



IMAGE: A MAP OF THE STARS OF THE ORION CONSTELLATION

Print ISSN: 2515-5784 Online ISSN: 2515-5794

# JournalPreview

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences  
Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



# JournalPreview

LONDON JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

This document is a pre-published view of London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences Volume 23, Issue 11 and Compilation 1.0. For any minor changes and updations kindly follow your paper's live editing URL given in sent email or get in touch with our support team at [support@journalspress.com](mailto:support@journalspress.com) or visit our website to use live chat support. This is a beta document thus order, content or existence of papers may alter in the published eJournal. You are requested to kindly acknowledge and approve your research paper in this JournalPreview within three days.

# Journal Content

In this Issue



Great Britain  
Journals Press

- i. Journal introduction and copyrights
- ii. Featured blogs and online content
- iii. Journal content
- iv. Curated Editorial Board Members

- 
- 1. Science Capital and Science Museums: Review of a CIMUSET Session in the General Conference of ICOM 2022. **1-3**
  - 2. Redefining Feminine Sensibility in Girish Karnad's Selected Plays: The Fire and the Rain and Naga-Mandala. **5-8**
  - 3. Multitudinary Crimes in the Scope of the Collective Criminal Process. **9-14**
  - 4. The Epistemic Resources of Bioethics and its Legitimation in Higher Education. **15-20**
  - 5. Lyrical Poetry of Nikola Milicevic – Opus and Microstructures. **21-33**
  - 6. Addressing Pre-Service Teachers Difficulties in Circle Theorems Through the Constructionist Approach. **35-44**

- 
- V. Great Britain Journals Press Membership



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Science Capital and Science Museums: Review of a CIMUSET Session in the General Conference of ICOM 2022

*Jessica Norberto Rocha & Gabriela Heck*

## ABSTRACT

What are the potentials and challenges for science museums to promote equity and justice from a science capital perspective? That was the theme of one of the CIMUSET sessions during the ICOM Conference in 2022. This review presents highlights from the panelists' presentations and the discussion afterward. The session demonstrates that museums recognize accessibility, inclusion, and diversity as relevant and urgent themes to be addressed. However, there is little concrete evidence of practice — especially regarding including people with disabilities. At the same time, the discussion highlighted weaknesses and sensitive topics, lessons learned, opportunities to be explored, and a field of practice and research to be deepened and broadened.

*Keywords:* science communication; science centers and museums; social inclusion.

*Classification:* FOR CODE: 200206

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573348  
Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Jessica Norberto Rocha & Gabriela Heck. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncom-mercial 4.0 Unported License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

# Science Capital and Science Museums: Review of a CIMUSET Session in the General Conference of ICOM 2022

Jessica Norberto Rocha<sup>a</sup> & Gabriela Heck<sup>a</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*What are the potentials and challenges for science museums to promote equity and justice from a science capital perspective? That was the theme of one of the CIMUSET sessions during the ICOM Conference in 2022. This review presents highlights from the panelists' presentations and the discussion afterward. The session demonstrates that museums recognize accessibility, inclusion, and diversity as relevant and urgent themes to be addressed. However, there is little concrete evidence of practice – especially regarding including people with disabilities. At the same time, the discussion highlighted weaknesses and sensitive topics, lessons learned, opportunities to be explored, and a field of practice and research to be deepened and broadened.*

**Keywords:** science communication; science centers and museums; social inclusion.

## I. ICOM 2022 AND THE NEW DEFINITION OF MUSEUM

Between 20-28 August 2022, it was held in Praha (Czech Republic) the International Council Of Museums General Conference (ICOM 2022). The conference's summit was the approval of the new definition of a museum:

A museum is a not-for-profit, permanent institution in the service of society that researches, collects, conserves, interprets and exhibits tangible and intangible heritage. Open to the public, accessible and inclusive, museums foster diversity and sustainability. They operate and communicate ethically, professionally and with the participation of communities, offering varied experiences for

education, enjoyment, reflection and knowledge sharing (ICOM, 2022).

After many years of discussions, the qualifiers "accessible," "inclusive," and "diversity" were added to the definition bringing light to changes (and challenges) in the social role of museums.

## II. SCIENCE CAPITAL AND SCIENCE MUSEUMS - THE SESSION

Aligned with this new perspective of a museum, one of the sessions held by the Committee for Science and Technology Museums (CIMUSET, from French Comité International des Musées de Sciences et des Techniques) was entitled "Science Capital: Exploring Potentials and Challenges for Science Museums to Foster Equity and Justice." According to the session description, its objective was to promote a discussion on the potentials and challenges for science museums to promote equity and justice from a science capital perspective. Thus, it was proposed to rethink the role of science museums, focusing on including voices that are not being heard and people who are, in general, not participants in museums' activities - for example, communities of black people, indigenous communities, needy communities, immigrants, and refugees.

The session proposed Science Capital as a key point of the discussion. This concept was developed to explain patterns of scientific aspiration and participation in science among young people, which is fundamental to promoting equity in the field of STEM [Archer, Dewitt & Willis, 2014; Archer *et al.*, 2015]. One of its results is the Equity Compass: a tool developed to deepen equity issues in the scientific field and guide equitable and transformative pedagogical practices [Yestem, 2020].

A Brazilian researcher from Museu da Vida (Museum of Life) from Oswaldo Cruz Foundation was the session's chair in which six researchers, museum professionals, and science communicators from North and South Americas and Europe participated. A University College London (UK) professor explained science capital and equity compass. Two professionals from the Science Museum Group (SMG) (UK) addressed the science capital approach at the institutions. A Colombian professional from the interactive science center Maloka, located in Bogotá, contributed with reflections on science capital in the Latin American context. A Danish professional from the Museum of Science and Technology in Denmark discussed how to face and eradicate exclusionary practices in science museums. Lastly, a Canadian professional from the Ingenium Museum spoke about building a bridge between science and society through the lenses of science capital.

After approximately 50 minutes of presentation by the panelists, the audience was invited to ask questions and share experiences. Faced with the emerging issue of accessibility and inclusion of people with disabilities, we asked the following questions: "When you talk about inclusion and diversity, are you also thinking about people with disabilities and how your programs target these audiences?"

Regarding this first question, the professional who works for SMG answered that "*inclusion means everyone*," suggesting that they consider people with disabilities in the science capital framework. She informed to the audience that the SMG has a staff member that is *head of access and inclusion*, responsible for mitigating barriers that people have to engage at any level, not only for disability but also emotional or intellectual. The Danish professional commented that, in his institution, still there's no staff responsible for addressing specifically the theme of inclusion – an issue that needs to be transformed by changing the organization's mindset. Lastly, addressing the Canadian context, the professional refers to the Accessibility Act of Canada and states that her museum compels it, promoting different accessibility practices. Still, even before the Act,

they already worked with an inclusion, diversity, and accessibility framework.

Specifically for the professor developing the "Science Capital" concept, we also asked: "How does the equity compass address people with disabilities? Do you know any other research (apart from Heck's<sup>1</sup>) that addresses people with disabilities, equity compass, and science capital?" She explained that the Equity Compass was developed to be used across any form of intersectional injustice. It means it can be used in a disability context or perspective, as well as gender or race. She considered that it might be helpful to work on specific case studies about particular areas - in special people with disabilities, given that intersectionality is very complex, involves different societal issues, and people can forget some of them.

She concluded by saying she currently leads a project called "Making Spaces"<sup>2</sup>, funded by Lloyd's Register Foundation. One of the project's partners is an adaptive designer based in New York who works with people with disabilities. So, she hopes the group will have more exciting case studies in the future. Finally, she did not mention or refer to any other research that has applied the Equity Compass to this particular area.

### III. DISCUSSION AND CHALLENGES

Following up on the panelists' answers, a practitioner from the audience – who works in a science center in Pakistan – commented that her institution had undergone an audition process highlighting the importance of being more accessible. She clarified that apart from complying with local policies, they also aim to be broad their inclusive practices; however, it has been challenging for them for many reasons, such as institutional change and professional training and expertise.

Through this productive discussion, we could perceive that the challenge was not only in the Pakistani case. With the insights from the panelists and other people from different parts of

<sup>1</sup> See Heck [2022]

<sup>2</sup> <https://m4kingspaces.org/about/>

the globe that were in the audience, it became evident that accessibility, inclusion, and diversity incorporated in the new definition of museums are still a process under development in practice and theory. From our point of view, the CIMUSET session demonstrates that institutions recognize the theme's relevance, and some try to combine it with the ideas of "science capital" and "equity compass." However, when questions and discussion came, the responses predominantly focused on theory and the need for an organizational change—as Reich (2014) had already stated in her Ph.D. thesis. There is little concrete evidence of practice — especially regarding including people with disabilities.

Either incentivized and based on literature or demanded by international conventions and national laws and policies, these science museums are still crawling towards more practical and concrete actions towards the new museum's qualifiers. The CIMUSET section was undoubtedly a success and served as a strong and promising starting point. While it brought to light weaknesses and sensitive topics to discussion, there are lessons to be learned, opportunities to be explored, and an entire field of practice and research to be further explored and developed in the coming years.

The 2022 CIMUSET session during the ICOM conference demonstrated that the issue of accessibility can be further explored, with an interest in investigating and improving practical actions to make museums more accessible and inclusive to everyone. In this perspective, it is essential to mention that this topic is becoming increasingly relevant, to the point where it will be the focus of the next CIMUSET Conference taking place in 2023 in South Korea, titled "Enhancing Accessibility to Museums." The upcoming meeting will provide a valuable opportunity to further advance in this area, share experiences, discuss challenges, and promote the development of guidelines and best practices.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Jessica Norberto Rocha thanks National Council for Scientific and Technological (CNPq) for the

Productivity Grant in Science Communication field and the Carlos Chagas Filho Foundation for Research Support of the State of Rio de Janeiro (FAPERJ) for the grant Young Scientist of Our State. Gabriela Heck acknowledges the financial support provided by the Coordination for the Improvement of Higher Education Personnel – Brazil (CAPES) – Finance Code 001.

## REFERENCES

1. Archer, L., Dawson, E., Dewitt, J., Seakins, A. & Wong, B. (2015). "Science capital": A Conceptual, Methodological, and Empirical Argument for Extending Bourdieusian Notions of Capital Beyond the Arts. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 52(7), 922–948.
2. Archer, L., Dewitt, J. & Willis, B. (2014). Adolescent boys' science aspirations: Masculinity, capital, and power. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 51(1), 1–30.
3. Heck, G. S. (2022). *Museus de ciências como espaços de construção do capital da ciência de pessoas com deficiência*. In *Anais do II Seminário Discente do PPGEDU-PUCRS [Seminário]*. Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, Brasil.
4. ICOM. (2022). ICOM is pleased to announce that the proposal for the new museum definition was approved. Retrieved from: <https://icom.museum/en/news/icom-approves-a-new-museum-definition/>
5. Reich, C. A. (2014). *Taking Action Toward Inclusion: Organizational Change and the Inclusion of People with Disabilities in Museum Learning*. [Doctoral dissertation]. Boston College University Libraries.
6. Yestem Project UK Team. (2020). *The Equity Compass: A tool for supporting socially just practice*. London: YESTEM Project UK Team.

*This page is intentionally left blank*



Scan to know paper details and author's profile

# Redefining Feminine Sensibility in Girish Karnad's Selected Plays: The Fire and the Rain and Naga-Mandala

*Seema Jaysi*

## ABSTRACT

Feminine word is related to women or girl and it's considered suitable for them. The word feminine is used for the inner units of the self and sensibility in the fragrance of an artist's personality. It means an artist's (women) is identified and distinguished by their sensibility that is self-identity. Feminism is used to describe political, cultural or economic movement aimed for establishing equal rights and legal protection for women in society. Girish Karnad's plays are very significant from feministic point of view. His plays ridicule the unjust values of the patriarchal society which does not care for the feelings of a woman and considers her a subordinate that exists only to serve him with absolute loyalty. The plays – The Fire and the Rain and Naga-Mandala these elements are all there to serve the purpose of the dramatist. The paper highlights the pathetic condition undergone by the women characters in selected play of Girish Karnad. The paper presents Girish Karnad's effort to redefine the position of women in the society that has always limited their opportunities. His feminist sensibility is allowing his heroines to struggle for their identity with respect. He presents truth about human life and emotions contained in ancient Indian stories with alteration of social or moral values and modern norms.

*Keywords:* feminine, patriarchal society, self-identity, pathetic condition, social and moral values.

*Classification:* FOR CODE: 20052

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573348  
Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Seema Jaysi. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

# Redefining Feminine Sensibility in Girish Karnad's Selected Plays: The Fire and the Rain and Naga-Mandala

Seema Jaysi

## ABSTRACT

*Feminine word is related to women or girl and it's considered suitable for them. The word feminine is used for the inner units of the self and sensibility in the fragrance of an artist's personality. It means an artist's (women) is identified and distinguished by their sensibility that is self-identity. Feminism is used to describe political, cultural or economic movement aimed for establishing equal rights and legal protection for women in society. Girish Karnad's plays are very significant from feministic point of view. His plays ridicule the unjust values of the patriarchal society which does not care for the feelings of a woman and considers her a subordinate that exists only to serve him with absolute loyalty. The plays – The Fire and the Rain and Naga-Mandala these elements are all there to serve the purpose of the dramatist. The paper highlights the pathetic condition undergone by the women characters in selected play of Girish Karnad. The paper present Girish Karnad effort to redefine the position of women in the society that has always limited their opportunities. His feminist sensibility is allowing his heroines to struggle for their identity with respect. He presents truth about human life and emotions contained in ancient Indian stories with alteration of social or moral values and modern norms.*

**Keywords:** feminine, patriarchal society, self-identity, pathetic condition, social and moral values.

## I. INTRODUCTION

The word 'Feminism' comes from French word 'Feminism' means 'of the female sex' or 'Mature Woman'. The feminism is a cultural structure of

marginality in relation to patriarchal orthodox society. Its origin is the fact that in all societies which divide the sexes into different cultural, economic or political spheres. Women are always referred in sub-ordinate position as objects or show piece where men are treated as subject which is always argumentative in nature. In broadly, we can say that feminism to consider as the social relation with reference to patriarchy and gender-bias. It is a critical theory aimed at analysis gender in relation to the true position of women in society. Feminism is a women's movement which struggle or aim for equal right for women and men involving in a fair competition with male dominated society. However, this movement has, to face many challenges different issues like stereotype sex role, politics of patriarchal system etc. Hole and Levine point out that "the socially unequal position of women throughout history is not the result of biology, but is due to the value which society has placed at any given time on the biological differences between the two sexes"<sup>1</sup> (Bhagwat, p.30) According to Janet Richards, "The essence of Feminism has a strong fundamental case intended to mean only that there are excellent reasons for thinking that women suffer from systematic social injustice because of their sex, the proposition is to be regardless as continuing Feminism"<sup>2</sup>(Janet, p.03).

