, el noventayochismo y la obra de Miguel de Unamuno.

<sup>1</sup> Según García de la Concha, la revolución estética marcó el año 1944, con la publicación de cuatro obras imprescindibles de la primera posguerra: *Hijos de la ira* de Dámaso Alonso, *Sombra del paraíso* de Vicente Aleixandre, *Poesía y dolor* de Ildefonso Manuel Gil y *Pasión del verbo* de Carmen Conde (1983: 490). Para la irradiación estética a partir de 1944, véase Prieto de Paula (1991); especialmente cap. IV: «La diáspora de los hijos de la ira (Lírica española de 1944 a 1952)».

Así que, el lenguaje de las Escrituras renueva el estancamiento formal en el que se encontraba la lírica de los años 30, permitiendo expresar el desasosiego originado por una crisis religiosa que es, en realidad, identitaria y social, al coincidir con la instauración del régimen franquista. Asimismo, desde el punto de vista mítico y simbólico, permite revelar el proceso de reconstrucción nacional y la conciencia crítica de la posguerra. De hecho, la intertextualidad bíblica, explotando la cobertura universal del mito y la carga asociativa del símbolo, resultó muy operativa para los poetas de los cuarenta, ya que les otorgó un margen de libertad que el régimen les negaba:

A través de su particular infraestructura mítica y simbólica, el exiliado interior subvierte el programa ideológico de la dictadura: bajo esa máscara de poesía religiosa que detecta la poesía existencial desarraigada, consigue expresar su condena al dolor y a la injusticia que sobrevienen con la muerte de España en el conflicto civil (Jato, 2004: 12).

La misma subversión detectada a la hora de analizar el aparato mítico se hace patente en el uso del versículo, que viene a ser oponente del sistema de versificación garcilasista imperante en el régimen. Por consiguiente, el lenguaje, en cada uno de sus elementos compositivos, adquiere una connotación subversiva, ya que expresa una rebelión individual que va contra un verso tradicional y contra un orden centralizador:

La desarticulación del verso implica la desarticulación de un sistema, de un sistema objetivo, entendido como orden universal aceptado y de un sistema subjetivo, entendido como correspondiente orden interno. [...] Se trata de la reivindicación de un sujeto moderno desmembrado y en conflicto y de su modo particular de sentir la ausencia de un orden superior. [...] La liberación de la forma implica ir contra la sociedad, el *statu quo*, contra la imagen del padre. El arte moderno es siempre revolucionario a través de una forma pura que adquiere un sentido subversivo (Utrera, 2010: 9-10).

La sustancia constitutiva de ese código lingüístico, entonces, parece ser la reversibilidad. Gracias a su infraestructura, los poetas encarnan aspectos universales de la condición humana, pero cuya esencia se revierte y se matiza de forma específica, debido a las circunstancias históricas vividas por los autores. Las alusiones intertextuales, si bien hacen mención a un referente preciso, cambian su sentido al alterarse las causas que las originan. Este procedimiento llega a cobrar una función catártica, puesto que, a través del lenguaje bíblico, la cultura de disidencia puede manifestar, más o menos veladamente, su inconformismo ante un sistema político y cultural no propenso a aceptar críticas y reprobaciones.

A continuación, se ofrece un breve recorrido textual por autores que hicieron un uso peculiar de ese lenguaje bíblico que venimos describiendo. Hemos destacado poetas cuyas estéticas se vinculan, temáticamente, con el existencialismo, y, discursivamente, con el agonismo. Se incluye a Dámaso Alonso, a los poetas de la *Antología consultada de la joven poesía española* (1952) que siguen la corriente encabezada por *Hijos de la ira* —o sea, Vicente Gaos, José Hierro, Eugenio de Nora, José María Valverde, Blas de Otero; en menor medida Carlos Bousoño—. Añadimos a la lista a José Luis Hidalgo, por el intenso patetismo que estructura su verso.

## II. EL USO DEL VERSÍCULO Y LA ESTRUCTURA SALMÓDICA

La tendencia al uso del versículo, tan en boga en los cuarenta, había empezado a atisbarse ya a finales del siglo XIX, si bien con claras diferencias. Desde el punto de vista métrico, en efecto, a partir del Modernismo se va pronunciando una progresiva generalización del verso libre, iniciada por Juan Ramón Jiménez en su *Diario de un poeta recién casado* (1917). Un impulso notable a esa tendencia lo dio el creciente número de traducciones en verso libre o prosa poética de obras americanas, inglesas y francesas, que fueron dándose a conocer en muchas revistas a principios del siglo XX: *Renacimiento*, *La Lectura*, *España*. Analizando la obra crítica de Díez-Canedo y centrándose en la selección de

autores extranjeros traducidos al castellano en *Prometeo* (1908-1912), Navarro afirma:

Díez-Canedo acierta, sin duda, al señalar la importancia de la traducción como referencia inevitable en la evolución de la poesía moderna hacia el verso libre. La traducción en prosa había sido siempre un hecho, pero a partir del simbolismo, adquiere un sentido distinto, ya que supone la plasmación en un nivel práctico de aquello que no era aceptado todavía en el campo de la creación literaria en el propio idioma. La traducción de poesía en verso libre o prosa viene a constituir así la «prueba» de la posibilidad de una poesía independiente de la rima y del metro (1997: 292).

Efectivamente, el verso libre desvincula lo poético de los criterios habituales de medida y rima, manteniendo la estructura tipográfica tradicional del verso. Sus características fundamentales son la irregularidad y la extensión variable. La falta de rigidez de su estructura intenta reflejar la naturalidad de la expresión oral.

Si bien la *silva* barroca podría considerarse el antecedente métrico del verso libre, Díez-Canedo, en su ensayo «Lugones y la libertad del verso» (1983), señala como precursores a Bertrand, Baudelaire, Nietzsche y Whitman. Este, especialmente, adopta una modalidad de verso libre de mayor extensión, que es el versículo, metro predilecto de los poetas de los cuarenta y apropiado a la andadura prosaria de la poesía social. De hecho, la crítica es unánime en considerar la influencia que el versículo de *Hojas de hierba* (1855) tuvo «en la segunda generación versolibrista, la de las vanguardias: concretamente en Sabat Ercasty, Neruda, Aleixandre, Dámaso Alonso y León Felipe, entre otros» (Paraíso, 1985: 63).

Hablando de la versificación de Aleixandre y de los poetas de la Generación del 27, Bousoño puntualiza que la peculiaridad de ese verso es un ritmo endecasilábico:

los ritmos que forman la masa más abundante de la versificación aleixandrina no tienen nada de extravagante. Se trata simplemente de

endecasílabos y de sus combinaciones, ya tradicionales desde los tiempos del Modernismo: pentasílabos, heptasílabos, eneasílabos y alejandrino. A lo que habría que agregar hexámetros y pseudoheptámetros, anfíbracos, anapestos y peones para obtener la casi totalidad de los tipos posibles (1973: 322-323).

Efectivamente, el endecasílabo permite mantener un ritmo prolongado que confiere una sensación de tensión contenida, una cadencia oracional, a diferencia del verso breve. El amplio margen de libertad expresiva del versículo no inhibe la intención rítmica del autor, que se manifiesta tanto en la representación gráfica (con su sistema de pausas y acentos) como en el despliegue de figuras retóricas de repetición y significación. Sin embargo, ese peculiar modelo métrico está vinculado a las Escrituras. Más del 40% del texto bíblico entraña un alto nivel de lirismo, la mayor parte del cual aparece en el Antiguo Testamento, en los llamados libros poéticos: *Salmos*, *Proverbios*, *Lamentaciones*, *Cantar de los Cantares*, *Job* y *Eclesiastés*. Los primeros cuatro están escritos enteramente en verso. El libro de *Job* comprende un prólogo y un epílogo en prosa, y el *Eclesiastés* entraña una considerable porción de poesía en su estructura discursiva. Además, fragmentos poéticos aparecen tanto en los libros históricos, en los que se emplea la poesía para ilustrar el relato y para la celebración de un suceso épico, como en los proféticos, que fusionan en secuencia continua prosa y verso. Lo que caracteriza esta versificación, del todo ajena a los principios prosódicos clásicos, es su estructura reiterativa, base de la retórica bíblica y semítica<sup>2</sup>, que se puede descomponer en tres elementos principales: el binarismo, patente en el frecuente recurso a bimetraciones; la parataxis, especialmente el uso de endíadidas como método de coordinación; y la simetría. Cada una aparece en distintos niveles de organización textual, tanto el léxico como el oracional, hasta convertirse en el principio compositivo de un libro bíblico en su

entereza (Meyner, 2008: 13), como ocurre, por ejemplo, en *Salmos* o *Proverbios*. Entre los otros rasgos principales, además de su concisión y carácter elíptico, mentamos lo que Paraíso define como *ritmo de pensamiento*, o sea, «la reiteración de una emoción que se manifiesta en la tendencia al paralelismo y a la reiteración de palabras-clave, dotadas a menudo de un gran contenido simbólico» (1985: 55).

En virtud de esa idiosincrasia, el versículo es el medio favorito de los poetas de posguerra, no sólo por las características estructurales propias de esta forma de versificación y sus artificios retóricos connaturales, sino también por el ritmo lógico que en él subyace y que permite la revelación completa de las especulaciones íntimas del espíritu humano acerca de lo divino en sí, y de la relación con lo divino: interrogaciones y exclamaciones, apóstrofes líricas, hipérbolos, comparaciones, anáforas, paralelismos y bimetraciones son algunos de los recursos a través de los cuales se encauza mejor el agonismo de la poesía. En efecto, una somera observación de los poemas de los años cuarenta es suficiente para revelar la adopción del salmo, quintaesencia de la lírica bíblica, como recurso compositivo favorito para los autores; preferencia que se hace patente ya en el título de sus creaciones. Considérese el bellissimo «De Profundis» de *Hijos de la ira*; los salmos contenidos en *Subida al amor* (1945) de Bousoño («Salmo sombrío», «Salmo violento», «Salmo desesperado», «Salmo del solitario»); los reunidos en *Hombre de Dios* (1945) de Valverde («Salmo inicial», «Salmo de la tierra y el hombre», «Salmo de las estrellas», «Salmo de las rosas», «Salmo de la sed de Dios», «Salmo de la ciudad», «Salmo de la mano de Dios»); o los de *Ángel fieramente humano* (1950) de Otero («Salmo por el hombre de hoy»).

En resumidas cuentas, la estructura paralelística del versículo faculta la enucleación de un concepto en el que se subsume la indagación creativa del autor. Además, los procedimientos de composición y el tono dramático que estructuran el verso, le confieren un intenso patetismo, acorde con el aparato simbólico que en él se despliega.

<sup>2</sup> Sobre el análisis retórico de los textos bíblicos, su historia y sus características, véanse: Marguerat y Bourquin (2000), Simian-Yofre (2001), Alter (2003), Meyner (2003, 2006, 2008), Oniszcuk (2013), Ryken, Wilhoit y Longman (2016).

### III. EL APARATO MÍTICO: DE CAÍDAS, DESTIERROS Y PERSECUCIONES

Desde un punto de vista mítico-simbólico, la tendencia al uso del lenguaje bíblico en poesía había empezado a evidenciarse ya una década antes, en las manifestaciones de algunos integrantes de la Generación del 27. De hecho, pese al rupturismo con la estética decimonónica que favorecieron las vanguardias y a la innovación formal por la que abogaron, los poetas —de filiación vanguardista, no se olvide— terminaron por apelar a los más socorridos mitos fundacionales de la cultura occidental: los de la tradición judeocristiana. Lo que puede parecer una contradicción conceptual se resuelve, en realidad, teniendo en consideración ciertos factores contingentes a la temporalidad del periodo.

El paulatino proceso de secularización que experimentó Europa desde finales del siglo XIX, la consiguiente desacralización del mundo puesta en marcha por el nihilismo nietzscheano<sup>3</sup>, la transitoriedad de la existencia y la falta de perdurabilidad de la palabra planteadas por Bergson y Heidegger, las consecuencias de la industrialización en el ser humano y en las ciudades..., son, todos ellos, elementos cuya coincidencia temporal favoreció su retroalimentación, de modo que terminaron generando una crisis de la cosmovisión que afectó a toda la sociedad; una crisis, por lo demás, enconada por la catástrofe general de las guerras y por la depresión económica de 1929.

La toma de conciencia de esta situación histórica hizo que los agentes culturales interpretaran su propia naturaleza y la de todo lo existente a través de determinadas ideaciones sobre dicho entorno. En el caso específico que nos atañe, el recurso a mitemas bíblicos, descontextualizados y desubicados de su marco de procedencia, contribuye a vertebrar el *horror vacui* que significó individual y socialmente la pérdida de la fe en la modernidad. Es decir, significan, mediante su abstracción modélica, el proceso de

alienación subjetiva ante lo real y la identificación con el esquema arquetípico que lo fundamenta. Merced a este valor universal que entrañan, los mitos sufren asimismo cierta actualización histórico-antropológica, dependiendo del abordaje literario que se realice, revelando tanto la actitud de un autor particular hacia su tiempo, como las diferentes reelaboraciones míticas realizadas por sus contemporáneos (Labanyi, 1989: 2). O sea, su esquematicidad y universalidad contribuyen a crear una mitología individual que se incrusta en toda una tradición mítica.

Pero ¿cómo se inserta el mito en las varias cristalizaciones poéticas que aparecieron a partir de los años treinta? Por lo general, o se hallan referencias explícitas a mitos fundacionales de la tradición judeocristiana o incorporaciones de elementos sintagmáticos que aluden a ellos, o se detecta un aparato simbólico adscribible al mismo ámbito. Por lo que atañe al último aspecto, es preciso puntualizar que esos símbolos no aparecen separados del contexto mítico al que se refieren, sino que se configuran como sus directas irradiaciones. De hecho, si el fondo mítico es sencillamente aludido, es posible recordar gracias a un determinado conjunto imagístico. Además, en virtud de su capacidad asociativa y transfiguradora, el símbolo «va a convertirse en un intermediario entre esas dos esferas: el mundo físico (la realidad palpable, la que se percibe a través de los cinco sentidos) y el trascendente (la realidad “invisible, “intangible” de las abstracciones)» (Jato, 2004: 24).

Partiendo de ese punto de arranque, y tomando prestadas de Lévi-Strauss y Kerényi las categorías de *mitema*<sup>4</sup> y *mitologema*<sup>5</sup> respectivamente,

<sup>4</sup> «El antropólogo francés explica el mito como si fuera un lenguaje, y por lo tanto fuera susceptible de ser dividido en unidades constitutivas pertenecientes a un nivel complejo de análisis; llama a estas partes *grosses unités constitutives* o *mythèmes*» (Ortuño, 2014: 8).

<sup>5</sup> «La palabra mitologema fue usada por primera vez por Kerényi en 1949 para expresar la esencia del mito, la parte invariable del mismo; así pues, las características principales del mitologema vendrían a ser su esquematicidad, su estatismo (el esquema básico parece repetido en diferentes mitos) y la dificultad de traducir su significado a lenguaje no

<sup>3</sup> El concepto de la «muerte de Dios», aparecido ya en *La gaja ciencia* (1882), se popularizó diez años después con la publicación de *Así habló Zaratustra* (1892).

Ortuño (2014: 7-8) clasifica las modalidades de uso del mito en las manifestaciones poéticas surgidas a raíz de la Generación del 27. La estudiosa identifica cuatro vías, que resumimos a continuación:

- la inserción en el tejido lingüístico de fragmentos sintagmáticos extraídos de las Escrituras o de textos litúrgicos con una finalidad distinta a la de procedencia<sup>6</sup>;
- la introducción de unidades léxicas que, debido a la frecuencia de su aparición en el sistema tropológico del poema, se vinculan al hipotexto bíblico<sup>7</sup>;
- la transposición de mitologemas propios de la tradición judeocristiana a otros sistemas míticos, por una relación de parecido en sus esquemas constitutivos<sup>8</sup>;
- la romanticización de ciertos mitos, cuyo esquema constitutivo sea creación / Paraíso - caída / error - sufrimientos - Apocalipsis / profecía.

Los mitos a que nos referimos proceden tanto del Antiguo Testamento como del Nuevo. La intertextualidad evangélica hace hincapié en referencias cristológicas relacionadas con la Pasión que, de por sí, no se postula como mito *stricto sensu*. Sin embargo, y siguiendo la senda interpretativa de Ricoeur (1979: 426), el martirio del Mesías llega a alcanzar valor mítico por entrañar una verdad soteriológica, ejemplificada a través de la conducta de Cristo, cuya rememoración adquiere una simbología específica para el cristianismo.

Por lo que concierne al primer punto, los autores revelan un amplio conocimiento de los libros

---

mítico, con lo que tendrían algo de universal al repetirse en lo básico en diferentes mitologías» (Ortuño, 2014: 6).

<sup>6</sup> Considérese el verso «El ángel del Señor se anunció a María: puede pasar primero», extraído del poema «La muerte o antesala de consulta», del libro de Aleixandre *Espadas como labios* (1935).

<sup>7</sup> Es lo que ocurre en la primera estrofa de «Decidme anoche», de *Ocnos* (1942), en la que Cernuda disemina bimebraciones y sustantivos que evocan claramente la pasión de Cristo: «miedo invisible», «sangre», «rígidas espinas» (2005: 148).

<sup>8</sup> En «Elegía», de *Libro de poemas* (1921), García Lorca describe a la diosa Ceres con atributos y connotaciones propios de la Virgen María.

sapienciales<sup>9</sup>. Después de los *Salmos*, el de *Job* es el texto al que más referencia se hace, tal vez por un proceso de transferencia que llega a realizarse entre los autores y la fuente. Sometido a una opresiva prueba por Satanás con autorización de Dios, Job demuestra su fidelidad al Creador. Pero no es el desenlace del tanteo lo que fascina, sino el tanteo mismo. El personaje del Antiguo Testamento es el justo que sufre injustamente, que padece enfermedades y desgracias, que se hunde en la miseria, que sobrevive a la muerte de sus hijos y a la devastación de su mundo, y que se ve privado de la palabra divina. Job no entiende la ira de Dios, ya que no ha sido provocada por su irreprochable conducta moral, ni justifica el silencio de Yahvé, que lo lleva a dudar de todo. Es evidente el paralelismo que se crea entre la agonía jobiana y la existencialista. Incluso en el léxico recurren muchas semejanzas, especialmente en el ámbito semántico de la putrefacción, de la corrupción física, de la repugnancia<sup>10</sup>. El «De Profundis» de *Hijos de la ira* está repleto de imágenes expresionistas del mismo talante (340-341)<sup>11</sup>:

Si vais por la carretera del arrabal, apartaos, no os inficione mi pestilencia.

El dedo de mi Dios me ha señalado: odre de putrefacción quiso que fuera este mi cuerpo [...]

Yo soy la piltrafa que el tablero arroja al perro del mendigo,  
y el perro del mendigo arroja al muladar.

---

<sup>9</sup> *Job, Salmos, Proverbios, Eclesiastés y Cantar de los Cantares*.

<sup>10</sup> «Gusanos y costras polvorientas cubren mi carne, mi piel se agrieta y supura» (*Job* 7: 5); «Él me aplasta por una insignificancia y multiplica mis heridas sin razón» (9: 17); «Aunque me lavara con nieve y purificara mis manos con potasa / Tú me hundirías en el fango y hasta mi ropa sentiría abominación por mí» (9: 30-31); «Así este hombre se deshace como madera carcomida, como ropa devorada por la polilla» (13: 28); «Su ira me desgarró y me hostiga, Él rechina sus dientes contra mí» (16: 9); «Mi mujer siente asco de mi aliento, soy repugnante para los hijos de mis entrañas» (19: 17); «Los huesos se me pegan a la piel y se me desprenden los dientes de las encías» (19: 20); «De noche, me siento taladrar mis huesos, los que me roen no se dan descanso» (30: 17); «Mi piel ennegrecida se me cae, mis huesos arden por la fiebre» (30: 30).

<sup>11</sup> Las citas por Alonso (1998). En lo sucesivo me limitaré a señalar, en cada cita, el número de la página entre paréntesis.

[...]

yo soy el orujo exprimido en el año de la mala cosecha,

yo soy el excremento del can sarnoso,

el zapato sin suela en el carnero del camposanto,

yo soy el montoncito de estiércol a medio hacer,  
que nadie compra

y donde casi ni escarban las gallinas.

Pero te amo,

pero te amo frenéticamente.

¡Déjame, déjame fermentar en tu amor,

deja que me pudra hasta la entraña,

que se me aniquilen hasta las últimas briznas de mi ser,

para que un día sea mantillo de tus huertos!

Los poetas demuestran una verdadera inclinación al Génesis, especialmente hacia los mitos relacionados con la creación del Universo y las vicisitudes de la pareja edénica, después de su expulsión a la Tierra. Asombra, en efecto, la cantidad y la variedad de representaciones del jardín del Edén que aparecen en la poesía española de la primera mitad del siglo XX.

Pese a estar ligado a la modernidad, el del Paraíso es un tópico universal que ha ido reiterándose en la literatura, desde las poetizaciones del *locus amoenus* clásico hasta la poesía renacentista, pasando por la tradición literaria cristiana de la Edad Media; desde la recreación miltoniana hasta el Modernismo, pasando por el Romanticismo y el simbolismo. Pero, centrándonos en el contexto hispánico del siglo XX, toda reelaboración del Edén está marcada negativamente por un sentimiento de nostalgia, que hace que el mito de la creación se una, de una vez por todas, al de la expulsión y la caída.

Si desde Bécquer hasta Juan Ramón Jiménez los jardines paradisíacos que florecen en las páginas de los poetas son «trasunto de una intimidad que aspira a crear, o a crearse, un mundo bello» (Alvar, 1986: 4), en tanto que evasión de otro mundo que ha empezado ya su particular *descensus ad inferos*, en las representaciones posteriores el mitema del jardín primero llega hecho añicos. Como ya se ha explicitado atrás, el laicismo y el nihilismo finiseculares obturan

cualquier posibilidad de construcción idílica de un lugar idealizado, repleto de seguridades lógicas, teológicas y escatológicas (Gillespie, 1995: XIII), con lo cual a los poetas sólo les cabe entonar un canto elegíaco a la plenitud de antaño.

En resumen, la vigencia de este mito muestra, de un lado, la permeabilidad de la poesía de los años treinta al derrumbamiento de la cosmovisión general, y, de otro, la pervivencia de elementos románticos y simbolistas<sup>12</sup> que analizaremos a seguido. Respecto a su significación en la modernidad literaria española, suele declinarse en una poliedricidad de símbolos, para cuya clasificación volvemos a remitir a Ortuño (2014: 55-74)<sup>13</sup>.

El tópico de la pérdida del Paraíso en las poetizaciones de los existencialistas, en efecto, se matiza con un tinte más hosco. La palabra serena y el afán panteísta de *Sombra del paraíso* no arraigan mucho en esos poetas, quienes prefieren el tono brusco de Alonso para enfrentarse a esta temática. Aunque no se cite directamente el Edén, las alusiones son bastante claras, gracias al uso de símbolos relacionados con el mitologema de la creación, como el de la espada y el del ángel. La expulsión va aparejada a la idea de destierro, abandono y privación, como sugieren respectivamente Vicente Gaos («En destierro»:

<sup>12</sup> Sobre la supervivencia en la modernidad literaria occidental de elementos románticos y simbolistas, y la necesidad de enfocar el asunto desde una perspectiva transversal, véanse: Abrams (1971), Silver (1996), Prieto de Paula (2002), Carnero (2002), Alarcón Sierra (2002), Urrutia (2002).

<sup>13</sup> Según la estudiosa, el paraíso puede representar la patria añorada en el exilio (León Felipe, *Ganarás la luz*, 1943), el espacio doméstico que, pese a cercenar las exigencias de libertad, representa un lugar seguro (Pilar de Valderrama, *Hortus conclusus*, 1928), la edad de la inocencia que permite al ser humano la armónica fusión con la naturaleza (Vicente Aleixandre, *Sombra del paraíso*, 1944), la alegoría del amor perfecto en sus derivaciones humana y espiritual (Pedro Salinas, *La voz a ti debida*, 1934; Ernestina de Champourcín, *Cántico inútil*, 1936), la pérdida de Dios y de la fe (García Lorca, *Libros de poemas*, 1921; Rafael Alberti, *Sobre los ángeles*, 1929; Luis Cernuda, *Un río, un amor*, 1929); la palabra creadora (Pedro Salinas, *Presagios*, 1924).

105) y Eugenio de Nora («Recuerdo de la nada»: 112)<sup>14</sup>:

Así, arrojado misteriosamente en esta vida, el hombre está angustiado.

\*

Avanza lento [...] avanza con pesadumbre de buey martirizado:

sabiéndose arrojado, condenado a la vida.

El derrocamiento, el hecho de encontrarse en una contingencia desabrida, incitan al canto nostálgico del lugar primero o al cuento infeliz de la condición presente; así que la tierra, la de antes y la de ahora, aparece constantemente, o como recuerdo desdibujado y doliente de la dicha o como realidad física, reseca materia que se pisa y se recorre. Indicativos son los títulos de algunas obras: *Sobre la tierra* (1945) de Vicente Gaos; *Tierra sin nosotros* (1946) de José Hierro; *Mujer sin Edén* (1947) de Carmen Conde.

Contextualizando esa precipitación del *locus amoenus* al *locus horridus*, resulta inmediata la referencia al momento histórico: naufragadas las ilusiones de un posible regreso al *statu quo ante bellum*, el poeta bracea para no hundirse en la lóbrega realidad del régimen.

Ese *locus horridus* del destierro se configura como un paisaje inhóspito y desapacible, áspero y seco —también *locus eremus*—, réplica de la tierra a la que fueron arrojados Adán y Eva después de la expulsión. De forma magistral lo explica José Hierro («Llanura»: 39)<sup>15</sup>:

Este llano desierto, esta tierra maldita,  
este otero desnudo de costados resecos,  
este páramo triste donde el hombre que grita no  
encuentra un solo monte que devuelva sus ecos,  
este desierto mudo, esta monotonía,  
esta soledad ocre como una calavera.

Vuelve, en Nora, la referencia a una aspereza que no es solo de la tierra sino también de sus fenómenos atmosféricos: «¡Dejadme aquí! Sobre

esta tierra seca, / mordido por el viento áspero» («Lamento», *Cantos al destino*, [1945] 1999: 119).

Y ese yermo en el que se vive la congoja del castigo y del silencio divinos, se erige como barrera infranqueable entre el mundo terreno y el mundo celeste. Dios se esconde, para Valverde, más allá de los nimbos, espectador cruel e indiferente de la soledad humana («Salmo inicial»: 127):

Señor, no estás conmigo aunque te nombre siempre.

Estás allá, entre nubes, donde mi voz no alcanza [...].

[...]

Eres ciudad detrás de las montañas.

Eres un mar que a veces no se oye.

Aquí la divinidad es el Yahvé antiguo testamentario: no ese Dios «humano» y compasivo al que se refería Blas de Otero en *Redoble de conciencia* (soneto «Lástima», antes aparecido en *Espadaña* como «Déjame»), sino un Dios airado que provoca tempestades, que mata con fuego y derriba. Proporcionamos dos ejemplos extraídos respectivamente de Bousoño («Salmo violento», *Subida al amor*: 32) y Dámaso Alonso («La isla», *Hijos de la ira*: 338-339):

Devora mi amargura y tierra amarga.

Devóralas, Señor de mi tormenta.

\*

Y el mar se alza como materia sólida, como un paño de luto [...]

Oh Dios,

Yo no sabía que tu mar tuviera tempestades,

Y primero creí que era mi alma la que bullía

[...]

Y eras tú.

[...]

Tú has querido poner sordo terror y reverencia en mi alma

Infantil,

e insomnio agudo donde había sueño.

Y lo has logrado.

Pudiste deshacerme en una llamarada.

<sup>14</sup> Las citas por Gaos (1959) y Nora (1999), respectivamente. En lo sucesivo me limitaré a señalar, en cada cita, el número de la página entre paréntesis.

<sup>15</sup> Las citas por Hierro (2017). En lo sucesivo me limitaré a señalar, en cada cita, el número de la página entre paréntesis.

Otra característica que debe ponerse de relieve es la reiteración obsesiva de la búsqueda que se deduce tanto en Valverde («Te persigo en el bosque detrás de cada tronco. / Hombre de Dios me llamo. Pero sin Dios estoy»; «Salmo inicial»: 127) como en Bousoño («Queriendo olerte, Dios, desesperado / voy por los valles, las montañas»; «Salmo desesperado»: 33).

Ese movimiento, cuya dirección no se explicita y que parece circular por su repetición, puede llegar a hacerse horizontal, como en «Falsos semidioses» de José Hierro: ángeles caídos, ya conscientes de la propia condición inmutable, a los seres humanos les queda solo aceptar el lugar por donde caminan (55):

¿A qué salir al horizonte si no podemos  
despojarnos de nuestra historia  
como de un traje roto y viejo?  
Nos creíamos semidioses  
(itodo era hermoso, como un sueño!),  
criaturas de la alegría,  
su centro estaba en nuestro centro.  
Mas nos abruman las montañas,  
nos curvamos bajo su peso  
sin gracia lírica de juncos,  
altos y secos.  
Y retornamos a las calles  
que se disparan contra el puerto,  
a nuestros cielos empañados,  
a los jardines polvorientos,  
a continuar, ya para siempre  
desterrados de nuestro reino.

Sin embargo, si la temática cristiana de los años treinta, sea directa o tangencialmente abordada, sirve para insertar la desautorización de lo sagrado en un tiempo mítico de crisis que había empezado ya en el 98, en la aparición de poemarios de cariz religioso que se verificó a partir de mediados de los años cuarenta tiene, en cambio, una función subversiva, ya que, en virtud de su valor universal, consigue poner nombre al inconformismo y a la desazón contemporáneos. O sea, las bases estéticas que comparten los poetas son las mismas, pero los recursos estilísticos y las finalidades difieren.

En las reelaboraciones existencialistas, lo que prima no es ya primordialmente la interpretación individual de la crisis universal de lo sagrado, sino el desamparo de encontrarse *desterrados*, figurada o literalmente, en una realidad adversa e irreconocible como es España tras la instauración del franquismo. Si en las precedentes manifestaciones la pérdida se aceptaba con cierta resignación, los poetas de los cuarenta canalizan el desgarramiento de la privación en una invectiva, más o menos velada, contra los agentes desencadenantes de la tragedia del país.