The play 'The Fire and the Rain', (1998) is the most successful play, based on the myth of 'Yavakri' from the Mahabharata. It is an English trans-creation of a play in Kannada with the title "Agni Mattu Male" (1994- 95) with his own playwright. In play, the writer show different feminist issues which include the socio-political, role of womanhood, sex role, identity, race,

liberation and reflection of socially imposed values on women in a diverse manner. Vishakha and Nittilai are two major female characters pushed into the tangled network of the action, controlled by the male domination in the play. The study of the characters of Vishakha and Nittilai demands the analysis of belonging to two different social- cultural statuses in society. Karnad, through the character of Vishakha, openly criticize the typical image of a women constructed by the society where a women is expected to remain 'silent' or 'dumb' as an object of suppression. Karnad thinks nothing is wrong in extramarital affairs of married women and he boldly shows extramarital relationship in his most plays. In an interview with Tutun Mukherjee, when he says, "I used to know a married woman once who positively blossomed after she had an extra marital affair"<sup>3</sup> (Mukherjee, p.43). So, he wants his reader to understand that every human being has desires not only men, but a woman too has desires which should be given an equal opportunity in the society, without granting cheats in masculine system.

In this play, the two women characters Vishakha and Nittilai, the innocent women who were victimized and subjected to tremendous pain, insult, suffer from gender injustice which gradually helped them to be bewildered and supplicating into strong, bold and rational women. Vishakha, a Brahmin girl is married to Paravasu, sage Raibhya's elder son in a high caste Brahmin family. After one year, Vishakha's married life became joyless and companionless and she falls easily to the hand of the male persecution and loneliness torments who wish (seamlessly) explore her body as an experiments or even worse. Vishakha affirms, "There was no happiness in that exploration as we experimented with our bodies. He used me as an instrument for search; I didn't know what the search was for. I yielded to him and let my body be turned inside out, as he did his own. I didn't know whether it was a mystical or spiritual search for something which could not be defined. Only the sense pervaded the air"<sup>4</sup> (The Fire and the Rain, p.68). Then Nittilai is a virtuous and beautiful tribal girl belongs to a lower caste family which shows

women are equally subjected to harsh behavior, displacement and inevitable victims beyond social order as patriarchal system denies the backgrounds of women's social status. Vishakha's openly objection against being treated as an instrument of exchange between men as she had to meet the expectation to fulfill the sexual desire of both her husband Paravasu and her former lover Yavakri. Vishakha, expresses her feeling, "My husband and you! How different the two of you are! He didn't leave even a pore of my body unexplored- and you think that a women is only a pair of half-formed breasts" (p.68). Nittilai also has to face many challenges to create place for herself within her own society although being low caste tribal community. It doesn't matter whether a woman belongs to which class or caste but there is little chance for women to escape the suffering of the gender-bias. Karnad makes a very clever use of Nittilai character who courage to challenges the oppression imposed upon her by the violent and male dominant subjects. Nittilai is frank, bold and fearless girl. She is a fearless critic of Brahmanism and rationally exposes its deceitfulness, hypocrisy and opaqueness. She proudly quotes what her father says; "These high-caste men are always glad enough to bed our women but not to wed them" (p.60). She is criticizing of the secretiveness of high-caste Brahman. As a reformer Karnad wants to reform his society for which he has uncovered the hypocrisy, double standard and hollowness of the Brahmins who always held the highest position in society. As a social reformer Nittilai asks very brave questions to Yavakri who claims to earn pursuit of knowledge. She says that she would ask just two questions about his Universal Knowledge. "First, can he make it rain? And, second, can he predict the hour of his own death?"(p.62) At this point Nittilai's thinks, all knowledge is fruitless if it doesn't lead to the well-being of the people.

Vishakha is another revolutionary character Karnad has portrayed. She is a passionate person but her personal life is ruined and left to suffer alone, homeless and without any support to flower in her youthful age. "Women were less valued than man"<sup>5</sup> (Kosta, p.200). Vishakha

becomes the victim of the power struggle among the male dominated characters of upper-class bigotry to which she gradually appears more intensely conscious to control their fates. Now time allowed her to take revenge on Yavakri, in his unpleasant plan which she came to know that Yavakri, in his obsession of desire for revenge, molests her to retort the misbehavior done to his father, by her husband's family. Vishakha thinks that she has been used by Yavakri as instrument, weapon of vengeance and Universal Knowledge that he attained couldn't help him to possess noble idea. So, it's time now to take final step to save her family from giant Yavakri when she pours out the sanctified water from Yavakri's kamandalu. Vishakha empties the water: Vishakha starts emptying Yavakri's kamandalu by pouring the water out, calmly and slowly. Yavakri's looks at her and shouts. (p.76) Yavakri has to become the fall guy (scapegoat) of her treachery which exemplifies her intellectual presence of mind. She does not forgive Yavakri even when he cries out: "I love you, Vishakha. I have not looked at another woman in my whole life. Is it my fault that you happened to marry Paravasu?" (p.76) Hence, Yavakri is killed by Brahma Rakshasa as she takes her revenge and now realizes her strength or full potential to free from abused enslaved sexuality.

Rani, the female protagonist of the play 'Naga-Mandala', as her name itself justifies she is beautiful and looks like a princess. Karnad describes her personality as "Queen of the whole wide world. Queen of the long tresses"<sup>6</sup> (Naga-Mandala, p.56). She was married with Appana Rani feel happy for her new life starts with husband but her happiness was not for a long time. The day entered her husband house she was treated like a maid-servant for which she is thrashed in tears. And Appana has enjoys openly extra-marital affair with a bazaar harlot. He locks her in the alone house where she lives a life without any hope and identity. Rani is neglected by her husband Appana and the rights of a wife are given to that concubine. At the starting Rani appears as the image of an ideal Indian woman bashful and unquestioning just as the ensign of 'subordinate' where Rani is looked

in her own husband house. She obeys her husband order like a dumb. Women in India are taken for granted as men have failed to understand that she too has emotion and feeling. She is exploited easily because she is an innocent girl and no one care to ask for her sentiments. In the alone house of her husband, Rani is locked-up "like a caged bird?" (p.88) symbolizes the chain of restrictions placed around women, which denies ever her legal rights and blocks her natural growth.

Presently, Rani realizes the importance of self-identity that awaits another point of view as though it seems Karnad is giving a twist to these – old custom by portraying Rani's resolve to get release from the oppression of these situation. This way Karnad's seems to legalise the sexual intercourse between human and inhuman world that provide enjoyment and peace. In fact Karnad ask question and expose the problem of the identity of women that provide him a space to tackle the women issues. The story starts with Rani who for the start of new married life from complete sincere to fulfillment of experience to assert her identity. It is at the instruction of Kurudavva, an old blind women is a close friend of Appanna's mother. She offers Rani magic root that is a powerful love potion. With the help of that magic root, she finds Naga (King Cobra) mythical snake falls in love with Rani. Naga provides the role of passionate lover to give the sexual pleasure to Rani.

Karnad locates the complicated suspense of Rani's circumstance which ultimately helps her to break-out of the moral codes imposed by society. She also wants a male partner in her life with whom she desire for love and happiness. Her inner urge remains repressed and at any cost she has to fulfill her sexual desires with the first appearance of Naga, Rani gets faith and commitment in her body. She feels heavenly marital joy or happiness in company of Naga that become a wonderful world for her. By which Karnad gives a twist to the Indian tradition. Naga who become the form of Appanna and starts visiting her during the night whose love helps her to forget the demonic world of her cruel husband. Her capability to recognize her own selfness leads

her place or value to acquire a subject status beyond the status of male. She looks to be a free woman who shows the dare to overcome the model of gender-bias society. The Cobra- a passionate lover Naga, who fulfills the wish of his beloved Rani with gift of motherhood, finally has to sacrifice his life for the sake of love.” Naga presses Rani’s hair to his body” (p.96). Whatsoever the special care and love she doesn’t get from her husband in real world, Rani gets it from Naga. In the presence of Naga, she starts to feel in safe hand, happy and comfortable thus breaking her isolation when she says to Naga,” Let it come. When you’re there by my side, I don’t care” (p.76).

Rani gets to experience the wedded bliss in the company of her lover Naga. Further, she forces Appanna who represents patriarchal male-dominance in his misbehavior to accept the reality of his wife in front of the village elders when she becomes pregnant. While Appanna questions her chastity when she is put on the ordeal to prove her loyalty by virtue of the snake-ordeal in front of the society without thinking her mental and physical condition. All villagers bring to heel her position. No one shows the sympathy for innocent and pregnant woman everyone wants to prove her purity. Rani puts on snake-ordeal and proves her chastity. And everyone applauds Rani’s innocence and the village elder declare that she is not a simple woman, but a ‘Divine Being’, ‘a Goddess’ and her husband Appanna is forced to accept her with respect in front of public as the Elder announces:

*Elder I:* Appanna, your wife is no ordinary woman. She is the incarnation of a goddess. Don’t feel sorry that you doubted her and ill-treated her. This is how goddesses reveal themselves to the world. You were chosen as the instrument to reveal your wife’s divine status to the world. (p.93).

Karnad thus making a challenging task by balancing the power to remove patriarchal dominance society and the identity is restored when he declares, “Rani gave birth to a beautiful child. It was son. And Rani lived happily ever after with her husband, child and servant.”(p.94)

and Rani recovers her identity as a respectful wife and mother.

In the two plays *the fire and the Rain and Naga-Mandala* Karnad’s has intentionally refined sensibility the women characters to raise their powerful voice against injustice and suppression which signifies a positive message on our modern society. By exploring the lives of women caged by patriarchal dominated society. Karnad has taken the responsibility of underlined women to free their lives from the bondages of male chauvinism. Actually, through these women character Karnad has explored the symptoms of refined sensibility which has enable them to fight against traditional rules of patriarchal society. It is observed that here Vishakha endeavour to create space for herself in the crossroads of conventional custom. Nittilai free herself from a forced shackle of marriage despite the traditional norms of patriarchal system. Even Rani recovers her position from total declension to unique power.

## REFERENCE

1. Bhagwat, Vidyut. (2004). “Feminist Social Thought.” New Delhi: Rawat Publication, P.30.
2. Janet, Richards. (1981) Print. ‘Women Writers Talking.’ Cambridge: London, p.3.
3. Mukherjee, Tutun. (2008). Girish Karnad’s Plays, Performance and Critical Perspectives. New Delhi: Pencraft.
4. Batra, Shakti. (2020). Girish Karnad The Fire and the Rain: A Critical Study. (Fifth Reprint 2020). New Delhi: Surjeet Publication, p.68, 68, 60, 62, 76, 76.
5. Kosta, Abhishek. (2012). The Plays of Girish Karnad: A Study in Myths and Gender. New Delhi: Creative Book, p.200.
6. Batra, Shakti. (2015). Girish Karnad Naga-Mandala: A Critical Study. (Sixth Reprint 2015). New Delhi: Surjeet Publication, p.56, 88, 96, 76, 93, 94.
7. Hazarika, Munmi. (2017). Feminine Sensibility in Girish Karnad’s Plays. RJELAL. Vol.5. Issue 1. <http://www.rjelal.com>.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Multitudinary Crimes in the Scope of the Collective Criminal Process

*Almir Santos Reis Junior & Gilciane Allen Baretta*

*Catholic University of Mozambique*

## ABSTRACT

Multitudinary crimes are those committed by several people, however, without a subjective link. Such crimes are committed in collective turmoil. For this reason, considering the principle of individualization of the penalty, in the procedural phase, it becomes relevant to verify the need (or not) to identify the participation of each agent during the commission of the crime in order to establish the criminal responsibility of each one since the initial accusation, in compliance with the constitutional principles of culpability and the personality of the penalty. The absence of factual elements, collected in the investigation, may not allow the identification of the conduct of each agent in the commission of the crime. Therefore, it is necessary to analyze if the concept of collective criminal procedure can be applied in the scope of multitudinary crimes in order to relativize the content of the initial, described in article 41, of the Code of Criminal Procedure, to the point of describing the facts in a generic way, that is, refraining from individualizing the conduct of each agent. Therefore, the hypothetical-deductive method will be used in relation to the doctrinal source. It is expected that the results of the research can contribute, in the procedural sphere, with grounds for criminal proceedings in multitudinary crimes.

**Keywords:** multitudinaria crimes. individualization of the penalty. collective criminal process. responsibility.

**Classification:** FOR CODE: 1801

**Language:** English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573348  
Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



# Multitudinary Crimes in the Scope of the Collective Criminal Process

Almir Santos Reis Junior<sup>α</sup> & Gilciane Allen Baretta<sup>σ</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*Multitudinary crimes are those committed by several people, however, without a subjective link. Such crimes are committed in collective turmoil. For this reason, considering the principle of individualization of the penalty, in the procedural phase, it becomes relevant to verify the need (or not) to identify the participation of each agent during the commission of the crime in order to establish the criminal responsibility of each one since the initial accusation, in compliance with the constitutional principles of culpability and the personality of the penalty. The absence of factual elements, collected in the investigation, may not allow the identification of the conduct of each agent in the commission of the crime. Therefore, it is necessary to analyze if the concept of collective criminal procedure can be applied in the scope of multitudinary crimes in order to relativize the content of the initial, described in article 41, of the Code of Criminal Procedure, to the point of describing the facts in a generic way, that is, refraining from individualizing the conduct of each agent. Therefore, the hypothetical-deductive method will be used in relation to the doctrinal source. It is expected that the results of the research can contribute, in the procedural sphere, with grounds for criminal proceedings in multitudinary crimes.*

**Keywords:** multitudinaria crimes. individualization of the penalty. collective criminal process. responsibility.

**Author α:** PhD in Criminal Law from the Pontifical Catholic University of São Paulo. Professor of the Masters and Doctorate Courses in Law at the Catholic University of Mozambique. Adjunct Professor TIDE of the Law course at the State University of Maringá (UEM). He served as coordinator of specialization

courses in Criminal Sciences and Criminal Expertise, offered by PUC/PR, where he was also a professor, for 14 years, in the undergraduate course in Law. Research Group: Multitudinary crimes in the scope of the collective criminal process – State University of Maringá.

**σ:** Doctoral Student in Law at the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul. Master in Criminal Law from the State University of Maringá (UEM). Undergraduate and Graduate Professor in the Law course at the State University of Maringá (UEM). Research Group: Multitudinary crimes in the scope of collective criminal process – State University of Maringá.

## I. INTRODUCTION

First of all, it is important to point out that multitudinous crimes are those committed by several people, without a subjective link, in a collective turmoil and the biggest problem, in these kinds of crimes, lies in the difficulty in identifying the participation of each agent during the commission of the crime.

So, this article intends to focus on the discussion about multitudinary crimes and the need (or not) to individualize the facts committed by agents, since in such crimes there is no subjective link between the participants. The unit of the process occurs, therefore, by the occasional intersubjective connection or by simultaneity, understood as that in which two or more crimes have been committed, at the same time, by several people together (art. 76, I, 1st part, CPP).

Considering the difficulty in knowing how each person acted in the commission of the crime, in order to individualize their conduct, it is important to analyze the possibility of mitigating this individualization in the initial accusation, from a procedural point of view. Therefore, it is necessary to verify if the concept of collective

criminal procedure can be applied in the scope of multitudinary crimes, in order to relativize the content of the initial accusation, described in article 41 of the Criminal Procedure Code.

For this, the hypothetical-deductive method was used in relation to the doctrinal source, and, in the sequence, were indicated the hypotheses that were tested through the bibliographical research technique.

## II. THE PROBLEM OF MULTITUDINARY CRIMES IN THE PROCEDURAL SCOPE

In the study of multitudinary crimes, there is a certain misinterpretation of its concept. This is because, as already mentioned, they are those practiced by several people, without a subjective link, in collective turmoil.

In this context, the great difficulty is to identify the participation of each agent during the commission of the crime in order to establish the criminal responsibility of each one, in compliance with the constitutional principles of culpability and personality of the penalty.

Here lies precisely one of the main discussions on this matter - the possibility of a concurrence of agents in crimes committed by people in a crowd: on the one hand, there are those who believe the existence of a concurrence of people *sui generis*, because,

the collective commission of the crime, in these circumstances, despite occurring in a normally traumatic situation, does not rule out the existence of psychological links between the members of the crowd, that characterize the concurrence of people. In crimes committed by a delinquent crowd, it is unnecessary to describe in detail the participation of each of the actors, otherwise it will make the application of the law infeasible. The greater or lesser participation of each one will be object of the criminal instruction (BITENCOURT, 2021, p. 276 - our translation).

On the other hand, there are those who claim that “the psychological link between the agents cannot

be presumed and must be demonstrated in the concrete case, so that all can be held for the result arising from the sum of the conducts” (GRECO, 2019, p. 125; our translation).

It is worth noting that those who commit the crime under the influence of a crowd in turmoil will have their penalties mitigated, as determined by article 65, III, e, of the Penal Code. This because,

The mitigating factor thus recognizes the lesser culpability of the individual who is influenced by the crowd in turmoil, if he has not provoked it. It is not necessary that the subject has participated in the turmoil, but that it has influenced his criminal resolution. The turmoil of the crowd must exert a decisive influence on the configuration of the criminal will, therefore, the lesser exigibility of different conduct that will be directed to the subject (GALVÃO, 2017. p. 883; our translation).

In this sense, there are decisions that do not recognize the mitigating factor provided for in article 65, III, e, of the Penal Code, when the crimes of homicide were not committed under the influence of a crowd in turmoil, but rather, for a pre-existing reason, consisting of the victims' refusal to pay to prison leaders and to continue to their hunger strike:

[...] 8. The recognition of the mitigating circumstance of having the agent 'committed the crime under the influence of a crowd in turmoil, if he did not provoke it', provided for in article 65, item III, item 'e', of the Penal Code, if the appellant did not commit the crimes under that circumstance (TJDFT, APR 20141210025335, 2<sup>a</sup> T., Rel. Roberval Casemiro Belinati, DJe 31/03/2016, p. 10-148; our translation).

There are also judicial decisions in the sense of the inapplicability of this mitigating factor when the appellant was the cause of the disturbance:

[...] 3. The influence of a crowd, in the midst of turmoil (art. 65, item III, item 'e', of the Penal Code. (...), the accused cannot take

advantage of the turmoil which he caused, not proceeding, on the point, even to speak of a crowd, a mass dominated by the collective spirit of aggression, since the appellant was responsible for the beginning of the melee, opting, after the physical fight with the victim has ceased, to attempt three times against her life, using his vehicle for that purpose (TJDFT, APR 20110710026799, 1<sup>a</sup> T., Rel. Mário Machado, DJe 18/08/2011, p. 294; our translation).

In addition, those who promote, organize or lead the criminal practice or direct the activity of others will have the aggravated penalty, according to the intelligence of article 62, I, of the Penal Code.

It is also important to emphasize that “in cases where the turmoil provoked by the crowd is a condition for the very configuration of a crime, such as a feud, obviously the mitigating factor will not be considered, as it is an element of the crime” (BOSCHI, 2014, p. 238-239; our translation).

So, another point that we have to analyze is the need (or not) to individualize the acts committed by the agents, since in such crimes there is no subjective link between the participants. The unity of the process and the judgment is therefore given by the occasional intersubjective connection.

The possibility of mitigating the individualization of conducts, in the initial accusation, becomes relevant from the procedural point of view, because of the difficulty in knowing how each agent acted during the commission of the crime, since the observance of individualization can lead to impunity. Therefore, it is necessary to verify if the concept of collective criminal procedure can be applied in the scope of multitudinary crimes, in order to relativize the content of the initial accusation, described in article 41, of the Code of Criminal Procedure, to the point of describing the facts in a generic way, that is, refraining from individualizing the conduct of each agent.

### *2.1 In Search of Collective Criminal Procedure*

The collective process does not exist separately from the codified system, because its institutes are informed by traditional precepts and by concepts already elaborated, which must be reviewed from the perspective of collective legal relations. In the collective process, it is necessary to re-read the classic dogmatics, considering the peculiarities of collective interests (LEONEL, 2002, p. 89).

The collective process gained ground in Brazil, with the advent of the Consumer Protection Code. For Ada Pelegrini Grinover (2018, p. 480),

Finally, with the 1990 Consumer Protection Code, Brazil was able to count on a true microsystem of collective processes, composed of the Code that also created the category of homogeneous individual interests or rights - and Law n. 7.347/85, interacting through the reciprocal application of the provisions of the two laws.

In Brazil, there are several microsystems that deal with collective interests and, therefore, collective protection, such as the Public Civil Action Law, the Consumer Protection Code, the Child and Adolescent Statute, the Law for the Defense of Investors in the Securities Market, the Law for the Defense of Persons with Disabilities, the Antitrust Law, the Law of Administrative Improbity and the Organic Legislation of the Public Prosecutor's Office.

The legitimacy of the Public Prosecutor's Office to act in collective proceedings is not discussed, because it must always operate in the defense of collective interests and, in this kind of process, the legal possibility of the request will be viable, as long as there is no express legal prohibition. In this sense, for Ricardo de Barros Leonel (2002, p. 435),

In examining issues of collective process, the starting point should always be the premise that the legal operator must 'think collectively', examining procedural problems based on the idea that he is not dealing with an individual controversy. Although the

observation seems obvious, most of the mistakes that are made, in this matter, result from reasoning based on valid premises for individual demands, but insubstantial to solve doubts related to collective protection. It will be unfeasible to grant adequate dimension and operability to the collective process without changing mentality (our translation).

The collective process must fulfill an ethical and moral role, because of the possibility of several people being part of the passive pole of the procedural relationship, although there is no subjective link between them, in order to comply with the principle of procedural economy.

Its essence is always based when there are meta-individual or collective interests, as occurs, for example, in the areas of security, tax, consumer, traffic and environment, that is, interests that are linked to community relations and not to the individual in isolation.

In this area, the study about the possibility of applying the provisions of the collective procedure in the scope of criminal procedural, especially in the so-called multitudinary crimes, becomes prominent, in view of the difficulty founded, in the preliminary phase of the criminal procedure, in the identification and individualization of the cooperation of each agent in relation to the various crimes committed.

It must not be forgotten that, for the occurrence of a multitudinary crime, there must be a collective action and imputation. In this kind of crime, all the agents' conducts are in the same direction, however, without a subjective link between them for this purpose. In other words, this kind of crime has its origin through a turmoil in which there is the participation of several agents who, in an accidental unity of purpose, can offend a plurality of legal interests. Its most relevant feature lies, as stated above, in the lack of prior agreement between the contenders, a fact that makes it difficult the personal identification of each participant or co-author in the commission of the crime.

In the criminal scope, when analyzing the "Carandiru Massacre", which took place on

October 2, 1992, as a result of a confrontation between prisoners at the São Paulo House of Detention (called Carandiru) and military police officers, to contain a rebellion that took place there and which resulted in the death of more than 111 prisoners and many others wounded, due to the excessive violence used in this action, it is a true example of a multitudinary crime.

A police investigation was started and the fact was notified to the Military Justice, and then it was sent to the common justice system, "as well as an international complaint to the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, in order to hold the State responsible for the crimes committed by public agents who acted in contempt of the Democratic State of Law" (OLIVEIRA, 2022; our translation), however, it was not possible to identify and individualize the conduct that each defendant practiced, that is, it was not possible to describe and, therefore, delimit the contribution of each criminal agent, in the initial accusation, in relation to all those deaths.

The same occurs in the criminal practice against economic order, more specifically, the "cartel formation", provided for in article 4, II, of Law 8.137/90, in which the identification of the conduct of each agent is difficult to be accomplished, a fact that currently, under the existing criminal procedural basis, can lead of impunity.

Indeed, in crimes of this nature, it is not possible to clearly describe, in the initial accusation, the action committed by each of the agents. Therefore, generic complaints, which face the requirements of article 41 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and, consequently, the individualization of criminal behavior, that involves the typical description of multitudinary crimes, needs to be debated in order to verify the need to reject the denunciation, for being inept, in the form of article 395, I, of the Code of Criminal Procedure or receive it, considering the impossibility of describing the individual conduct, but rather the collective conduct and the result.

Moreover, perhaps the best moment to identify the individual conduct of the defendant is at the

criminal instruction stage. However, if it is not possible to identify it during the criminal proceedings, as it is a crime of a multitudinary nature, it becomes necessary for the judge to reevaluate its contents in order to proceed the individualization, due to its relevance when he recognizes the validity of the punitive intention and starts to the dosimetry of the penalty.

In this sense, the jurisprudence of the Federal Supreme Court has been oriented towards admitting the generic narration of the facts, without discrimination of the specific conduct of each defendant (CPP, art. 41), when it is a multitudinary crime, behold, only the instruction can clarify who, participated or remained unrelated to the illicit action or the result obtained with it. In this case law, the denunciation indicates the fact attributed to the patient and allows the exercise of the right of defense:

HABEAS-CORPUS. CRIMES, IN MATERIAL CONCURRENCE, OF EXCHANGE RATE FRAUD AND FRAUD, IN CRIMINAL CONTINUITY, AND GANG FORMATION. ALLEGATION OF INEPTITUDE OF THE DENUNCIATION AND LACK OF JUST CAUSE FOR THE CRIMINAL ACTION: MULTITUDINARY CRIME OR JOINT OR COLLECTIVE AUTHORSHIP. 1. It is not ineligible to denounce any omissions regarding the requirements of art. 41 of the CPP - which can be replaced at any time, before the final sentence (art. 569 of the CPP) -, as long as it allows the exercise of the right of defense. The defendant must defend himself against the facts alleged against him and not against the kind of criminal offense invoked in the denunciation. 2. In crimes of collective authorship, the complaint may generically narrate the participation of each agent, whose specific conduct is determined in the course of the criminal action. Precedent. 3. The Penal Code, when dealing with the concurrence of people, provides for the figures of author, co-author and participant, who, in any way, may be a legitimate passive pole in the action (art. 29), even if he has not practiced the conduct

foreseen in the core of the criminal type. 4. The special and summary rite of habeas corpus is not compatible with the reexamination of facts and evidence. 5. Known but dismissed habeas corpus (STF. HC 75868/RJ, 2<sup>a</sup>. T, Rel. Min. Mauricio Correa, j. 10/02/1998, DJe 06/06/2003; our translation).