En ese contexto específico, el mito actúa gracias a su *reversibilidad* (Ilie, 1980: 13), un concepto que Jato explica de la siguiente forma:

Frente a las mitologías oficiales del Imperio, los poetas del exilio, tanto territorial [...] como interior [...] se servirán, en cambio, de los mitos bíblicos para sacar a la luz una poesía «subterránea» [...] que hable verdaderamente de la realidad del ser humano. Aquí el mito sí que ejerce una auténtica labor terapéutica, y, en el caso de la cultura disidente, también subversiva, pues, tras su apariencia religiosamente ortodoxa, y gracias a su disfraz bíblico, enmascara la rebeldía latente en aquellos años dentro de unos cauces bien vistos por los estamentos oficiales. Estos poetas se sirven además de la cobertura universal del mito para expresar su rabiosa individualidad, para intentar encontrar una respuesta a las grandes preguntas que asaltan al ser humano [...]. Estos poetas buscan en los mitos tomados de la Biblia las explicaciones al dramático presente que aflora del conflicto armado. El mito les otorga además la capacidad de trascender esa crisis de identidad producto de su particular coyuntura histórica y superar la escisión nacional que esta provoca (2004: 20-21).

#### IV. PROYECCIONES UNAMUNIANA EN LA SIMBOLOGÍA MÍTICA

Ya hemos indicado que, en la vertiente espiritual de la poesía existencialista de los cuarenta, sobreviven elementos de la tradición mística cristiana y del simbolismo de fin de siglo. Más

concretamente, la crítica es propensa a identificar en esa corriente proyecciones noventayochistas que afectan al tono, al tema y al acervo simbólico. Siguiendo la línea de investigación de Jato (2004), Martínez Perea defiende que «la índole de los motivos religiosos de la promoción viene marcada por la unamuniana agonía cristiana y la machadiana búsqueda de Dios» (2008: 185). Debido a la profunda reflexión sobre el ser humano y la espiritualidad que desarrollaron en sus obras, Unamuno y Machado se consideran los antecedentes más próximos de la lírica religiosa de posguerra. La influencia de ambos se patentiza no solo en la temática metafísica, sino también en el tratamiento de determinados mitos bíblicos, como el de Caín. A continuación, intentaremos rastrear las huellas unamunianas en las poetizaciones de posguerra, analizando la relación de continuidad y ruptura que establecen con su fuente primaria.

En cuanto a lirismo y simbología, el legado de Unamuno se considera la herencia poética de la que más se beneficiaron los autores de los cuarenta. En efecto, en *Rosario de sonetos líricos* (1911) y en *El Cristo de Velázquez* (1920)<sup>16</sup> elabora un conjunto de símbolos que influirían en el lenguaje tremendista a partir de 1939, para significar la «somatización angustiosa de la búsqueda de Dios» (Jato, 2004: 42). En la poesía de esos años, el tormento espiritual se hace físico, se concreta en la carne; y la misma ausencia de la divinidad se vuelve presencia en el cuerpo del autor. En este proceso, al ser divino se le ceden atributos propios del ser humano para concretar su acción sobre el individuo: es un Dios que toca, besa y hace padecer hambre y sed.

Esta tensión agónica del discurso, siempre a punto de quiebra, acompañada de un acervo simbólico adscribible al ámbito de la corporeidad y aplicado a lo religioso, tan propio de la estética mística y del antropomorfismo de las Escrituras, alcanza una sistematización en los versos unamunianos. En *Rosario de sonetos líricos*

aparecen los motivos del tacto y el beso de la divinidad («En la mano de Dios»: 386):

Cuando, Señor, nos besas con tu beso  
que nos quita el aliento, el de la muerte,  
el corazón bajo el aprieto fuerte  
de tu mano derecha queda opreso.  
Y en tu izquierda, rendida por su peso  
quedando la cabeza, a que revierte  
el sueño eterno, aun lucha por cogerte  
al disiparse su angustiado seso.

Vemos cómo pesa esa mano, que lleva consigo terror y muerte. En la mayoría de las composiciones de posguerra, siguiendo el ejemplo casi inesquivable de Unamuno, el roce divino es un contacto que hiere y arrolla como un desastre natural. Considérense estos versos de Gaos (1959): «Dios mío, pon tu mano arrebatada, / tu huracán estelar, tu sorda ira / sobre tu oscuro hijo» («Desprecio del cielo»: 148).

En José Luis Hidalgo<sup>17</sup>, la mano de Dios cae como un hacha que troncha criaturas que ya se han convertido en vegetales: «y has de bajar, Señor, para arrancarme / con tus manos inmensas y desnudas» («Estoy maduro»: 79); y sigue Hidalgo: «Yo solo he preguntado si tu mano sombría / con nuestros troncos lívidos enciende sus hogueras» («Porque voy a llorarme»: 82).

Se exaspera en Blas de Otero la gravedad de esa garra tanto que, en *Redoble de conciencia*, es el mismo autor quien, humanizando a Dios (en unos versos ya citados), quiere cercenar esos miembros y hasta llega al deseo de matar al Creador («Lástima»: 113-114)<sup>18</sup>:

Me haces daño, Señor. Quitá tu mano  
de encima. Déjame con mi vacío,  
déjame. Para abismo, con el mío  
tengo bastante. ¡Oh Dios!, si eres humano,  
compadécete ya, quita esa mano  
de encima. No me sirve. Me da frío

<sup>17</sup> Las citas por Hidalgo (1976). En lo sucesivo me limitaré a señalar, en cada cita, el título del poema cuando es preciso, y el número de la página entre paréntesis.

<sup>18</sup> Las citas por Otero (1960). En lo sucesivo me limitaré a señalar, en cada cita, el título del poema cuando es preciso, y el número de la página entre paréntesis.

y miedo. Si eres Dios, yo soy tan mío como tú. Y a soberbio, yo te gano. Déjame. ¡Si pudiese yo matarte, como haces tú, como haces tú! Nos coges con las dos manos, nos ahogas. Matas no se sabe por qué. Quiero cortarte las manos. Esas manos que son trojes del hambre, y de los hombres que arrebatas.

La primera parte del soneto calca el versículo 21 del capítulo 13 de Job: «Aparta de mí la palma de tu mano y que tu terror no me atemorice».

Otro motivo muy recurrente, ya utilizado por Alonso en *Oscura noticia*, es el del beso de Dios que, falto de tintes dramáticos, objetiva el deseo de la divinidad («Solo»: 64): «Miedo a tu soledad. Sienta tu garra, / Tu beso de furor. Lo necesito / como el perro el castigo de su amo». Y es un deseo que no se satisface y que, aunque se cumpliera, aumentaría la ansiedad. Citamos a Blas de Otero («Un relámpago apenas»: 24): «Oh Dios, oh Dios, si para verte / bastara un beso, un beso que se llora / después, porque ¡oh, por qué! no basta eso».

Recurrimos de nuevo al mismo poeta para introducir otro símbolo: el de la sed, que a menudo acompaña al hambre («Sombras le avisaron»: 129): «Cada beso que doy, como un zarpazo / en el vacío, es carne olfateada / de Dios, hambre de Dios, sed abrazada». El beso humano es sombra vacía del beso de Dios; la unión con otro ser no aquietta la angustia, sino que la estremece. Parece clara la huella de Unamuno, en los versos del otro bilbaíno, al expresar la insaciabilidad de ese amor («Eucaristía»: 488):

Amor de ti nos quema, blanco cuerpo;  
amor que es hambre, amor de las entrañas:  
hambre de la Palabra creadora  
que se hizo carne; fiero amor de vida  
que no se sacia con abrazos, besos,  
ni con enlace conyugal alguno.

Y el quebrantamiento espiritual se agudiza aún más en *Redoble de conciencia*, cuando la misma divinidad se hace agua, agua que fluye y no se detiene para ser bebida: «No seas como el agua y

te derrames / para siempre, Agua y Sed de los humanos» («Muerte en el mar»: 110).

La característica de esta sed parece ser la infinitud, esa apetencia imperecedera que no da sosiego y se repite *ab aeterno* como en el suplicio de Tántalo. Bien lo expresa José María Valverde<sup>19</sup> en *Hombre de Dios* («Salmo de la sed de Dios»: 146):

Ya comprendo esa angustia de no encontrar reposo  
que no me deja quieto en ningún sitio;  
eres tú con tu sed.

[...]

Oh sed de Dios, oh llama  
que me sorbe la vida inmóvilmente.

*El Cristo de Velázquez*, una obra mediante la que Unamuno configura un modo de uso del lenguaje bíblico que irradiará hacia la poesía de los años cuarenta y cincuenta (Jato, 2004: 43), consta de 2539 endecasílabos blancos, divididos en cuatro partes. Es una meditación surgida a raíz de la contemplación del homónimo cuadro del pintor sevillano, acompañada por la lectura de la Biblia (el texto contiene, de hecho, referencias bíblicas en los márgenes). Así que el verso unamuniano se hace exégesis poética tanto de las Escrituras como de la pintura. El autor, a medida que se fija en varios detalles de la tela, los va explicando, proporcionando nociones doctrinales. Pero, como subrayó García de la Concha en su edición de la obra, «nos hallamos ante un poema y no ante un discurso teológico» (1987: 39). Y menos aún, añadimos, ante un discurso ecrástico.

Lejos de cualquier dogmatismo católico, el poema se centra en la figura de Cristo y, más concretamente, en ese Cristo salido del pincel de Velázquez, cuya humanidad es palpable. El tono empleado, aunque no se percibe en él agonismo, sigue la estela de las obras anteriormente mencionadas en lo referente al diálogo: el yo poético entabla un coloquio cuyo destinatario es ese Cristo que se escudriña.

<sup>19</sup> Las citas por Valverde (1998). En lo sucesivo me limitaré a señalar, en cada cita, el título del poema cuando es preciso, y el número de la página entre paréntesis.

Importancia primaria, entre el cúmulo de símbolos que será reelaborado por los poetas de la posguerra, tiene el emparejamiento antonímico luz-oscuridad, originado en el fuerte contraste cromático del lienzo. En efecto, Velázquez pintó un Cristo compuesto en su dramatismo, cuya blancura se recorta sobre un fondo de un gris muy oscuro, casi negro. Esa albura contribuye a su especial, por contraria al desgarrón patético, «serenidad apolínea, que en su plenitud va más allá de la que desprende un *Christus patiens*», como también contribuye a ello «la especial postura del cuerpo, ni desplomado ni colgando del madero, sino apoyándose como si estuviera vivo (en realidad, antinaturalmente) en el sucedáneo» (Prieto de Paula, 2019: 125). En la primera parte del poema, la referencia a la albura del cuerpo exangüe es muy frecuente y se hipostasias en el ámbito semántico de la blancura y la negrura. Considérese en especial la composición IV, que compendia todas las gradaciones que aparecerán a lo largo del poema<sup>20</sup>.

Más adelante, el Cristo descrito se objetiva en unos elementos cuya característica principal es el

<sup>20</sup> «Mira dentro de ti, donde está el reino / de Dios; dentro de ti, donde alborea / el sol eterno de las almas vivas. / Blanco tu cuerpo está como el espejo / del padre de la luz, del sol vivífico; / blanco tu cuerpo al modo de la luna / que muerta ronda en torno de su madre / nuestra cansada vagabunda tierra; / blanco tu cuerpo está como la hostia / del cielo de la noche soberana, / de ese cielo tan negro como el velo / de tu abundosa cabellera negra / de nazareno [...] Abre tus brazos / a la noche, que es negra y muy hermosa, / porque el sol de la vida la ha mirado / con sus ojos de fuego: que a la noche / morena la hizo el sol y tan hermosa. / Y es hermosa la luna solitaria, / la blanca luna en la estrellada noche / negra cual la abundosa cabellera / negra del nazareno. Blanca luna / como el cuerpo del hombre en cruz, espejo / del sol de vida, del que nunca muere. / Los rayos, Maestro, de tu suave lumbre / nos guían en la noche de este mundo, / ungiéndonos con la esperanza recia / de un día entero. Noche cariñosa, / ioh noche, madre de los blandos sueños, / madre de la esperanza, dulce Noche, / noche oscura del alma, eres nodriza / de la esperanza en Cristo salvador!» (462-463).

albor<sup>21</sup>. Podríamos sintetizar diciendo que Cristo se identifica con elementos pertenecientes a las esferas celeste (sol, luna, cielo, nube) y terrestre. Esta última, a su vez, se subdivide en tres categorías: vegetal-natural (arroyo, leche, lirio, árbol); animal (cordero, toro, águila, león, paloma, serpiente, dragón); y material (hostia, puerta, ánfora, espada).

Con respecto a la primera, hemos de volver al antropomorfismo de Dios y al de la sed, que se enlaza, a menudo, con el hambre. El Cristo de Unamuno, de hecho, es agua (arroyo por metonimia) y leche, pero también hostia y carne, pan, alimento único que sacia al ser humano («Eucaristía»: 488-489):

Nuestro amor entrañado, amor hecho hambre,  
ioh, cordero de Dios!, manjar Te quiere;  
quiere saber sabor de tus redaños,  
comer tu corazón, y que su pulpa  
como maná celeste se derrita  
sobre el ardor de nuestra seca lengua.

En los fragmentos que acabamos de presentar, se hace hincapié en la simbología bíblica y litúrgica que tiene relación con el mundo animal. Aunque los poetas de la posguerra no recurren a este procedimiento, es cierto que en sus composiciones se puede divisar una caracterización de la divinidad con atributos muy parecidos a los de las bestias; a veces esta percepción no llega a esclarecer y solo se sugiere; otras, se define por negación, como en *Ángel fieramente humano*: «y detrás de la nuca me

<sup>21</sup> «Como un arroyo al sol tu cuerpo brilla, / una plata viva en la negrura» («Arroyo-fuente»: 474); «Nube eres de blancura» («Nube-Música»: 474); «Cordero blanco del Señor» («Cordero»: 476); «Hostia blanca del trigo de los surcos» («Hostia»: 476); «Águila blanca» («Águila»: 479); «Blanco león de los desiertos» («León»: 481); «Tú, blanco toro de lunada frente» («Toro»: 482); «Eres la blanca puerta del empero» («Puerta»: 483); «Blanco lirio entre cardos» («Lirio»: 484); «Tu cuerpo como espada al sol relumbra, / como una espada al sol luce tu cuerpo» («Espada»: 485); «Ánfora blanca del licor divino» («Ánfora»: 486); «¡Tú, así, paloma blanca de los cielos!» («Paloma»: 486); «Como la leche de María blanco, / nata de la Humanidad, puro alimento» («Leche»: 487); «Y tú, blanco dragón de nuestra cura, / del Árbol de la Muerte suspendido, / todo el veneno del dolor recoges» («Serpiente»: 491); y más adelante: «pan de inmortalidad, carne divina» («Eucaristía»: 488).

tocasen / pronto, unas manos no humanas» («Hombre en desgracia»: 53); otras cuantas, y es el caso de Dámaso Alonso, se alude a ello veladamente: «no me sirven mis pensamientos, que coronan mundos a la caza de Dios («La obsesión»: 314) o se prefiere la indefinición («En la sombra»: 311):

Sí, tú me buscas.

A veces en la noche yo te siento a mi lado,  
que me acechas,

[...]

Tú me oteas, escucho tu jadear caliente,  
tu revolver de bestia que se hiere en los troncos,  
siento en la sombra  
tu inmensa mole blanca.

Bousoño precisa más: «todo tú ruges / arrojando sombra» («El señor en la noche»: 30). Finalmente, Vicente Gaos elige un animal específico, un alcotán («Incesantemente»: 191):

[...] el último

ruiseñor [...]

que aún canta en mi corazón tristemente,  
[...]

angustiado por el alcotán de tu mano,  
táctil ave de presa cuya mirada, en lo oscuro  
es implacable y redonda con la perfección de la  
muerte.

Es interesante notar que Gaos, en este caso, opta por una rapaz; en los libros sapienciales<sup>22</sup>, cuando se hace referencia a Dios como a un ave, se le connota como un águila, símbolo de piedad y amparo. Gaos, si bien escoge un ave que pertenece a la misma especie, la representa en el acto de cazar y matar. Pero Dios vuelve a tener un matiz protector en esos versos de *Hijos de la ira*, de Dámaso Alonso («La isla»: 336):

Callado y en reposo junto a tu criatura más  
desvalida,  
lo mismo que el enorme mastín paterno vela,  
sin nana, sin arrullo,  
el sueño  
del niño más pequeño de la casa.

<sup>22</sup> Véanse *Salmos* 17: 8; 36: 7; 63: 7; 91: 4; *Deuteronomio* 32: 11.

Retomando el hilo de la simbología lumínica que abre *El Cristo de Velázquez*, en la lírica existencialista la luz representa la fe o la certeza de un sentir reparador; la oscuridad, en cambio, es el enraizamiento en la duda, en la angustia del vivir. Las indagaciones personales del poeta, por consiguiente, parecen desarrollarse siempre en la sombra, durante una eterna noche del alma que, connivente pero no identificable con la tradición mística, reduce la visión y la esperanza. Consideramos dos ejemplos; uno de *Hijos de la ira* de Dámaso Alonso («Monstruos»: 299):

[...] en vano perturbo

el silencio de tu invariable noche  
con mi desgarradora interrogación.

Bajo la penumbra de las estrellas  
y bajo la terrible tiniebla de la luz solar.

El otro de *Los muertos* de José Luis Hidalgo («Verbos de Dios»: 78):

Señor, toda la vida es mi pregunta,

[...]

¿Ardes sin tregua tras el cielo negro  
o habitas solamente en mi palabra?

Muy a menudo el motivo de la oscuridad aparece junto al de la ceguera: hundido en la tenebrosidad, el individuo lanza a tentones sus interrogantes. La negrura es como un escudo que se interpone entre la luz divina y la mirada humana. Bousoño subraya la sensación de abandono que impera en esa búsqueda («Ola celeste»: 60): «No me escuchas [...] / Sin descanso te evades y me dejas / abandonado y ciego entre la sombra». Mientras Gaos insiste en la ciega obstinación del deseo de Dios («La vida no es hermosa. No, la vida...»: 144; y «En el mundo»: 195):

Doble noche del hombre a cielo raso  
que vive erguido a ciegas en su anhelo.

\*

Así, sobre la tierra, nosotros,  
sin más luz que la del deseo,  
fuerzas ciegas, sumisos  
habitantes de la mortal oscuridad, queremos  
vencer la noche de un cuerpo.

Siguiendo esa estela, Hidalgo objetiva la sed espiritual en el movimiento ascensional de sus manos, comparándolas con dos pájaros ciegos («Manos que buscan»: 86):

Como dos ciegos pájaros  
que no te conocieran,  
mis manos se levantan  
sobre toda la tierra  
y en lo oscuro te buscan  
creciendo a las estrellas.

El plan terrestre es horizontal y el plan celeste vertical; su anhelo de comprensión lleva al poeta a tenderse hacia arriba, a tensarse en un movimiento ascensional, como un árbol.

En la composición «La serpiente», de *El Cristo de Velázquez*, la cruz se define como un «Árbol de la Muerte» en el que están prendidas las almas, hostigadas por una tempestad. La cruz-árbol se convierte, más adelante, en barco («Barco»: 489):

Solo la cruz respaldo, el tronco errante  
donde sujeto vas, el árbol muerto,  
sin raíces, sin hojas y sin fruto,  
armadía al azar de los abismos  
de la tierra y del cielo inacabables,  
santo madero en que navega el alma  
tendida entre las dos eternidades.

Y se hace, finalmente, escala («Escala»: 490):

La escala de Jacob, cuando dormido  
en Harán —una piedra cabecera—soñó, donde  
subían y bajaban  
los ángeles, era tu cruz; sobre ella  
voz de tu Dios nos dice: «¡Soy contigo!  
¡Te guardaré y te llevaré a tu patria!».  
Que es tu cruz gradería de la gloria.

Si en Unamuno el árbol se hace cruz y escala, mástil en la borrasca y escalera para llegar al cielo, en la lírica de la posguerra adquiere una significación totalmente distinta. De hecho, «la adjudicación de la etiqueta de *desarraigo* induce una metáfora que asocia la promoción existencial a la imagen de un árbol que, violentamente arrancado de su medio vital e histórico, lucha con desesperación por hincar sus raíces y recobrar su

vertebración circunstancial» (Martínez Perera, 2008: 366). Ese árbol que se extiende hacia lo alto puede, según Bousoño, resplandecer en medio de la oscuridad gracias a la presencia divina («Buscando luz»: 47):

Sopla y enciéndeme, Señor, cual árbol  
resplandeciente entre la noche oscura.  
Mira mis verdes que se extienden largos,  
mira mis ramas de quejidos: crecen  
en la noche, tu fresca luz buscando.

En *Arcángel de mi noche*, de Gaos, sufre una ulterior transformación, ya que el árbol es el mismo corazón del poeta, arañado por la soledad y el dolor, que encierra en su entraña solo centelleos de luz («El corazón»: 138):

Mi corazón, un árbol de ternura,  
una tristeza honda, solamente  
un árbol ciego que la luz presiente,  
raíz de amor, dolor solo en su hondura.

[...]

Mi corazón, un árbol triste, triste,  
una infinita soledad, un daño  
que de mi entrada toma sueño y vida.

Más esperanzada es la actitud de Hidalgo, quien conecta este tema con otro: el árbol ya muerto seguirá recibiendo luz gracias a sus hijos, ramas verdes y altas de su tronco marchito («Los hijos»: 80):

Porque entonces, Señor, mi tronco seco  
sin la savia de ti, se irá a la nada,  
pero las ramas altas de mi vida  
seguirán por tu luz alimentadas.

Pese a permanecer asentado en la tierra, como hemos averiguado en esos fragmentos, el ser-árbol crece hacia el empíreo; y aunque el crecimiento no llegue a realizarse, el sueño de la elevación, como sugiere Blas de Otero, no termina nunca, ya que parece propiedad distintiva del ser humano («Mortales»: 79):

Árbol de Dios, oh, sí arboladura  
hundida al fondo donde el hombre ama;  
y desde allí, mortal, eterna, clama,  
reclama, sueña, eternidad y altura.

Se añade, finalmente, a la metamorfosis cruz-árbol el símbolo de la espada. La conjunción de la cruz y de la espada, muy frecuente en la retórica del nacionalcatolicismo, fue rechazada por los poetas de los cuarenta, quienes prefirieron conectar el símbolo con el relato genesiaco<sup>23</sup>. Así que injertan en el motivo de la espada otro muy recurrente en la lírica existencial: el del ángel.

Debido a su derivación antiguo testamentaria, esa figura enlaza con el tópico de la expulsión del Paraíso antes aludida. Además, si se examinan rápidamente algunos títulos del periodo, descubrimos que la referencia a los ángeles y al jardín edénico es directa o indirectamente patente. Ya en la preguerra, *Sobre los ángeles* (1929) de Rafael Alberti había contribuido a la difusión del tema. Pero en *Sombra del paraíso* (1944), de Aleixandre, el «angelismo» se funde con el motivo de la pérdida y la nostalgia de un mundo del que el ser humano ha quedado excluido. Le siguen Gaos con *Arcángel de mi noche* (1944), Blas de Otero con *Ángel fieramente humano* (1950), Carmen Conde con *El arcángel* (redactado en 1939, pero publicado en 1967) y *Derribado arcángel* (1960).

Cabe subrayar que si, en el Génesis, la caída y la expulsión del Edén es castigo reservado a Adán y Eva, tanto en los libros proféticos del Antiguo Testamento<sup>24</sup> como en el Nuevo<sup>25</sup> se alude a la caída de Lucifer, ángel sabio y hermoso que suscitó la ira de Dios por su soberbia. Podríamos colegir que, siendo representados los ángeles en la iconografía clásica como seres antropomorfos dotados de alas, y siendo idéntico en ambos relatos bíblicos el móvil de la indignación divina, Lucifer aparece como trasunto literario del mismo hombre. En efecto, en muchas composiciones de *Arcángel de mi noche* la identificación es total; Gaos llega a usar la misma onomástica («Sima y cima»: 101; y «Luzbel»: 149):  
En tu sima he caído de impureza.

<sup>23</sup> «Echó al hombre, y a oriente del Edén colocó a los querubines y la espada llameante que oscilaba, para cerrar el camino al árbol de la vida» (*Gén* 3: 24).

<sup>24</sup> Véanse: *Job* 1: 7; *Isaías* 14: 12-15; *Ezequiel* 28: 12-19.

<sup>25</sup> Véanse: *Mt* 4: 8-10; *Jn* 8: 44; *Ap* 12: 9.

[...]

Si abatido Luzbel por mi torpeza  
en tu abismo, en tu noche irrespirable.

\*

Arcángel derribado [...]

[...] el que quisiste

ser como Dios, ser Dios, mi arcángel triste,  
sueño mío rebelde y ambicioso.

La identificación con el ángel se hace más evidente y más aciaga en Blas de Otero: el mismo título de su libro, *Ángel fieramente humano*, lo declara abiertamente en su oxímoron. Solo que, en sus versos, el tormento de la imposibilidad de elevación hacia la divinidad se recrudece a causa del silencio de Dios («Hombre»: 42):

Luchando, cuerpo a cuerpo, con la muerte,  
al borde del abismo, estoy clamando  
a Dios. Y su silencio, retumbando,  
ahoga mi voz en el vacío inerte.

Oh Dios. Si he de morir, quiero tenerte  
despierto. Y, noche a noche, no sé cuándo  
oirás mi voz. Oh Dios. Estoy hablando  
solo. Arañando sombras para verte.

Alzo la mano, y tú me la cercenas.

Abro los ojos: me los sacas vivos.

Sed tengo, y sal se vuelven tus arenas.

Esto es ser hombre: horror a manos llenas.

Ser —y no ser— eternos, fugitivos.

¡Ángel con grandes alas de cadenas!

Por lo demás, el símbolo de la espada acarrea consigo la idea de escisión. El ángel que veda el paso al jardín es, al fin y al cabo, el recuerdo constante de la culpa, la hoja que cercena el anhelo de reunificación y que perpetúa la separación entre los ámbitos celeste y terrestre de las criaturas. Así, junto a la conciencia de la falta, se matiza también la del hibridismo de la esencia humana, como insinúa Hidalgo: «Siniestra es la raíz de Luzbel de mi carne / y sombría la estrella de tu sabiduría» («Yo quiero ser el árbol»: 78).

Aplicada a una antropología existencial, la presencia del ángel sitúa al hombre a horcajadas de dos esferas, telúrica y uránica, o —en terminología platónica— *pandémica* y *celeste*. En

palabras de Martínez Perera, ello expresa «la naturaleza dual del ser humano, que en el contexto histórico que nos ocupa se enriquece con la adición del estigma del destierro interior y del deseo de reintegración en una existencia auténtica» (2008: 340-341). En este sentido, el ángel expulso concreta el *angor* de quien «se siente condenado a sobrevivir arrojado en un medio hostil que domina el tiempo y la muerte, y que, asimismo, en su ansia de Dios, testimonia la esencia divina de la que proviene» (2008: 341).

En resumen, podríamos decir que la índole de los motivos religiosos de los poetas de posguerra viene marcada por la tensión agónica del lenguaje unamuniano y por el conjunto simbólico que plasma en *Rosario de sonetos líricos* (1911) y *El Cristo de Velázquez* (1920), para significar la somatización de la búsqueda de Dios. En ese proceso, la divinidad se connota con rasgos específicos del ser humano (el beso, la mano, el hambre y la sed) que, sin embargo, pierden carácter positivo para expresar una sensación de arrebató que acarrea la ausencia de Dios o su anhelo insatisfecho. En los casos de zoomorfismo, el Creador no es un animal que ofrece tutela como en las Escrituras, sino presencia aterradora. La herencia unamuniana de mayor envergadura parece ser la pareja antonímica luz-oscuridad, por la profunda reelaboración simbólica que sufre. En *El Cristo de Velázquez*, la luz representa a un Cristo que es certeza de fe y salvación, y que resplandece en la oscuridad. Su atributo principal es el albor; de hecho, se objetiva en una serie de elementos caracterizado por la blancura. En los poetas de los cuarenta, la luz es un objetivo casi inalcanzable, como la fe o la misma divinidad, que está más allá del mundo terrenal. En cambio, la oscuridad es símbolo de una humanidad que vive anclada en la incertidumbre y en el desconsuelo, dejada de la mano de Dios, sola y ciega. El deseo de unión con el Altísimo se concreta en el símbolo del árbol. Este, en Unamuno, es escalera que conduce a la gloria, sinédoque de la cruz y también de la espada. En la reelaboración de esta última imagen, los existencialistas hacen referencia directa a la Biblia y conectan el tema de la espada con los motivos de la expulsión del Edén y del ángel.

## V. CONCLUSIONES

A lo largo del siguiente estudio se ha podido comprobar que lo que vertebra esa vertiente de poesía, inaugurada por *Hijos de la ira* (1944) de Dámaso Alonso, es una honda preocupación religiosa que, además de expresar la religación del ser humano con la divinidad, revela el desasosiego –ontológico primero y político después– originado por una coyuntura histórica de aprieto.

En pleno auge de la poesía existencial, Dios se convierte en el destinatario mudo de la mayoría de poemarios del período. Más allá del agonismo trágico que alienta el ritmo y la retórica neoexpresionista, es rasgo característico de esa vertiente el recurso a un código lingüístico cuyo aparato simbólico arraiga en las Escrituras y que, en nuestro excursó, hemos definido como «lenguaje bíblico», adoptando el marchado forjado por Jato (2004).

Esta estrategia de ascendencia escritural entronca, desde el punto de vista métrico y retórico, con el versículo de tipo salmódico y, desde el punto de vista simbólico, con mitemas y mitologemas veterotestamentarios. No por casualidad, el proceso de desacralización que vive Europa desde finales del siglo XIX, el derrumbe del racionalismo filosófico, las consecuencias de la segunda industrialización y las tragedias bélicas de la primera mitad de la pasada centuria son, todos ellos, factores que obligaron a los poetas a aferrarse a los maltrechos mitos fundacionales de la tradición judeo-cristiana, cuya función fue la de asidero.

Destaca y asombra, en ese proceso, la recuperación del caudal lírico unamuniano y las referencias a su herencia simbólica. Las numerosas reelaboraciones del mito del jardín primero vienen filtradas por la luz –y la sombra– de *Rosario de sonetos líricos* (1912) y *El Cristo de Velázquez* (1920), como se desprende por el análisis realizado. Marcado negativamente por un sentimiento de nostalgia y de pérdida, el del destierro del Edén –tanto como el de la construcción de un Edén al amparo de la nostalgia «pasatista» identificada con la infancia personal o de las colectividades, al modo aleixandrino– se

convierte en paradigma del desamparo de vivir en una coyuntura desasapable.