However, despite this individualized description of the conduct of each agent being dispensable, it is necessary for the *Parquet* to establish the subjective link between the accused and the criminal practice, as the Superior Court of Justice has already decided:

REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF HABEAS CORPUS. CRIMINAL PROCEDURE. CRIME AGAINST THE ECONOMIC ORDER, EXTORTION, MISAPPROPRIATION AND GANG FORMATION. THESIS OF INEPTITUDE OF THE DENUNCIATION. ABSENCE OF MINIMUM INDIVIDUALIZATION OF THE CONDUCT ASSIGNED TO THE DEFENDANTS. ILLEGAL CONSTRAINT EVIDENCED. REQUEST GRANTED. 1. Although it is indispensable, in crimes of collective authorship, the detailed and individualized description of the conduct of each accused person, it cannot be conceived that the public prosecutor fails to establish any link between the accused person and the crimes imputed to him. 2. The absolute absence of individualized elements that point to the relationship between the criminal facts and the authorship offends the constitutional principle of full defense, thus rendering the denunciation inept. 3. Request for extension granted to determine the suspension of the criminal action in favor of the Accused [...], without prejudice to the offering of a new accusatory document, in compliance with the provisions of art. 41 of the Criminal Procedure Code (STJ. PExtDe no HC 214.861/SC, 5<sup>a</sup>. T., Rel. Min. Laurita Vaz, j. 19/04/2012, DJe 30/04/2012; our translation).

In summary, it is important the subsidiary application of the rules of collective procedure to collective criminal procedure, due to the

inexistence of a law that deals with this matter in the criminal sphere. Therefore, recognizing the application of the norms that provide for popular action as a basis for collective criminal proceedings, is a coherent and important measure to avoid impunity.

### III. FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

As can be seen, this is an extremely important discussion, since the mobilizations of people in favor of a certain purpose, whether legal or not, can generate consequences that are often harmful. It happens because people have expectations and desires and, depending on how this is stimulated, especially when crowds are organized, it makes them end up behaving in a certain way that they were alone they would not do, and in the crowd, responsibility can be diluted among its members and many can take advantage of this “anonymity” to avoid punishment, since the way in which the criminal process is structured today, generic denunciations are not allowed.

Thus, it is necessary for the law to adapt to these new demands, either by the subsidiary use of the norms of collective process, or by the creation of rules that discipline the collective criminal process.

### REFERENCES

1. BITENCOURT, Cezar Roberto Bitencourt. *Tratado de Direito Penal: parte geral*. São Paulo: Saraiva, 2021.
2. BRASIL. Tribunal de Justiça do Distrito Federal e Territórios. *APR 20110710026799*, 1ª T., Rel. Mário Machado, DJe 18/08/2011. Disponível em: <https://www.tjdft.jus.br/consultas/jurisprudencia/jurisprudencia-em-temas/a-doutrina-na-pratica/agravantes-e-atenuantes-genericas-1/circunstancias-atenuantes/ter-o-agente-cometido-o-crime-sob-a-influencia-de-multidao-em-tumulto-se-nao-o-pr-ovocou>. Acesso em: 29 mai. 2023.
3. BRASIL. Superior Tribunal de Justiça. *PExtDe no HC 214.861/SC*, 5ª. T., Rel. Min. Laurita Vaz, j. 19/04/2012, DJe 30/04/2012. Disponível em: [https://processo.stj.jus.br/SCON/GetInteiroTeorDoAcordao?num\\_registro=201101802203&dt\\_publicacao=13/08/2012](https://processo.stj.jus.br/SCON/GetInteiroTeorDoAcordao?num_registro=201101802203&dt_publicacao=13/08/2012). Acesso em: 29 mai. 2023.
4. BOSCHI, José Antonio Paganella. *Das penas e seus critérios de aplicação*. 7. ed. Porto Alegre: Livraria do Advogado, 2014.
5. CARVALHO, Márcio Augusto Friggi de. *Crimes multitudinários: homicídio perpetrado por agentes em multidão*. Curitiba: Juruá, 2016.
6. GALVÃO, Fernando. *Direito Penal: parte geral*. 9. ed. Belo Horizonte: D'Plácido, 2017.
7. GRECO, Rogério. *Direito Penal estruturado*. São Paulo: GEN, 2019.
8. GRINOVER, Ada Pelegrini. *Código Brasileiro de Defesa do Consumidor*. 12. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense, 2018.
9. LEONEL, Ricardo de Barros. *Manual de Processo Coletivo*. São Paulo: Revista dos Tribunais, 2002.
10. OLIVEIRA, Francisco Fagner Damasceno de. *Responsabilidade Internacional do Brasil: uma violação aos direitos humanos no caso ocorrido no “Carandiru”*. Disponível em: <https://fagnerdamasceno.jusbrasil.com.br/artigos/1185832421/responsabilidade-internacional-do-brasil>. Acesso em: 16 jan. 2022.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# The Epistemic Resources of Bioethics and its Legitimation in Higher Education

*Dr. C. Aymée Rodríguez Aradas & Dr. C. Eliannys Zamora Arevalo*

*Universidad de Oriente*

## ABSTRACT

The emergence of bioethics responds to the emergence of new moral problems related to the change in the place of science in terms of the application of its results and its impact on the lives of people, society and nature. The proceduralism in bioethics was supported by the creation of structures aimed at training, investigating and in other cases, at becoming constitutive and deliberative spaces for the reduction of ethical conflicts. They are constituted in structures from which the various methodological proposals in bioethics reach their legitimacy, since they provide the field from which to make their implementation effective in specific situations. It is worth highlighting the role played by the centers created in academic institutions, chairs and bioethics committees. Institutional development in the framework of the universities was key to the extension and consolidation of bioethics. The present work aims to analyze the instrumentalization of the epistemic resources of bioethics in Higher Education in Cuba.

*Keywords:* NA

*Classification:* FOR CODE: 220107

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573348  
Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023, Dr. C. Aymée Rodríguez Aradas & Dr. C. Eliannys Zamora Arevalo. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

# The Epistemic Resources of Bioethics and its Legitimation in Higher Education

Dr. C. Aymée Rodríguez Aradas<sup>α</sup> & Dr. C. Eliannys Zamora Arevalo<sup>σ</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*The emergence of bioethics responds to the emergence of new moral problems related to the change in the place of science in terms of the application of its results and its impact on the lives of people, society and nature. The proceduralism in bioethics was supported by the creation of structures aimed at training, investigating and in other cases, at becoming constitutive and deliberative spaces for the reduction of ethical conflicts. They are constituted in structures from which the various methodological proposals in bioethics reach their legitimacy, since they provide the field from which to make their implementation effective in specific situations. It is worth highlighting the role played by the centers created in academic institutions, chairs and bioethics committees. Institutional development in the framework of the universities was key to the extension and consolidation of bioethics. The present work aims to analyze the instrumentalization of the epistemic resources of bioethics in Higher Education in Cuba.*

**Author α:** Head of Philosophy Department, Social Sciences Faculty Universidad de Oriente, Cuba.

**σ:** Tenured professor and researcher in the Department of Philosophy, Social Sciences Faculty, Universidad de Oriente, Cuba.

## I. INTRODUCTION

Higher Education plays an important role in promoting social development, since its social mission is focused on the permanent investigation of the truth, essentially through scientific research, from which the integral formation of the human being is pursued. For its achievement, continuous improvement processes are involved that imply the intervention, according to the

distinctive nature of each professional field, of certain factors, spaces and knowledge constructs for its concretion.

Because the current university tries to be in tune with the world of the present, on the one hand, it responds to the most urgent social demands, and on the other, many of its characteristics are intertwined with the way of building knowledge and the cultural context of horizontal dialogue, is the propitious scenario for the instruction of the epistemic resources of bioethics. Assume bioethics as a bridge to the sustainability of life, and see in Higher Education the responsibility of training professionals who, together with the mastery of scientific and technological disciplines, develop the skills and attitudes that guarantee the integrated exercise for the benefit of individuals, society and nature, forces us to analyze the relationship between the two.

The present work is oriented to reveal those elements that, as epistemic resources, allow the integration of each of these positions, and whose instrumentation from a structure that directs its applicability, favors its projection as a methodological proposal that supports a global perspective of the bioethics in Cuba, from the complexity that it presents as a field of knowledge.

## II. METHODOLOGY

The study is carried out from a dialectical-materialist approach. It resorts to the use of the theoretical methods of scientific knowledge in the study of the complex framework in which the dilemmas and conflicts that today require moral evaluation occur. Its contribution consists in the theoretical-philosophical construction of the epistemic resources of bioethics, contextualized to the particularities of

Cuba, which allow its understanding as a methodological proposal.

### III. DISCUSSION

Bioethics, from its epistemic resources, favors the approach of different political, economic, ethical and social problems, from a multiple field, allowing deliberation and reflection on complex problems whose ethical reflection transcends particular fields. But its purpose cannot remain only to generate awareness about the potential and current consequences that the actions of the human race may have on life, but to make reconsiderations at the level of ethics, of both moral and legal norms that govern contemporary societies.

The re-dimensioning of the regulation of the relations of the subject towards everything living in a general sense, transversalized by the various dimensions in which the epistemic resources of bioethics are expressed, must be the axis that leads from an axiological perspective the development of the processes that occur within Higher Education. Considering the incorporation of the epistemic resources of bioethics in this implies first of all establishing a specific delimitation that allows differentiating the bioethical position of the normative action of the subject in correspondence with professional ethics.

The ethics of the scientist can be understood as the set of moral principles that guide this professional in the process of his cognitive activity and the behavior that he assumes in the context of a determined scientific community, with respect to individuals and society as a whole. . In a more normative sense, it can be affirmed that the ethics of the scientist is configured by the way in which the system of principles, norms and values of social morality are expressed in their effective behavior, that is, to what extent this professional endorses , to a greater or lesser degree, the system of norms and values valid for the society where he carries out his professional activity, in addition to the demands in the moral order of his profession.

Bioethics, on the other hand, seeks to harmonize practice in the field of science with moral values,

not only in professional performance, but also extends its regulations to the results achieved as part of it. In this sense, it analyzes from a critical and proactive position, the axiological structure of all social practices, because in different circumstances, they all have an impact on the phenomenon of life on the planet (Sotolongo, 2008).

That is to say, based on a factual knowledge of the pertinent practices, bioethics seeks to constantly review the norms and values that constitute them. The meaning is to propose, defend and establish an axiological framework that favors a new approach from which the development of these practices is ethically acceptable, pertinent to the phenomenon of life in all its aspects, from health and biomedical experiences, which they have to do with the well-being of human beings, even those related to the recognition and respect of the rights of animals and the conservation of the environment.

The instrumentation of bioethics can enrich Higher Education, and the processes that occur within it in its broadest sense, since it contributes not only to its internal organization, but also to the understanding of the social function that the subject performs in a certain context. It provides the tools that allow us to discern the requirements and challenges of today's world, favoring knowledge based on human well-being, from a transdisciplinary approach. As such, to the same extent that its relevance is investigated as a structure from which epistemic resources reach its quality of methodological proposal, it is enriched and strengthened from the possibilities that these offer to its actions as a social and educational institution.

The role of Higher Education in the promotion, development and consolidation of bioethics is of singular importance, as such it has been recognized by international organizations. UNESCO, regarding the need to teach bioethics, expresses that it is up to all States to teach it in the face of the new problems that humanity faces regarding the high advances in science and technology (UNESCO, 2020). To do this, it establishes through Article 23 of the Declaration

of Bioethics and Human Rights (2005) a program of permanent education in bioethics.

There are several purposes recognized by the regulation that highlight the importance of bioethics education. In the first place, it refers to the formation of a new conception of the subject, in which they manifest themselves as rational, free, reflective, critical, creators and transformers of their practices. It also recognizes the need for a contextualized education based on the practices of the subjects, which is problematizing, which questions and builds problems on the context and practices through intersubjective dialogue. Finally, it highlights its continuous nature, which leads to the change of primary and secondary attitudes.

From its epistemic resources it is recognized that bioethics uses the diversity of ethical conceptions to guide decisions in the face of dilemmatic situations that arise in human activities related to life in its different manifestations and the repercussions on the environment that could occur, but this It is not a spontaneous process, it must be supported by effective action guides. Given that Higher Education promotes an attitude towards reality and guides historical projects and has the capacity as a system to incorporate axiological aspects that allow the future professional a humanistic training that puts the social before techno-scientific knowledge and its applications, it becomes in a propitious space for the instrumentation of the epistemic resources of bioethics.

Bioethical reflections should not be seen as the exclusive heritage of those who practice certain professions: philosophers, doctors, jurists, applied science workers, among others, since this demands that the impact of technological applications in the lives of individuals be valued , in society and in nature, in which the necessary acceptance of the other as an expression of plural subject bearer of morality, stands as the center of these assessments. The words of Acosta (2009) support the previous criterion:

The global conception of bioethics and its interrelation with the sustainability of

development inevitably leads to biopolitics, to citizen action to ensure that joint responsibility materializes in policies that necessarily include the leading participation of both civil society and states. and international organizations of a governmental nature or not. Achieving the structuring and coherence of these efforts goes through a substantial change in education in values, where morality ceases to be separated from knowledge and becomes a constituent part of it. Bioethics, thus interpreted, is a matter for the whole society and not a topic of academic discussion among an elite of initiates. (p.288)

Coinciding with this, it is considered that bioethical analyzes must objectify the interests of the different agents involved (people, companies, institutions, society) and the heterogeneity of situations that arise, it is worth highlighting: The dependence and vulnerability of people before many professional actions, the coincidence or diversity of ethical conceptions and of the different types of evaluations and sensitivities derived from them, the possibilities of professional action that is responsible and respectful of pluralism and the autonomy of people, within the limits imposed legality. Likewise, the different evaluation options of the set of consequences that derive from each of them and the questions of principles or vital assumptions that are strengthened or undermined with each decision must be considered.

This leads to the consideration that Higher Education must transcend the limits of training in bioethics and achieve the insertion of the epistemic resources of bioethics in the general conception of the processes that occur within it. In such a way, it can lead to the formation of a system of values and attitudes in the subjects that interact in their frameworks, which configures the regulation of man's relationships with himself and with nature, according to what Delgado (2002) recognizes as a new look at the world, based on a different model of cultural man (p. 143).

It is about going beyond a learning of content or knowledge about bioethics, and reaching the conformation of aptitudes, attitudes and values of

each subject. María de los Ángeles Mazzanti Di Ruggiero (2012) bases the transcendence of the formative limits from the proposal of what she calls the formation of bioethical minds that she defines as follows:

The intellectual habit of a person to identify problems that have ethical or social implications, in the field of science and research, to provide solutions or answers to those problems, and make decisions about their application, in accordance with the laws that regulate these procedures and that give clear criteria on the legality of their use, so that they do not violate the dignity of the human person. It allows to rectify in case of error and reconsider other options before the study problem. It tends for the unity between thinking and moral action in the decisions of scientific activity, based on the fundamental principles and laws that regulate the conduct of the scientist and that inform the free action of each one. It is like a freely acquired conditioning to formulate ethical judgments and act with moral responsibility. (p.51)

For their part, Raquel Rodríguez and Yara Cárdenas (2011) argue that it is from bioethical education where the limits of teaching can be transcended, since it, in addition to training, has a general dimension that not only teaches how to think, but also how to do and to be. Corresponding to the above, bioethics education is aimed at structuring a set of moral values about life and health in their comprehensive understanding, which allows the implementation of morally valid decision procedures in situations that put the bioethical values. It is based on the development of a reflexive ethical conscience, interested not so much in conceiving a definitive regulation, as in constantly reviewing the validity and generality of the norms looking for new moral agreements.

The attention towards transdisciplinarity, and the ethical rigor of conduct, constitute today a claim to professional life; because although science is constituted as an important form of social activity, it includes all the subjective burden of human activity and requires an axiological resignification

that ensures adequate social relevance. Hence, its consideration as an essential resource of Higher Education constitutes a key aspect. (Rodríguez, 2021; Vidal, 2010).

First of all, contemporary social problems are not strictly disciplinary, they require a complex approach that combines multiple disciplines. Secondly, its solution demands the active participation of the subjects, and, consequently, of mutual learning communities in which specialists from each of the disciplines must dialogue and deal with participants who are not part of any discipline. But this dialogue must be established with a horizontal nature that fosters real communication, in which a common space is created, where the parties involved share needs, concerns, motivations and criteria, as a space for reflection, but based on respect for the various positions. In this way, the need for interactive dialogue to be conceived as an intrinsic element of Higher Education is understood.

The dialectical relationship of mutual conditioning of transdisciplinarity and interactive dialogue, contributes to bioethics going beyond academic walls and promoting the participation of all citizens in the actions and policies that the country develops based on social welfare. On the other hand, it favors balancing the scientific and social impact, with the cultural impact that is associated with these and that often presents contradictions in relation to them.

Higher Education is immersed in a social world from which it is not alien, so it is assisted by the responsibility of what type of professionals it trains and how they are going to face social changes in the performance of their profession. But they are not only influenced by the socio-environmental environment in which they subsist, but also by the international framework, which is inherent to it and from which they cannot escape. Given this, the processes that it develops must weigh, in fair value, the various epistemological and axiological elements of the phenomena, in order to configure in the professionals that it trains, a vision of the world based on the value of life in its broad meaning, from the educational and social dynamics.

In this sense, it must point to the adequate relationship between the orientation of professional ethical practice and the intention of the ethical legitimacy of human action. In this relationship, the moral transition is presented as an essential factor from which to lead, in an axiological sense, the role of the professional who graduates by making use of the knowledge acquired in society, balancing professional qualification as a technical update, and human qualification as an expression culture of their professional practice (Rodríguez, Zamora, 2022).

Cuba has the necessary political, social and legal structures for the development of actions that contribute to the achievement of true sustainable development, taking into account the complexities that in contemporary frameworks the subject's relationship with human beings, society and nature. Therefore, it requires the strengthening of those indicators from which to increase the effectiveness of the real impact of the policies that support it. In the framework of Higher Education this translates into achieving the formation of a subject with the capacity and quality to carry out such purpose.

As logically argued constructs, epistemic resources provide the framework from which to assume an epistemological position that allows answers to what has been previously raised, tempered to the emerging quality that contemporary processes present, in which the complexity of dilemmas and conflicts is integrated morals.

In this sense, the epistemic resources of bioethics find in Higher Education the structure that favors its expression as a methodological proposal as they allow to specify the necessary relationship between the epistemological, the practical and the axiological in the formation of a critical, integrative and complex thought. . This is because they promote: knowledge, in the sense of understanding the basic concepts of science, its usefulness in the lives of human beings and the environment, from bioethical positions that allow identifying where the true benefit is that leads to a actual quality of life. The know-how, from the search for viable solutions that are based on

transdisciplinary criteria and to the same extent that it considers values of respect, understanding and commitment to oneself and to the environment where the acceptance of the other as a morally valid subject is weighed. Knowing how to value, in terms of the moral evaluation of the attitudes that are associated with the previous positions. To the same extent, it implies assuming a determined position in the recognition of the contributions of science and technology in improving the quality of life, when they are well used.

#### IV. CONCLUSIONS

All of the above allows us to affirm that the epistemic resources of bioethics, as a methodological proposal, favor the resolution of conflicts raised not only by experimentation and the use of biotechnologies, but also by all those technical resources that have a relevant impact on the conception of human life and the different lifestyles. They allow critical analysis of the problems that these techniques pose at different levels and in various fields, the forms of intervention and the specific practices of the different professionals involved, as well as their human and social implications for the present and the future.

Its relevant instrumentation from Higher Education as a structure that legitimizes its actions, will favor the strengthening of the training of human resources that can face bioethics from the complexity that life presents and its understanding at different levels of reality and provide adequate responses to the complex conflicts of values present in today's technological world.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHIC REFERENCES

1. Acosta Sario, J. R. (2009). *Los árboles y el bosque. Texto y contexto bioético cubano*. La Habana, Cuba: Publicaciones Acuario, Centro Félix Varela.
2. Delgado Díaz, C. J. (2002). Cognición, problema ambiental y bioética. En: J.R Acosta Sario (Ed.). *Bioética para la sustentabilidad*. (pp. 135- 156).

3. La Habana, Cuba: Publicaciones Acuario, Centro Félix Varela.
4. UNESCO. (2005). Declaración Universal sobre Bioética y Derechos Humanos.
5. UNESCO. (2020). Manifiesto bioético latinoamericano para el día después. Programa de Educación Permanente en Bioética: Redbioética.
6. Mazzanti Di Ruggiero, M. A. (2012). Proceso de enseñanza aprendizaje en Ciencias Naturales que inciden en la formación de mentes bioéticas. (Tesis para optar por el grado de Dr.C). Bogotá: Universidad El Bosque.
7. Rodríguez Aradas, A. (2021). Los recursos epistémicos de la bioética. Su necesaria consideración en la Educación Superior en Cuba. *Opuntia Brava*, 13(Especial 1), 155-165. Recuperado a partir de <https://opuntiabrava.ult.edu.cu/index.php/opuntiabrava/article/view/1334>
8. Rodríguez Aradas, A. & Zamora Arevalo, E. (2022). La educación bioética frente a las controversias entre los sistemas de conocimiento y el ideal de justicia social, libertad e inclusión. En Pablo Guadarrama y Lucía Picarella. (Eds.) *Libertad y justicia social para el cambio social. Perspectivas y problemas*. Fisciano, Italy: NaSC Free Press, 237-268.
9. Sotolongo, P.L. (2008). Bioética y Complejidad. En: J.C. Tealdi (Dir.), *Diccionario Latinoamericano de Bioética*. (pp. 173- 176). Bogotá: UNESCO y Red Latinoamericana y del Caribe de Bioética, Universidad Nacional de Colombia.
10. Vidal, S. (2010). Bioética y desarrollo humano: una visión desde América Latina. *Revista Redbioética* 1, (1), 81- 123.



Scan to know paper details and  
author's profile

# Lyrical Poetry of Nikola Milicevic – Opus and Microstructures

*Miljenko Buljac*

## ABSTRACT

This article aims to present and interpret eight complete collections of lyrical poetry by Nikola Milićević (1922 – 1999), a Croatian poet who lived and worked in the twentieth century, and was also too a prose writer, essayist, translator, anthologist and scientist, one of the editors *Krugovi*, a magazine that created a generation of poets called 'krugovaši'. Literary criticism unfairly regarded Milićević „as traditionalist“ because he wrote sonnets and decimes and poems with solid, connected verses, and numerous microstructures remained almost unnoticed: poetic forms, diverse stanzas and strophoids, scattered verses arranged in unpredictable forms of weakened syllabicity and without a rhyme.

*Keywords:* lyrical poetry, circles (krugovaši), diverse poetic forms, verses with weakened syllabics, metonymy, rhythmic prose.

*Classification:* FOR CODE: 200506

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573348  
Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



# Lyrical Poetry of Nikola Milicevic – Opus and Microstructures

Lirsko Pjesništvo Nikole Milićevića, Opus I Mikrostruktur

Miljenko Buljac

## ABSTRACT

*This article aims to present and interpret eight complete collections of lyrical poetry by Nikola Milićević (1922 – 1999), a Croatian poet who lived and worked in the twentieth century, and was also too a prose writer, essayist, translator, anthologist and scientist, one of the editors of Krugovi, a magazine that created a generation of poets called 'krugovaši'. Literary criticism unfairly regarded Milićević „as traditionalist“ because he wrote sonnets and decimes and poems with solid, connected verses, and numerous microstructures remained almost unnoticed: poetic forms, diverse stanzas and strophoids, scattered verses arranged in unpredictable forms of weakened syllabicity and without a rhyme.*

*All language choices are in the function of creating a diverse rhythm. Poetic effects are the result of metaphors to which verbs have been added, of dynamics that refined their metonymic layer. A smaller part of the poems are examples of spoken poetry close to poems in prose, that is, rhythmic prose. Milićević's poetry emerges from deep humanity and modern sensibility, it is meditative and above all thought, without the basis of learned theories. In the interpretation of the semantic layers of the Song of the Old Lady, we applied a survey of girls and women using posts on Facebook. We sorted, processed, interpreted and published some of their views, attitudes and opinions.*

**Keywords:** lyrical poetry, circles (krugovaši), diverse poetic forms, verses with weakened syllabics, metonymy, rhythmic prose.

**Author:** Miljenko Buljac, PhD, sveučilišni profesor u mirovini. Hrvace 158, 21233 Hrvace, Croatia.

## SAŽETAK

*Ovaj članak želi prikazati, interpretirati i protumačiti osam cjelovitih zbirka lirске poezije Nikole Milićevića (1922 – 1999), hrvatskoga pjesnika koji je živio i djelovao u dvadesetom stoljeću, a bio je i prozni pisac, esejist, prevoditelj, antologičar i znanstvenik, jedan od urednika Krugova, časopisa koji je iznjedrio pjesnički naraštaj nazvan 'krugovaši'. Književna kritika nepravedno je Milićeviću spočitavala 'tradicionalizam' zato što je pisao sonete i decime te pjesme čvrstih, vezanih stihova, a gotovo nezamijećenima ostale su brojne mikrostrukture: pjesnički oblici, raznolike strofe i strofoidi, rasuti stihovi raspoređeni u nepredvidljive oblike oslabljene silabičnosti i bez sroka.*

*Svi jezični odabiri u funkciji su stvaranja raznolika ritma. Poetski učinci plod su oglagoljenih metafora, dinamike koja je oplemenila njihov metonimijski sloj. Manji dio pjesama primjerci su govorne poezije bliske pjesmi u prozi, odnosno ritmiziranoj prozi. Milićevićovo pjesništvo izniče iz duboke humanosti i modernoga senzibiliteta, meditativno je i nadasve misaono, bez podloge učenih teorija. U interpretaciji semantičkih slojeva Pjesme o staroj dami primijenili smo anketno ispitivanje djevojaka i žena koristeći se objavama na Facebooku. Sredili smo, obradili, protumačili i objavili neke njihove stavove i mišljenja.*

**Gljučne riječi:** lirsko pjesništvo, krugovaši, raznoliki pjesnički oblici, stihovi oslabljene silabičnosti, metonimija, ritmizirana proza.

„Svako djelo nosi u sebi svoj vlastiti svijet, svoju viziju, poruku, strukturu, pa i svoju teoriju“

(Nikola Milićević, *Sa stola i s koljena*, 28. studenoga 1977, *Forum*, XVII, br. 4-5 Zagreb 1978).

## I. INTRODUCTION

Nikola Milićević pjesnik je, prozaik, kritik, easyjet, antologičar, prevoditelj, urednik časopisa te ugledni znanstvenik, hispanist i kroatist, sveučilišni profesor. Biografi navode da se rodio 27. studenoga 1922. godine u Zvečanju pokraj Omiša kao jedno od šestoro djece u obitelji Mate i Filipe, rođene Kaštelan, obitelji koja je od kraja 18. stoljeća redovito imala ponekog svećenika. Umro je u Zagrebu 1. ožujka 1999., a pokopan 4. ožujka 1999. na groblju sv. Križa u rodnom Zvečanju.