## BIBLIOGRAFÍA

1. ABRAMS, M. H. (1971): *The Mirror and the Lamp. Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition*. New York: Oxford University Press.
2. ALARCÓN SIERRA, R. (2002): «Valores simbolistas en la literatura española del primer tercio del siglo XX», *Anales de Literatura Española*, 15, pp. 71-92.
3. ALBERTI, R. (1929): *Cal y canto*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente.
4. ALBERTI, R. (1929): *Sobre los ángeles*. Madrid: Compañía Iberoamericana de Publicaciones.
5. ALEIXANDRE, V. (1932): *Espadas como labios*. Madrid: Espasa Calpe.
6. ALEIXANDRE, V. (1944): *Sombra del paraíso*. Madrid: Adán.
7. ALEIXANDRE, V. (1978): *Obras completas*. Madrid: Aguilar.
8. ALONSO, D. (1944): *Hijos de la ira*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente.
9. ALONSO, D. (1998): *Poesía y otros textos literarios*. Madrid: Gredos.
10. ALTER, P. (2003): *El arte de la narrativa en la Biblia*. Madrid: Ediciones Cristiandad.
11. ALVAR, M. (1986): *Juan Ramón Jiménez y la palabra poética*, Puerto Rico: Universidad de Puerto Rico.
12. BOUSOÑO, C. (1945): *Subida al amor*. Madrid: Editorial Hispánica.
13. CARNERO, G. (2002): «La ruptura modernista», *Anales de Literatura Española*, 15, pp. 13-25.
14. CERNUDA, L. (1942): *Ocnos*. London: The Dolphin.
15. CONDE, C. (1947): *Mujer sin Edén*. Madrid: Jura.
16. CONDE, C. (1960): *Derribado arcángel: poemas*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente.
17. CONDE, C. (1967): *El arcángel*. En *Obra poética de Carmen Conde: (1929-1966)*, pról. de Emilio Miró. Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva.
18. DíEZ-CANEDO, E. (1944): «Lugones y la libertad del verso», en *Letras de América*. México: El Colegio de México, pp. 323-368.
19. GAOS, V. (1944): *Arcángel de mi noche*. Madrid: Editorial Hispánica.
20. GAOS, V. (1945): *Sobre la tierra*. Madrid: Revista de Occidente
21. GAOS, V. (1959): *Poesías completas (1937-1957)*. Madrid: Giner.
22. GARCÍA DE LA CONCHA, V. (1983): *La poesía española de posguerra: teoría e historia de sus movimientos*. Madrid: Editorial Prensa Española.
23. GARCÍA DE LA CONCHA, V. (1987): *La poesía española de 1935 a 1975*, 2 vols. (I, *De la preguerra a los años oscuros [1935-1944]*; II, *De la poesía existencial a la poesía social [1944-1950]*). Madrid: Cátedra.
24. GILLESPIE, M. A. (1995): *Nihilism Before Nietzsche*, Chicago: Chicago University Press.
25. HIDALGO, J. L. (1947): *Los muertos*. Madrid: Rialp.
26. HIDALGO, J. L. (1976): *Obra poética completa*. Santander: Institución Cultural de Cantabria, 1976.
27. HIERRO, J. (1946): *Tierra sin nosotros*. Santander: Proel.
28. HIERRO, J. (2017): *Poesía completa (1947-2002)*. Madrid: Visor.
29. ILIE, P. (1980): *Literature and Inner Exile. Authoritarian Spain, 1939-1975*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins UP.
30. JATO, M. (2004): *El lenguaje bíblico en la poesía de los exilios españoles de 1939*. Kassel: Edition Reichenberger.
31. JIMÉNEZ, J. R. (1917): *Diario de un poeta recién casado*. Madrid: Casa Editorial Calleja.
32. LABANYI, J. (2002): *Myth and History in the Contemporary Spanish Novel*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
33. MARGUERAT, D. e Ivan BOURQUIN (2000): *Cómo leer los relatos bíblicos*. Bilbao: Editorial Sal Terrae.
34. MARTÍNEZ PEREA, M. Á. (2008): *Motivos religiosos en la poesía existencial española de posguerra (1939-1952)* [tesis doctoral]. Universidad de Las Palmas de Gran Canaria.
35. MYNET, R. (2003): *Leer la Biblia*. México: Siglo XXI.
36. MYNET, R. (2006): «La binarité, caractéristique essentielle del langage biblique», *Studia Rhetorica*, pp. 1-8.
37. MEYNET, R. (2008): *Trattato di retorica biblica*. Bologna: EDB.

38. NAVARRO, E. (1997): «Las traducciones de poesía y la introducción del verso libre en España», en Rafael Aín Gaitero y Miguel Ángel Vega Cernuda (coords.), *La palabra vertida: investigaciones en torno a la traducción*. Madrid: Universidad Complutense, pp. 291-297.
39. NORA, E. DE (1947): *Cantos al destino*. Madrid: Editorial Hispánica.
40. NORA, E. DE (1999): *Días y sueños. Obra poética reunida (1939-1992)*. Madrid: Cátedra.
41. ONISZCZUK, J. (2013): «L'analisi retorica biblica e semitica», *Gregorianum*, 94, 3, pp. 479-501.
42. ORTUÑO CASANOVA, R. (2014): *Mitos cristianos en la poesía del 27*. London: MHRA Texts & Dissertations 96.
43. OTERO, B. DE (1951): *Redoble de conciencia*. Barcelona: Instituto de Estudios Hispánicos.
44. OTERO, B. DE (1955): *Pido la paz y la palabra*. Torrelavega: Cantalapiedra.
45. OTERO, B. DE (1960): *Ángel fieramente humano / Redoble de conciencia*. Buenos Aires: Losada.
46. PARAÍSO, I. (1985): *El verso libre hispánico. Orígenes y corrientes*. Madrid: Gredos.
47. PRIETO DE PAULA, Á. L. (1991): *La lira de Arión. De poesía y poetas españoles del siglo XX*. Alicante: Universidad de Alicante / CAPA.
48. PRIETO DE PAULA, A. L. (2002): «Subjetivación, irracionalismo, música: rasgos del simbolismo en la poesía española hacia 1900», *Anales de Literatura Española*, 15, pp. 55-70.
49. PRIETO DE PAULA, Á. L. (2019): *Las esquinas del yo: estudios de literatura española contemporánea*. Madrid: Visor.
50. RICOEUR, P. (1979): *The Conflict of Interpretations: Essays in Hermeneutics*, Evanston: Northwestern University Press.
51. SILVER, P. (1996): *Ruina y restitución: reinterpretación del romanticismo en España*. Madrid: Cátedra.
52. RYKEN, L., James C. WILHOIT y Tremper LONGMAN III, eds. (2016): *Gran diccionario enciclopédico de imágenes y símbolos de la Biblia*. Barcelona: Editorial CLIE.
53. SIMIAN-YOFRE, H. (2001): *Metodología del Antiguo Testamento*. Salamanca: Ediciones Sígueme.
54. UNAMUNO, M. de (1911): *Rosario de sonetos líricos*. Madrid: Imprenta española.
55. UNAMUNO, M. de (1920): *El Cristo de Velázquez*. Madrid: Calpe.
56. UNAMUNO, M. de (1999): *Obras Completas, IV*. Madrid: Fundación José Antonio de Castro.
57. URRUTIA GÓMEZ, J. (2002): «El retorno de Cristo, tipo y mito». *Anales de Literatura Española*, 15, pp. 237-257.
58. UTRERA, M.V. (2010): *Estructura y teoría del verso libre*. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas.
59. VALVERDE, J. M. (1945): *Hombre de Dios*. Madrid: Instituto Ramiro de Maeztu.
60. VALVERDE, J. M. (1998): *Obras completas I. Poesía*. Madrid: Trotta.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# We Don't Need No Education

*Volker W. Thürey*

## ABSTRACT

The foundation of this paper is the premise that mankind is a result of evolution. From this requirement I conclude that every property of people must be generated by evolution. Here I justify that some social behavior must be innate. Education is not necessary to explain it. Of course, I can not prove that humans are generated by evolution.

*Keywords and Phrases:* evolution, education, educability.

*Classification:* LCC Code: BF698.95

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Volker W. Thürey. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# We Don't Need No Education

Volker W. Thürey

## ABSTRACT

*The foundation of this paper is the premise that humanity is a result of evolution. From this requirement, I conclude that every property of people must be generated by development. Here I justify that some social behavior must be innate. Education is not necessary to explain it. Of course, I can not prove that humans are generated by evolution.*

*Keywords and phrases:* evolution, education, educability.

*Author:* Bremen, Germany.

It is a general opinion that the character of people is formed by education in the childhood. I believe that this doesn't seem right. Instead, I think that character is given by the genes. Here I try to justify this.

In this paper, I assume the not-provable claim that humans and all animals are generated by evolution. Therefore, every property has to be justified by development, i.e., any property of someone had given an advantage in the struggle of life.

Nearly all humans feel unhappy if they are alone. Humans have lived in groups. This ensured a more successful existence since life in a group is more accessible than isolated. This requires some social behavior. Therefore, many mammals live in groups, for instance, lions, horses, orcas, and other mammals. Of course, others live alone, for instance, leopards. Living in groups requires some social behavior. Therefore, the capability of social behavior must be innate. Nearly all humans have some. Even Adolf Hitler had it. Of course, he also wanted to lead other people. He has chosen the democratic way. Therefore, he joined a party. His primary abilities were to give speeches and to convince others to accept him as a leader.

Indeed, Adolf Hitler was a very evil person. I believe that this was innate. Up to now, there is no proof that education can turn a bad person into a good person, and vice versa; and also, there is not a single example. (It is impossible to prove or disprove the capability for 'educability'. Proofs usually are made in a mathematical context. For instance, the statement 'The set of prime numbers is finite' can be proved or disproved.)

With the word educability, I mean the capability to determine a property by education. The most crucial insight is that educability is a highly nontrivial property and by no means self-evident. Therefore, the capability of the educability of any property has to be fixed in the genes.

Assume that we want that a specific education has the consequence of property **A**. How can it be compelled and determined? The only possibility is that after instruction to prevent people from transmitting their genes if they do not have property **A**. It would have to be done over several generations. This would be nearly impossible.

Of course, many people believe that a specific education has the consequence **A**. To ensure this claim, it has to be proved, but I believe that this is impossible. One reason is that perhaps it is wrong.

In any case, education is not necessary to explain any property.

Of course, humans are social beings. Children must be raised by adults, in the safety of a group.

---

\*49 (0)421 591777, volker@thuerey.de

They learn a lot from grownups. The best example is the language.

Most statements are only personal views. Naturally, I can not prove them.

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I thank Bouchra Ben Zahir for a careful reading as well as Rüdiger Rehberg and Arne Thürey for support.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# PhET Simulation Instruction and its Effects on Students' Motivation to Learn Physics

*Patrick Agyei, Moses Abdullai Abukari, Philip Dorsah, Thomas Nipielim Tindan,  
Abel Nyimba Najah & Isaac Azumah Gonyalug  
Peki Senior High Technical School, Peki, Ghana*

## ABSTRACT

The study investigated the effect of Physics Education Technology (PhET) simulated instruction on students' motivation to learn electricity concepts in physics. Questionnaire for Students' Motivation Towards Science Learning (SMTSL) was used to assess Senior High School students' motivation to learn electricity concepts after they were taught in a demonstrative classroom and an exploratory classroom using the Physics Education Technology (PhET) simulation instruction. Sequential explanatory mixed methods design was used. The sample consisted of sixty-three (63) first-year Senior High School Science students. Posttest scores revealed that students' motivation to learn electricity concepts significantly increased after they were taught electricity concepts with the PhET interactive simulation in both demonstrative classroom ( $M = 3.26$ ;  $SD = 0.29$ ) and exploratory classroom ( $M = 3.38$ ;  $SD = 0.15$ ). It was also found that the mean scores of students on all the motivation scales such as: self-efficacy, physics learning value, learning environment stimulation and active learning strategy, increased significantly except performance goal which recorded a lower mean after using the PhET simulation to teach.

**Keywords:** demonstrative instruction, electricity concepts, exploratory instruction, interactive instruction, motivation, PhET simulated instruction.

**Classification:** LCC Code: LB1028.3

**Language:** English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Patrick Agyei, Moses Abdullai Abukari, Philip Dorsah, Thomas Nipielim Tindan, Abel Nyimba Najah & Isaac Azumah Gonyalug. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# PhET Simulation Instruction and its Effects on Students' Motivation to Learn Physics

Patrick Agyei<sup>α</sup>, Moses Abdullai Abukari<sup>σ</sup>, Philip Dorsah<sup>ρ</sup>, Thomas Nipielim Tindan<sup>ω</sup>,  
Abel Nyimba Najah<sup>‡</sup> & Isaac Azumah Gonyalug<sup>§</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*The study investigated the effect of Physics Education Technology (PhET) simulation instruction on students' motivation to learn electricity concepts in physics. Questionnaire for Students' Motivation Towards Science Learning (SMTSL) was used to assess Senior High School students' motivation to learn electricity concepts after they were taught in a demonstrative classroom and an exploratory classroom using the Physics Education Technology (PhET) simulation instruction. Sequential explanatory mixed methods design was used. The sample consisted of sixty-three (63) first-year Senior High School Science students. Posttest scores revealed that students' motivation to learn electricity concepts significantly increased after they were taught electricity concepts with the PhET interactive simulation in both demonstrative classroom ( $M = 3.26$ ;  $SD = 0.29$ ) and exploratory classroom ( $M = 3.38$ ;  $SD = 0.15$ ). It was also found that the mean scores of students on all the motivation scales such as: self-efficacy, physics learning value, learning environment stimulation and active learning strategy, increased significantly except performance goal which recorded a lower mean after using the PhET simulation to teach. It is recommended that teachers should use the PhET simulation as an instructional resource for teaching electricity concepts since it has the potential to increase students' motivation to learn physics.*

**Keywords:** demonstrative instruction, electricity concepts, exploratory instruction, interactive instruction, motivation, PhET simulated instruction.

**Author α:** Peki Senior High Technical School, P. O. Box 97, Peki, Ghana.

**σ ρ ω:** C. K. Tedam University of Technology and Applied Sciences, Navrongo, Ghana.

**‡:** St. Charles Minor Seminary Senior High School, P. O. Box 175, Tamale, Ghana.

**§:** Bagabaga College of Education, Ghana.

**Funding:** The authors received no funding for this research work.

**Declarations:** We declare no competing interest.

## I. INTRODUCTION

Concepts learned in physics significantly impact society because they are frequently used in several scientific and technological advancements (MoE, 2010). For this reason, one of the objectives of the Senior High School physics programme in Ghana as stipulated in the 2010 Physics syllabus is to encourage and maintain students' enthusiasm in physics as a practical tool for societal change (MoE, 2010, p. ii). Attainment of such an objective means physics concepts must be taught in ways that are able to sustain and maintain students' interest in the subject (Antwi & Sakyi-Hagan, 2015; Wieman et al., 2010). In the classroom, the use of relevant instructional resources to support the teaching learning process significantly impacts students' performance and maintain their interest in learning concepts taught (Adebayo & Adigun, 2018). An instructional resource that has been proven by research in the 21st century to help encourage and maintain students' enthusiasm towards learning is the use of interactive simulations such as the PhET simulation (Antwi & Sakyi-Hagan, 2015; Strayer, 2016; Agyei et al., 2019; Rehman et al., 2021).

“Interactive simulations” are “computer-generated dynamic models which include

animations, visualisations and interactive laboratory experiences that present theoretical or simplified models of real-world components, phenomena, or processes” (Bell & Smetana, 2008). Simulations have also been proven to give real life view of theoretical concepts, motivate and sustain learners’ interest and makes students active participants during the teaching-learning process (Antwi & Sakyi-Hagan, 2015; Wieman et al., 2010). Simulating situations increases students’ interest and encourages engagement through the use of role-play in the simulation environment and also develops in students critical thinking (Rahmawati et. al., 2022). This suggests that simulation has the potential to motivate learners towards learning concepts taught in the classroom.

Notwithstanding, students’ performance in physics in the external examination organised by the West African Examination Council for Senior High School students in Ghana have been below average over the years (WAEC, 2015; 2016; 2017; 2018; 2019; 2020; 2021). The report by the Physics Chief Examiner showed that students’ continually show weaknesses on questions drawn from electricity concepts (WAEC, 2015; 2017; 2018; 2019; 2020; 2021) which could account for their low performance as students who try to answer such questions are unable to provide the required answer expected by the examiner. The examiner highlighted incorrect explanation, lack of understanding and application of physics concepts as the causes of students’ low performance. In addition to these factors, research has also indicated availability and adequacy of instructional materials (Fatoki et. al., 2021), lack of understanding and application of mathematical skills in solving physics problem (Tuminaro & Redish, 2004; Semela, 2010) as well as lack of reference materials, laboratory equipment, and interest in the subject (Mekonnen, 2014) as plausible causes of students’ low performance in the physics. This suggests that the use of relevant teaching-learning resources influences students’ motivation which will in turn improve their performance (Lalley et. al., 2010).

Interestingly, the National Curriculum Framework of Ghana (MoE, 2018) entreats the

teacher to use relevant instructional materials that will help the learner in learning. The Education Strategic plan 2018 – 2030 also highlights the application of technology as relevant teaching-learning tool (MoE, 2018). The ICT Education policy has also recommended ICT to be used as a pedagogical tool (MoE, 2018). One of the technological tools that has the efficacy to influence learning of physics is the use of computer simulations (Wang et. al., 2010).

The study specifically sought to answer the research question; What are the motivational behaviours of students in learning electricity concepts when taught with the PhET simulations in a demonstrative classroom and in an exploratory classroom?

## II. LITERATURE REVIEW

### 2.1 Theoretical Framework

The constructivist theory is one of the theories mostly used with regards to technology assisted lessons on students’ learning outcomes (Agyei, et al., 2019; Rehman et al., 2021; Antwi & Sakyi-Hagan, 2015). The engagement theory propounded by Kearsley and Shneiderman, (1998) also supports technology assisted lessons (Marshall, 2007; Mensah, 2019). The engagement theory like the constructivist also emphasised a teaching methodology which has students at the core of affairs and this makes the theory have similar features to the constructivist theory and for that reason, suitable to be employed as the study’s theoretical underpinning.

“The engagement theory is a framework for technology-based teaching, whose fundamental underlying principle is that students must be meaningfully engaged in learning activities through interaction with others and worthwhile activities” (Kearsley & Shneiderman, 1998). Also, proponents of this theory are of the view that learners’ engagement can be facilitated using technology as a teaching tool. These theorists implore teachers to have lessons that are activity oriented in order to help students apply creative and innovative ideas to solve problems. Also, these activities should be motivating and interesting to students and they believe that

technology has the potential of creating such interesting learning opportunities.

The engagement theory also emphasises the integration of activities that promote meaningful students' learning such as students learning in groups to solve problems. This theory according to the proponents has three major parts which when put together, enhances meaningful learning by students. The components are "relate, create and donate" (Kearsley & Shneiderman, 1998). The first component which is "the relate component emphasises team efforts that involve communication, planning, management and social skills". By working in teams, students cooperate and collaborate to bring out ideas towards understanding concepts being taught since cooperativeness facilitates improvements in teaching and learning of physics (Agyei et. al., 2019).

The second component which is "the create component" involves making the teaching and learning activity creative and innovative. Under this component, the realisation of the real-life application of concepts that are taught are made known to the learner and this has the propensity of making learning more motivating and interesting to students. The PhET simulation has been proven to have the potential to offer such real-life scenarios to learners (Bell & Smetana, 2008).

The donate component of the engagement theory also emphasise the essence of making useful contributions while learning. This motivates students to learn due to their active involvement in the series of activities that go on in the classroom (Kearsley & Shneiderman, 1998).

The "engagement theory" served as the underlying theoretical underpinning of this study. Also, this theory was used since it emphasises students collaborative work as well as using technology as an instructional tool to actively engage students.

## *2.2 Impact of Computer Simulations on the Motivation of Students*

According to Schunk et. al. (2014), "motivation is the process whereby goal-directed activity is

instigated and sustained". This means that motivation provides the desire that encourages an individual to try and accomplish a task in order to become successful. Motivation serves as the basis for gaining understanding of scientific concepts due its significance in improving students' concept formation (Albalate et. al., 2018). Studies have shown that students' learning of science (physics) is highly influenced by their motivation. According to Albalate et. al. (2018), without motivation, students' learning will be basically by rote memorization which will in turn lead to inadequate understanding of scientific concepts. To Spandana et. al. (2020), motivation has the inherent effect of inspiring and increasing students' interest towards science (physics) learning. Also, students who are motivated to learn have better learning outcomes than their counterparts with low motivation (Zimmerman & Schunk, 2008).

Past studies have explored how the application of computer simulations influenced students' learning. A study done by Prima et. al. (2018) on the topic "Learning Solar System using PhET Simulation to Improve Students' Understanding and Motivation" explored how the use of the PhET simulation will enhance learner's understanding and motivate the learners to learn solar system concepts. According to the study's findings, students who learned about the solar system with simulation as a teaching tool improved on conceptual knowledge and motivation more than students who learned about the same thing without simulation. The study further revealed a moderate correlation between students' conceptual understanding and motivation towards learning solar system concepts.

In another study, Manao et. al. (2020) explored how PhET simulation used with experiments increased students' motivation. The study found that PhET interactive simulation combined with experiments significantly increased students' motivation. The study further revealed that the PhET interactive simulation created an enjoyable and conducive learning environment which accounted for the increased students' motivation. Furthermore, Susilawati et. al. (2022) examined how the PhET simulation could be used to

enhance students' motivation and problem-solving skills. The study revealed that there was a significant gain in students' problem-solving skills and motivation with the use of the PhET interactive simulation as a teaching and learning resource. All these suggest that the use of the interactive PhET simulation in teaching physics concepts significantly improves students' motivation.

### 2.3 The Students Motivation Towards Science Learning (SMTSL)

Studies have been conducted using the SMTSL to determine students' motivation towards specific content areas in science (physics, biology, chemistry). A study conducted by Spandana et. al. (2020) used videos and quizzes to determine students' motivation towards science (physical science and biology concepts) using the SMTSL developed by Tuan et. al. (2005). The study revealed that significant changes were observed in learners' motivation on the concepts taught with active learning strategy having the highest mean and performance goal having the lowest mean. In another study done by Albalate et. al. (2018), the researchers investigated the motivation of STEM university students towards science learning using the SMTSL. It was observed that all students scored higher on all the domains of the SMTSL questionnaire except performance goal which attained a lower score. Achievement goal attained the highest mean score followed by active learning strategies with performance goal attaining the lowest mean score which suggest that students are motivated to learn for their own sake and not to compete with friends and also to impress the teacher during the teaching-learning process.

Furthermore, Dermatsaki et. al. (2012) adapted the SMTSL in the "Greek language to determine students' motivation towards physics learning". The aim of the study was to test the factorial structure of the SMTSL in order to "provide information on the reliability and structural validity of the SMTSL in different cultural contexts" with emphasis on physics learning. The results of the study showed that the items on the SMTSL questionnaire were reliable and valid. The researchers further recommended that to use the

"SMTSL in different cultural contexts, a rewording of some of the items might be needed".

SMTSL is useful for determining motivation in subject-specific content areas, a predictor of attitude towards learning and performance with the items being reliable to determine students' motivation towards physics learning in different cultural contexts and grade levels. This makes the SMTSL questionnaire appropriate to be adapted for the current research which sought to determine students' motivation on learning electricity concepts in physics.

## III. METHODOLOGY

### 3.1 Research Design

The study employed the explanatory sequential mixed methods design. In this approach, researchers collect quantitative data first, analyse the data and then use qualitative data to give a detailed explanation to the quantitative results obtained (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). This approach to research is considered to be explanatory since it uses qualitative data to explain quantitative results and its sequential nature is based on the fact that quantitative data is collected before a qualitative data (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). The collected data was analysed quantitatively. After this analysis, the researcher interviewed a sample of the students to help understand why there was a decrease in the mean score on performance goal.

### 3.2 Participants for the Study

The participants were first-year Senior High School science students selected from two Senior High Schools in the South Dayi district of the Volta region of Ghana. The two schools were identified as School A and School B for purposes of anonymity. The sample size consisted of sixty-three (63) students, 32 from school A and 31 from school B. Students in School A were taught with the PhET simulation through demonstration by the teacher. Students in School B were taught with the PhET simulation in an exploratory manner where students had the opportunity to explore the PhET themselves in the computer

laboratory. All lessons were taught under the guidance of the physics teacher.

### 3.3 Data Collection Instruments and Procedure

The Students' Motivation Towards Science Learning (SMTSL) questionnaire was adapted for the study. The questionnaire was first developed by Tuan, Chin and Shieh, (2005). The questionnaire has thirty-five (35) items with six (6) subscales on a five point Likert scale. The subscales/dimensions are self-efficacy, active learning learning strategies, science learning value, performance goal, achievement goal and learning environment stimulation.

According to Tuan et. al. (2005), the questionnaire is useful when a researcher is interested in determining students' motivation in a particular content area of a subject since students show different motivational traits in different content areas. This makes the use of the SMTSL questionnaire relevant in this current study.

The six subscales on the SMTSL questionnaire measure students' motivation for learning science (Bawaneh & Moumene, 2020). The scales on the questionnaire are described below:

- Self-efficacy involves the learners' perceptions on their own capabilities to do well on classroom learning activities;
- Active learning strategies deals with the participatory position of the learner during classroom activities which requires the learner to apply comprehended knowledge to solve learning problems;
- Science learning value requires learners to comprehend the invaluable impact of science in daily life which will in turn lead to the arousal of students' interest in learning. This brings about the use of creative and innovative strategies such as inquiry, problem-solving and critical thinking which the student will apply to learning situations;
- Performance goal deals with the learner's rationale to take part in class activities. Among such rationale include being seen as an academically good student by the learner's peers and teachers and also to obtain higher marks on test activities in the classroom;

- Achievement goal deals with the learners' inherent characteristic to feel happy and fulfilled when able to solve a learning problem. This inherent characteristic has the tendency to arouse students' interest to learn;
- Learning environment stimulation deals with the use of activities capable of sustaining students' interest in learning. This includes the use of instructional resources such as interactive simulations which are able to create a lively classroom atmosphere for learning to occur (Tuan et. al., 2005, p. 643).

The original test items have an overall Cronbach alpha ( $\alpha$ ) reliability coefficient of 0.89. The Cronbach alpha ( $\alpha$ ) reliability coefficient of the questionnaire items in this study was 0.88 which implies that the items were reliable (Creswell & Creswell, 2018).

To obtain qualitative information on students' motivation, the researcher used a semi-structured interview to obtain in-depth information on students' views of the PhET simulation assisted lessons on their motivation to learn electricity concepts.

## IV. DATA ANALYSIS

The study employed both descriptive and inferential statistics to analyse quantitative data while content analysis was used to analyse the qualitative data obtained through the interview. Means and standard deviations were used to ascertain students' motivation before and after they were taught electricity concepts with the PhET interactive simulation. Independent sample t-test and paired sample t-test at a confidence level of 95% were used to compare students' motivations before and after teaching with the PhET in both demonstrative and exploratory lessons.

The students' motivation mean scores were categorised based on a criterion adopted from Ofori and Dampson (2012) cited by Akoto-Baako (2020). A mean score of 1.00 – 1.99 denotes low motivation, 2.00 – 2.99 denotes a moderate motivation and 3.00 – 3.99 denotes a high motivation.

## V. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1 presents the mean scores and standard deviations on the motivation constructs for students in schools A and B.

**Table 1:** Mean Score of Students in School A, and B on the Motivation Constructs Before the Intervention

Motivation Construct	School A N = 32		School B N = 31	
	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>
Self-efficacy	2.66	0.40	2.89	0.19
Active Learning Strategy	2.60	0.30	2.65	0.26
Physics Learning Value	2.77	0.75	2.34	0.30
Performance Goal	2.87	0.67	2.79	0.34
Achievement Goal	2.38	0.35	2.27	0.41
Learning Environment Stimulation	2.71	0.60	2.16	0.16
Overall motivation	2.67	0.19	2.52	0.13

The overall motivation mean score for School A ( $M = 2.67$ ,  $SD = 0.19$ ) and that of School B ( $M = 2.52$ ,  $SD = 0.13$ ) showed that students in both schools have moderate motivation before the intervention. It could also be observed that performance goal had the highest score on students' motivation before the intervention ( $M = 2.87$ ,  $SD = 0.67$ ) while learning environment had minimal influence on students' motivation in School B ( $M = 2.16$ ,  $SD = 0.16$ ). All the constructs moderately influenced students' motivation to learn electricity concepts in physics. The higher mean score for performance goal could suggest that students' rationale for learning physics concepts could be to obtain higher scores on tests,

to impress the teacher and also to be seen as smart students. The low mean score for learning environment ( $M = 2.16$ ,  $SD = 0.13$ ) could imply that students do not find the physics learning environment (classroom) to be interesting and interactive.

To ascertain students' level of motivation towards physics (electricity concepts) after being taught with the PhET interactive simulation, motivation means scores for both schools were computed.

Table 2 showed the mean scores of students on the various motivation constructs after the intervention for Schools A and B.

**Table 2:** Mean Scores of students in School A, and B on the Motivation Constructs After the Intervention

Motivation Construct	School A N = 32		School B N = 31	
	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>
Self-efficacy	3.44	0.35	3.58	0.17
Active Learning Strategy	3.37	0.37	3.52	0.26

Physics Learning Value	3.47	0.35	3.50	0.34
Performance Goal	2.46	0.45	2.27	0.36
Achievement Goal	3.28	0.43	3.58	0.25
Learning Environment Stimulation	3.55	0.45	3.83	0.19
Overall motivation	3.26	0.29	3.38	0.15

The overall motivation means of 3.26 for School A and 3.38 for School B indicates a high motivation. This means that students' motivation on electricity concepts increased after being taught the concepts using the simulation in either a demonstrative classroom or in an exploratory laboratory.

To ascertain whether mean scores for the two schools differ significantly or not, an independent sample t-test was performed and the result presented in Table 3.