Nikola Milićević pohađao je osnovnu školu u rodnom mjestu, gimnaziju u dominikanaca u Bolu na Braču i u splitskom Nadbiskupijskom sjemeništu. Maturirao je u travničkoj Klasičnoj gimnaziji, bio na kušnji u bračkoj 'pustinji' (nastambi) Blaca. Iz memoarskih zapisa *Godina u pamćenju* doznajemo o mobilizaciji, ratnom putu s partizanskim odredom na Mosoru i Kamešnici, te u pohodu na Trst, ranjavanju i glasu u njegovu kraju da je poginuo, pismu i radosnoj vijesti koja je zatekla roditelje, boravku u Vrhnci i Ljubljani, doznajemo o vožnji vlakom do Iloka, borbama u Novom Sadu, Srijemu i osječkoj vojarni u Gornjem gradu, o otpustu iz vojske; prvom dolasku u Zagreb, povratku kući, posjetu stricu svećeniku u Blacima. Također, u memoarskoj prozi niz je pojedinosti iz studijskog razdoblja u Zagrebu.

Brešić navodi dvije Milićevićeve duhovne kolijevke: Zvečanje i Zagreb, Zvečanje koje ga je podiglo i Zagreb koji ga je oblikovao, ističe pet izgubljenih godina, razdoblje od 1945. do 1950. kad se od književnosti tražilo da služi politici, a trebalo ga je i puno dužim označiti, sve do pojave *Krugova* (1952) i Tadijanovićeve *Elegije o pjesniku koji nije dugo godina pjevao* iz 1953. godine (usp. Brešić, 2009: 662). Nakon studija književnosti bavio se novinarstvom i književnom kritikom pišući eseje i kolumne u časopisu

*Krugovi* i u *Vjesniku*, dnevnom listu. Bio je jedan od urednika časopisa *Krugovi* 1952. godine, u kojem je objavio niz pjesama, članaka i polemika s nositeljima i zagovornicima lakirovke, koji su isticali potrebu kako književnost treba biti sredstvo u službi društvenih funkcija. Na pragu pjesničke zrelosti kratko je zašutio ne pristajući na „duhovno nasilje“ i veličanje ideologije socijalističkog jednonumlja i *agitpropa*. Od 1955. godine do umirovljenja 1988. bio je sveučilišni nastavnik na Filozofskom fakultetu u Zagrebu, a dvije akademske godine proveo je kao lektor hrvatskoga jezika na Faculté des Lettres u Bordeauxu od 1959. do 1961. godine. U razredu za književnost Hrvatske akademije izabran je za člana suradnika 1988., a redovitim članom postao je 1992. godine.

Prvim stihovima predstavio se u srednjoškolskoj *Omladini* 1940., a prvom samostalnom zbirkom *Zlatna grana* 1952. godine. Pjesme objavljuje i godinu kasnije u zajedničkoj zbirci *Pod ravnodušnim zvijezdama* s Vlatkom Pavletićem i Slobodanom Novakom. Slovio je tada najplodnijim autorom krugovaškog naraštaja, sljednik 'Gričana', Sudete i Ujevića, ali i 'staromodni' pjesnikom (što je lako odbaciti ili pobijediti). Osim pesama objavljuju novele, književne studije i eseje, memoirs prozu, predvodio je s francuskog, španjolskog, portugalskog, talijanskog, ruskog i latinskog jezika s izrazitim sklonostima za španjolsku i hispanoameričku poeziju. Obrazovanjem romanist i slavist, poznavatelj je europske književne baštine s profinjenim osjećajem za novu senzibilnost, čistoću i ljepotu izraza te sklad pjesničkih oblika. Iskustvom prevođenja stekao je brojne spoznaje kojima se nametnuo u znanstvenim i prevoditeljskim krugovima.

Preveo je Jiménezove *Pjesme* (1987), Verlaineove *Pjesme* (1988), Márquezov roman *Sto godina samoće* (1985). Milićević je priredio vrijedne antologije hrvatskoga i pjesništva drugih naroda.: *Zlatna knjiga svjetske ljubavne poezije* (1968), *Zlatna knjiga španjolske poezije* (1972), *Antologija europske lirike od srednjeg vijeka do romantizma* (1974).

Nositeljem je vrijednih nagrada: Grada Zagreba 1963. za *Hispanoameričku poeziju*, Nazorovom nagradom 1973. za *Zlatnu knjigu španjolske poezije*, Ujevićevom 1984. za zbirku *Nepovrat*. Autor je 4. knjige *Povijest svjetske književnosti* (1974), monografije *Vladimir Čerina* (1965), zbirke članaka i eseja *Riječ u nevremenu* (1981) te *Od davnih do nedavnih* (1989) u koju je uključio inačicu *Ponoćnih prikaza* iz 1985. te memoarske zapise *Godina u pamćenju*.

Nikola Milićević bio je iznad i prije svega lirski pjesnik, među suvremenicima izvoran i samozatajan. Navodimo njegove cjelovite pjesničke zbirke: *Zlatna grana* (1952), *Pod ravnodušnim zvijezdama* (1953), *Obećanja žute zore* (1956), *Snijeg i crna ptica* (1964), *Prah zemaljski* (1974), *Nepovrat* (1984), *Pjesme iz tišine* (1994) te *Sonet u krugu* (1998). Ovdje ne navodimo brojne naklade njegovih izabranih pjesama.

#### *Ranije pjesništvo Nikole Milićevića*

Arhetipskim motivima tornja, čempresa i pradjedovskog groba u ranijim uradcima (*Noć u Zvečanju*, *Čempres*, *Elegija za moje mrtve*) Milićević je uvjerljivim pjesničkim slogom rekao tko je, odakle dolazi i kamo ide, i na toj matrici izgradio je svoj poetski univerzum predanošću književnom poslanju, senzibilnosti usvojenoj na pravim izvorima onodobne francuske lirike, na zrelosti jezika te na novim pjesničkim oblicima, a ne toliko ustaljenoj formi i zadanim vrijednostima pjesme, što su drugi isticali (Branimir Donat, Nedjeljko Mihanović). Nekoliko soneta kojima se okušao, samo što su izuzetci u razigranim pjesničkim Milićevićevim oblicima.

*Cvat* je prva od *Elegija za moje mrtve*, napisana stihovima oslabljene silabičnosti i bez sroka. Čim se spomene elegija pomislimo na elegijski distih i na parnu, glatku rimu, ali pjesnik je u ovom nizu prema svojim zamislama i odabirima tonaliteta stvarao uspješan vlastiti tip moderne elegije. Ključno svojstvo elegičnosti već je u odabiru teme i u ozbiljnu emocionalnom ustroju kojim se s istinskim pijetetom oživljuje sjećanje na svoje mrtve. Njihova patnja i smrt imaju svoje plodove: tamni cvjetovi cvatu u proljeće, a u tvrdom lišću kadulje i vrijeska bude se njihove kosti. U teškom

mirisu bilja dišu crni vapaji, a očaj im je u kamenu skamenjen, i u zemlju zaoran. Iz njihove ledene samoće proviruje zaplašen neki davni, nemilosni bog (opća imenica). *Elegija za moje mrtve* rukovet je od dvanaest pjesama rasutih stihova. Česte su anafore (*Ovdje su zasijani moji mrtvi. / Ovdje trune njihovo nadanje*).

*Dozivanje*, treća pjesma niza *Elegije za moje mrtve* svojom strukturom još je modernija: puna je prebacivanja sintakse u nove stihove. Rečenice su prelomljene, usitnjene, razbijene, ostavljene u dozivima, prepune upitnih intonacija. Lirski subjekt traži odgovore koje bi mu samo njegovi mrtvi mogli dati. (Tko je on, je li njihov, jesu li oni dali kosti njegovim udovima, jesu li njihove ruke ostale u njegovim rukama, je li iz njihove snage potekla njegova nemoć zbog koje ih doziva, je li išta od njih ostalo u njemu koji pognut i kao oprezan stranac ulazi u njihovu uspomenu?). Izlomljena, usitnjena sintaksa donosi umor, zasićenje: previše je pitanja koja traže odgovore. Otud zastranjenja književnih kritičara na račun „tvrdo kuhane“ poezije Nikole Milićevića, isuviše ozbiljne, mnogima stoga tradicionalne. Govorna impostacija lirskog subjekta dominira pjesničkim diskursom što neponovljivim čine upitne intonacije. Smirenje stiže već u *decimi*, pjesmi tradicionalnog klasičnog oblika s prividno sačuvanim parnim rimama, ali osvježenoj novim nadahnućem. Stihovi kao da su prodisali doživljajem djetinjstva i zavičaja: 'gusto treperenje' lirskog subjekta prenosi se na žarko vrenje žedne zemlje i na „dubok šumor širokih nebesa“.

*Decima o žitu* pjesma je iz zbirke *Snijeg i crna ptica* (1964). Sastavljena je od deset izosilabičnih jedanaesteraca s rimama *abbaaccddc*, rekli bismo – obgrljenog je sroka s neobičnim modifikacijama. Književnoteorijski pojam 'decima' unesen je u naslov. Tema pjesme je o životu ljudskom, o kruhu svakodnevnom, o žitu i žarkom suncu, o zemlji koja vapi kapljicu vode u doba zrenja, o lomljenu kruhu i njegovu toplu dahu na stolu siromahovu te o mirnu, sigurnu životu. Sintagma „snu žutog mira“ upućuje na *Alkemiju riječi* Arthura Rimbauda, na oksimoron („snu žutog mira“), novi tip metaforike obilježene dominantnom žutom bojom, ali i na simboliku i

blisku koloristiku hrvatskog slikara Miljenka Stančića, ilustratora njegove zbirke *Obećanje žute zore* iz 1956. godine. Nije to 'cesarićevsko' slikanje pejzaža ili stvaranje ugođaja nego obuhvaćanje godišnjeg ciklusa od sjemenke preko njihanja i povijanja klasja, boli vrenja i dozrijevanja u kojem žito vapi za kapljicom kiše, i konačno do toplog daha izlomljena kruha na sirotinjskom stolu i šumora širokih nebesa. Pišući o početnoj izrazitoj slikovitosti, metaforici i simbolici Milićevićeva pjesništva, Brešić navodi:

„... s vremenom se povukla pred lapidarnim, stilski pročišćenim, gotovo škrtim izričajem. Jednostavan, sabran i siguran on je i u onim pjesmama u kojima prevladavajući nostalgično-elegijski ton odmjenjuje vedrijim i razigranijim stihovima nalik pučkim pošalicama (*Crni tamburaš, Mala lamentacija...*)“ (Brešić, 2000 505b).

Književni povjesničar zamijetio je u zrelijem pjesništvu potiskivanje prvotne simbolike, koloristike i metaforike, također i 'promjenu' temeljnog tonaliteta, što bismo prvenstveno pripisali Milićevićim metonimijama. Onako 'oglagoljene' lako ih je prepoznati i u ovoj pjesmi: *prilazim tiho gustom treperenju (žita), napetim osjem svjetlost sunca bode (žito), i (klasje) pati kao tijelo živog mesa, i (slutim) dubok šumor širokih nebesa*. U metonimijama sva su poetska obilježja, prave vrijednosti kojima je pjesnik Milićević nadvisio svoje suvremenike, stvorio poetski diskurs kojim potresno govori o ljudskom životu i odjecima, šumoru širokih nebesa, a time je nadmašio pjesnike zarobljene samo pejzažiranjem i stvaranjem ugođaja. Iskustva svijeta i studijskih putovanja, boravci u Francuskoj, odlazak na obale Velikog oceana, začudnost pred njegovom širinom i veličinom, navodi pjesnika zapodjenuti razgovor biranim riječima. Budući da je stigao izdaleka, ne bi se želio Oceanu zamjeriti. Svjestan je svoje neznatnosti i onog kutka Jadrana između Splita i Brača pred kojim je odrastao. Iskustvu pjesme pridonose pjesničke konvencije vezane uz portugalskog pjesnika Fernnada Pessoa iz Lisabona, također i Lautréamonta iz Montevidea, puno južnije ali s druge strane Atlanskog oceana, koji je otplovio brojne vode prije nego je dospio u

pakao *Maldororovih pjevanja*. Ocean je bio milostiv Kolumbu, ali se mnogi nisu vratili, a lirski subjekt uplašeni je moreplovac.

Ocean je pun tuđih suza i okrutnog smijeha, i on ga ne će više nikada vidjeti. Stoga se s njim pozdravlja uz poruku: „/Ti se valjaj i razmahuj u svojoj širini kako te volja, / a ja ću se stiskati u sebi (ovakvom kakav jesam) / kako budem znao i umio //“ (*Pred velikim oceanom*). Već od Vladimira Vidrića u hrvatskom pjesništvu puno je pejzaža sa zanjihanom granom kojima je svrha poezija s isječakom zbilje, trenutak prelijeta misli, stvaranje ugođaja i ljepote u jednom hipu. Dobriša Cesarić stvarao je sugestiju višeznačnosti ali tek u naznakama. Milićević pak poigravao se sa semantikom na nešto drugačiji način. Misaona slojevitost obremenila je njegovo pjesništvo, kako to tvrdi književni povjesničar: „čuvstvo je ustupilo mjesto refleksiji“ (Mihanović, 1982: 13).

Pjesma *Grana* je iz rukoveti *Gorko more* zbirke *Prah zemaljski* iz 1974. godine. Kao i *Decima o žitu*, pjesma *Grana* sastavljena je od deset silabičnih jedanaesteraca s rimom *abbaaccdde*, rekli bismo – obgrljenim srokom, odnosno njegovom neobično skraćenom modifikacijom, nastalom stoga što je broj rasutih stihova u pjesmi – deset, a ne osam ili dvanaest, broj djeljiv s četiri. I ona je dio nekog pejzaža (1. sličica: *čista je, svijetla i sva zelena*, 2. sličica: *nečujno se k'o lepeza njiše*, 3. sličica: *u jutru plavom dahom je noći umivena*, 4. sličica: *svija se tu nad našom glavom*). Ipak, zaključna tri stiha ove *decime* donose otklon, uzmak, iskrivljen doživljaj, nagrđivanje sličnih ranijih pjesničkih predložaka u odnosu na Cesarićev, u kojem je zanjihana grana izvor čudesne ljepote.

Pjesniku Milićeviću nije stalo do stvaranja oduška ljepotom. Njegova grana u lirskom subjektu, a tako i u recipijentu stvara zebnju, prijeti padom na glavu, budi u nama strah, strepnju, prijeti kakvim zlom kojeg bismo se željeli osloboditi: „/nad našim danom i našim bezdanom, / nad nekom strepnjom znanom i neznanom / što zelenim se brani zaboravom //“. Kao i prethodna, pjesma *Potomak* iz istog je ciklusa zbirke *Prah zemaljski*. I ona je *decima* sastavljena od pet distiha s parnim, glatkim rimama, i silabičnim

dvanaestercima, izuzevši dva stiha sa slogom više. Poetske vrijednosti pjesme *Potomak* u njezinu su semantičkom sloju, u konativnim vrijednostima. Snažna oznaka identiteta lirskog subjekta je u sastavnici koja upućuje na vezanost uz zemlju koja mu je „mat“. Odabir čakavskog lika ove imenice nije motiviran srokom nego je prema njoj izabran izraz „za uzvrat“. Svetost riječi u plodonosnom je nizu: zemlja, majka, zadana riječ, zapis u drvu i kamenu, krv, patnja, tračak svjetla iznad pokopišta; također i odabiru antonimskih parova: prokletstvo / znamen, dah / miris, svjetlost / tmina, zvjezdana sjajnost / mračna dubina, gola riječ / ništa.

Jasna potvrda jest u danoj, zadanoj riječi, u zapisu, u riječi koja je *logos*. Njome su se njegovi pretci porukama urezanim u drvu i u kamenu, znamenom svoje svetosti i prokletstva, znacima križa, patnje i odabranosti vezali uz zemlju. Riječi u Milićevićevoj pjesmi kao da su od krvi, nabijene nepotrošivom snagom, kao da su užgane riječi koje žele biti svjetlo iznad vječnog počivališta, mjesta za koje je pjesnik odabrao stilem 'pokopište'.

Konotacije riječi proširuju se na gorke znamen što zemljom i patnjom miriše, riječi koja u sebi nosi i svjetlost i tminu, sav sjaj i mračnu dubinu. Konativne vrijednosti pjesme iznad su njezinih apelativnih: biti potomak poprma svojstva dostojna najvišeg čovjeka, a to su nasljednici onih kojima je zemlja majka, onih zemljom i patnjom obilježenih, onih koji to znamenje prihvaćaju kao zadaću služenja, kao znamen i križ svjetlosti, a ne tmine, u koju se neki drugi zavlače kako bi sebi priskrbili lagodnosti i užitke.

#### *Zrelije pjesništvo Nikole Milićevića*

Milićević se ogledao i sonetima: „I u svoje sonete (*Riječ i prah zemaljski, Sonet u krugu...*) ovaj tankoćutni, gordo ravnodušni i uvijek sumnjičavi pjesnik unosi duboko proživljeni, sasvim osobni, ali i općeljudski osjećaj egzistencijalističke nesigurnosti, tjeskobe i trpkoga mirenja (*Treba strpljivo*) sa sudbinom kao nejasnim poslanstvom na koje nas je uputio Neznani, a na koje on odgovara stoičkim mirom kao svojevrsnim idealom svojeg pjesništva (Ruža vjetrova)“, zapazio je Hrvoje Pejaković (prema Brešić, 2000:

504). Promičući „moć i magiju verbuma“, pjesnik Milićević vraća povjerenje u riječ, a lirici njezino dostojanstvo (usp. Mihanović, *ibid.*). *Putnikova pjesma* je sonet iz *Soneta i tercina* zbirke *Prah zemaljski*, također i pjesma *Sonet u krugu*. Sonet je sazdan od silabičnih jedanaesteraca, čvrstih, bez opkoračenja i prebacivanja. Ovim sonetom Milićević je udovoljio svim formalnim zahtjevima tradicionalnog Petrarkina mediteranskog pjesničkog oblika, u kojem se u katrenima, u logičkom i semantičkom smislu artikulira pjesnikova teza i antiteza, a u tercetima njihova sinteza. U katrenima Milićevićeve soneta pravilna je obgrljena rima *abba abba*, a u tercetima također pravilan srok *ccd eed*. Lirski subjekt bi se htio naći u nekom sjajnom gradu, gradu čudesa, sna i zaborava, u kojem bi uz pomoć ljekovitih trava pronašao spokoj. U značenjskoj antitezi, njegova se nevidljiva nada, koja ga obasjava u duši, sve ono što bi toliko htio pretočiti u zbilju i ostvariti ono duši nevidljivo, ono što ga iznutra obasjava i što bi htio postići u svom životu, zbog čega je slomljen i zbog čega čami u duši. Sve mu je to daleko i neostvarivo. Stoga, gazi kroz polja i prelazi brda, zemlja je tvrda, njegove snage posustaju, rane ga bole, bode ga trn i kamen. Svjestan je da cilju ne ću stići, da mora naprijed ići, jer gotov je samo ako stane. Stane li, srušit će sve dotad sagrađeno.

Razigranim poetskim diskursom Milićević se predstavio sonetima vrijednim spomena: *Na Griču* i *Sonet u krugu*. Iz neonske svjetlosti Donjega grada neboder se ruga tamnim zidinama, a pod uličnom svjetiljkom Matoševa je spodoba u fraku (*Na Griču*). Još razigraniji je *Sonet u krugu*, igrom riječima i nabranjima blizak Begovićevim (anti)sonetima. Čvrsta struktura strofa narušena je opkoračenjima i prebacivanjima, a to je već odmak od strukture mediteranskog soneta i zakonitosti kojima se od teze preko antiteze stiže do misaone sinteze.

*Sonet u krugu* donosi igru riječima s odjecima brzalice, poskočica i nabraljica, razigranih asocijativnih nizova s preskocima misli koje uključuju nove digresije i nove, često oprječne logične veze, afirmacije i negacije te unose novih pitanja i zaključaka. U sonetu je svašta i sve, a to sve je istodobno sve i ništa, i znanje i neznanje, i

sve je u mraku ili pak u jurećem vlaku, u oblaku što visi, a mogao bi taj oblak pasti, ali ne će, a sve to utječe na nas i ravna našim životom i postajanjem.

U pjesmi su zasićeni nizovi aliteracija i asonanca, riječi bliskog glasovnog sastava, suglasničkih ili samoglasničkih odabira: mraku – vlaku – oblaku; mlaku – kvaku; tugu – krugu; svašta – ništa; naopako – tako – kojekako. Navedeno glasovno podudaranje u svojoj pohrani otkriva tajnovite veze među riječima, snažnu asocijativnost i predvidljivost u izrazu.

Kritički prikaz zbirke *Prah zemaljski* 1976. godine Tomislav Ladan naslovio je *Modernist bez modernizma*, da bi pritom Milićevićeve *procédée* ocijenio zastarjelim i neprimjerenim, što odlučno pobijamo jer osim soneta i pjesama sazdanih katrenima i tercetima, nizovi su pjesama oslabljene silabičnosti s nevezanim i rasutim stihovima, pogotovo u rukoveti *Gorko more*. Što se tiče primjedbe na staromodne zavičajne teme, pejzaže i Milićevićev mediteranizam, ni u tome nije Ladan u pravu jer je pjesnik prevladao deskriptivne cesarićevske note, što bismo mogli potvrditi nizom pjesama, tako i u nasumice odabranoj *Ne žali*, pjesmi moderne strukture.

Htjeli bismo istaknuti kako je Milićevićev modernizam sedamdesetih godina donosio živost poput Pupačićeva, Slamnigova ili pak Šoljanova, a u sonetnim uradcima *Izvor*, *Prognani Orfej*, *Zemaljski hodočasnik*, *Tamni krug*, *Sizifi*, te *Riječ i prah zemaljski*, pjesnik je u sonetnoj formi iskušavao neke druge mogućnosti izričaja, i stoga ih držimo eksperimentalnim pokušajima. Pjesma *Zvijezde* iz ciklusa *Sujetlost ponoćna*, zbirke *Nepovrat*, kratkog je daha, bez sroka, pjesma je oslabljene silabičnosti. Završetci stihova nisu čvrsta mjesta. Njezine su vrijednosti u sermantičkim slojevima. Prema motivima: *zvijezde*, *more*, *dubine*, *beskraj*, prividno, pomislili bismo na pejzaž, na uzlet lirskog subjekta u svjetlost, u ljepotu, u doživljaj radosti i vedrine, ustvari, pomislili bismo na svrhu kojom je pjesnik gradio pejzažne učinke. Nakon uvodnih bljeskova nastupila je tama. Noć je ugasila svjetla, 'abešimićevski' rečeno, razobličila je stvari, raznijela oblike, poplavila ih svojim mrakom.

Ostale su samo razvaline, rasulo, svega je nestalo u neuhvatljivosti svojoj, potonulo, posvuda je ostao tamni nedogled. Pjesma se dovršila usklikom bliskim pjesniku Tagori, oduškom raspoloženju s naglašenim uzdahom:

“/ *O zvijezde od suza i dragulja!* /“. Gore u praznini samo su još zvijezde: isplakane od suza i dragulja, nastalih od patnje, boli i od dubokog plača.

I kad jede ubranu smokvu ispod stabla, Milićeviću je to svečani obred kojim bi utažio glad, ali i oćutio čudesne sokove darežljive zemlje i sunčane svjetlosti (*Smokve*). Od pjesnika doznajemo da sve oko nas ima svoje tajne: da kiše šapuću, lišće šumori, vjetar huji, da kamen nešto zbori a trava mrmori (*Govor i šapat*).

U nekoliko pjesama pjesnik se obraća Neznamom koji ga je poslao ovamo neka izvrši svoju zadaću: uzore njivu, zasadi vinograd, porine brod u more. Ni danas ne zna kako izvršiti poslanje, osluškuje razgovore lišća i tišine tek da dozna što se zbiva u bistrini voda i u dubokim ogledalima neba. Ostade neuk i gol (*Kao na početku*) u potrazi za svojom Gorom uznesenja (*S tihom nadom u koracima*). Prejaki uzdasi i pretjerane geste rijetko se pojave u Milićevićovoj lirici, ako ih pak ima tada dostižu Kranjčevićevu jedrinu: „/ *Bože, zašto su tvoje zemaljske stvari / tako ravnodušne, / tako hladne prema nama? /*“ (*Zemaljske stvari*). Ima iskrenih i poniznih zaziva: „/ *Bože, zatvori zlim vjetrima pute, / neka svi glasovi okolo zašute, / da se čuje samo šapat valova i pjeska //*“ (Bonaca). Kadšto u poetskim inačicama nabasamo na pretapanja s biblijskim retcima: „/ *I blaženi koji su snili / djetinje snove, njihovo je carstvo nebesko /*“ (*Carstvo nebesko*).

## II. JEKA IZ DJETINJSTVA U METONIMIJI LIRSKE PJESME

Pjesma *Jeka* iz ciklusa *Mrak i sjas* iz zbirke *Pjesme iz tišine* (1994) pisana je kratkim stihovima potpuno je oslabljene silabičnosti s brojnim opkoračenjima i prebacivanjima. Odjeci nad prodolinom – najsnažnija je senzacija iz Milićevićeva djetinjstva, bilo da se odnosila na glasove ili pak jeku zvekira na čudesnim 'dverima'

(vratima) u dominikanskoj nastambi u Blacima na otoku Braču, kamo je kao mladić dospio da bi nakon djedova i očeva brata postao Nikom Milićevićem III., i tako nastavio svećeničku tradiciju svoje obitelji. Isklesana u kamenu, izrezbarena u planinskim stijenama, nastamba je postala skloništem, kamenim gnijezdom u kojem su bijegom pred Osmanlijama sigurnost našli poljički svećenici, ali i mjestom kušnje bogoslovima prije prvih svetih zavjeta. Pristup nastambi, bilo s mora ili s kopna, zahtijeva goleme napore, silaske i uspone kamenjarom.

Nenajavljeni gosti, znatizeljni turisti, stizali bi pred 'kamenom gnijezdo', lupali zvekirom čiji bi odzvuk odjeknuo nad prodolinom, u kojoj bi svećenici čuvali stado ili uređivali vinograd. Često bi morali ostaviti svoje poslove kako bi udovoljili gostima i proveli ih 'pustinjom', pokazali im teleskope i zvjezdarnicu, knjige i knjižnicu, etnografsku baštinu. Još u dječaćkom dobu pjesnik Nikola Milićević kucao je na tim vratima zemaljskim, a nazivao ih je – nebeskim, udarao batovima, golim šakama i teškim zvekirima, i slušao lelujavi glas i veličanstvenu jeku, strpljivo čekajući hoće li se netko odazvati i popeti kamenom stazom iz prodoline i hoće li netko otvoriti tajne 'dveri'. Bez obzira na ishode, odlaskom u svijet na školovanje, u vojsku, nastavak studija i sveučilišnu karijeru, ostalo mu je u uhu i u sluhu ono uporno lupanje i gromka, veličanstvena jeka oko 'pustinja' Blaca. Ostala je u pjesniku žarka nostalgija za južnim obroncima Brača, njegovu prodolju i strmim vrletima kamo želi poći i nabrati *plavetna vrijeska, kadulje i ruzmarina*, kako bi *tri opojna mirisa* sjedinio u *najčudesniji miris* koji duši donosi slutnju božanskoga daha (*Tri mirisa*).