**Table 3:** Independent Sample t-test on Motivation Construct for Schools A and B

School	N	M	SD	t	df	P
A	32	3.26	0.29	1.994	61	0.051
B	31	3.38	0.15			

The t-test results in Table 3 showed that there was no statistically significant difference in the mean scores of students in Schools A (M = 3.26, SD = 0.29) and B (M = 3.38, SD = 0.15),  $t(61) = 1.994$ ,  $p = 0.051$ . This implies that when the PhET interactive simulation is used in teaching electricity concepts either in a demonstrative classroom or in an exploratory classroom, it has

the potential to sustain students' interest and motivate them to learn the concepts taught.

Also, to ascertain whether there was significant difference in the mean scores between the pretest and posttest scores, a paired sample t-test was performed for all the two schools and the results shown in Table 4.

**Table 4:** Paired sample t-test of students in Schools A and B on the Motivation Pre-Questionnaire and Post-Questionnaire

School	N		M	SD	T	df	P	$\eta^2$
A	32	Pretest	2.67	0.19	10.399	31	0.000	0.777
		Posttest	3.26	0.29				
B	31	Pretest	2.52	0.13	19.850	30	0.000	0.933
		Posttest	3.38	0.15				

The results showed that there was a statistically significant difference in the mean scores between the pretest (M = 2.67, SD = 0.19) and posttest scores (M = 3.26, SD = 0.29) for School A,  $t(31) = 10.399$ ,  $p = 0.000$ . Again, there was a statistically significant difference in the mean scores between the pretest (M = 2.52, SD = 0.13) and posttest

scores (M = 3.38, SD = 0.15) for school B,  $t(30) = 19.850$ ,  $p = 0.000$ .

The effect size was computed to be 0.777 for School A and 0.933 for School B. This indicates a large variation between the pretest and posttest scores and suggests that students' motivation to learn electricity concepts increased when they

were taught the concepts either in a demonstrative classroom or in an exploratory classroom.

## VI. DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

Findings from the study revealed that before the use of the interactive simulation in teaching electricity concepts, students' motivation to learn electricity concepts was moderate for both schools. On the motivation subscales, students in school A had a higher mean score on performance goal ( $M = 2.87$ ,  $SD = 0.67$ ) and students in school B had a higher score on self-efficacy ( $M = 2.89$ ,  $SD = 0.19$ ) followed by performance goal ( $M = 2.79$ ,  $SD = 0.34$ ) before the intervention. However, after teaching electricity concepts using the PhET interactive simulation, students' motivation significantly increased for School A ( $M = 3.26$ ,  $SD = 0.29$ ) and School B ( $M = 3.38$ ,  $SD = 0.15$ ). This finding corroborates with previous studies (Prima et. al., 2018; Manao et. al., 2022; Susilawati et. al., 2022) who found that the use of the interactive PhET simulation in teaching physics concepts led to an increase in students' motivation from a lower level to a higher level. It was also found that the mean scores of students on all the motivation scales increased significantly except performance goal which recorded a lower mean for both School A ( $M = 2.46$ ,  $SD = 0.45$ ) and School B ( $M = 2.27$ ,  $SD = 0.36$ ) after using the PhET simulation to teach. This finding was in line with the studies conducted by Spandana et. al. (2020) and Albalate et. al. (2018) who also observed that performance goal recorded the lowest mean score after students have been taught with PhET simulation which implies that students now feel motivated to learn not just to impress the teacher but for their own personal gains. However, there was no significant difference in students' motivation towards electricity concepts taught with the PhET simulation in a demonstrative classroom and in an exploratory classroom as revealed by the independent sample t-test analysis. This suggests that teachers can use the PhET simulation to motivate students to learn electricity concepts in a demonstrative classroom if a computer laboratory is not available for use. Again, it was found that learning environment stimulation recorded the highest mean score for

both schools after the intervention. However, School B recorded a higher mean score on this scale than School A. This finding corroborates with the findings of Agyei (2019), Agyei and Agyei (2021) who indicated that students in the exploratory classroom had access to computers with the simulations installed on them which made their lessons livelier than those who had it in the demonstrative classroom.

Also, in order to find out why students' mean score on performance goal dropped after being taught electricity concepts with the PhET simulation, three students were randomly selected from each school and interviewed to gain more understanding concerning the results obtained. All the students interviewed mentioned that they participated in the lesson from the beginning to the end. When the students were asked why they participated in all the lessons taught with the PhET simulation, they gave the following responses:

*S1: I participated in the lesson because this was the first time I have seen physics being taught in a computer laboratory or doing physics on a computer. I always think the computers are meant for ICT lessons.*

*S2: I joined the lesson every time because I became curious on the first day that we had the lesson with the thing (referring to PhET simulation) and so I wanted to learn more from it.*

*S3: I was very happy we were learning physics with a projector and also how I could just visualise circuit symbols. I don't think I will forget these circuit symbols because you click on the component and it changes to its symbol and a click brings it back to the original component.*

Students' reasons for participating in the study were reasons personal to them and not because they have to attend the physics class. Students were also asked whether their reason for participating in the lesson was hinged on impressing the teacher or having higher scores than their friends. Below are some of the responses given by students.

*S4: Sir, you can find out from my friends, they will tell you I am a punctual student and I attend all classes. We have always been told when resistors are in parallel, the current is shared among them and I have been thinking about how it is shared. But from this lesson I saw with my own eyes how the moving current divided when it got to the junction. I was more curious about seeing this because I know when I understand I can do well in class.*

*S5: I know I perform better than some of my friends and some also do well than me. What I was more concerned with was trying to build different circuits to see which of the bulbs will give a brighter light.*

*S6: As for me, I always want to understand things so that I can explain in my own way. Sir, I know you are not going to be here with us all the time so I want to understand the thing well.*

Students did not particularly join the lesson to impress the teacher or have better marks than their friends. Students were more concerned with their achievement goal more than their performance goal. The researcher further finds out from students whether they enjoyed the lesson taught with the PhET simulation and would also like to have more physics lessons. Below are some of the responses given by the students.

*S7: The lesson was very interesting and I really enjoyed it. I wish we always learn with this tool (referring to the PhET simulation).*

*S8: I really enjoyed the lesson because I was able to create my own circuits. To me, I would like to have more lessons with the PhET.*

*S9: The lesson was fun and interesting because I could see what was happening when you either change the voltage or current in the circuit. I would like to have more physics lessons everyday only when it will be taught with the PhET.*

From students' responses, the interactive PhET simulation was interesting and fun learning with

it. They further highlighted that they will enjoy other physics lessons when those lessons are also taught with the PhET simulation. The responses given by respondents suggest why there was a drop in students' performance goal after the intervention and the rest of the motivation constructs attaining a higher mean score.

## VII. CONCLUSION

It was revealed by the study that the PhET interactive simulation improved students' motivation towards studying electricity concepts. There was a statistically significant difference between students' motivation before the intervention and after they were taught the concepts with the PhET for both schools. Particularly, no significant difference was observed between the motivation of learners towards studying electricity concepts for students taught in a demonstrative classroom and those taught in an exploratory classroom. Also, performance goal scale of motivation recorded a higher mean score before the intervention than after the intervention. Interview data revealed that students' motivation towards learning electricity concepts was hinged on their achievement goal. This suggests that the PhET interactive simulation offers the affordances of increasing students' motivation towards physics learning (Prima et. al., 2018; Manao et. al., 2022; Susilawati et. al., 2022).

## VIII. RECOMMENDATION

It is therefore recommended that stakeholders in education should include the PhET simulation in the physics curriculum as an instructional resource for teaching electricity concepts since it has the potential to increase students' motivation towards learning physics concepts. Again, the government and other stakeholders must make efforts to provide projectors to schools so that physics teachers who want to teach electricity concepts can use the PhET simulation in a demonstrative manner to teach since using the PhET interactive simulation in the demonstrative classroom also improved students' motivation.

*Competing Interest*

The authors have no competing interest to declare.

## REFERENCES

1. Adebayo, O. O., & Adigun, S. Q. (2018). Impact Of Instructional Aids on Students' Academic Performance in Physics in Secondary Schools in Federal Capital Territory (FCT) Abuja, Nigeria. *European Scientific Journal*, 14(4), 366– 376.
2. Agyei, E. D. (2019). *Tracking the development of pre-service teachers' competencies for integrating information and communication technology in the teaching of high school physics in Ghana*. An unpublished Ph.D thesis. University of Free State, Bloemfontein.
3. Agyei, E. D., & Agyei, D. D. (2021). Enhancing Students' Learning of Physics Concepts with Simulation as an Instructional ICT Tool. *European Journal of Interactive Multimedia and Education*, 2(2), e02111. <https://doi.org/10.30935/ejimed/11259>
4. Agyei, E. D., Jita, T., & Jita, L. C. (2019). Examining the effectiveness of simulation-based lessons in improving the teaching of high school physics: Ghanaian pre-service teachers' experiences. *Journal of Baltic Science Education*, 18(6), 816 – 832. <https://doi.org/10.33225/jbse/19.18.816>
5. Akoto-Baako, H. (2020). *Effects of increase enrolment on teachers in senior high schools in Ghana*. An unpublished Ph.D thesis. University of South Africa, South Africa.
6. Albalate, A. R., Larcia, H. D., Jaen, J. A., Pangan, K. R., & Garing, A. G., (2018). Students' Motivation towards Science Learning (SMTSL) of Stem Students of University of Batangas, Lipa City. *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 1262-1274.
7. Antwi, V., & Sakyi-Hagan, N. (2015). Effect of Computer Assisted Instruction on Students Interests and Attitudes in Learning Electricity and Magnetism in a Ghanaian Senior High School. *International Journal of Innovative Research & Development*, 4(4), 302–315.
8. Bawaneh, A. K. & Moumene, A. B. H. (2020). Flipping the Classroom for Optimizing Undergraduate Students' Motivation and Understanding of Medical Physics Concepts. *EURASIA Journal of Mathematics, Science and Technology Education*, 16(11), 1 – 16. <https://doi.org/10.29333/ejmste/8561>
9. Bell, R. L., & Smetana, L. K. (2008). Using Computer Simulations to Enhance Science Teaching and Learning. In L. R. Bell, J. Gess-Newsome, & J. Luft (Eds.), *Technology in the secondary science classroom* (pp. 23–32). National Science Teachers Association Press.
10. Creswell, J. W. & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). California: SAGE Publications, Inc.
11. Dermitzaki, I., Stavroussi, P., Vavougiou, D., & Kotsis, K. T. (2012). Adaptation of the Students' Motivation Towards Science Learning (SMTSL) questionnaire in the Greek language. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*. DOI 10.1007/s10212-012-0138-1
12. Fatoki, J. O., Iornyagh, P. & Ochedikwu, J. O. (2021). Assessment of Availability and Adequacy of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) Facilities in Teaching and Learning of Physics among Technical Schools in Benue State, Nigeria. *VillageMath Educational Review (VER)*, 2(1), 14 - 22. <https://ngsme.villagemath.net/journals/ver/v2i1/fatoki-oiornyagh-ochedikwu>
13. Kearsley, G., & Shneiderman, B. (1998). Engagement Theory: A Framework for Technology-Based Teaching and Learning. *Educational Technology*, 38(5), 20-23. Retrieved from [www.jstor.org/stable/44428478](http://www.jstor.org/stable/44428478).
14. Lalley, J. P., Piotrowski, P. S., Battaglia, B., Brophy, K., & Chugh, K. (2010). A comparison of V-Frog to physical frog dissection. *International Journal of Environmental and Science Education*, (5)2, 189 – 200.
15. Manao, G. R. S., Lumbantobing, S. S., & Faradiba, M. S. (2020). Increasing Learning Motivation Through the Application of Physics Education Technologies Combined with Experiments. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 560, 245 – 249.

16. Marshall, S. (2007). Engagement Theory, WebCT, and academic writing in Australia. *International Journal of Education and Development using Information and Communication Technology*, 3(2), 109 - 115.
17. McLeod, S. (2014). Simply Psychology. Retrieved from [www.simplypsychology.org/interviews.html](http://www.simplypsychology.org/interviews.html).
18. Mekonnen, S. (2014). Problems Challenging the Academic Performance of Physics Students in Higher Governmental Institutions in the Case of Arbaminch, Wolayita Sodo, Hawassa and Dilla Universities. *Natural Science*, 6, 362-375. <http://dx.doi.org/10.4236/ns.2014.65037>.
19. Mensah, J. Y. (2019). *The effect of ICT integration on senior high students' motivation and achievement in geometry: the case of Gomoa West District*. Unpublished master's thesis, University of Education, Winneba.
20. Ministry of Education (2018). *National Pre-Tertiary Education Curriculum Framework*. National Council for Curriculum and Assessment. Accra.
21. Ministry of Education, (2010). *Teaching syllabus for physics*. Curriculum Research and Development Division. Accra.
22. Ofori, E. & Dampson, W. A. (2012). *Doing quantitative research analysis using SPSS*. Kumasi: Empree Press.
23. Prima, E. C., Putri, A. R., & Rustaman, N. (2018). Learning Solar System using PhET Simulation to Improve Students' Understanding and Motivation. *Journal of Science Learning*. 1(2), 60-70.
24. Rahmawati, Y., Zulhipri, Hartanto, O., Falani, I., & Iriyadi, D. (2022). Students' conceptual understanding in chemistry learning using PhET interactive simulations. *Journal of Technology and Science Education*, 12(2), 303-326. <https://doi.org/10.3926/jotse.1597>
25. Rehman, N., Mahmood, A., Zhang, W., & Alam, F. (2021). Teaching physics with interactive computer simulation at secondary level. *Brazilian Journal of Technology and Society*, 14(1), 127-141. <https://doi.org/10.14571/brajets.v14.n1.127-141>.
26. Salikha, U. A., Sholihin, H., & Winarno, N. (2021). The influence of STEM project-based learning on students' motivation in heat transfer learning. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1806 (1), 012222.
27. Schunk, D.H., Pintrich, P.R & Meece, J. (2014). *Motivation in education: Theory, research and applications*. (pp. 1-5). Boston: Pearson
28. Semela, T. (2010). Who is joining physics and why? Factors influencing the choice of physics among Ethiopian university students. *International Journal of Environmental & Science Education*, 5 (3), 319 – 340.
29. Spandana, B., Rani, R. N., & Devi, S. S. (2020). Students' Motivation towards Science Learning (SMTSL) - An Intervention with Video and Quizzes. *Current Journal of Applied Science and Technology*. 39(4): 85-91.
30. Strayer, J. F. (2016). Designing Instruction for Flipped Classrooms. *Instructional-design theories and models: The Learner-centered paradigm of education*, 4, 321-349.
31. Susilawati, A., Yusrizal, Y., Halim, A., Syukri, M., Khaldun, I., & Susanna, S. (2022). The Effect of Using Physics Education Technology (PhET) Simulation Media to Enhance Students' Motivation and Problem-Solving Skills in Learning Physics. *Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation*, 8(3), 1157-1167. <https://doi.org/10.29303/jppipa.v8i3.1571>.
32. Tuan, H. L., Chin, C. C. & Shieh, S. H. (2005) The development of a questionnaire to measure students' motivation towards science learning. *International Journal of Science Education*, 27(6), 639-654. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0950069042000323737>.
33. Tuminaro, J. & Redish, E. F. (2004). Understanding students' poor performance on mathematical problem solving in physics. *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 720, 113 – 116. <https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1807267>.
34. WAEC (2015). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.
35. WAEC (2016). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.

36. WAEC (2017). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.
37. WAEC (2018). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.
38. WAEC (2019). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.
39. WAEC (2020). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.
40. WAEC (2021). *Résumé of Science Subjects*. WAEC Press.
41. Wang, F., Kinzie, M. B., McGuire, P., & Pan, E. (2010). Applying technology to inquiry-based learning in early childhood education. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 37(5), 381-389.
42. Wieman, C. E., Adams, W. K., Loeblein, P., & Perkins, K. K. (2010). Teaching physics using PhET simulations. *The Physics Teacher*, 48(4), 225-227.
43. Zimmerman, B. J., & Schunk, D. H. (2008). *Motivation: An essential dimension of self-regulated learning*. In D. H. Schunk & B. J. Zimmerman (Eds.), *Motivation and self-regulated learning. Theory, research and applications* (pp. 1–30). New York: Lawrence: Erlbaum.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Postmodernity, the Dark Ages

*Ecilana Luiza de Menezes Vieira*

## ABSTRACT

The history of humanity is a process marked by several stages. After these historical steps are thoroughly analyzed and observed they receive an inscription according to their respective characteristics. At postmodernity would not be different, despite its starting, already has deep marks that will be forever etched. It discussed one of them their main features that way more specifically. The suppression of objective values and the emergence of subjective values.

*Keywords:* postmodernity; objective values; subjective values; history.

*Classification:* LCC Code: B831.3

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0





# Postmodernity, the Dark Ages

Ecilana Luiza de Menezes Vieira

## ABSTRACT

*The history of humanity is a process marked by several stages. After these historical steps are thoroughly analyzed and observed they receive an inscription according to their respective characteristics. At postmodernity would not be different, despite its starting, already has deep marks that will be forever etched. It discussed one of them their main features that way more specifically. The suppression of objective values and the emergence of subjective values.*

**Keywords:** postmodernity; objective values; subjective values; history.

## I. DARKNESS

### 1.1 Philosophical and Religious Concept

The word darkness comes from the Latin *Tenebrae*, darkness. This term is often used with a religious connotation to refer to evil. In the sacred texts, several passages allude to this. Darkness in a certain biblical verse refers to chaos or disorder “In the beginning God created the heaven and the earth. And the earth was without form, and void; and darkness was upon the face of the deep. And the Spirit of God moved upon the face of the waters.” (*King James Version*, Gen 1:1-2) (emphasis added).

The reason they are used as synonyms may be because evil and darkness provoke a feeling of unfamiliarity in humans and consequently radiate a sense of helplessness. Something dangerously negative that is, however, veiled. The evil or misfortunes in human life do not have a manual on how to function, the problem of evil is an obscure field that human being cannot decipher. These resembles the sense of darkness.

That is why word evil, and darkness are so close in literature, as both denote or describe misunderstood circumstances or problems and

indicate something that is out of order. For example, diseases, miseries, and injustices from the human perspective are evil, as they indicate abnormalities, they are seen as an accident during existence that, to try to explain, not only religious people but also philosophers have focused on the subject.

Greek mythology at first explained evil as the distancing of men from the gods.

At that epoch myths were the principal source of explanation of the world. Later, pre-Socratic naturalists, to elucidate the origin of everything, already made another approach to reality. It was in this context, according to Peixoto, that the Greeks began to see the world “as a field of opposing forces interacting and manifesting their becoming character”: light and darkness, hot and cold, white and black, sweet and bitter, good and evil and other things. Such opposing forces would be in constant dispute for space. These disputes would be responsible for alternating between disorder and order.

### 1.2 Scientific Concept

In the scientific concept, darkness commonly symbolizes retrogression and priority. The clearest example to understand the use of this term is to observe the nickname “Dark Ages” used for the first time among the humanists of the 17th century. The term describes a kind of obscurity that plagued the European continent from the fifth to the fifteenth century. At that epoch, according to them, ignorance and superstition were prevalent in all aspects of human beings.

Enlightenment intellectuals made such a statement when comparing above mentioned period with the previous period, the Ancient Age. For them, antiquity was responsible for the formation of powerful empires whose cultural legacy is still remarkable today, such as

philosophy, theater, and the Olympic Games, among others.

The dark ages, on contrary, were predominantly dominated by superstitions and legends.

## II. POSTMODERNITY

There is consensus that the postmodern period began after the second world war. In other words, we are inaugurating a new Era whose foundations are gradually becoming sedimented. Despite being an era inaugurated recently, there are already several important and impactful events that distance the current period from its previous ones not in years, but in centuries of advances.

An example of this advance is the technological era in which we live. There has never been a period of history like this one. Since the advent of the first computer, created after the Second World War, until the present day, a very accelerated advance can be seen. There are more and more computerized devices connected to a huge structure of networks that connect nations from East to West that exchange precise and instantaneous information. Never has an individual had so much access to information. It is undeniable that although this is quite common during everyday life, this would be impossible for older generations to imagine it.

In addition, there is the medical breakthrough. Life expectancy has increased, disease diagnoses are more accurate, and treatments are more accessible. Compared to previous periods, today has more resources for a patient to achieve a cure or at least to live with the disease in the most appropriate way possible. Thanks to surgical procedures, medicine has worked miracles.

Above all, advances in entertainment. Technology has given new air to the film industry, the seventh art. Cinema does not only rely on great interpretations, now counts together with computerized special effects that awaken the most varied feelings in the viewer and make possible inconceivable achievements. Through technology, the spectacular scenes of history have become possible, such as the biblical scene of the Red Sea parting, or huge wooden horse described by

Homer in the Trojan War, the Leviathan of Greek mythology, etc.

However, just as the postmodern era differs from its predecessors in technology, it also differs in other respects. Today, in its eagerness to promote a new society, at all costs, it has played a leading role in dark moments in human history. Postmodernity has sheltered ideas that are not very compatible or that have harmed human behavior. That's because he wants to break with the past, that includes the pillars of humanity, the moral values that governed humanity for centuries.

Ever since ancient times, philosophers and religious thinkers representing various attitudes in different cultures have been searching for the truth regarding moral values, attempting to find criteria for what is right, and what constitutes good advice. They have described the virtues of human character at length and suggested these be acquired. They have created a heritage containing centuries of experience and reflection. In spite of the obvious differences of originating cultures and attitudes, even though they worked in widely divergent times and places, the similarity, or complementary nature, of the conclusions reached by famous ancient philosophers are striking. It demonstrates that whatever is valuable is conditioned and caused by the laws of nature acting upon the personalities of both individual human beings and collective societies. (LOBACZEWSKI)

Pluralism and relativism would be the new pillars to build a more tolerant society where respect predominates. According to Shapiro, this tolerance is founded on "live and let live" or "if it makes you feel good, do it" sums up Hedonism. That word came from the Greek Hedon which means pleasure. Felicity has always been the goal of life since the dawn of humanity, but that happiness proposed by the hedonistic view causes a degeneration in the human spirit. Thanks to the pursuit of pleasure without responsibility or any intrinsic value, pleasure is pursued without a virtuous or austere basis, which brings some regrets.

In the relationship of postmodernity, there is no space for commitment or altruism, only space for self-interest. Thanks to hedonism, society has developed an egotism that consists of imposing a vision of the world highly and excessively endowed with personal feelings and instincts on the real world, which became a tool to destroy the true meaning of life. In other words, actions pursued by individuals have as the sole purpose of personal satisfaction. Consequently, preventing concepts such as dignity from being known and cultivated, generating instead of this the objectification of human beings.

### III. AGE OF DARKNESS

Once in the 90's a pastor made the following statement during his sermon "I believe we're going into the darkest days that humanity has ever known. So dark they'll make the dark ages look like mid-day" (Leonard Ravenhill). As already mentioned above term darkness refers to something negative, to retrogression. In an honest analysis, it is unfair to attribute the title "Dark Ages" to the medieval world when it forged Western civilization. In medieval universities, debates took place whose transcendental, relevant, and central characters debated yet today.

Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274), famous medieval theologian, studied ontological questions (study of being), questions about reason and faith, angels, etc. Saint Anselm devoted himself to themes such as the existence of a superior being and wrote treatises and dialogue whose object was the truth. Such deeply profound themes were repeatedly debated during the "Dark Ages".

On the other hand, currently, academic debates revolve around purely ideological and partisan issues. They are instruments of power disputes. Discussions have meager levels linked to identity and collectivism, in fact, two movements whose gears are based on resentment and revanchism. Debates do not bring anything to light. They are darker than ever, as they are channeled into personal offenses, causing simple conflicts of ideas to lead to the ostracism of the opponent and his definitive exclusion from the debate. The

prevailing climate is one of intolerance and discord.

The main reason for the drop in performance and the rise of darkness or ignorance was caused by the abolition of man as a thinking being. In other words, what is most valuable in human beings was taken away from them, this moment only became possible when the objective foundations and the truth became secondary to the debate. From then on, the space was occupied by ideological conclusions reproduced by easily manipulated inactive minds. When there is an absence of clarity, stability, and firmness, the emptying of thinking, criticality, and cognition predominates. This opens the door to incompetence, ignorance, darkness, and evil.

In the present century the logical and objective foundation for interpreting reality has been rejected, and relativism has been accepted. It consists of despising anything whose value is absolute or of fixed nature. Subtly, relativism destroys facts and replaces them with interpretations, which is why some authors also call postmodernity the post-truth era. Truth has no intrinsic value it is up to the individual to decide its importance or irrelevance.

According to Roger Kimball, relativism has assumed the role of religion in the West and has inaugurated a wave of authoritarianism never seen in history. According to Roger Kimball, relativism appears to be tolerance and freedom, it seems to bend the rigidity of rules that were once inflexible, but in practice it tends to defend discretion and arbitrariness, not based on any law, but on simple utopia or personal desire. In the name of "tolerance" a large part of society is coerced to annul its convictions to become subservient to the will of others. Since then, a climate of hostility and intolerance has been growing. Therefore, there is no incentive to respect but a promotion of discrimination, especially to cultures based on absolute values.

From 1950 onwards, the Frankfurt school leads and develops this subject. With a severely critical stance towards the hegemonic culture, virtuous life and traditional values began to be criticized,

and delinquency and addictions became means to oppose. Mostly, moral values became subjective in these contexts. Therefore, today's highly sexualized and lust-numbered society are the effects of that era.

This movement gained more strength in the 1960s. The view of the followers of the hippie movement, which led this new lifestyle, is that the evils of that time were caused by the capitalist system and traditional family values. From then on, the hippie movement would defend an alternative way of life and worldview, mainly seeking to establish a new pattern of behavior. Based on that, they would solve any problems related to that time. Despite the movement having gained thousands of supporters and fervently preaching against wars and defending peace and love, the group, however, did not overshadow the tragedies after World War II.

This movement gained more strength in the 1960s. The view of the followers of the hippie movement is that evil at present were caused by the capitalist system and traditional family values. From then on, the hippie movement would defend an alternative way of life and worldview, mainly seeking to establish a new pattern of behavior. Based on that, they would solve any problems related to that time. Despite the movement having gained thousands of supporters and fervently protesting wars and defending peace and love, the group, however, did not overshadow the tragedies after World War II.

After the Second War, several tyrannical regimes emerged with extreme violence as their main characteristic. For this, they relied on a very sophisticated and discreet method, however, with relevant effects that made tragedies, genocides, and massacres carried out by the regime legitimate. Therefore, tyranny is stronger than ever in postmodernity. It seems unbelievable or impossible, however, it has a cause: Relativism.

*“If relativism signifies contempt for fixed categories and [for] men who claim to be bearers of an external objective truth, then there is nothing more relativistic than fascist attitudes”.* (Benito Mussolini).

Revolutionary regimes provoked great massacres like Pol Plot and his revolutionary group did in Cambodia by exterminating 1.5 million people in just four years, or the communist Regime of Mao Tse Tung that killed in masse from 50 to 80 million people in China. Such revolutions took place in different parts of the world and aimed to overthrow the current political, economic, and even cultural system with a new system whose foundations are ideals (ideologies) that sought to solve real problems, but without real or objective solutions, but utopian ones.

Polish psychiatrist Andrew Lobaczewski wrote the book Ponerology: Psychopaths in Power, in which he recounts his experience studying in Poland when it was dominated by communists. Ponerology in Greek means evil, and Ponerology in this case means the study of evil. The term Ponerology was coined by him to intended to designate a science that consisted of studying how the evil (whose trace was dominant in the leaders of the newly communist Poland) worked or works in its complex structure. Lobaczewski explains why so many psychopaths occupy key positions and how their rise was possible.

There have always been psychopaths, men devoid of any guilt or compassion, but the current moment seems to favor that they appear with more recurrence. In the general view a psychopath is imagined as one brilliant and creative mind, but in practice this is not the case. Lobaczewski claims that it is the opposite psychopaths in essence are quite mediocre people and do not appear to be anything extraordinary.

What makes them, despite this, still have the strength they have is the fact that society is in unhealthy intellectual and mental conditions, or rather in darkness. The author states that “the cycle of happy and peaceful times favors a narrowing of the worldview and an increase in egotism” (89, 1998). According to him, it is precisely in these times when there is a loss of introspection skills and discernment about the complex laws of life, and at the same time, priority is given to the consumption of what is pleasant and easy.

That generates harmful effects such as the “impoverishment of psychological knowledge, the capacity of differentiating the properties of human nature and personality” (85, 1998). The consequences of intellectual impoverishment are the non-existence of the search for truth and its replacement by truncated information that will lead to a false perception of reality. That's why nowadays, when truths mostly inconvenient have raised on rare occasions, they are cataloged as a sign of rudeness or lack of education.

Therefore, one of the most recurrent arguments in Lobaczewski's study is how the human mind needs to exercise objective parameters, contrary to the assumptions of relativism, to guarantee a healthy development. Therefore, although the modern human being has arrogated to many conquests, he lacks essential elements for maintaining his own existence.

#### IV. FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

The work has not intended to promote reactionaryism. The title post modernity dark ages seek to bring a veiled issue: there is an intellectual crisis in postmodernity, and it stands as the reason for the instability that humanity's lives. Current advances do not overcome occasional setbacks that have always lived, though today have grown exponentially. In the last centuries, there were also dark moments, but the current moments seem to be even darker.

Monarchical absolutism, for example, led to bloody episodes but with damage attenuated by universal absolute principles and values. But with the repeal of absolute principles and values, postmodernity opens disorder in all aspects. Today the power is in the hands of people with an extremely fragile intellect and psychology who rule entire nations with highly concentrated power.

Therefore, this power is highly destructive and harmful to the human spirit are indomitable because the tools, principles, criteria, and values that curb tyrannical behavior have been taken away from them. There is no absolute law, no

restrictions on abusive practices, Totalitarianism, therefore, is free, light, and loose.

#### REFERENCE

1. Lobaczewski, Andrew M. (1998) “Political Ponerology: A Science on The Nature of Evil Adjusted for Political Purposes.” New York: University of New York, P.85, 89.
2. The Book of Absolutes: A Critique of Relativism and a Defense of Universals, by William Gairdner; McGill-Queens University Press.
3. Kimball, Roger. (2009). “Introduction: The dictatorship of relativism. The New Criterion. <https://newcriterion.com/issues/2009/1/introduction-the-dictatorship-ofrelativism>.
4. PEIXOTO, M. C. D. Reflexões sobre a origem do mal na antigüidade grega. Revista Brasileira de Estudos Políticos, Belo Horizonte, MG, v. 91, p. 77-107, 2005.
5. Shapiro, Ben. (2013).“Porn Generation: How Social Liberalism Is Corrupting Our Future”. Editora Regnery, Washington, D.C. P. 40.

*This page is intentionally left blank*



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Perceived Effect of Practice on Secondary School Chemistry Students: The Case Study of Selected Schools in the Ovia North East Local Government Area, Edo State, Nigeria

*Kennedy Imasuen & Stanley O. Ebuwa*

*University of Benin*

## ABSTRACT

This study investigated the perceived effect of practical senior secondary school students' performance in chemistry: the case study of selected schools in Ovia North East Local government area, Edo state. To achieve this, three research questions were raised. The study design was quasi-experimental, using pre-test and post-test approaches. The study population consisted of all public senior secondary schools in the Ovia North East Local Government, Edo State, while the study sample size was 400 students drawn from the twenty-seven (27) public senior secondary schools in the local government area. Simple random sampling techniques were used to select fourteen schools representing fifty percent. Purposive sampling was used to determine 400 students from the fourteen schools. The instrument for the study was an achievement test drawn from past questions from the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) and the National Examinations Council (NECO).

*Keywords:* chemistry, practical, predictor, science, performance.

*Classification:* LCC Code: LB1585

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Kennedy Imasuen & Stanley O. Ebuwa. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# Perceived Effect of Practice on Secondary School Chemistry Students: The Case Study of Selected Schools in the Ovia North East Local Government Area, Edo State, Nigeria

Kennedy Imasuen<sup>α</sup> & Stanley O. Ebuwa<sup>σ</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*This study investigated the perceived effect of practical senior secondary school students' performance in chemistry: the case study of selected schools in Ovia North East Local government area, Edo state. To achieve this, three research questions were raised. The study design was quasi-experimental, using pre-test and post-test approaches. The study population consisted of all public senior secondary schools in the Ovia North East Local Government, Edo State, while the study sample size was 400 students drawn from the twenty-seven (27) public senior secondary schools in the local government area. Simple random sampling techniques were used to select fourteen schools representing fifty percent. Purposive sampling was used to determine 400 students from the fourteen schools. The instrument for the study was an achievement test drawn from past questions from the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) and the National Examinations Council (NECO). Two teachers of Chemistry and three Measurement and Evaluation experts validated the test items. The reliability of the instrument was checked using the Kuder-Richardson formula 20 reliability statistics and gave an index of 0.89. The collected data were analyzed using the mean and standard deviation, the t-test, and two-way analysis of variance.*

*The result that emanated from the study revealed that senior secondary school students who were taught Chemistry with practicals performed better than those who were trained without practicals. It accounted for about 63.9% of student's learning of Chemistry, teaching*

*Chemistry with practicals had a significant effect on the performance of senior secondary school students in Chemistry, as it contributed about 63.9% of students' learning of Chemistry, and that there was no significant difference between male and female students exposed to teaching Chemistry with practicals and those without. That is, sex was not a determining factor in student' performance in Chemistry practices. It was recommended that teachers use more practical work during teaching and learning Chemistry in secondary schools and that chemistry teachers undergo intensive continuing education in practical work management and recent research to improve their practices.*

**Keywords:** chemistry, practical, predictor, science, performance.

**Author α:** Institute of Education, University of Benin, Nigeria.

**σ:** ICTU Department, University of Benin, Nigeria.

## I. INTRODUCTION

Chemistry is the branch of pure science that deals with the study of the composition, properties of matter, its uses, changes, and the laws and principles that govern these changes (Ebbing, 1996). It is one of the subjects offered all over the world including, Nigeria. It is an integral part of what is called science and an active and continuously growing science that is of vital importance for the world as a whole, both in the field of nature and the realm of society (Anaso, 2010). Chemistry is the science that has the most direct and dramatic impact on us and the science that shapes the world in which we live. Therefore,

student performance in the subject is a significant concern for any developing country (Khan et al., 2011). The uniqueness of Chemistry and the role it should play in the development of any nation is not seen in the students' performance. Around the world, student academic performance and achievement in science have shown a decline. For example, in the United States of America (USA), this decline over the years prompted the focus and urgency of school reform efforts for science education (Mupanduki, 2009). Hofstein (2004) reported that this decline led to a new era of science education reform where both the content and pedagogy of science were being examined and new standards were emerging aimed at shaping meaningful science education. Student performance in Chemistry in Nigeria has also been poor and unimpressive. (Anasod, 2010).

Over the years, some authors have argued that science cannot be meaningful to students without valuable hands-on experiences or hands-on experiences in the school laboratory (Hofstein et al., 2007). This means that experiences in the school setting should make students to interact with materials to observe and understand the natural world. Practical brings about practice which are designed and conducted to engage students individually or in small groups, (a method called a class experiment), or in large group demonstration settings (known as teacher demonstration methods).

Since chemistry is a practical science, the teaching and learning of chemistry must include practices. Practicals on chemistry is an essential part of effective science education, and science educators have suggested that there are such benefits to learning through the use of laboratory activities (Millar, 2009). Anaso (2010) reported that lack of chemistry practicals by chemistry students resulted in poor student communication and poor observation skills, leading to poor student performance. For Dillon (2008), quality chemistry practices help develop students' understanding of scientific processes and concepts, hence the substantial investment made in the provision and equipment of chemistry laboratories in secondary schools.

Achimugu (2012) described the goal of practical activities in Chemistry as helping students develop scientific process skills such as observing, classifying, predicting, measuring, drawing, recording data, and hypothesizing, which promotes the development of scientific attitudes such as objectivity, honesty, curiosity, patience and open-mindedness'. Chemistry labs are an essential feature of senior secondary school science education. Therefore, a large proportion of high school chemistry class time is devoted to labs that are presumed to lead to distinctive student achievement (Abraham & Millar, 2008). According to them, some science educators have questioned its effectiveness as a teaching and learning strategy. However, this has yet to be thoroughly studied in Nigeria. While the hands-on (practicals) approach is generally effective in getting students to do things with objects and materials, it is considered ineffective in developing their conceptual understanding of associated scientific ideas and concepts. In countries such as the UK, a tradition of chemistry practicals in school chemistry teaching is seen by teachers and scientists as fundamental to the attractiveness and effectiveness of chemistry learning (Abraham & Millar, 2008). Although many science teachers believe that students' chemistry practicals lead to better knowledge and, indeed, better education; things are better understood and remembered quickly and easily, if done by individuals and thus promote effective understanding (Millar, 2009).

Instruction in Chemistry is carried out through practical and theoretical work. Practicals are mainly done as student experiments in the lab and the teacher demonstration either in the lab or in the classroom, while theory is often done in the school (Twoli, 2006). Wellington (1998) describes Chemistry practicals as teacher demonstrations or class experiments in which all students perform similar tasks, working in small groups or experiment circles with small groups of students engaged in different activities, rotating on the carousel. In senior secondary school, laboratory activities are designed and conducted to engage students individually or in small groups (student experiments) and large group demonstration

settings (teacher demonstrations) (Hofstein et al, 2007). The successful learning of Chemistry depends partly on the correct use of a teaching method whose activities address most of the learning senses. Twoli (2006) opined that chemistry is a subject that encourages "hands-on" experiences, hence more practice-oriented modes of instruction should be selected. Science practicals are a very prominent feature of school science in many countries, and a large proportion of class time is devoted to them. Thus, it is a feature of the school's science curriculum. For example, the West African Examination Council (WAEC) syllabus had over the years recommended that the teaching of all science subjects listed in the syllabus should be practically based. After several decades of emphasizing the assumed importance of practicals in science teaching and learning, the importance became elevated to the level of a dogma (Abimbola, 1994).

Poor performance in Chemistry is not unique to Nigerian secondary school students. In the Caribbean, for example, the biggest challenge facing science teachers and researchers is low achievement in science subjects among senior secondary school students (high school students). A review of the high school certification examination results in Biology, Chemistry, and Physics had fallen below 50% in these science subjects (Ogunkola & Fayombo, 2009). Similarly, International Studies of Educational Performance revealed that students in the United States of America consistently rank near the bottom in science and mathematics (Rutherford & Ahlgren, 1991), an indication of poor performance in these subjects. In general, chemistry has been a prerequisite subject for offering science-oriented courses in tertiary institutions (Ava & Odomwonyi-Out, 2011).

Teaching Chemistry with practice has continued to help achieve meaningful learning and increase student interest in Chemistry (Okeke, 2019). Several studies have been conducted to reinforce the benefits of teaching chemistry with practical. Okeke (2011) found that using a hands-on approach has always helped students score highly in the theory part of Chemistry. For their part, Oloyede (2010) and Okeke (2015) found that

students score low in the theoretical aspect of Chemistry using the conventional (traditional) teaching method. They attributed this low performance to the inability of the students to find a link between the skills learned in the practical class with the theoretical teaching of Chemistry. For his part, Usamani (2011) observed that students with practical orientation/experience were more likely to perform better than those with limited practical skills.

While chemistry is supposed to be necessary for students, some studies have shown that boys and girls differ in their perception of the practical approach. For example, Trumper (2006) opined that boys and girls of the same age tend to have different attitudes toward similar teaching styles in Practical Chemistry. However, Kibirige and Tsamago (2013) showed that the attitude of boys and girls towards science when similar methods were used in Chemistry teaching was not different. However, Okeke (2019) showed that there was a significant difference between male and female students in Chemistry practices. The result also revealed that the girls showed more interest in the practicals than the boys.

## II. PROBLEM STATEMENT

The development of a scientific base in a country depends mainly on the application of Chemistry, and Nigeria is not an exception. The teaching of Chemistry will be complete if not done with practicals. A cursory look at the performance of students in Chemistry over the years showed a downward trend even in the enrolment and performance of Chemistry. Chemistry is taught as a theoretical subject in the classroom; the laboratory where it is supposed to be is not properly utilized. Students recorded low skill acquisition and poor performance in Chemistry despite the fact that it plays an important role in the economic and technological advancement of a nation. This poor or inadequate performance of students in Chemistry may be attributed to the fact that teachers teaching Chemistry do not give adequate attention to practical activities. Could this be why students are failing and running away from Chemistry? If Chemistry is introduced with a

practical orientation, will it increase students' performance? This is the crux of the study.

### III. RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1. Do secondary school students learning Chemistry using a practical approach perform better than those teaching without practicals?
2. Does teaching Chemistry with a practical approach affect student performance in Chemistry?
3. Is there a significant difference in the performance of boys and girls who are exposed to the teaching of Chemistry with practical and those who are not?

### IV. METHODS

The study was a survey that adopted quasi-experimental, using pre-test and post-test designs. This design was adequate for the study because the performance in Chemistry of the group of students who integrated the Chemistry practicals (experimental group) was compared with those in Chemistry of the group taught without practices (control group). In both groups, a pre-test and a post-test were used to determine the performance of the groups before and after treatment. The study population consisted of twenty - seven (27) public senior secondary schools in the Ovia North East Local Government Area, Edo State. The study sample size was 400, while simple random sampling technique was used to select fourteen schools representing fifty percent. Purposive sampling was used to

determine 400 students from the fourteen schools.

The instrument for the study was an achievement test, with questions drawn from the West African Examinations Council (WAEC) and the National Examinations Council (NECO). The questions were administered to both groups. In group one (control group), 200 students from seven (7) schools were selected, and from the remaining seven (7) schools, another 200 students were chosen to constitute the experimental group. Both were previously pre-tested. Subsequently, the control group was taught using the conventional method, while the experimental group was led using the practical. Both groups were post-test. The test consisted of 20 items based on "Qualitative and volumetric analysis." This topic was chosen because it is usually taught as part of the work scheme of the three Higher Secondary students.

The validity of the test items was conducted by two Chemistry teachers and three Measurement and Evaluation experts. Some of the items were restructured and corrected before the instrument was produced. The reliability of the instrument was determined using the Kuder-Richardson formula 20 reliability statistics and gave an index of 0.89. The researcher assisted by the Chemistry teachers in the schools sampled, helped to administer the test. They also help in marking. The collected data were analyzed using the mean and standard deviation, the independent sample t-test, and the two-way analysis of variance.

### V. RESULTS

*Table 1:* Mean and standard deviation of the performance of Secondary School students in Chemistry

Learning Chemistry	N	Mean	Standard deviation	Mean difference
With practicals	200	31.28	4.48	3.34
Without practical	200	27.94	3.60	

Table 1 shows the mean and standard deviation of the performance of Secondary School students in Chemistry as 31.28 and 27.94 for those taught with practicals and those without practicals, with a mean difference of 3.34 in favor of those

students taught with practicals. This implies that students taught Chemistry with practicals performed better than those taught without practicals.

*Table 2:* Analysis of variance of the effect of Chemistry practical on the learning of Chemistry

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	1110.771	3	370.257	110.065	0.000
Intercept	161411.250	1	161411.250	47981.94	0.000
Chemistry Learning	1084.050	1	1084.050	322.250	0.000
Error	3328.916	398	8.364		
Total	175540.000	400			
Corrected Total	4439.686	399			

*R Squared = 650 (Adjusted R Squared = 0.639)*

Table 2 shows an F value of 322.250 and a p-value of 0.000. This implies a significant effect of practicals on the teaching and learning of Chemistry ( $p < 0.05$ ). The adjusted R square of

0.639 indicated that the practical approach in the teaching and learning of Chemistry contributed about 63.9% to the total variance of students' knowledge of Chemistry.

*Table 3:* Mean and standard deviation of the performance of Secondary School male and female students that are exposed to the teaching of Chemistry with practicals and those without

Chemistry learning	Sex	N	Mean	Standard deviation
Without practical	Male	124	26.86	3.41
	Female	76	26.28	3.91
	Total	200	26.64	3.60
With practical	Male	124	31.19	4.66
	Female	76	31.44	4.23
	Total	200	31.28	4.48
Total	Male	248	29.02	4.61
	Female	152	28.86	4.81
	Total	400	28.96	4.68

Table 3 shows the mean and standard deviation of public Secondary School students that were exposed to the teaching of Chemistry with practical and those without as 26.86 and 3.41; 26.28 and 3.91; 31.19 and 4.66; and 31.28 and 4.48 for male and female students respectively.

Table 4: Analysis of variance of the effect of sex on the learning of Chemistry

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	1110.771	3	370.257	110.065	0.000
Intercept	161411.250	1	161411.250	47981.94	0.000
Chemistry Learning	1084.050	1	1084.050	322.250	0.000
Sex	1.309	1	1.309	0.389	0.533
Chemistry learning * Sex	8.109	1	8.109	2.411	0.121
Error	3328.916	398	8.364		
Total	175540.000	400			
Corrected Total	4439.686	399			

Table 4 shows an F value of 0.389 and a p-value of 0.533. This implies that there was no significant difference between male and female students exposed to Chemistry teaching with practicals and those without ( $p > 0.05$ ). Table 4 also revealed that sex was not a determining factor in students' performance in Chemistry ( $F_{0.05,1,398} = 2.411$ ;  $p = 0.121$ ).

## VI. DISCUSSION OF THE FINDINGS

The study revealed that senior secondary school students who were taught Chemistry with practicals performed better than those taught without practicals. This indicated a significant difference between the two categories of students. Employing the use of practicals in the teaching Chemistry to students, aids to increase students' interest in Chemistry (Okeke, 2019). This led to a significant difference between those taught Chemistry with practicals and those without practicals, which was observed in this study. This confirmed previous studies by Millar (2004) and Usmani (2011).

Another finding from the study, was that teaching Chemistry with practicals had a significant effect on the performance of senior secondary school students in Chemistry. It accounted for about 63.9% of the total variance of student knowledge in Chemistry. Using practicals in the teaching of Chemistry according to Achimugu (2012), offers

various opportunities to students, such as: handling chemicals safely and with confidence, gaining skills such as observing, classifying, predicting, measuring, and recording data, and also helping students develop scientific attitudes such as objectivity, curiosity, patience, and open-mindedness. This was in tandem with Hofstein (2004), Okeke (2011), and Oloyede (2011).

The study also showed no significant difference between male and female students exposed to chemistry teaching with practicals and those without. That is, sex was not a determining factor in students; performance in Chemistry practicals. This was in line with Kibirige and Tsamago (2013), who showed that boys' and girls' attitudes towards science were not different, when similar methods were used. It also corroborated the opinion of Trumper (2006), whose study showed that boys and girls of the same age tend to have different attitudes towards similar teaching styles in Practical Chemistry. But disagree with Okeke (2019), who showed that there was a significant difference between male and female students in Chemistry practicals, with girls showing more interest in practices than boys. The study did not also align with Akpan (2005), who found that gender played a crucial role in determining different attitudes and learning styles, and this impacted differently on individuals. The stereotype of the sexual function to which the

students were linked could influence their performance in both the practical and theoretical aspects of the Chemistry examination. The slight difference in the result of the present study could be attributed to the students' exposure to the same experimental period using the same method. Hence gender could not play a significant role in their assimilation of what they were taught.

## VII. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Chemistry is an essential subject in science, that help in the scientific and technological development of any nation. Therefore, it must be properly taught adequately, so that the student can assimilate it. To achieve this emphasis should be placed on teaching Chemistry using the practical approach as it enhances the knowledge and understanding of students in a better way as compared to teaching Chemistry in a conventional manner (traditional method). The study also showed that when students are exposed to practicals in the learning of Chemistry, it has a positive effect on their performance. Above all, it was observed that regardless of gender (sex), students perform better in Chemistry using the practical approach.

In light of the above, teachers should use more practical work during the teaching and learning of chemistry in secondary schools. Chemistry teachers must undergo intensive in-service training in practical work management and recent research to improve their practices. Public senior secondary schools must have well-equipped laboratories with modern facilities so that students can learn the desired practical skills and underlying theory.

## REFERENCES

1. Abimbola, IO (1994). A critical appraisal of the role of laboratory chemistry practices in science education in Nigeria. *Journal of Curriculum and Instruction*, 4(2), 59-65.
2. Abrahams, I. & Millar, R. (2008). Do Chemistry practices really work? A study of the effectiveness of Chemistry practices as a teaching and learning method in school sciences. *International Journal of Science Education*, 30 (14), 1945 - 1969.
3. Achimugu, L (2012). Strategies for effective completion of practical Chemistry work in Nigerian senior secondary schools. *Journal of the Nigerian Science Teachers Association*, 12(6), 1-9.
4. Akpan USA (2005) *Qualitative analysis issues in SSCE chemistry guide to improve student achievement* , paper presented at a refresher course for secondary chemistry teachers by the Nigerian Chemical Society, Jos Chapter 11-12 November
5. Anaso, JN (2010). *Strategies to improve the performance of Chemistry students at the tertiary level*. Abuja, Nigeria. National Center for Mathematics.
6. Ava, A. and Odomwonyi-Otu (2011). *The challenges of effective teaching of Chemistry: A case study*
7. Dillon, J. (2008). *A review of research on practical science in school* . London: King's College
8. Reflux, DD (1996). *General Chemistry* . Fifth edition. Boston, United States; Houghton Mifflin Company.
9. Hofsein, A. (2004). The laboratory in Chemistry Education: Thirty years of experience with developments, implementation and research. *Chemistry Education Research and Practice* , 5(3), 247-264.
10. Hofstein, A. & Mamlok-Naaman, R. (2007). The laboratory in science teaching: the state of the art. *Research and practice in chemical education* . 8(2), 105-107.
11. Khan, MS, Hussain, s., Ali, R., Majoka, MI, & Ramzan, M. (2011). Effect of the inquiry method on the performance of Chemistry students at the secondary level. *International Journal of Academic Research* . 3(1), 955-959.
12. Kibirige, I. & Tsamago, H. (2013). Performance of learners in physical sciences using laboratory investigations. *International Journal of Educational Sciences* , 5(4): 425-432.
13. Miller, R. (2004). *The role of Chemistry practices in science teaching and learning* . Senior secondary school Science Lab: Role

- and Vision. Washington, DC: National Academy of Sciences.
14. Miller, R. (2009). *Practical Activity Analysis to Evaluate and Improve Effectiveness: The Practical Activity Analysis Inventory (PAAI)*. York: Center for Innovation and Research in Science Education, University of York.
  15. Mupanduki, BT (2009). *The effectiveness of a standards-based integrated chemistry-mathematics curriculum in improving academic achievement in chemistry for senior secondary school students in Southern California*, California, USA: Azusa Pacific University.
  16. Ogunkola, BJ and . Fayombo, GA (2009) Investigating the Combined and Relative Effects of some Student Related Variables on Science Achievement between Secondary School Students in Barbados. *European Journal of Scientific Research*. 37(3), 481-489
  17. Okeke, D.O. (2011). *Effect of mind map teaching strategy on student interest, performance, and retention in upper secondary school Chemistry* . Unpublished doctorate. Thesis, University of Nigeria, Nsukka.
  18. Okeke, D.O. (2015). *Influence of the practice of Chemistry on the interest and performance of students in upper secondary schools* . A paper presented at the 4th South East Academy <sup>Conference</sup> held at Enugu State College of Education (Technical), 9-12 <sup>September</sup> 2015.
  19. Okeke, D.O. (2019). Influence of the practice of Chemistry on the interest and performance of students in upper secondary schools. *Southeast COEASU Teacher Training Magazine*. 3(1), 205-211.
  20. Oloyede, O.I (2010). Improvement of the domain learning acquisition strategy on achievement and self-concept in Senior secondary school Chemistry . *Humanities and Social Sciences Journal* . 5(1), 19-24.
  21. Rutherford , F.J. and Ahlgren , A. (1991) *Science for all Americans* , Oxford University Press.
  22. Trumper, R. (2006). Factors affecting senior secondary school students' interest in biology. *Science Education International* . 17(1) 31-48.
  23. Twoli, N. (2006). *Teaching chemistry in secondary school : a textbook for chemistry teachers in developing countries*. Nairobi: Nehema Publishers.
  24. Usmani, A. (2011). Teaching physics skills A2. Retrieved from <http://www.scrib.com/doc/6469292/teaching-22-physics-practical-skills>.
  25. Wellington, J. (1998). *Practical work in science. It's time for a reassessment* . In J. Wellington (Ed.). *Practical work in school sciences: where to now?* London: Routledge. doi:10.4324/9780203267059.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Approaching and Distancing: Diplomatic and Geopolitical Strategies in Russia and Türkiye Relations

*James Onnig Tamdjian*

*University of São Paulo*

## ABSTRACT

The article intends to contribute to discussions on the foreign policies of Moscow and Ankara focused on their immediate surroundings. Through an analysis of agreements and pacts, it understands how the infrastructure works, ethnic-cultural issues and military aspects are amalgamated in an extremely dynamic scenario since the end of the 20th century. It is in the field of economics that the mainstays of structural problems are found, which has origin in historical rivalries for hegemony in the territory, which is seen here as an expression of power. These disputes are, therefore, very specific forms managed by the diplomacies of countries sensitively guided by the logic of national identities. The result is questions arising whether in the field of international relations there are limits to so many distances and approximations, rivalries and pragmatisms between Turkey and Russia.

*Keywords:* NA

*Classification:* LCC Code: JZ1305

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351

Print ISSN: 2515-5785

Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 James Onnig Tamdjian. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# Approaching and Distancing: Diplomatic and Geopolitical Strategies in Russia and Türkiye Relations

James Onnig Tamdjian

## ABSTRACT

*The article intends to contribute to discussions on the foreign policies of Moscow and Ankara focused on their immediate surroundings. Through an analysis of agreements and pacts, it understands how the infrastructure works, ethnic-cultural issues and military aspects are amalgamated in an extremely dynamic scenario since the end of the 20th century. It is in the field of economics that the mainstays of structural problems are found, which has origin in historical rivalries for hegemony in the territory, which is seen here as an expression of power. These disputes are, therefore, very specific forms managed by the diplomacies of countries sensitively guided by the logic of national identities. The result is questions arising whether in the field of international relations there are limits to so many distances and approximations, rivalries and pragmatisms between Turkey and Russia.*

*Author:* Professor of Geopolitics at the International Relations Research Laboratory at FACAMP - Brazil, Researcher at the Program in Political Economy at the Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo - Brazil.

## I. INTRODUCTION

In recent decades, the acceleration of networks and international flows of goods, people and ideas, has expanded the discussion on the role of National States in the future in a context of intensified sharing of products, wealth and global problems.

A more attentive reading of the current geopolitical framework, where materiality and immateriality ideologies and economies are

amalgamated, aim to a future where the increasing density in the use of territory will lead to intersections of interests in the context of disputes between nations and business corporations.

Obviously, diplomacy can and must work so that peaceful solutions are found and thus any clash of interests is seen as something that can be resolved. However, it is possible to observe that certain strategies of some national states are totally immersed in geopolitical conditions that treat the aspirations of countries as imperative issues for national survival. When disagreements between nations reach this level, diplomacy loses much of its negotiation capacity.

Projects for inter-oceanic and inter-maritime channels, gas pipelines, oil and mineral pipelines, highways and railroads, new maritime routes that were little used before, submarine cables, airports and info-roads create nodal points that involve the interests of large corporations and national states that, in addition to the environment for negotiations and multilateral organizations press to exert influence in large portions of the geographic space.

Understanding the foreign policies of Russia and Turkey is one of the most important and challenging tasks of current geopolitics.

## II. RUSSIAN AND TURKISH EURASIANISMS IN THE CONSTRUCTION OF NATIONAL POLITICAL IDENTITIES

The end of the Cold War (1945-1991) gave rise to the transition in the former planned economy

countries, so-called socialist countries linked to the Soviet Union, to a market economy. This reignited discussions about the possibility of expanding capitalist relations of production. This perspective includes all of Eastern Europe and the gigantic territorial mass represented by the Eurasian dimension of Russia and the former Soviet republics.

They were literally new frontiers for diplomacy and the world economy. In many of these countries, the considerable reserves of raw materials attracted investors and attracted investors and new business conglomerates were born, which are also fundamental for understanding the current geopolitical situation.

For this new reality, it was possible to notice the gradual resumption of discussions on the theses of Halford Mackinder (1861-1947), British professor at the London School of Economics who defended in 1904, at a conference at the Royal Geographical Society, the ideas that became the important article entitled “The Geographical Pivot History”. He supported the view that the existence of the Heartland or Earth-Heart, which would correspond to the centre of Russia and surroundings, once dominated would allow the control of a considerable part of the terrestrial globe. This is how Russia and its surroundings reassumed its position as a global geostrategic pivot.

Due to its hegemonic role, it was in the United States of America that this theme attracted a lot of centrality with an enormous intellectual production on the subject. An example is the work of one of the most influential American scholars, Zbigniew Brzezinski (1928-2017) who in one of his works entitled *The Grand Chessboard: American Primacy and Its Geostrategic Imperatives* says:

*“Eurasia, however, retains its geopolitic importance. Not Only is its western periphery – Europe- still the location of much of the world’s political and economic power, but its eastern region – Asia – has lately become a vital center of economic growth and rising political influence. Hence, the issue of how a globally engaged America copes with the complex Eurasian power*

*relationships – and particularly whether it prevents the emergence of a dominant and antagonistic Eurasian power – remains central to America’s capacity to exercise global primacy”*

In Russia this corollary was called Eurasianism. Prof. Angelo Segrillo in his work – *Occidentalism, Slavophilism and Eurasianism: intellectuals and politicians in search of Russian identity* – points out that in the 19th century western thinkers defended the modernization of Russia by looking at the most industrialized countries in Europe. They denounced human misery and the social tragedy of an archaic and obscurantist Russia. Slavophiles, on the other hand, refuted emphatically characterizing Europe as a decadent civilization.

The conception of a Eurasian Russia prevailed, originating from Slavophilia and contrary to the socio-political model of industrialized Europe. This Russian self-image, as individualized and unique to the rest of the world, survived within the intellectual production of the Communist Party until 1985, when the foundation of Perestroika (economic reformulation) and Glasnost (political opening) were laid.

It was during the Gorbachev Era (1985-1990) that controversial thinkers and commonly associated to the dissident Soviet movement started to expose their ideas with greater amplitude willing to fill the gap left from the socialist thinking. It was the case of the intellectual Lev Gumilev (1912-1992) who through his ethnological approach defended that Eurasia, with emphasis to Russia, had legitimacy to defend its identity which was unique.

In this environment of reformulation of the Russian national thought that emerged the figure of Aleksander Dugin. Since the 1980s he has led several Euroasianist movements. In his work “The Fourth Political Force” he proposes to overcome liberalism, communism and fascism by strengthening the Russian state in opposition to the West and rejecting any system of global governance.

This new Russian Eurasianism began to coexist with a novelty in the foreign policy of the Republic of Turkey that adapted to the new geopolitical conditions of the New World Order anchored in the contradictions and dualities of the country. Secular but with growing influence from Islam, a NATO member with regional power aspirations, an Asian with European ties and pretensions.

In 1985 the English researcher and journalist David Barchard coined the term “neo-Ottomanism” in an article entitled “Turkey and West” published by the Royal Institute International Affairs – Chatam House. He tried to show the extent of Turkish interference in the internal affairs of Cyprus since the 1974 invasion, when the Turkish army took over the northern part of the island, which became the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus.

The use of the term Neo-Ottomanism generates academic debates inside and outside Turkey. Prof. Karabekir Akkoyunlu researcher at the Center for Southeast European Studies at the University of Graz, Austria says in his article “The defeat of the 'real' neo-Ottomanists”:

*In fact, the neo-Ottomanism of President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan and his Justice and Development Party (AKP) is not only intellectually unrelated, but also diametrically opposed to the principles of the original Ottomanists, the nineteenth and early twentieth century proponents of pluralism, constitutionalism and parliamentarism in the Ottoman Empire”.*

The Armenian Genocide in 1915 is proof that it really wasn't like that. Calling neo-Ottomanism the current Turkish geopolitical pretensions is certainly an exaggeration that is based solely and exclusively on the dimensions of the ancient Sublime Porta(1). The Erdogan Era (2002) is definitely marked by the religious conservatism that permeated Kemalist nationalism (2).

### III. AREAS OF INFLUENCE, DIPLOMACY AND GEOPOLITICS: PRAGMATISMS THAT DO NOT ERASE NATIONALISMS

One of the first actions that allows us to understand the importance of diplomacy for the

new geopolitics that was under construction in the post-Cold War era was the creation of the Commonwealth of Independent States – CIS in 1991. It was a political effort to maintain commercial relations between the former Soviet republics now sovereign, which still had very interdependent production chains.

The ambitions of this community to transform itself into a broad and powerful common market have been emptied over time. Its first constituent documents were still undergoing adjustments when the UN had already granted the status of a regional organization with the right to participate in the 1994 General Assembly. After that, the provisional text of the CEI became generic and with reservations in many subjects.

It is interesting to note that in the final text of the CIS statute signed in 1993 is one of the initial marks of Russia's problems with Ukraine. The Ukrainian President, in that time, Leonid Kravchuk (1934-2022) did not sign the document, claiming that he was affronting his country's internal legislation and that he would remain a collaborator of the bloc. Even if initially, this was already a demonstration of Ukrainian nationalist bias.

In that same period, a new character came to figure in this equation. Turkey, a NATO member country, governed at the time by Turgut Ozal (1989-1993), attentive to the geostrategic issues of the Black Sea, was one of the first countries to recognize the constitution and the new Ukrainian government, as well as its territorial integrity. Over the years Turkish-Ukrainian relations have deepened. Bilateral trade and technological exchange grew. Just remember that the Turkish government provided the powerful Bayraktar TB2 drones to the Ukrainian armed forces in the war against Russia and this was done after having provided them to be tested by Azerbaijan against Armenians in Nagorno-Karabakh in 2020 (3).

In addition, Turkish foreign policy played a leading role in multilateral arrangements of global scope during the government of Necmettin Erbakan (1996-1997). Ankara encouraged the creation of the D-8 (Developing 8) Organization

for Economic Cooperation along with Egypt, Iran, Pakistan, Malaysia, Indonesia and Bangladesh, which became a group to discuss alternatives to reduce global disparities and create various cooperation programs.

In few years, the growth of the Turkish economy, in ever greater contact with European and Middle Eastern markets, brought Turkey to the geopolitical scene with intentions of expanding its influence. Between 2001 and 2010, Turkey tripled its trade with Syria, quadrupled with North Africa, quintupled with the countries of the Gulf Cooperation Council (4) - United Arab Emirates, Oman, Bahrain, Qatar, Kuwait, Saudi Arabia and sevenfold with Egypt.

One of the main vectors of this power were the large companies and conglomerates from the most diverse sectors. Builders, weaving, food industries, transport, telecommunications, all expanding their businesses in a framework that allowed the resumption of the term neo-Ottomanism.

In the case of Russia, the conjunctures of the 1990s also played a decisive role. Moscow understood that the diplomatic or geopolitical projection must obligatorily go beyond the CIS agreements. The new Russian leaderships and the emerging oligarchies needed to guarantee their influence in the so-called “near abroad”. Between 1992 and 1993, the documents that gave rise to the Collective Security Treaty Organization were signed, the first arrangement of a military alliance between the former Soviet republics.

Following the 1994 Bucharest Memorandum, which was backed by the United States, United Kingdom and Russia, Ukraine removed physical control of dozens of nuclear weapons, including warheads and tactical devices. The signing of these documents was shrouded in controversy. If, on the one hand, it was another Ukrainian step towards moving away from Russia and its Soviet past, this implied that Kiev signed the NPT – Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons and gave up this strategic path. It is important to remember that operational control of weapons of mass destruction stationed in

Ukraine has always been in the hands of Moscow's high command.

In 1999 the Collective Security Treaty Organization fractured. Azerbaijan has not renewed its membership in the OTSC. Azerbaijani leadership held the Russians responsible for their defeat by the Armenians in the Nagorno–Karabakh (Artsakh to Armenians) conflict that took place between 1988–1994 resulting in the creation of the internationally unrecognized Armenian Republic of Nagorno Karabakh. At that time, the Baku government accused Russia of creating a diplomatic environment that favored the Armenians.

This further pushed Azerbaijan towards a formal military alliance with Turkey, which was the first country to recognize post-Soviet Azerbaijan in 1991, asserting the Turkish ethnic identity that unites the two countries. In 2000, that is, shortly after Azerbaijan withdrew from the OTSC, the Training and Education Center of Armed Forces was created, a military school where the Turkish Armed Forces command began to provide training for Azerbaijani military personnel, including NATO protocols.

Certainly, Turkey's approachment to Azerbaijan and Ukraine generated Russian distrust in the diplomatic field. The most important economic and trade issues deserved a different treatment between Moscow and Ankara. In 1999, for example, the mega project of the Blue Stream gas pipeline was signed. With an approximate cost of US\$ 4 billion, it started operating in 2003 bringing natural gas from Russia, via the Black Sea, to be distributed through Turkish territory, especially to Europe. This is not a simple work. It is a partnership between the powerful Russian company Gazprom and the Turkish company Botas Petroleum.

From a geopolitical point of view, the Russian government understood that its problems with Ukrainians and Turkish were added to the advance of NATO, which was expanding strategic partnerships in its former area of influence in Eastern Europe. Strategically, it was important to ease possible pressures coming from other regions

and borders to concentrate war power on a European front in the event of an eventuality. This thesis proved adequate to the crisis with Ukraine that led to the retaking of Crimea by the Russians in 2014.

In 1996, Russia, China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan committed themselves at a summit meeting in Shanghai to reduce troops at the borders and expand mechanisms of mutual trust in the area of security. The success of this agreement brought Russia and China even closer together, which in 2001 led the formalization of the Shanghai Cooperation Organization. With the rapid adherence of Uzbekistan, the organization began to expand collaboration from energy sources to the modernization of transport and telecommunications. Later, with the accession of India and Pakistan, the gradual construction of a new order in International Relations became more and more explicit, since the members of the Shanghai Summit represented the largest population and the largest area of the globe.

The high point of this process was when, in the same period in 2001, Russia and China signed the Treaty of Cooperation and Good Neighborhood, expanding mutual trust and enabling the execution of large contracts for the supply and management of energy resources between the two countries.

The multifaceted quest to expand partnerships and influence through multilateral agreements has become the world's keynote. Because they have contiguous zones of influence and theoretically are on opposite sides (Turkey has been a member of NATO since 1952), this new diplomatic cartography of Russia and Turkey came to have a different weight in international relations.

From 2003 onwards, in Erdogan Era, in Turkey, the motto "One nation, two states" gained strength to refer to links with Azerbaijan. For Ankara, Azerbaijan is a political and territorial spearhead in its intentions to restore ties with the former Soviet republics of Central Asia, with which it has historical and cultural ties. Diplomatic efforts and multilateral talks that

began in the 1990s allowed Kazakh President Nursultan Nazarbayev to sow the seed in 2006 for what in 2009 would become the Cooperation Council of Turkish-Speaking States, today the Organization of Turkish States. This institution has an agenda ranging from collaboration in the field of technology to discussions on foreign policy. The most recent advance is the project for customs facilitation corridor between the member countries launched in 2022. With a strong presence of Turkish companies, business between Turkey and these countries is already approaching the figure of US\$ 20 billion annually. Furthermore, members admitted the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus as an observer to the organization last year, which is sure to create embarrassment with Greece and the Greek-majority Cypriot government.

The Erdogan-Aliyev partnership has gained even more importance with the current scenario of heightened tensions in the West with Russia, Iran and China. Turkey is undoubtedly Azerbaijan's biggest ally. It is an important "landlocked country"<sup>(5)</sup> that has skillfully managed its availability of energy resources, especially oil and natural gas, in international trade. From the Shah Deniz gas fields in the Azerbaijani Caspian to the Erzurum terminal or the Port of Yumurtalik, both in Turkey, a strong partnership has developed between British Petroleum, SOCAR (State Oil Company Azerbaijan Republic) and the Turkish state TPAO, all shareholders of extensive gas and oil pipelines that span the entire region.

In that period of favorable economic conjunctures, pragmatism in the commercial field, between Russia and Turkey, was present once again in 2010. That year, the agreement was reached which made possible the start of construction of the Akkuyu Nuclear Complex in southwest Turkey, on the shores of the Mediterranean. The project and a good part of the initial investments are in charge of the Russian company Rosatom. Construction was carried out by the Turkish mega-construction company Ozdogu, which also operates in the mineral sector. There will be 4 power generation plants and the project will cost between US\$ 20 and 30 billion.

Since the War in Syria (2011), Ankara – Moscow relations have created yet another different page in geopolitics. For Turkey, Syria has always been a threat to its interests. Former President Hafez Assad's (1971-2000) alignment with the Russians was always a point of tension for NATO during the Cold War.

The civil war that destroyed part of Syrian territory was fueled by the support of foreign intelligence agencies, including the Turkish one, which were trying to get rid of yet another anti-Western leader, in this case, Bashar - Al -Assad. As for the Russians, Syria is a historical ally that allowed, in 1971, the leasing of the Port of Tartus on its Mediterranean coast as a support base for the Russian naval fleet.

After 20 years without strategic-military use, the Port of Tartus region has returned to activity. It was from there that Russia launched the first attacks against jihadist positions in Syria in 2013.

It is important to remember that the Turkish government used the conflict in Syria to try to violently repress the Kurdish people in their libertarian, democratic and feminist struggle in Rojava, Syrian Kurdistan. In 2017 Russia and Syria renewed and expanded the possibilities of using Tartus with projects to expand the berths and facilities.

Between comings and goings Putin and Erdogan met pragmatically once again in 2014. During a visit by Putin to Turkey, the signing of an agreement between the oil companies of both countries was announced. GAZPROM and BOTAS undertook to create the TurkStream, a mega gas pipeline that would connect Krasnodar in Russia to Kiyikoy in Turkey and from there to all of Southeast Europe. The execution of the project was suspended when, in 2015, in the midst of the conflict in Syria, Turkish air defense shot down a Russian Sukoy military plane, generating a serious diplomatic crisis. It was only with the reconciliation in 2016 that the works really took off.

#### IV. THE RECENT EFFORTS FOR PEACEFUL COEXISTENCE AND TURKEY AS A POSSIBLE TRUER OF THE GEOPOLITICAL BALANCE

In 2017 Ankara made one of its highest bets in the geopolitical field. The Turkish government purchased S-400 anti-missile systems from Russia despite being a member of NATO. Retaliation by the United States was not long in coming. Turkey was formally accused of breaking the military alliance pact and for this reason it was suspended from the development program of the ultra-modern F-35 Strike Fighter fighters. This will prevent the country from continuing to participate in the construction of these warplanes and will obviously not receive them when they are ready.

In 2022, Turkey claimed problems maintaining the anti-missile purchase agreement with the Russians due to bureaucratic issues involving its participation in the technological development and production of equipment. This once again opened channels of dialogue with Washington even if momentarily as the dynamics of Turkish and Russian foreign policies could and can change rapidly.

For Russia, the international situation was extremely unfavorable in 2018. The growing tensions and conflicts with Ukraine and the totally adverse international scenario with blockades and sanctions led to a new Russian diplomatic and economic offensive.

That year, the 5<sup>th</sup> Meeting of Heads of State of the Caspian Countries was held in the port of Aktau in Kazakhstan. Russia, Iran, Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan and Turkmenistan have finally begun to close the diplomatic void that has existed over Caspian boundaries and jurisdictions since the dissolution of the Soviet Union in 1991.

Among many resolutions, the prohibition of the military presence of any other country in those waters other than those bathed by the Caspian was defined. It was a clear message from Moscow to the Azerbaijani government of Ilham Aliyev to

allow warships from Turkey, its biggest ally, to navigate the Caspian.

The Aktau agreements in 2018 ended up also generating new expectations in the area of infrastructure. Gas and oil pipelines will finally be able to cross the Caspian at the bottom of its waters, linking its western and eastern banks and more precisely integrating in an even more dynamic way the energy resources coming from Turkmenistan and Kazakhstan.

If Russian demands that there be no alien vessels in the Caspian caused any unease in Ankara, it soon dissipated. It is very likely that most of the new energy sharing and distribution projects that arise will have to be integrated into the Trans-Anatolian Pipeline, known as TANAP and which drains Azerbaijani gas to Europe and is controlled by Turkish investments that will thus benefit.

It is very likely that the most recent movement of pieces on this board that brought Russian and Turkish pieces closer together took place in the last week of February 2023, when the 12th Conference on the Middle East of the Valdai Club was held. This is an important think tank that brings together specialists from the strategic area of Russia and foreign guests. Obviously, the discussion environment was influenced by the Russian-Ukrainian conflict.

One of the subjects of the conference was the project “International North-South Transport Corridor” - INSTC. Conceived since 2002 by Russia, India and Iran, the intermodal transport project aims to connect the Indian Ocean and the Persian Gulf, via Iran, with the Caspian Sea and then Russian territory. The goal of the mega-project is to replace the traditional, long and expensive route between the Port of Saint Petersburg and Mumbai via the Suez Canal. Reduce the current 17,000 km to around 8,000 km using land connections, especially rail and optimizing the use of navigation in the Caspian Sea, the border between Russia and Iran. Enthusiasts even say that it would save 50% in time and 30% in transportation costs.

As a mark of the new phase, in early May 2022, a large Russian freighter anchored in the Port of Noshahr in the Iranian Caspian after decades of absence of this type of vessel in that location. Due to these new opportunities, Russians and Iranians began to project the creation of a special shipyard. As it is a lake-river-sea connection, the vessels that sail there need very specific technical characteristics.

Being an inland sea (or closed sea) the Caspian drains its ships through the Don River, through the Russian southwest until reaching the Volga-Don canals, built in the Soviet era. When these ships arrive on the Volga River they head directly to the Sea of Azov and from there to the Black Sea to the Mediterranean Sea, i.e. an open sea. The Putin government allocated around US\$ 1 billion to modernize and provide more security for navigation on these rivers and canals. Obviously, this expands commercial possibilities for Iran, which is linked to the Russian industrial park, including the war sector.

The ambitions of the United States of America and even NATO in maintaining effective embargoes and sanctions against Russia and Iran may be compromised if these projects to boost navigability linking the Caspian to the Mediterranean help Moscow and Tehran to reduce losses.

If you imagine that Turkey is out of the problem this time, it's necessary to understand it isn't. Ultimately, any projection of power by Russia or Iran into the waters of the Black Sea that the US-led bloc finds threatening will need to rely on Turkey to exert counterpressure or deterrence. It remains to be seen whether Ankara will want to play that role. Perhaps this is not the geopolitical strategy chosen by the most rebellious of NATO members.

## V. CONCLUSION

The paths trodden by the foreign policies and geopolitical ambitions of Russia and Turkey are approaching and overlapping in the territory since the end of the Cold War.

The regional and global geographical space requires special attention from Ankara and Moscow to each other's political, economic and ideological pretensions. Both in the Caucasus and in Central Asia, the possibilities for cooperation are visible and the clashes of interests are worrying, which could intensify conflicts and tensions between the two countries. If they converge in some energy infrastructure projects, they may obviously diverge in others in the future. Due to the dynamics of transformations, relations between Russia and Turkey are on the way to being decisive on a global scale. Their respective interfaces and relations with China and the US have a determining potential in the construction of new international arrangements. Even in the face of economic, social and financial vulnerabilities, Turkey now occupies a central position in international politics and part of this image comes from its proximity to Russian interests. Its mediation in the Russian-Ukrainian War is just one example of what Ankara's foreign policy options can represent. The Eurasian identity, interpreted by each of the two countries with their particularities, is a fundamental element to understand what today seems to be a mutual geopolitical surveillance.

### BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Akkoyunlu, Karabekir - *The defeat of the 'real' neo-Ottomanists*, *Open Democracy*, 2020.
2. Barchard, David - *Turkey and West - Royal Institute International Affairs - Chatam House. Taylor & Francis*, 2023.
3. Bozdaglioglu, Yucel, *Modernity, Identity and Turkey's Foreign Policy*, *Insight Turkey*, 2008, vol. 10, Number 1.
4. Brzezinski, Zbigniew - *The Grand Chessboard: American Primacy and Its Geostrategic Imperatives*, *Basic Book*, 1997, New York.
5. Dugin, Alexander - *Fourth Political Theory*, 2009, *Amfora*, Moscow.
6. Ivanova, Inessa - *Turkey in Central Asia: a Partner or a Rival?* - *Journal RAS - Russian Academy of Science*, Issue 7, 2019.
7. Kapyrin, Igor - *Comunidade dos Estados Independentes: (C.E.I.): estudo introdutório, acordo que institui a C.E.I., carta da C.E.I. e Tratado da União Económica da C.E.I. 1995 - Polis: Revista de Estudos Jurídicos-Políticos - Universidade Lusiana de Lisboa*.
8. Light, Margot - *In search of an identity: Russian foreign policy and the end of ideology*, *Journal of communist studies and transition politics*, vol. 19, 2003, Issue 3.
9. Mackinder, Halford - "The Geographical Pivot History" - [https://www.iwp.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/20131016\\_MackinderTheGeographicalJournal.pdf](https://www.iwp.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/20131016_MackinderTheGeographicalJournal.pdf) acessado em 15 de julho de 2023.
10. Segrillo, Angelo - *Ocidentalismo, Eslavo filismo e Eurasianismo: intelectuais e políticos em busca da identidade russa: Intelectuais e Modernidade*, Editora FGV, 2010, Brasil.

### Footnotes

1. Sublime Porta - term found in diplomatic documents, especially French, between the 18th and 19th centuries to designate the Ottoman Empire. Its origin is in the great gate (bab-i-ali, in Turkish) that gave access to the governing bodies of the empire in Constantinople, today Istanbul. Among the buildings stood the current equivalent of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
2. Kemalism - ideology that refers to the founder of the Turkish Republic, Kemal Ataturk (1881-1938), who promoted a modern and secular state apparatus based on positivist and enlightenment principles. This view brings Turkish nationalism to the decisive role of the armed forces in the country's political reality.
3. Drones over Nagorno-Karabakh: A glimpse at the future of war, Vol. 45, No. 2, *Nieuwe uitdagingen* (2021), pp. 15-20, Joel Postma.
4. <https://www.gcc-sg.org/en-us/Pages/default.aspx>, accessed July 15, 2023.
5. Kishor Uprety, *The Transit Regime for Landlocked States: International Law and Development Perspectives*, (Washington DC: The World Bank, 2006).



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Intersectionality between Politics, Religion, and Gender during the Colombian Peace Plebiscite

*Nayive Castellanos Villamil*

## ABSTRACT

Evangelical activism has used moral repertoires to legitimize or delegitimize nationwide political processes, capitalizing on conservatism anchored in all social strata. The gender approach, the recognition of diverse sexualities and the democratization of rights to marginalized groups have become major annoyances for leaders of the largest Pentecostal and Neo-Pentecostal churches, who see in these issues a great risk for the maintenance of the traditional family, but at the same time, one of the resources to be used in electoral environments, with greater or lesser adherence, according to the interests of the moment. The Colombian plebiscite for peace became one of the scenarios that made the intersectionality between politics, religion, and gender widely visible as one of the cases, among many, in Latin America.

*Keywords:* Evangelical activism; Plebiscite for peace; Gender; Colombia.

*Classification:* LCC Code: JA84.C6

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Nayive Castellanos Villamil. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# Intersectionality between Politics, Religion, and Gender during the Colombian Peace Plebiscite

Interseccionalidade Entre Política, Religião e Gênero Durante o Plebiscito Pela Paz Colombiano

Nayive Castellanos Villamil

## ABSTRACT

*Evangelical activism has used moral repertoires to legitimize or delegitimize nationwide political processes, capitalizing on conservatism anchored in all social strata. The gender approach, the recognition of diverse sexualities and the democratization of rights to marginalized groups have become major annoyances for leaders of the largest Pentecostal and Neo-Pentecostal churches, who see in these issues a great risk for the maintenance of the traditional family, but at the same time, one of the resources to be used in electoral environments, with greater or lesser adherence, according to the interests of the moment. The Colombian plebiscite for peace became one of the scenarios that made the intersectionality between politics, religion, and gender widely visible as one of the cases, among many, in Latin America.*

**Keywords:** Evangelical activism; Plebiscite for peace; Gender; Colombia.

## RESUMO

*O ativismo evangélico tem se valido de repertórios morais para legitimar ou deslegitimar processos políticos de abrangência nacional, capitalizando o ancorado conservadorismo em todas as camadas sociais. O enfoque de gênero, o reconhecimento de sexualidades diversas e a democratização de direitos a grupos marginalizados tornaram-se grandes incômodos para lideranças das maiores igrejas pentecostais e neopentecostais, que veem nesses temas um grande risco para a manutenção da família tradicional, mas, ao mesmo tempo, um dos recursos a serem usados em entornos eleitorais, com maior ou menor*

*aderência, de acordo aos interesses de momento. O plebiscito pela paz colombiano se tornou um dos cenários que mostrou amplamente a interseccionalidade entre política, religião e gênero como um dos casos, dentre vários, na América Latina.*

**Palavras-chave:** Ativismo evangélico; Plebiscito pela paz; Gênero; Colômbia.

## I. INTRODUÇÃO

No século XXI, abordar o fenômeno religioso na América Latina, desde vários campos sociais, torna-se além de necessário um desafio constante, pela heterogeneidade tanto dos agentes, das pautas e das repercussões no âmbito público. Paulatinamente, nesta região, as instituições religiosas e mesmo as práticas individuais têm mostrado que a modernidade se desenvolve junto com o pluralismo religioso, e que crenças e doutrinas ao invés de se confinar meramente ao espaço privado, cada vez ocupam um lugar mais destacado na tomada de decisões que abrangem a sociedade toda.

O cristianismo é a religião com maior filiação na América Latina. Nas últimas décadas, o segmento evangélico disputou os privilégios da Igreja Católica e até conseguiu se posicionar como uma força política, especialmente, em entornos eleitorais e no desenho de políticas públicas relativas à moralidade normativa. Muito tem se passado desde a chegada das primeiras missões pentecostais estadunidenses no século XIX, até a instauração de igrejas locais nos anos 1980, dirigidas por pastores nacionais, que apesar de iniciarem como pequenos locais austeros localizados nas periferias, pouco a pouco foram

construindo capital simbólico, financeiro e político.

Vários desses reduzidos lugares de congregação, além de produzir sujeitos religiosos, formaram sujeitos políticos, com o intuito de conquistar espaços considerados seculares. Com o tempo, essas igrejas conseguiram se tornar não apenas lugares de ampla reunião, com custosas infraestruturas, mas também em instituições religiosas de influência transnacional. Alguns dos aspectos que ajudaram nessa empreitada de crescimento econômico foram a doutrina baseada na Teologia da Prosperidade, que salienta a benção de bens materiais, pelo esforço individual, os dízimos e os benefícios concedidos por parte do Estado, como o não pagamento de impostos, bem como o corporativismo e a venda de bens simbólicos. No campo político, alguns dos pastores mais ativistas, mediante acordos programáticos partidários, ativa participação em entornos eleitorais e campanhas morais, pouco a pouco, conseguiram poder de negociação com a política tradicional e as barganhas necessárias para ocupar instâncias governamentais. É preciso lembrar que segmentos de diversas correntes religiosas são ativos politicamente e que, inclusive, alguns defendem pautas progressistas, porém os mais visíveis e com maior destaque são as lideranças conservadoras de cunho evangélico, pentecostal e neopentecostal.

O conservadorismo ancorado na sociedade, as crises políticas e de representação, bem como os perversos efeitos da avançada neoliberal nas classes menos favorecidas, configuraram cenários propícios para o auge do ativismo político evangélico conservador. A mobilização desses grupos afixou a ponte entre política e instituições religiosas, através da difusão de repertórios morais, tais como a defesa da família tradicional, a rejeição à ampliação de direitos para grupos populacionais não normativos, a recusa do enfoque de gênero e das liberdades sexuais. Esses quesitos são alguns dentre muitos outros, promovidos num contexto de avanço progressista, por parte de movimentos sociais, que favorecem a democratização de direitos a comunidades marginalizadas, o que incomodou a segmentos conservadores.

As lideranças conservadoras das maiores igrejas evangélicas, ora como independentes, ora através de suas organizações políticas ou em aliança com partidos tradicionais, têm influenciado na correlação de forças estatais e inclusive ajudado a definir contendas eleitorais. Um dos casos que representa esse panorama, com semelhanças e diferenças aos já vistos na América Latina, possui como denominador comum a interseccionalidade entre religião, política e moralidade. O plebiscito pela paz na Colômbia, em 2016, evidenciou o impacto dos repertórios morais nesse processo político de abrangência nacional e internacional.

A pergunta inicial que suscita essa questão é de que forma se associou moralidade, enfoque de gênero e o processo de paz colombiano. O que pareceria em princípio difícil de compreender pela aparente distância entre um assunto e outro, foi o que precisamente se tornou o mecanismo de proselitismo para deslegitimar a consulta popular que visava ratificar os acordos de paz perante a sociedade.

Claramente, as circunstâncias, os agentes e os interesses envolvidos nesse processo foram variados, porém destaca-se neste texto as campanhas que empreenderam grupos evangélicos em oposição ao processo de paz. Essa perspectiva permite encontrar contrastes e analisar os contrapontos da agenda programática desse segmento e a forma como se mobilizam de acordo com o contexto e com os interesses do momento.

A controvérsia e conseqüente problema público gerado a partir de visões de mundo transcendentais nos antagonismos políticos, referenciam um dos temas estruturais da política contemporânea que envolve religião, moralidade, sexualidade, gênero e política. Este texto tem como intuito se aproximar a essa discussão a partir da mobilização evangélica durante o plebiscito pela paz, que pautou o gênero, a família e a diversidade sexual, como temas contrários ao bem-estar da sociedade, deixando os acordos como apenas uma estratégia para introduzir um regime sexual na sociedade, considerado adverso às leis naturais. Em decorrência disso, organizaram-se campanhas espalhadas por todo o



Não obstante, perante a importância do que estava em jogo, o presidente da época decidiu buscar essa aprovação via legislativa, aproveitando o apoio que tinha nessa instância.

Essa aprovação indignou ainda mais aos segmentos populacionais que votaram contra o plebiscito, levando-os a prosseguir seus discursos de rejeição até o dia de hoje.

Material de campanha contra o plebiscito



Fonte: MUELLE, 2017, p.188

As negociações de paz suscitaram amplo ativismo pelos interesses que envolviam, e se agudizaram quando esse processo se vinculou à chamada “ideologia de gênero”. Essa relação que em princípio parecia totalmente desconectada, os segmentos conservadores religiosos conseguiram articulá-la com retóricas atreladas à ameaça comunista, ao desaparecimento da família e à deturpação da sociedade pelo fato dessas negociações incluírem a perspectiva de gênero, que, no fundo, tinha como finalidade reconhecer as diversas vítimas do conflito que sofreram violências devido a uma guerra sem limites em todo o território colombiano.

Se gestou uma ampla campanha pelo não aos acordos e ao plebiscito liderada pelo ex-presidente de direita Álvaro Uribe Vélez, à qual se somaram empresários, religiosos e diversas camadas sociais. As lideranças evangélicas juntaram-se com maior afinco quando foi contemplado o enfoque de gênero no texto dos acordos, com a finalidade de ter uma via mais democrática. Não obstante, clivagens partidárias tradicionais se uniram junto com partidos confessionais e legislativos evangélicos ou meramente conservadores para frear os acordos. Inclusive, as

camadas que votaram contra o plebiscito ainda hoje negam reconhecer sua legitimidade.

### III. ATIVISMO EVANGÉLICO CONSERVADOR

No processo político de paz, de longo alcance, intervieram muitos interesses, instituições, tanto domésticas quanto internacionais, bem como diversos agentes. Lideranças das maiores igrejas colombianas como Claudia Rodríguez de Castellanos, senadora e pastora da *Misión Carismática Internacional*, MCI, bem como John Milton Rodríguez pastor e presidente do atual partido cristão *Colombia Justa Libres*, CJL, e Marco Fidel Ramírez, senador que se auto nomeia defensor da família tradicional, entre outros, aderiram e atizaram a campanha de deslegitimação dos acordos já empreendida pelas camadas conservadoras e apoiadoras do ex-presidente Uribe.

Essas lideranças participaram ativamente dos diálogos de paz, especialmente, quando foi inserido o enfoque de gênero nos textos dos acordos. Esses acordos buscavam a inclusão das múltiplas vítimas como princípio para uma transformação democrática. A pastora Claudia

Rodríguez foi das primeiras a exigir que de inserir esse enfoque, este deveria contemplar apenas às mulheres que sofreram no conflito armado, mas de jeito nenhum à população LGBTQIA +.

### Tradição, família e propriedade



Fonte: MUELLE, 2017, p.188

A iniciativa de incluir o enfoque de gênero nos diálogos de paz criou tanto desconforto e pânico nos segmentos evangélicos conservadores, que o estenderam mediante mobilizações em todo o território nacional, até o ponto que a pauta moral terminou sendo o elo mais forte entre o plebiscito pela paz e as camadas conservadoras. Uma pauta que, perante a importância dos diálogos de paz, parecia não ser protagonista, o segmento conservador conseguiu que aquilo tomara sentido para quem aderiu a esses repertórios, que foi a esmagadora maioria da população. O contexto regional também auxiliou na aderência da pauta moral, porque em países como Peru e Brasil a chamada “ideologia de gênero” já gerava amplo proselitismo.

O enfoque de gênero facilmente se tornou “ideologia de gênero” para os grupos evangélicos, por conta do perigo que para eles representavam os diálogos com a guerrilha, o qual mostrou no fundo a recusa para falar com grupos insurgentes, o desprezo pelas esquerdas e a negativa a Santos como presidente, além do intuito de ocupar espaços decisivos nessas contendas e, de passo, aticar a moralidade, como recurso de propaganda inesgotável até agora.

Nas mobilizações identitárias, o gênero se tornou fundamental para pensar a produção de políticas públicas e questões de Estado relacionadas a direitos. O conceito está atrelado, em certa

medida, às ondas do feminismo, à emergência do reconhecimento dos direitos da mulher e às noções de patriarcado e dominação. O gênero se desagrega do conceito de sexo; o primeiro para pensar uma dimensão cultural e o segundo uma dimensão biológica a partir de padrões sexuais. Essa desagregação permite o reconhecimento de identidades, que apenas desde o conceito sexo não permitiria esse alargamento, o que tornou-se foco de disputa de direitos.

A partir do ano 1990 o gênero mobiliza questões de políticas internacionais, mas no começo do século XXI passa a ser entendido na ideia de ideologia de gênero, que nega o reconhecimento das políticas públicas em prol da diversidade. Essa agitação se gesta no Vaticano apontando seus riscos para a família, como uma ameaça para as estruturas sociais, o que acabou criando pânico moral, mas não entre sujeitos religiosos “despreparados”, mas como uma ideia que reforça o apelo e as convicções morais também de não religiosos.

Desde aquela época se mobilizaram preceitos morais religiosos contra um Estado, acusado de “ideologizar” os filhos, isto como uma ideia contrária à inclusão de temas como igualdade de gênero e combate à homofobia nos currículos escolares.

Diversos países da América Latina vêm experimentando a ascensão de lideranças políticas sustentadas em pautas conservadoras nos costumes e ultraliberais na economia, com discursos que combinam uma agenda de recrudescimento do neoliberalismo com a mobilização de valores morais de cunho religioso em uma retórica de defesa da vida, inocência das crianças e integridade da família.

Por exemplo, o movimento *Con Mis Hijos No Te Metas* (CMHNTM) foi criado no Peru em dezembro de 2016, a fim de organizar a oposição contra a implementação do enfoque de gênero na educação, por meio do Currículo Nacional, que entraria em vigor em 2017, questão que logo se foi estendendo a América Latina.

O ambiente político colombiano de 2016 foi atizado pela proposta governamental de criar *ambientes escolares libres de discriminación*, para evitar assédio contra estudantes com identidades sexuais diversas. A partir daí surgiu a concepção de que se pretendia distribuir uma cartilha com conteúdo sexual para confundir as crianças. A comoção foi causada pela ideia de que existia uma doutrina sexual nas escolas, dirigida pela ministra de educação da época, Gina Parody. Esse fato somado às prévias reclamações de descontentamento popular por ela ser lésbica e estar na frente de uma das pastas mais importantes, causou sua pronta demissão. A questão das cartilhas também teve eco no Brasil, antes do impeachment de 2016, e na França no ano 2010, que apesar de ter tido características particulares, geraram campanhas em torno à defesa das crianças “no contexto de uma direita cristã mobilizada e cada vez mais globalizada” (VIGOYA, 2017, p. 227, tradução nossa).

Esse nervosismo na Colômbia vinha crescendo desde que o Tribunal Constitucional aprovou o casamento e adoção de casais do mesmo sexo. Este fato deixou incomodadas as lideranças evangélicas, que decidiram promover um referendo encaminhado à adoção de crianças apenas por famílias heterossexuais. Essa iniciativa da advogada e política evangélica Vivian Morales só passou no primeiro debate, mas não nas instâncias posteriores.

No meio desse contexto álgido, continuaram se somando as rejeições aos acordos, por parte de diversas figuras públicas como jogadores de futebol, que vieram nas negociações, entre o governo e a guerrilha, fatos opostos à religião e a Deus. Tudo isso incentivou ainda mais às lideranças evangélicas a conformar o Pacto cristão pela paz, como contraparte aos acordos, para levar suas preocupações sobre o que estava se negociando e, ao mesmo tempo, elenar a exigência de se reunir diretamente com as FARC e com os grupos LGBTQIA+, com o intuito de que eles não comprometeram pontos sensíveis para grupos religiosos tais como a família e a educação das crianças.



## Participación en Pacto Cristiano por la Paz

Misión Paz a las Naciones  
12 de octubre de 2016

Nuestro Apóstol Jhon Milton Rodríguez estuvo hoy, miércoles 12 de octubre, en la primera reunión del Pacto Cristiano Por la Paz. ¡Somos uno por Colombia! Reunión que fue organizada por las Iglesias Cristianas Misión Carismática Internacional, Manantial, Tabernáculo de la Fe, Centro Misionero Bethesda, Ríos de Vida y Misión Paz a las Naciones en unión con todos los Pastores cristianos.

El Pacto Cristiano Por La Paz representa la unidad de las Iglesias cristianas en Colombia quienes se han venido pronunciando para manifestar sus profundas preocupaciones y diferencias frente a los «acuerdos de paz» entre el presidente Juan Manuel Santos y el grupo armado FARC-EP desde el año 2010.

Fonte: <https://misionpaz.org/>

A sua vez os grupos LGBTQIA+ pediram manter o enfoque de gênero nos acordos, ao qual os evangélicos responderam com um texto exigindo ao governo quesitos, tais como o respeito da família tradicional; o direito de educar as crianças de acordo com seus valores; a liberdade de culto e a não estigmatização; a consideração de contemplar o perdão do cristianismo dentro da justiça de transição que beneficiou às FARC; o respeito à propriedade privada; a eliminação do termo gênero nos acordos; e a participação política em condições iguais tanto para guerrilheiros quanto para evangélicos. Essas exigências e a pressão em torno disso fizeram com que o presidente da época se comprometesse publicamente afirmando que as famílias, as igrejas e os crentes não sairiam prejudicadas com os acordos.

## Declaração presidencial sobre a chamada “ideologia de gênero”



Fonte: Red+noticias

Cabe lembrar que na época a *Iglesia de Dios Ministerial de Jesucristo Internacional* IDMJI, uma das maiores organizações religiosas colombianas, mediante seu partido político *Movimiento Independiente de Renovación Absoluta*, MIRA, se posicionou a favor dos acordos e até fez uma campanha de esclarecimento sobre a diferença entre enfoque de gênero e a chamada ideologia de gênero. Porém, nas posteriores eleições presidenciais de 2018, esta igreja e seu partido aderiram ao *Centro Democrático* que, previamente, fez campanha contra os acordos. Essa posição que parece ambivalente por parte do MIRA foi sustentada com a afirmação que tanto em 2016 quanto em 2018 a defesa da democracia foi o mais importante, independente do partido ao qual se aliaram.

Tirando essa exceção daquele momento por parte do MIRA, houve outras mobilizações como a de “famílias pela verdade”, como contraparte ao reconhecimento da diversidade, que vieram as negociações de paz como instrumento de fragilização de princípios cristãos. Somado a isso, se reforçaram as alianças político-religiosas com

partidos tradicionais da direita partidária. Até fundações internacionais como a brasileira Plínio Corrêa de Oliveira, que tem como mote Tradição Família e Propriedade, ajudaram a propagar a mensagem de rejeição aos acordos atrelando-os ao marxismo, ao comunismo e ao risco para a propriedade privada.



Fonte: *Pliniocorreadeoliveira*

#### IV. Gênero

O enfoque de gênero nos acordos provocou tanta tensão, que o termo começou a ser um dos mais buscados na internet. Amaya (2017) destacou que o interesse nas buscas foi especificamente sobre a chamada ideologia de gênero, que para o período 2012 e parte de 2016 se manteve em 1%, mas entre julho e agosto de 2016 passou a 100%, momento que coincidiu com toda a controvérsia das cartilhas e o contexto do plebiscito pela paz. “A ideologia de gênero, no caso colombiano, marcou antagonismos políticos e posicionou um novo ator político no debate: o público vigilante [em prol das crianças]” (AMAYA, 2017, p. 155, tradução nossa). Esse confronto supera o simples reducionismo de enquadrar o enfrentamento apenas entre setores “modernos e ilustrados” e setores “atrasados e intolerantes”, já que mais do que um afeto secular ou um desdém pelo religioso, isso mostra como a partir dessas tensões se lida com a coexistência das diferenças na política contemporânea.

Teoricamente a categoria gênero tem sido trabalhada há décadas. Vigoya e Rondón (2017) destacam as contribuições que em termos temporais e de reconhecimento de direitos se gestaram no marco das conferências

internacionais do Cairo e do Pequim na década dos 90, ecoando de forma positiva nas agendas da ONU, da U.E. e da OEA no que tange a quesitos jurídicos e institucionais para enfrentar temas de gênero, sexismo e homofobia. Essas transformações, apesar de moderadas, produziram reações nos segmentos conservadores e religiosos, argumentando leis naturais, que segundo a Igreja Católica, regem o modo correto de ser e fazer de indivíduos e famílias.

Os dois movimentos de reivindicação, tanto de movimentos sociais quanto de instituições religiosas, decorreram de instâncias locais a outras de nível global, para projetar seu acionar político. “Esta “politização reativa” também envolve uma mudança na gramática desses discursos e ativismos, que foge da oposição tradicional entre o religioso e o secular, na medida em que se aproveita de mecanismos democráticos e argumentos seculares para posicionar suas demandas [...] através da formação de “cidadanias religiosas”” (VIGOYA; RONDÓN, 2017, p. 120, tradução nossa).

A emergência da “ideologia de gênero” ou a ideologia contra o gênero, como sugere Judith Butler, surgiu como produto do ativismo católico, se espalhando com ampla recepção e efetividade.

O impacto e a incontestabilidade dessa retórica reverberaram em várias parcelas da sociedade, o que terminou influenciando entornos eleitorais, na medida que agitou sensibilidades e medos existenciais que foram atrelados a políticas públicas, a decisões governamentais e ao futuro de processos políticos. Esse tipo de conexões entre política, moralidade e ativismo religioso atingiu diversos contextos e regiões, pela potência que ainda possuem os discursos conservadores e a administração dos pânicos sociais para capitalizar as crises, além de servir como recurso para legitimar ou deslegitimar comícios de votação. Esse ativismo se enquadra na tradicional construção de amigo-inimigo, cujo antagonismo é exacerbado por agentes que presumivelmente procuram desestabilizar a ordem e as estruturas já desenhadas como rígidas e binárias, pretendendo acabar com a família como núcleo da sociedade e sustento da nação.

Os gêneros e as sexualidades, como conjunto de escalas que vão do global ao local e vice-versa, exploram questões tais como: as intersecções entre o dogmatismo religioso e segmentos conservadores; as periferias não contempladas na política sexual; e as heterotopias como aqueles lugares que desafiam o ordenamento hierárquico do gênero e da sexualidade e, nesse sentido, a chamada “ideologia de gênero” representa uma retórica conservadora instrumentalizada politicamente, que produz intersecções étnico-raciais, nacionais e de faixa etária, envolvendo questões democráticas e de cidadania (VIGOYA, 2017).

Desse modo, o gênero está intrinsecamente ligado ao político, este último como antagonismo inerente às sociedades, cuja relação produz heterotopias perante formas antidemocráticas e resistência às mudanças. Essa divergência na sociedade, de certa forma, tem a ver com a confluência do “antigo” e do “novo” regime no que tange a direitos sexuais na medida que cada um está acompanhado de suas racionalidades e moralidades, que operam de forma conjunta e convivem tensamente nas diversas formas de articulação e, em consequência, nos processos de cidadanização dos sujeitos na luta por políticas sexuais democráticas (CARRARA, 2015). Essa

análise dialoga com a abordagem de Rubin (1984), quando adverte das consequências dos paradoxos morais herdados do século XIX e, a sua vez, , conversa com a análise de Vigoya em torno à influência ideológica da direita conservadora, cada vez que associa o sexo fora do âmbito familiar ao comunismo e à debilidade política. “Boa parte da tradição cristã, seguindo São Paulo, sustenta que o sexo é em essência pecaminoso. Ele pode ser redimido se praticado no casamento, só para a procriação e longe do prazer” (RUBIN, 1984, p. 20).

Nessa mesma perspectiva a abordagem de Preciado (2013) afirma que essas campanhas nomeadas contra a ideologia de gênero procuram uma ideologia naturalista e religiosa, com princípios comuns, com o intuito de oprimir minorias sexuais conduzindo às próprias crianças que tanto defendem a herdar o fardo patriarcal. “Os defensores da infância e da família apelam para a figura política de uma criança que constroem privada de qualquer força de resistência [...] A criança é um artefato biopolítico que garante a normalização do adulto.” (PRECIADO, 2013, tradução nossa).<sup>2</sup>

Por sua parte, já Wittig desde 1980 chamou a atenção sobre a arquitetura da sociedade heterossexual em termos de uma necessidade ontológica do diferente e do outro, que se traduz no dominado, conceito sem o qual a sociedade não funciona econômica, simbólica, linguística nem politicamente. E para Butler (2003), especificamente, o debate contemporâneo sobre gênero é circular quando enquadrado como construção cultural, já que esse construto está nos limiares do livre-arbítrio ou do determinismo, em razão que esses limites se estabelecem desde um discurso cultural hegemônico baseado em estruturas binárias.

Mas, o que está em jogo quando o gênero é invocado para explicar ou justificar uma posição política? Esta pergunta elencada por Vigoya é chave para introduzir não apenas o enquadramento desta questão como problema público, mas também para analisar as

<sup>2</sup>[https://www.liberation.fr/societe/2013/01/14/qui-defend-l-enfant-queer\\_873947/](https://www.liberation.fr/societe/2013/01/14/qui-defend-l-enfant-queer_873947/)

repercussões e os custos políticos dessa intersecção. Um exemplo disso, foram as eleições presidenciais de 2018 na Colômbia, já que o contexto do processo de paz deixou o terreno cimentado, daquilo que previamente já estava fermentando, para que a direita conservadora tomasse novamente o poder. Nesse sentido, uma das reflexões sobre o crescente ativismo cristão, especificamente de matriz católica e evangélica, se explica, em parte, pela emergência no reconhecimento de múltiplas sexualidades e identificações de gêneros vinculado “à crescente autonomização da sexualidade como um plano relevante de exercício de direitos, em que se constituem novos atores políticos, cujas identidades coletivas são forjadas em torno de formas específicas de desejos, de práticas sexuais e de performances ou “expressões” de gênero (SIMÕES; CARRARA, 2014, p. 74). Essa emergência está atrelada à reivindicação dos direitos sexuais como parte dos direitos humanos, cuja desconsideração histórica tem deixado sem legitimidade política a diversos grupos sociais não normativos.

E, apesar que os discursos repressivos não provenham unicamente pela via institucional, os Estados têm se engajado nesses confrontos com diferenças substanciais entre o passado e o presente, já que as relações entre Estados e instituições religiosas têm mudado, bem como os graduais processos de laicidade, secularização, descentralização e transnacionalização de demandas sociais que pressionam os espaços de condensação política no que tange a gêneros e sexualidades (CORRÊA 2009).

Pórem, diferencial mais significativo, entretanto, é que a intersecção entre “sexo” e política na cena contemporânea já não decorre exclusivamente de ações e discursos repressivos e punitivos implementados pelos Estados. Ela também se nutre das demandas por direitos articuladas por nós – as atrizes e os atores da política sexual –, das leis e normas propostas e adotadas para proteger e respeitar a pluralidade sexual e dos discursos de respeito ou tolerância expressos por atores estatais relevantes. O debate sobre sexualidade e direitos humanos – que vem transcorrendo na ONU e outras arenas globais – é disso uma ilustração exemplar (CORRÊA, 2009, p.20).

Como foi referenciado anteriormente, o uso do gênero como recurso político por parte de agentes religiosos, especificamente em instâncias eleitorais, mostra a resistência no reconhecimento da diversidade sexual e na democratização de direitos nas políticas públicas, que se usa como dispositivo de mobilização, já que acionam sensibilidades, medos, imaginários e representações sobre estruturas binárias do corpo e seu controle, adaptadas através de narrativas políticas estratégicas para ganhar votos, aproveitando o solo fértil do conservadorismo. Assim, a religião e a construção de sistemas morais constituem vários sistemas de inclusão-exclusão nos quais há posições diferenciadas, neste caso, dependendo da identidade sexual e do gênero (BÁRCENAS, 2014, p. 39, tradução nossa).

#### V. REACOMODAÇÃO DE FORÇAS

Os ganhos conseguidos durante a campanha contra os acordos pelas lideranças evangélicas deixaram cimentado o terreno para a criação do partido *Colombia Justa Libres* e, em boa parte, para a eleição presidencial de 2018, que levou o candidato uribista Ivan Duque ao poder. Durante seu governo os evangélicos alcançaram vaga no Executivo e se mantiveram no Legislativo.

Um ponto interessante na reacomodação de forças é o duplo movimento que para lideranças evangélicas conservadoras adquire o Estado. Este, por uma parte, se torna o palco de conquista programática e a instituição a defender de forças progressistas e, ao mesmo tempo, vira um concorrente a ser desmistificado de qualquer característica benfeitora ou messiânica, que o coloque no mesmo patamar que o Deus cristão.

Embora as lideranças evangélicas no Legislativo colombiano não configurem um grupo coeso, dadas suas diferenças e posicionamentos tanto doutrinários quanto políticos, conseguiram reacomodar forças e ocupar mais espaços, maior capacidade e tamanho, através de coalizões governistas, como foi o caso do partido MIRA, cuja visão independente terminou se inclinando à direita partidária com o Centro Democrático.

Não obstante, em termos comparados, apesar do acirramento de pautas morais durante os acordos de paz, as correlações de força e as mudanças em políticas públicas não chegaram aos níveis de países como Brasil, com medidas regressivas em diversas pastas ministeriais e a nomeação de lideranças extremamente conservadoras como foi o caso da evangélica Damares Alves no Ministério da Família.

No caso colombiano, esse Ministério ainda segue como um projeto muito desejado por grupos religiosos, mas não consegue se materializar. A pastora evangélica e advogada Claudia Rodríguez de Castellanos foi uma das porta-vozes do projeto de criação dessa pasta ministerial, o que gerou diversas controvérsias em torno da sua importância e necessidade. As polêmicas passavam desde a discussão da sua viabilidade até a alerta de criar uma instituição operando como pauta moral e religiosa sob a visão de um único conceito de família.

## VI. CONSIDERAÇÕES FINAIS

As constantes tensões entre os referentes comportamentais de cunho religioso e outras formas de existência, bem como a reivindicação pelo reconhecimento, continua sendo o horizonte das controvérsias morais contemporâneas, embora tenham se registrado mudanças significativas em matéria de direitos via jurídica. Mas, muitas dessas controvérsias tornam-se recursos políticos dada sua ferrenha tensão, na qual se reproduz a noção tradicional de diferença a partir do confronto amigo-inimigo, onde busca-se o apagamento deste último valendo-se paradoxalmente de instâncias democráticas.

A moralidade normativa religiosa como propulsora discursiva na esfera política torna-se problema público, enquanto envolve e mobiliza vários agentes, interesses, gera e participa de ferrenhos embates nos espaços democráticos.

Um dos quesitos em torno do uso da moralidade religiosa tange a sua agitação quando se trata de políticas de reconhecimento, que funciona a grande escala, dado o solo fértil do conservadorismo na sociedade e, por vezes, como articuladora do segmento religioso, tão diverso e

heterogêneo. Não obstante, quando se trata de pautas de redistribuição, a moralidade religiosa passa a um segundo plano para dar atenção a outros problemas sociais. Desse modo, dependendo da funcionalidade do que está em jogo, ativam-se pautas morais não apenas porque lideranças religiosas de alguma maneira acreditam nelas, mas também porque são dispositivos de agitação e contenda eleitoral.

A campanha contra a assinatura dos acordos, em 2016, entre a guerrilha das FARC e o governo Santos, na qual participaram diversos segmentos, entre eles camadas de evangélicos, arrastou os ganhos alcançados para a candidatura de Ivan Duque nas presidenciais de 2018, consolidando o triunfo do candidato de direita, herdeiro do ex-presidente Álvaro Uribe Vélez do partido Centro Democrático, o que levou à recomodação de forças evangélicas.

Mas, de acordo com a última contenda presidencial colombiana, em 2022, observa-se que a modulação da potência de repertórios conservadores muda e, em certas conjunturas, não alcança para impulsionar a chegada no poder de determinados interesses e visões de mundo. Porém, cabe lembrar que o ativismo evangélico conservador em termos globais coadjuva no crescimento do extremismo da direita no poder.

## REFERÊNCIAS BIBLIOGRÁFICAS

1. AMAYA, J. F. S. La tormenta perfecta: Ideología de género y articulación de públicos. *Sexualidad, Salud y Sociedad* (Rio de Janeiro), n. 27, p. 149–171, dez. 2017.
2. BÁRCENAS, K. B. Iglesias y grupos espirituales para la diversidad sexual y de género en México: intersecciones sobre religión y género. *Revista de Estudios Sociales*, n. 49, p. 33–46, maio 2014.
3. BUTLER, J. Problemas do gênero. Disponível em: <[https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/6330031/mod\\_resource/content/1/butler-problemas-do-genero.pdf](https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/6330031/mod_resource/content/1/butler-problemas-do-genero.pdf)>.
4. CARRARA, S. Moralidades, racionalidades e políticas sexuais no Brasil contemporâneo. Disponível em: <<https://www.scielo.br/j/>>

mana/a/6D5zmtb3VK98rjtWTQhq8Gg/?lang=pt>.

5. CORRÊA, S. O percurso dos direitos sexuais: entre margens e centros. *Bagoas - Estudos gays: gêneros e sexualidades*, v. 3, n. 04, 2009.
6. MUELLE, C. E. Cómo hacer necropolíticas en casa: Ideología de género y acuerdos de paz en Colombia. *Sexualidad, Salud y Sociedad (Rio de Janeiro)*, n. 27, p. 172–198, dez. 2017.
7. PRECIADO, P. B. Qui défend l'enfant queer ? Disponível em: <[https://www.liberation.fr/societe/2013/01/14/qui-defend-l-enfant-queer\\_873947/](https://www.liberation.fr/societe/2013/01/14/qui-defend-l-enfant-queer_873947/)>. 1.
8. RUBIN, G. S. Notas para uma teoria radical da política da sexualidade. p. 81, 1984.
9. SIMÕES, J. A.; CARRARA, S. O campo de estudos socioantropológicos sobre diversidade sexual e de gênero no Brasil: ensaio sobre sujeitos, temas e abordagens. *Cadernos Pagu*, n. 42, p. 75–98, jun. 2014.
10. VIGOYA, M. V. Intersecciones, periferias y heterotopías en las cartografías de la sexualidad. *Sexualidad, Salud y Sociedad (Rio de Janeiro)*, n. 27, p. 220–241, dez. 2017.
11. VIGOYA, M. V.; RONDÓN, M. A. R. Hacer y deshacer la ideología de género. *Sexualidad, Salud y Sociedad (Rio de Janeiro)*, n. 27, p. 118–127, dez. 2017.
12. WITTIG, M. O Pensamento Hetéro. Disponível em: <[https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/6132463/mod\\_resource/content/1/Wittig%2C%20Monique%20O%20pensamento%20Hetero\\_.pdf](https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/6132463/mod_resource/content/1/Wittig%2C%20Monique%20O%20pensamento%20Hetero_.pdf)>.

*This page is intentionally left blank*



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# The Deontologies of the Global Journal of Archaeology & Anthropology Revisited

*Javier Martínez Jiménez*

*Universidad de Cambridge*

## INTRODUCTION

Todos sabemos cuál es el objetivo de la ciencia, o al menos, tenemos una idea abstracta de cuáles son los objetivos y las intenciones de la ciencia. Sin embargo, en este mundo del capitalismo tardío en el que vivimos, nos encontramos con la problemática de que hay compañías editoriales se dedican a exprimir económicamente a los autores a cambio de publicaciones que luego no va a leer nadie. Esta discusión, así muy por encima, no es nada nueva, y creo que todos nos sabemos de lo que estoy hablando.

*Keywords:* NA

*Classification:* LCC Code: GN301

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573351  
Print ISSN: 2515-5785  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 15 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Javier Martínez Jiménez. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncom-mercial 4.0 Unported License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.



# The Deontologies of the Global Journal of Archaeology & Anthropology Revisited

Javier Martínez Jiménez

*Author:* Facultad de Clásicas, Universidad de Cambridge.

## I. INTRODUCTION

Todos sabemos cuál es el objetivo de la ciencia, o al menos, tenemos una idea abstracta de cuáles son los objetivos y las intenciones de la ciencia. Sin embargo, en este mundo del capitalismo tardío en el que vivimos, nos encontramos con la problemática de que hay compañías editoriales se dedican a exprimir económicamente a los autores a cambio de publicaciones que luego no va a leer nadie. Esta discusión, así muy por encima, no es nada nueva, y creo que todos nos sabemos de lo que estoy hablando.

Como muestra, esta mañana acabo de recibir un correo electrónico de este International Journal of Paleobiology & Paleontology [aunque, habiendo dicho esto, cada vez que me mandan un correo electrónico, voy a mandarles a todos este mismo artículo, así que a lo mejor no sale en la chorrada esta de paleobiología], pidiéndome ser editor o si quería enviarles un artículo. A mí, que soy arqueólogo en una facultad de estudios clásicos. Es que es la polla con los emails automatizados. Es más, hay un par de revistas científicas que de vez en cuando me piden que haga de evaluador ciego sobre temas que no tienen absolutamente nada que ver con lo mío, como ingeniería de materiales o física hidráulica. Cada vez que me llega uno de estos les escribo directamente a los autores para decirles que la publicación a la que han enviado su propuesta es de broma.

Pero como iba diciendo, esta misma mañana me ha llegado un email con esta solicitud rarísima, y me ha dado por enviar algo. A ver, me explico: voy a escribir estos tres o cuatro primeros párrafos mientras desayuno y luego voy a cortar y pegar un trabajo de la facultad para que al menos parezca

que tiene formato académico. No sé aún si voy a pegar uno en inglés o en castellano, porque a fin de cuentas es lo mismo.

En conclusión, si los editores leen esto, vergüenza debería daros trabajar para esta gente. Si no lo leéis y lo envían a los evaluadores, pues por favor denle el visto bueno, porque esto es un cachondeo. Si de milagro llega a publicarse, estimado colega lector, este journal es de chiste. Como no creo que llegue a publicarse, porque no pienso pagar, sé que esto no lo va a leer nadie más. Así que por eso aquí termino. A los del journal, que os den.

Por cierto, este es el verdadero título de este artículo: *Qué esperar de una revista patraña: gilipolleces académicas y publicaciones de cachondeo.*

## II. EMPIEZA EL CORTA-PEGA

The period between 400 and 700 saw how the Western Empire collapsed and the Eastern Empire struggled to continue. While the West divided into several successor Germanic kingdoms, the East remained a single entity. The archaeology of towns also shows how towns in the West declined faster than those in the East, and a couple of centuries earlier. However, can we see this division East/West in the economy of the period? If this was the case, the archaeological evidence would point towards different trends in both regions, but it does not seem to be the case.

The archaeological evidence points towards a series of patterns which repeat across the Mediterranean, regardless of East and West: we should look at a more regional level in order to see differences, because the patterns we can see in *some* parts of the East are seen in some *other* parts of the West, with a couple of centuries delay,

while in others seem roughly contemporary. The aim of this essay is to show that the archaeology shows how regional variation is more important for the economy of this period rather than a simple East/West division. And even though a wide range of material will be considered (coins, coarse wares, fine wares, amphorae, towns, field surveys), we will focus more on pottery as a general indicator of economic trends. It is important that we consider the “positivist fallacy”: we only can count on the positive evidence, which may be over-representative of what trade might have been like in this period. Nevertheless, it is reasonable to assume that pottery is a low-prize bulk good which might have been traded as any other commodity, and its distribution and production patterns could give a good rough overview.

### III. LATE ANTIQUE INFRASTRUCTURE

Firstly we should mention that both texts and archaeology show that infrastructure was failing in the Late Antique period. As the Classical city faded away, and the central government took over many responsibilities, local issues such as harbour-dredging, anti-siltation dikes, roads and canals decayed (Ephesus, Marseilles, Portus, Caesarea Maritima). The trading infrastructure was not repaired making more and more difficult trading exchanges, which could have put back traders. Small factors such as these are to be taken into account, and not taken for granted, or ignored in the broader politico-economical frame of this period<sup>1</sup>.

### IV. MODELS AND REGIONS

While the Roman Empire stood, there was a constant flow of wealth (taxes: coin, *annona*) from the core provinces towards the frontiers which consumed them and the capital(s)<sup>2</sup>. It is true that since the Empire's division, each half

had to sustain its borders with its own resources and each half developed a group of “core” and “border” provinces. From these very premises we see two parallel regions in both halves, and these regions would develop similarly through time. If the core was producing and the frontier just consuming, the end of the Empire and the flow of tax would have put to an end this situation, leading into ruin those provinces that were fed and did not produce, while the producing provinces would centre upon themselves if there was nobody to buy their products – not even the state<sup>3</sup>.

The picture is more complicated than that. Even if the main bulk of goods flowed in this direction, there was still the need for exchange, because Mediterranean regions cannot be self-sufficient, on a long term<sup>4</sup>. Regions were interconnected and the state offered a wide and solid frame for further exchange<sup>5</sup>.

Historical events marked the fate of these provinces. While the fifth century invasions (or conscious withdrawal) soon separated the Western frontiers (Britain, Rhine, Alps) from their cores (Spain, Africa, Italy), the East remained united (excepting the Balkans). However, in the seventh century, invasions in the East seem to have caused similar effects. Provinces, however, could be divided into smaller (or larger) regions, linked by economic ties. While Egypt was self-contained, for instance, we can see a north-south division in Italy and Gaul and an inland-coastal division in Asia, the Levant, Spain and Africa.

### V. FINE WARES

Fine wares were fine pottery table wares following the Samian ware (*terra sigillata*) Roman tradition. They were normally produced *en masse*<sup>6</sup> aiming for the general consumer, offering

<sup>1</sup> Wickham, ‘Overview: production, distribution and demand’ in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, 1998 (=Wickham in *The Sixth c.*), pp. 284, 292, Ward-Perkins, *The Fall of Rome and the End of Civilization*, 2005 (=Ward-Perkins, *Fall*), pp. 133

<sup>2</sup> Wickham, *Framing the Early Middle Ages*, 2005 (=Wickham, *Framing*) p. 717

<sup>3</sup> Ward-Perkins ‘Specialized Production and Exchange’ in *Cambridge Ancient History XIV* (=Ward-Perkins in *CAH XIV*), p. 380; Wickham, in *The Sixth c.*, p. 290

<sup>4</sup> Panella, ‘Merci e scambi nel Mediterraneo tardoantico’, in A. Carandini, L. Cracco Ruggini and A. Giardina (eds), *Storia di Roma*, III.ii, 1993 (=Panella in *Storia di Roma*), pp. 614-7

<sup>5</sup> Wickham, *Framing*, p. 717

<sup>6</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, pp. 97-9

a quality product at a reasonable price. They were no luxury items<sup>7</sup>. They have the advantage that it is easily datable and (normally) their red colours make them easily spottable on field surveys and excavations – which may over-represent their importance. Overall, fine wares suffered a process of simplification and regionalisation as their (potential) markets ceased to demand and costs (probably) rose<sup>8</sup>.

The most prominent fine ware of this period is the African Red Slip ware (ARS), which was produced from the third to the eighth centuries, and was during the fourth century the commonest ware across the Empire<sup>9</sup>. Produced in several kiln-sites on a grand scale, the production seems to have decreased slowly before the Vandal rule, decreasing both in number and in range<sup>10</sup>. It does not seem that the Vandal invasion meant a disruption of the production<sup>11</sup> but rather that its trading network was decreased its demand. Even if it was originally sailed together with the grain fleet (which would have made its further distribution easier)<sup>12</sup>, and it was available deep inside the continent, the Vandal invasion put this fleet to an end. Traders had to pay in full their shipments and it seems that this did not put them back, as the Tarraconensis province became a new focus of ARS import<sup>13</sup>. It had to compete with local fine wares in Gaul, and though it made it to the East, it was also pushed out<sup>14</sup>. The only region which seemed to have constant contact was coastal Spain<sup>15</sup>, which was otherwise isolated from

the central area<sup>16</sup>. ARS localised from the seventh century onwards, until it only supplied its neighbouring area.

Even though ARS made its way into the East, Asia Minor produced its own local set of fine wares: Phocaean Red Slip (PRS). These wares were very similar in design and quality to their African counterparts, but were not linked to any *annonaria* province. This implied that they originally had to be shipped at the traders' full cost, which would explain its local distribution. They developed from local wares until they became predominant in the Aegean (and Constantinople)<sup>17</sup> and other Eastern regions. The flow of trade diminished as the demand declined or could be sufficed by local wares.

The Eastern market had local fine wares both in the Levant<sup>18</sup> and in Egypt (ERS)<sup>19</sup>, and their local range can be due to either the lack of competitiveness of other wares (ARS, PRS) or the increasing difficulty of trading. Or both. In the West seems to happen the same: Gaulish Samian wares were replaced by locally-produced ceramics: the *Derives du Sigillate Paleochretiene* (DSP)<sup>20</sup> in the Mediterranean area and the Argonne wares in the north<sup>21</sup>. Even if they were exported at the beginning to neighbouring regions (Britain, Italy, Spain) they soon had to limit their scope and focus on the local needs. In Spain, while the coast relied on an African supply for fine wares (both before and during the Byzantine conquest<sup>22</sup>), the centre, isolated from the wider Mediterranean kept their old Samian wares (TSH) which were more and more reduced in their

<sup>7</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 88

<sup>8</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 104; Wickham in *The Sixth c.*, p. 287; Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, p. 654

<sup>9</sup> Panella, 'Gli scambi nel Mediterraneo Occidentale dal IV al VII secolo dal punto di vista di alcune «mera»' *Hommes et richesses dan l'Empire byzantin*, 1989 (= Panella in *Hommes et...*), p.131

<sup>10</sup> Panella in *Storia di Roma*, pp. 658-9; Panella, in *Hommes et...*, p.139

<sup>11</sup> Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, p. 651; Wickham, *Framing*, pp. 711-2, 723

<sup>12</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 710, 722; Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, pp. 626-8

<sup>13</sup> Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, p. 651

<sup>14</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 645

<sup>15</sup> Gutiérrez Lloret, 'Eastern Spain in the Sixth Century', in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, 1998, p. 164; Wickham, *Framing*, p.748

<sup>16</sup> Gutiérrez, *op. cit.*, p. 175

<sup>17</sup> Ward-Perkins, *CAH XIV*, p. 360; Abadie-Reynal, 'Céramique et commerce dans le basin égéen du IVe au VIIIe siècle' in *Hommes et richesses dan l'Empire byzantin*, 1989, p. 156

<sup>18</sup> Wickham, *Framing*, pp. 772-3

<sup>19</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 760

<sup>20</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 746; Loseby, 'Marseilles and the Pirenne thesis I: Gregory of Tours, the Merovingian kings and "un grand port"', in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, 1998, pp. 213; Ward-Perkins in *CAH XIV*, p. 373

<sup>21</sup> Wickham, *Framing*, pp. 795-6

<sup>22</sup> Gutiérrez, *op. cit.*, pp. 165, 177-8

variety and their distribution, until they were city-based productions<sup>23</sup>.

In general terms, fine wares show the same pattern in all regions, both East and West: that of an increased regionalisation as the single market offered by the Empire collapsed<sup>24</sup> and trading costs overseas increased or local substitutions/imitations became more widely available. All these wares, nevertheless, were linked to a highly specialised mode of production, in which there was the possibility of making profit out of cheap items, made in bulk. The circumstances during the sixth and seventh centuries did not allow this, and the over-specialisation played against productivity<sup>25</sup>.

## VI. COARSE WARES

Apart from fine wares people in antiquity used coarse wares, which were cheaper, more economic, and normally for cooking use. As it happened with fine wares, in the early years of our period, these wares were also made *en masse*<sup>26</sup>. These were common pottery, for everyday use, and necessary, which means that when these could not be supplied (war, bad communications) they still needed to be done. This meant that soon the most basic pots started to be made locally, even domestically<sup>27</sup>. The Italian *olle* are a good example of this rough coarse wares produced on a local basis substituted the quality and standardised previous wares<sup>28</sup>. Sub-Roman British pottery are an extreme example<sup>29</sup>.

Amongst the early “industrial” wares we should mention two examples, as most of the later coarse wares were so local that cannot be studied in general terms. These two examples show the two ends of the scale. Firstly, North-Syrian Brittle ware, which seems to group a series of localised productions of similar standards, distributed along the Euphrates and the Dura

Europos-Apamea route. Brittle ware was exceptional, as it continued to be made and distributed around North Syria into the Arab period<sup>30</sup>.

Mayen wares were also far-reaching coarse wares, from the Rhine and Moselle valleys. It even linked through the Rhône with the Mediterranean basin. In contrast to Brittle ware, Mayen wares showed a constant reduction in their offered range and the reach of their distribution, and became more and more localised<sup>31</sup>.

## VII. AMPHORAE AND RELATED PRODUCTION

More information can be extracted from amphorae than from coarse wares, because they were containers intended to be sent overseas, they were not storage vessels, so their decline must be linked to a decline in transport. Even though amphorae are found everywhere, their precedence is overall from the East. It seems that the west ceased to export things *in amphorae* in this period. Barrels seem to have taken over, which are invisible archaeologically, and thus would seem as if exports had finished overall from the West<sup>32</sup>. If buildings were made with perishable materials (not necessarily worse materials)<sup>33</sup> it is very sensible to assume barrels as an alternative. The use of barrels in the West would explain why we find so many amphorae from the east. After all, we know that trade occurred in the West, as Loseby points out from Gregory of Tour’s *Histories*<sup>34</sup>. Amphorae distribution patterns show how trade flowed, and we see how regionalised these products become, specially linked to tax-paying.

The only western amphorae from this period are the African ones, which seem to have been mainly sold in the western Mediterranean<sup>35</sup>, linked to oil

<sup>23</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 164, 179

<sup>24</sup> Cf Wickham, *Framing*, p. 717; Ward-Perkins, in *CAH XIV*, p. 381

<sup>25</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, pp. 136-7

<sup>26</sup> Wickham, *Framing*, p. 795

<sup>27</sup> Gutiérrez, *op. cit.*, p., 179; Panella in *Hommes et...*, p. 134

<sup>28</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, p. 106

<sup>29</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 108

<sup>30</sup> Agnes Voeker, lecture in the Byzantine archaeology Seminar, Oxford, MT 08

<sup>31</sup> Wickham, *Framing*, pp. 794-6

<sup>32</sup> Andrew Wilson, *Maritime archaeology and Ancient Trade* OCMA conferences, Madrid, September 2008

<sup>33</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, p. 109

<sup>34</sup> Loseby, *op. cit.*, pp. 217 ff, Gregory of Tours, *DLH*, IX.22 and IV.43

<sup>35</sup> Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, p. 629

and fish products rather than wine. Exceptions are found (Egypt, for instance<sup>36</sup>), but it seems that African amphorae saw their distribution range narrowed. Even African amphorae were sent as part of the later Byzantine *annona*<sup>37</sup>, they were fewer and fewer. Field surveys show that land-owning patterns were changing through the sixth and seventh centuries, maybe as a result of a decline in the demand or an increase in shipping costs, but by the time of the Arab invasions, African economy had become much localised and aiming self-consumption<sup>38</sup>.

All Late Roman amphorae classifications refer to eastern origins: LR1 from Cilicia, LR2 the Aegean, LR3 Asia, LR4 Gaza, LR5 Palestine, etc<sup>39</sup>. Efforts have been made to link each type to a certain product (oil, wine), which would imply regions specialised in certain products for surplus. The survey on the limestone massif of Syria show how these production sites would have worked on a non-single-crop basis<sup>40</sup>. These products were mostly sent to Constantinople as part of the taxes and the *annona*, although we see some wine Gaza amphorae being sent as part of “elite trade”, linked to monastic sites<sup>41</sup>.

While all amphorae exports were dependant on an agricultural surplus, agricultural regions were not fully dependant on their overseas exports, so we see in the regions linked to these amphorae how the seventh century invasions affected the coastal regions far more than the inland agrarian sites<sup>42</sup>. The over-specialisation of the coastal regions in exporting the *annona* made them more vulnerable to disruptions such as the Arab and Persian invasions than the inland agricultural areas. When the amphorae of each region stop to circulate (also during this century) we see how these regions started to focus more on their own economies and became more self-sufficient<sup>43</sup>.

<sup>36</sup> Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, pp. 656-7

<sup>37</sup> Gutiérrez, *op. cit.*, p. 177

<sup>38</sup> Wickham, *Framing*, pp. 723-5

<sup>39</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 663-5

<sup>40</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, p. 124

<sup>41</sup> Panella, in *Storia di Roma*, pp. 668-80

<sup>42</sup> Wikcham, *Framing*, p. 774

<sup>43</sup> Ward-Perkins in *CAH XIV*, pp. 374-5, 383

## VIII. ADDENDUM: COINAGE AND “ELITE GOODS”

A final mention will be made on coinage, which provides with important evidence when studying the economy. The Roman world was a coin-using economy, for everyday transactions, which is reflected in the wide use of small denomination coinage<sup>44</sup>. In this period, we see these low denomination coins dropping, and even disappearing from the archaeological record. Those coins we do find are normally high denomination coinage (gold, silver), usually linked to big payments (maybe big shipping cargoes?). Furthermore, while the East remained united under a same coinage system, the West fragmented into several states, with different patterns<sup>45</sup>, even if coins in the West were meant to be copies of the Imperial ones. This lasted until the reigns of Theudebert in Francia<sup>46</sup> and Liuvigild in Spain<sup>47</sup>. After that, each region functioned with its own currency, especially big port sites such as Marseilles and Seville, which minted their own low-denomination coinage<sup>48</sup>. The east kept its own coinage, but it all in a sudden seems to have dropped in use, and coins are hardly in Eastern sites after 600<sup>49</sup>.

Apart from coins, some other golden items, such as brooches, belt-fittings and other ornaments were made, with indubitable skill: such are the sicadas from Childeric’s grave, the hanging Crowns from Guarrazar, the brooches of Sutton Hoo or even the gold offerings of Gudme, in Denmark. It seems that the only goods that kept moving across the Mediterranean were elite goods, made by very capable craftsmen, but this must be linked more to gift-exchange than actual trade, and are the only elements which are not

<sup>44</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, 112

<sup>45</sup> At least in Francia; Loseby, *op. cit.*, p. 223

<sup>46</sup> Procopius, *Bell. Goth.* III.33, as quoted in De Francisco Olmos, and Vico Monteoliva, ‘Historia de la Moneda Visigoda. Las acuñaciones de Toledo’ in *Hispania Gothorum: San Ildefonso y el Reino Visigodo de Toledo* 2007, p. 183

<sup>47</sup> Isidore, *Hist. Goth.* 51, in De Francisco Olmos, and Vico Monteoliva, *loc. cit.*

<sup>48</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, pp. 113, 117; Loseby, *op. cit.*, p. 224

<sup>49</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, p. 120

regionalised, and can be seen as linking regions (Francia-Scandinavia, Toledo-Constantinople)<sup>50</sup>.

Other elite elements of trade, normally controlled by the state (marble quarries) seem to have been active from the quarries towards imperial centres, such as Ravenna, but it seems that within the general trend decay of Classical urban landscape, even old marble was cheaper and more readily available than imported imperial marble<sup>51</sup>.

## IX. CONCLUSIONS

We have seen as the archaeological evidence provided by pottery, coins and amphorae point towards a general disruption of the old Roman trade system. We have seen how regions that were once united by taxes soon became autonomous. This was parallel to a process of failure of the infrastructure, which made trading more difficult and more expensive. The demand started to be sufficed by local supplies, as the over-specialised productions became less and less productive, because they needed to be sold in bulk. In the West it is clear that the economy became regionalised, but in the East this also happens, behind the overall flow towards Constantinople, as little trade happened between regions and soon, once the Imperial infrastructure finally failed in the seventh century, ceased. The Imperial infrastructure kept Mediterranean trade going, but only as it linked Imperial possessions: the *annona* eased trade but also limited it and the importance of regional productions grew and became more relevant.

[Nota: como el trabajo este era muy corto, voy a pegar otro]

The Syrian Limestone massif is a remote area of the Near East, high above the plain of Antioch and in between the valley of the Orontes and the plain running towards the Euphrates. The presence of abandoned stone houses in villages of this area (built between the second and the sixth centuries AD) has been used as a significant case-study of Late Antique rural settlement patterns. Even

though the Limestone massif had previously studied (partially) during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the theses exposed by Tchalenko in the 1950's were new and had a deep impact. Many others have written so to praise him, and in other cases, much has been contested and argued about his conclusions.

The aim of this essay is to analyse how much of what Tchalenko originally said has been generally accepted and how much has been rejected, or proven to be inaccurate. We will try to see how well based these criticisms are and assess in which ways could further research make the theses and criticisms clearer.

We will start by explaining Tchalenko's theses and approaches and then we will move on to point by point analysis and criticism, mainly based upon the works of G. Tate, D. Hull, J. Cassana and C. Wickham.

## X. THALENKO'S THESES

The Limestone massif had already been studied before Tchalenko was commissioned to survey the area, but it was his interpretations made his work relevant and controversial.

Tchalenko studied the three main regions of the massif, compiling information of all the sites, carefully studying the architectural details, the inscriptions, aiming for an accurate dating and a full geographical approach. This study was made only by means of surface survey<sup>52</sup> without any excavation at any of the sites. He made a thorough research on the written sources related to the area and he also studied the geological composition of the region.

His publication in three volumes (text, plans and further comments) marked a turning point in the study of Late Antique rural settlements. The main issues that Tchalenko arose in his original publication can be summarised in four main points.

<sup>50</sup> Ward-Perkins, *Fall*, pp. 117-8, Wickham, *Framing*, p. 799, Wickham in *The Sixth c.*, pp. 281-2

<sup>51</sup>

<sup>52</sup> Foss, "The Near Eastern countryside in Late Antiquity: a review article" in *The Roman and byzantine Near East: Some Recent Archaeological Research*, p. 217

The first one is that of the nature of the settlements and their internal organisation. According to Tchalenko, the rural settlements of the massif were both urban and rural, and unique. Because they were located on an isolated spot, living of the terrain around them, but still had elements of “urbanism” that could be identified. Amongst these we find elements such as bazaars and open public spaces, communal buildings such as *andra* and churches and *basilicae*<sup>53</sup>. The existence of communal exploitation systems such as oil presses<sup>54</sup> and the design of the houses are indicators of rural life<sup>55</sup>.

The second main element of Tchalenko’s thesis is the economy of the area, which was based on the massive production and export of olive oil to the Mediterranean<sup>56</sup>. His analysis of the soil and the region’s geology led him to consider that only the olive tree could grow in such a region, both because of the components and the extreme permeability which prevents any irrigation<sup>57</sup>. The monoculture of the olive for exporting purposes was the reason why the houses were built in “luxury materials” such as stone<sup>58</sup>. Parallel to this we see how these over-specialised villages needed some “crafts villages” which would supply them with commodities<sup>59</sup>.

Thirdly, we have Tchalenko’s idea of a “rural civilisation” unique and apart from the surrounding region. It emerged when the massif was initially settled and colonised by the state, which distributed the land and divided the plots, giving some to veterans and functionaries (who lived in *villas*) and then these large land-owners developed a series of villages which they owned<sup>60</sup>.

Finally we have to mention Tchalenko’s dating, based on his survey and his analysis of the epigraphy, which finishes by 610 and according to him, is linked to the Persian invasion and then to

the Arab invasion, which soon broke all the ties of the region with their former customers and led the peasants to bankruptcy, thus ending the settlement in the region<sup>61</sup>.

#### *Tate and Sodini*

The first and main criticisms against Tchalenko’s work came from a fellow countryman of his, G. Tate, who excavated several sites of the same Limestone massif and proved Tchalenko wrong in several aspects, and made a whole new interpretation.

The results of the excavations contradicted Tchalenko in a number of ways. The finds of D  h  rs pointed towards low-status settlements due to the lack of any fine ware<sup>62</sup> which would contradict Tchalenko’s assumption of a series of wealthy landowners. The use of stone is explained as the use of the only available material, and that the use of the same building technique and material for over 500 years without innovation should point to humbler inhabitants<sup>63</sup>. The excavation reports also coincides with the fact that the soil is incapable of sustaining any irrigation<sup>64</sup>, but the large amount of animal bones points towards the presence of animal husbandry, and thus the need for grazing areas and fodder crops<sup>65</sup>. The houses in general, seem all to have been the same, and no evidence has been found for any non-domestic activity in the supposed *andra*<sup>66</sup>.

In further works, Tate has researched beyond his own excavations, trying to counter most of Tchalenko’s arguments. Tate’s landscape study had to agree with Tchalenko’s fact on the nature of the soil as optimum for *trees* and unsuitable for irrigation<sup>67</sup>, and he added more details to our knowledge regarding density and dispersion of settlements<sup>68</sup>. He presents an alternative

<sup>53</sup> Tchalenko, *Villages antiques de la Syrie du Nord: Le Massif du B  lus    l’  poque romaine*, pp. 9, 17-8, 21-3, 29

<sup>54</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 41

<sup>55</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 403

<sup>56</sup> Foss, *op. cit.*, p. 217

<sup>57</sup> Tchalenko, *op. cit.*, p. 63

<sup>58</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 12

<sup>59</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 390 ff.

<sup>60</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 318-7

<sup>61</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 6, 431 ff

<sup>62</sup> Sodini, *et alii*, “D  h  s (Syrie du Nord), campagnes I-III (1976-1978): recherches sur l’habitat rural”, *Syria* 58, pp. 237 ff

<sup>63</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 183

<sup>64</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 5

<sup>65</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 293

<sup>66</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 6; Cf. Tate, *Les Campagnes de la Syrie du Nord du IIe au VIIe si  cle* (=Tate, *Campagnes*), p. 213

<sup>67</sup> Tate, *Campagnes*, p. 200

<sup>68</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 201-6

approach to the village economy, as he explains that the region is an isolated and back area of Syria<sup>69</sup>. He explains the emergence of a cadastre and land distribution not as an evident sign of centuriation for veterans, but as an imposition of the central government to the peasants that have been moved away from the plain (where the veterans were settled)<sup>70</sup>. From this assumption, Tate considers that the inhabitants of this region were simply farmers (supported by his excavation evidence), which lived on multiple crops, of which olive was perhaps the one which made them prosperous<sup>71</sup>. He suggests mixed crops of cereal + olive + vines, and also *other* fruit-trees and animals<sup>72</sup>. The production of oil is explained as to supply the local cities (Antioch, Apamea)<sup>73</sup>.

The main divergence with Tchalenko is Tate's approach to the emergence of village communities<sup>74</sup>. Whilst Tchalenko proposes villages emerging out of the lands of extensive land-owners or sanctuaries, Tate proposes that villages emerged up in the high lands because they had been displaced, and thus they became free medium landowners living in community<sup>75</sup>. He presents as a proof of this the houses, which are all similar and should be seen as linked to single-productive units (nuclear families), an *oikos*<sup>76</sup>.

### Hull

Hull, in a more recent work, has been studying the monasteries of the Limestone massif. He also developed his theories as opposed to Tchalenko's assumptions on monasteries' locations and their relationship with near-by settlements<sup>77</sup>. Tchalenko had assumed that monasteries were in this isolated region of the Empire seeking for spiritual retirement.

Hull, on the one hand set a series of defining elements that could point to as monastic site, such as baptisteries, religious decoration, an enclosure columns for stylites and subsistence elements such as granaries and cisterns<sup>78</sup>. On the other hand, analysed the spread of monasteries in relation to settlements by means of a GSI, and got different conclusions, which can be linked to Tate's approach of a region covered by self-sufficient villages. Firstly, Hull pointed out that monasteries are almost always located within a 2km radius from the nearest village<sup>79</sup>, located above the settlements, so they could be seen. The visual link between monasteries becomes evident, and visibility was an important issue in the monastery-village relationship<sup>80</sup>.

Considering the visual and spatial relationship existing between villages and monasteries, Tchalenko's argument does not sustain, and it seems evident that monasteries were directly interrelating with the villages, most probably through economic exchange<sup>81</sup>. Hull also suggested that the existence of monasteries close to the villages would imply that the regular clergy would substitute the secular clergy when servicing the community<sup>82</sup>.

### Cassana

The uniqueness of the Syrian massif had been challenged already, but it was not until J. Cassana and the University of Chicago Project for Antioch's plain that parallel research was done in a near-by region.

Cassana's article showed how the Antioch plain, around the lake (the lowland just below the Limestone massif) was also densely settled by small villages<sup>83</sup> and explains the settlement of the massif as a movement of the old landowners to

<sup>69</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 201

<sup>70</sup> Tate, "The Syrian countryside during the Roman era" in S. Alcock (ed.) *The Early Roman Empire in the East* (=Tate, *Countryside*), pp. 60-1

<sup>71</sup> Tate, *Campaignes*, p. 249

<sup>72</sup> Tate, *Countryside*, p. 66; Tate, *Campaignes*, pp. 243-6

<sup>73</sup> Tate, *Campaignes*, p. 331

<sup>74</sup> Cf with Wickham, *infra*

<sup>75</sup> Tate, *Campaignes*, pp. 287-94

<sup>76</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 257-8

<sup>77</sup> Tchalenko, *op. cit.*, p. 177

<sup>78</sup> Hull, "A spatial and morphological analysis of monastic sites in the Northern Limestone massif, Syria" in *Levant: Journal of the Council for British Research in the Levant*, 40, pp. 93-4

<sup>79</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 95

<sup>80</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 96

<sup>81</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 104-5

<sup>82</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 106

<sup>83</sup> Cassana, "The archaeological landscape of Late Roman Antioch" in I. Sandwell and J. Huskinson (eds.) *Culture and Society in Later Roman Antioch*, p. 104

the uplands as they were expelled by Roman authorities settling veterans in the plain<sup>84</sup>. This conclusion is not only based on Tate's discussion<sup>85</sup>, but also on archaeological evidence.

It seems that the lower plain was better communicated with the outer world through a series of water canals and river ways, which linked to the production of LRA 1 in *this* region that could point to mass export of olive oil – and not from the massif<sup>86</sup>. The intensive exploitation of the land is evident through the silt deposits and the erosion of the terraces, which affected the modern bed of rivers and canals<sup>87</sup>

Even though Cassana's research is mainly based on surface surveys, some other methods of surveying have been used, including palynological analyses. These have shown that the plain was also planted with multiple crops, despite a peak during Late Antiquity of olive pollen<sup>88</sup>.

#### Wickham

Finally, we have Chris Wickham's analysis, part of his great work "Framing the Early Middle Ages". In his review of the evidence and the scholarship on the subject, Wickham seems to agree with Tate and Hull, when claiming that there is no urban element in these rural settlements, as claimed by Tchalenko<sup>89</sup>.

His Marxist points of view frame also his discussion of the Limestone massif settlement: he does not see the villages as houses given by the rich landowners to their peasants as Tchalenko proposes, but neither as a group of free small land-owner peasants as described by Tate. Wickham finds evidence for some wealth linked to medium-owner village elites and city-based landowners, which would use and distribute the wealth and exploit the olive as a special production of the region, and was able to employ specialised architects<sup>90</sup>. He considers that there

should have been some sort of medium-distance exchange to the neighbouring towns beyond oil as a cash-crop, otherwise the presence of Phocaean red-slip and Byzantine coins would be hard to explain<sup>91</sup>.

Regarding the end of the settlements' prosperity, Wickham points out (contradicting Tate and Tchalenko) that there is no decline after 550 AD, there is just an end of new housing. Based only on historical bases he points out that the decline should have started after 570, when the cities (and the demand for oil) were also in decline<sup>92</sup>. This would eventually lead to an increase of the localisation of the economy until it became partially isolated from the outer networks.

#### Conclusion

Much has been argued about Tchalenko's interpretation and analysis of the Limestone massif. Because of the original research was done only by surveys, much was left without a solid basis, and it is only after careful new excavations or new survey systems (and the use of new technologies like GIS) that the counter arguments have been proven right, and very convincingly.

The main criticisms against Tchalenko's work are on the nature of the economy of these villages, as well as the reasons for their emergence, although Tchalenko's ideas of the agricultural constrains of the massif's soil and the importance of oil. Elements such as the "urban" nature of the villages, the position and nature of the inhabitants or the types of crop that were planted have been convincingly counter argued.

Overall, Tchalenko's work, even if by now mostly surpassed and corrected, is still the main reference to any work related with the Limestone massif.

A tomar por culo.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Abadie-Reynal, C. 'Céramique et commerce dans le bassin égéen du I<sup>er</sup> au VIII<sup>e</sup> siècle' in *Hommes et richesses dan l'Empire byzantin*, 1989.

<sup>91</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 445

<sup>92</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 448-50, 620

<sup>84</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 105

<sup>85</sup> *Ibidem*, p.105; Cf Tate *Countryside*, pp. 60-1

<sup>86</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 114-5

<sup>87</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 113

<sup>88</sup> *Ibidem*, p. 114

<sup>89</sup> Wickham, *Framing the Early Middle Ages: Europe and the Mediterranean 400-800*, p. 443

<sup>90</sup> *Ibidem*, pp. 444-7

2. Casana, J. 2004, "The archaeological landscape of Late Roman Antioch" in I. Sandwell and J. Huskinson (eds.) *Culture and Society in Later Roman Antioch*.
3. De Francisco Olmos, J.M and Vico Monteoliva, J. 'Historia de la Moneda Visigoda. Las acuñaciones de Toledo' in *Hispania Gothorum: San Ildefonso y el Reino Visigodo de Toledo* 2007.
4. Foss, C. 1995 "The Near Eastern countryside in Late Antiquity: a review article" in *The Roman and byzantine Near East: Some Recent Archaeological Research*.
5. Gutiérrez Lloret, S. 'Eastern Spain in the Sixth Century', in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, 1998.
6. Hull, D. 2008, "A spatial and morphological analysis of monastic sites in the Northern Limestone massif, Syria" in *Levant: Journal of the Council for British Research in the Levant*, 40.
7. Loseby, S. 'Marseilles and the Pirene thesis I: Gregory of Tours, the Merovingian kings and "un grand port"', in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, 1998.
8. Panella, C. 'Gli scambi nel Mediterraneo Occidentale dal IV al VII secolo dal punto di vista di alcune «mera»' *Hommes et richesses dan l'Empire byzantin*, 1989.
9. Panella, C. 'Merci e scambi nel Mediterraneo tardoantico', in A. Carandini, L. Cracco Ruggini and A. Giardina (eds), *Storia di Roma*, III.ii, 1993.
10. Sodini, J.-P. *et alii*, 1980, "Déhès (Syrie du Nord), campagnes I-III (1976-1978): recherches sur l'habitat rural", *Syria* 58.
11. Tate, G. 1992, *Les Campagnes de la Syrie du Nord du IIe au VIIe siècle*.
12. Tate, G. 1997, "The Syrian countryside during the Roman era" in S. Alcock (ed.) *The Early Roman Empire in the East*.
13. Tchalenko, G. 1953-1958, *Villages antiques de la Syrie du Nord: Le Massif du Bélus à l'époque romaine*.
14. Ward-Perkins, B. 'Specialized Production and Exchange' in *Cambridge Ancient History XIV*.
15. Ward-Perkins, B. *The Fall of Rome and the End of Civilization*, 2005.
16. Wickham, C. 'Overview: production, distribution and demand' in R. Hodges and W. Bowden (eds), *The Sixth Century: Production, Distribution and Demand*, 1998.
17. Wickham, C. *Framing the Early Middle Ages*, 2005.
18. Wickham, C., 2005, *Framing the Early Middle Ages: Europe and the Mediterranean 400-800*.

# Great Britain Journal Press Membership

For Authors, subscribers, Boards and organizations



Great Britain Journals Press membership is an elite community of scholars, researchers, scientists, professionals and institutions associated with all the major disciplines. Great Britain memberships are for individuals, research institutions, and universities. Authors, subscribers, Editorial Board members, Advisory Board members, and organizations are all part of member network.

Read more and apply for membership here:  
<https://journalspress.com/journals/membership>



For Authors



For Institutions



For Subscribers

Author Membership provide access to scientific innovation, next generation tools, access to conferences/seminars/symposiums/webinars, networking opportunities, and privileged benefits. Authors may submit research manuscript or paper without being an existing member of GBJP. Once a non-member author submits a research paper he/she becomes a part of "Provisional Author Membership".

Society flourish when two institutions Come together." Organizations, research institutes, and universities can join GBJP Subscription membership or privileged "Fellow Membership" membership facilitating researchers to publish their work with us, become peer reviewers and join us on Advisory Board.

Subscribe to distinguished STM (scientific, technical, and medical) publisher. Subscription membership is available for individuals universities and institutions (print & online). Subscribers can access journals from our libraries, published in different formats like Printed Hardcopy, Interactive PDFs, EPUBs, eBooks, indexable documents and the author managed dynamic live web page articles, LaTeX, PDFs etc.



GO GREEN AND HELP  
SAVE THE ENVIRONMENT

## JOURNAL AVAILABLE IN

PRINTED VERSION, INTERACTIVE PDFS, EPUBS, EBOOKS, INDEXABLE DOCUMENTS AND THE AUTHOR MANAGED DYNAMIC LIVE WEB PAGE ARTICLES, LATEX, PDFS, RESTRUCTURED TEXT, TEXTILE, HTML, DOCBOOK, MEDIAWIKI MARKUP, TWIKI MARKUP, OPML, EMACS ORG-MODE & OTHER



SCAN TO KNOW MORE

[support@journalspress.com](mailto:support@journalspress.com)  
[www.journalspress.com](http://www.journalspress.com)



\*THIS JOURNAL SUPPORT AUGMENTED REALITY APPS AND SOFTWARES