*Brda i bregovi* primjerak je govorne poezije bliske pjesmi u prozi, odnosno ritmiziranoj prozi iz zbirke *Pjesme iz tišine*, ninkule iz mira, iz duboke pjesnikove smirenosti. Pjesma se sastoji od pet sintaktičkih jedinica raznolike veličine raspoređenih u deset stihova s posve slobodno odabranim prebacivanjima i jednim opkoračenjem. Stihovi su sasvim oslabljene silabičnosti čiji su početci s manjim desnim uvlakama, tj. s dvostrukim lijevim rasterom.

Značenjske, konativne vrijednosti pjesme usmjerene su životnim lutanjima, osjećaju neispunjenosti i vapajima Bogu. Na svom putu prelazimo gore, brjegove, brda, humke i brežuljke, uspinjemo se i silazimo, a nigdje kraja. Nigdje konačna vidika, koraci i koraci, prašina nam je na obući, uzalud tražimo mir, umor je u nogama, u mislima, u srcu... Vapimo iz klonulosti, tražimo neku Maslinsku goru, nekakav gaj skrušenja i unutrašnjeg plača, mjesto gdje ćemo se sabrati bez straha i pomoliti se bez glasa, sami, ali „združeni sa svim što oko nas treperi i diše“ – upečatljiva je metonimija, poetska mikrostruktura koja se uz pomoć glagola iz metafore iznjedrila, iščupala, osamostalila. Pjesnik Milićević i ne sluteći odvodi recipijenta u duhovnu sferu pjesme *Nađeni Bog* Antuna Branka Šimića: „/ *Bog oko tebe sja treperi miriše i šuši* //“.

Strukturom i razmještajem stihova pjesma *Cesta* bliska je već navedenoj *Brda i bregovi*, samo što je nešto veća od nje. Obje su iz ciklusa *Zrak i zemlja*. Primjerak su govorne poezije, pjesme u prozi, odnosno ritmizirane proze. Milićevićeva *Cesta* svjedoči cijelu povijest od davnih vremena kad je bila 'kaldrma', makadamski put do današnjih asfaltiranih prometnica.

Povijesnim spoznajama pjesnik je *cesti* priložio vizualne i vremenske konotacije, i to metonimijom, uz metaforu jednu od poetski učinkovitijih mikrostrukture: „/ *Ova cesta dolazi iz daleka i vodi bogzna / kamo* /“. U pjesmi sažeto je iskustvo davnih vremena: cestom su se kretale rimske legije, potom su njome hramali umorni križari. Stoljećima poslije njih Mlečani su vukli topove, turske karavane donosile žito, odnosile sol i ulje. Napoleonovi vojnici su je popravljali i širili, spremali se njome u velike pohode i osvajanja. Cestom su stizali i odlazili svi osvajači, pljačkaši i palikuće. Pjesma je dovršena zaključcima, promišljenim stavovima o cestama, stazama i putovima koje su svima veliki izazov i velika nada, mnogima nepoznanica, a putnicima tjeskoba i bol, beskraj i beznade.

### III. PJESMA O STAROJ DAMI – PREDLOŽAK ANKETNOG ISTRAŽIVANJA

Parnim rimama *Pjesma o staroj dami* prati strukturu starinske elegije, a njezini dugi silabični stihovi osciliraju brojem slogova. Najviše je petnaesteraca, potom stihova za slog kraćih ili pak dužih, a zaključni dvanaesterac bio je potreban upitnoj intonaciji čime je stih učinkovito dovršen, a njime istodobno i sintaktički ustroj. *Pjesma o staroj dami* na samom je svršetku *Pjesama iz tišine* i jedan je od zadnjih, ako ne i posljednjih pjesnikovih uradaka. Sve semantičke pohrane pjesme jezgrovite su i jasne. Pjesnik se izravno obraća staroj dami, koja je zanemarila obitelj i rađanje djece, dajući prednost gozbama, zabavama, lijepim provodima i ugodnostima. Nestalo je sjaja onih plesnih dvorana, strasnih cjelova i zlata; ostao je teret uspomena, već pokopana sjećanja stoljetne dame koja sjedi u starom naslonjaču. Konativne vrijednosti upućuju na ironijske znakove: „/ *Nad vašom sijedom glavom lebdi daleko vrijeme, / bjelina pradavnih dana pada na vaše tjeme /*“. Sve je u sugestiji i slutnji smrti. Litota „*dah drugoga svijeta*“ utkan u crnini te stoljetne gospođe, ublaženi je izraz za smrt, neumitnu i neodgodivu. Po njenoj glavi pepeo sipi iz visina, ali da bi ironija bila jača, naglašeni su znaci onodobne i sadašnje slave: „*prašina zvjezdana s mirisom ruže i krina*“ te „/ *Labudi svitanja nose, bjelina svijeta se hvata, / zelena jutra gore od cjelova i zlata /*“. Grka vremena nisu poharala, dotukla samo staricu; od njih nepomičnim su postale i stvari, krute, ukočene, mrtve: klavir, vaze, portreti... U praznini svima prijete ta uspavana tišina nakupljena oko starice. Nakon potraćena, besmislena života, pjesnik ironično postavlja pitanje: „/ *Iz kog li ste doba stigli, iz kojih spomenara, / i što ćete vi, gospo stoljetna, stara? /*“.

Pri interpretaciji *Pjesme o staroj dami* definirali smo hipotezu o stavovima pjesnikova odnosa prema staroj dami, osjećajima ljubavi i mržnje, primijenili anketno ispitivanje djevojaka i žena koristeći se objavom na Facebooku, proveli anketu na raznoliku uzorku u odnosu na dob, stupanj obrazovanja i društveni status, sredili smo, obradili i protumačili stavove ispitanih žena. Donosimo odgovore djevojaka i žena o stavku koji

se odnosio na to je li pjesnik, koji je živio u 20. stoljeću bio *ženomrzac*? Nakon njihova pozornog čitanja pjesme ubrzo su uslijedili odgovori:

„Uz najbolju volju, ne vidim ovdje moralnu osudu. Pjesma je o starosti i prohujaloi mladosti“ (Sanda Ham).

„Je li pjesnik u ovoj pjesmi ženomrzac? Ni trunke.“ (Miljenka Koštro).

„Ne mislim da je bio ženomrzac“ (Mare Hrgović).

„Ne, nije bio ženomrzac. Opisao je život žene okružene slavom ovozemaljskih dobara. I što? Sve materijalno i opipljivo postalo je ništavilom života... Tko može zaboraviti ludost proživljenog? Ostaje praznina duha koju nije ispunila pravim životnim vrijednostima“ (Vinka Milošević).

„Budući da skrb o djeci donosi žrtvovanje, danas se nametnuo stil samačkog života. Modernim roditeljima pitanje je prestiža imaju li kućnog ljubimca, psa ili mačku, a o djeci i ne razmišljaju. Vidimo na kraju životnog puta staricu kojoj ništa nije ostalo. Samo praznina, mrtve stvari i uspomene koje blijede. Nije ovo mržnja prema ženi, ovo je realan kraj pogrešnog životnog odabira, života potraćena na zabave i uživanja poslije kojih ostaju ništavilo i samoća umjesto ljubavi prema djeci i unučadi. Imati obitelj nagrada je za žrtvu koju smo kao žene podnijele za bližnjega i to davanjem cijele sebe“ (Ljubica Tomić).

“Osjetih čežnju za istinskim i izvornim životom žive žene. Iako govori o promašenu životu neke starice, pjesnik slavi roditeljicu života. Naglašen je bol za izgubljenim životnim smislom“ (Vesna Budimir).

„Ne, nikakav ženomrzac! Realno prikazana praznina, usamljenost, svijest o prolaznosti svega, s kojom se starija žena nalazi licem u lice... Ustvari, tako se može osjećati i ona koja je bila u obitelji, braku, kao i ona koja je čitav život bila sama. Uostalom, (p)ostati usamljena nije isto što i živjeti - sama. Imamo danas mnoge koji ne žive sami, ali su iz puno razloga jako usamljeni. A imamo i one koji žive sami, ali nisu usamljeni“ (Slavica Čilaš).

„Ženomrzac nikako! Autor pokazuje suosjećanje s damom na koncu svjesnom prolaznosti svega. Možda je autor odbijeni prosac? Možda je gospođa rođena u bogatoj obitelji? Možda su joj pomrla djeca? Pjesma je uspješno prikazala ono što je bilo lijepo, a prošlo je. Pitanja koja se nameću čine pjesmu još boljom.“ (Anđelka Korčulanić).

„Pjesnik nije ženomrzac, ali je teški konzervativac jer osuđuje na svoj način život žene koja se odlučila živjeti slobodni život s ovozemaljskim užiticima bez obiteljskih obveza. Na kraju, u poznim godinama, nije ništa opipljivo ostavila po čemu bi se mogla pamtit. Reklo bi se, život potrošen u ništa“ (Iva Bilandžić Barać).

„Ovo je pjesma o protoku vremena i svega što je u njemu. Isus je rekao neka prvi baci kamen tko je bez grijeha. Ipak, osjeća se ironija, a ona najviše govori o pjesniku. Ima pjesničkog dara, dubok je, ali obraćajući se ostarjeloj dami, najviše je rekao o sebi. Realan je, ali, malo gorak“ (Mara Šakotić).

„Vrijeme nudi uspomene koje mi često ne biramo“ (Milenka Žuro).

„Nije ženomrzac, ali poručuje onima koji se ne mogu zaustaviti u svojoj raskalašenosti i gube osjećaj za vrijeme koje brzo prolazi“ (Katarina Šakić).

Zaključimo, većina anketiranih žena koje su iznijele svoje poglede o Milićevičevoj *Pjesmi o staroj dami*, unatoč prikrivenoj osudi promašena života i gorčini koja se naslućuje, drže da pjesnik nije ženomrzac, ali je nekima od njih ironičan, konzervativan, nekima pak poučan. Suditi o životnim izborima drugih ljudi nemamo pravo, ali imamo pravo rasuđivati o lošim pojavama kako nas one ne bi zarobile. U ljudskom životu često se znaju nametnuti dvostruka pravila iznesena latinskom poslovice: „*Quod licet Iovi, non licet bovi*“, tj. „Što je dopušteno Jupiteru, nije volu“, odnosno: „Nije sve za svakoga“. Prema našim ljudskim mjerilima neke prekršajne postupke pojedinca mogli bismo doživjeti humanim gestama, a bezazleni pogled na djevojačke razgoličene obline, unatoč besprimjernoj razgoličenosti, oštro osuđujemo.

Nitko od nas svojim životom i svim postignućima ne stvara vječne vrijednosti. Svi smo krhki, slabi i prolazni. Duhovnim vrijednostima možemo druge ljude nadvisiti i nadživjeti, pretočiti svoje vrijednosti u memoriju budućim naraštajima, ali moramo znati da sve što posjedujemo, u samo jednom trenutku možemo sve izgubiti, tako i zauvijek nestati.

#### IV. PJSNIŠTVO NIKOLE MILIĆEVIĆA OVJERENO PROSUDBAMA DRUGIH ISTRAŽIVAČA

Ulascima u pjesničke svjetove drugih autora, kojima se Nikola Milićević istinski predavao, obogaćivao je svoje vidike, usvajao je primjenu pjesničkih postupaka i poetskih mikrostruktura koje su imale odjeka u njegovoj poeziji, oplemenjenoj prevođenjem. Iako se svakodnevno potvrđivao kvalitetom poetskih prinosa, rastom i zrelošću estetskih dosega svojih prijevoda i vlastitih uradaka, onodobna književna kritika pjesniku Nikoli Milićeviću nije bila sklona sve do pravorijeka Ive Frangeša. Skromno je ispraćala Milićevičeve zbirke, na tematskoj razini isticala je zavičajni kolorit i motive, a zanemarila dublje, univerzalne vrijednosti jednog od „jakih glasova suvremene hrvatske poezije“ (I. Frangeš, prema: Brešić, 2000: 504).

Iz istih razloga ni recepcija mu nije bila sklona. Ostao je u sjeni Kaštelanovoj, zadugo nepoznat i neproučen pjesnik. Pogled na Milićevičevo pjesništvo, Brešić je potkrijepio ocjenom Krste Špoljara o prožetosti tradicije i suvremenosti „melankoličnog mediteranca“ koji se inspirirao pučkom baštinom, klasičnom kulturom i romanskim pjesnicima, posebice španjolskim modernistom Lorkom. Tematsko su ishodište njegove lirike zavičaj i podrijetlo, mediteranski zavičajni prostor, pretci i starina, govori poljičkoga kraja, odnosno duboki osjećaj iskonske i zagonetne veze s korijenima – rodnom grudom, jezikom i dalekim predcima (usp. Brešić, 2000: 504). Tvrđimo kako nije riječ o utjecajima nego dodirima.

U pregledu *Povijesti hrvatske književnosti* Dubravko Jelčić je uz dva usputna spomena, Nikoli Milićeviću posvetio svega 14 redaka, što

držimo nedostatnim, pogotovo što ga je uvrstio među vodeće pjesnike krugovaškog naraštaja, doduše, nešto starijeg od ostalih, s naglaskom kako se „bitno izdvaja mirnom jednostavnošću lirske dikcije“ (Jelčić, 1997: 312). Jelčić navodi naslove zbirka, suradnju u časopisima, njegovo stvaralačko iskustvo prevoditelja. U prosudbi odnosa prema modernosti, Jelčić je u zabludi kad tvrdi: „... izgradio je izraz otužnog južnjaka moderne osjećajnosti bez upadnih modernističkih težnji“ (ibid.). Milićevićovo pjesništvo izniče iz duboke humanosti i modernoga senzibiliteta, meditativno je i nadasve misaono, spontano i bez podloge o nekakvoj učenosti. Najvećim dijelom njegovi su stihovi rasuti ili raspoređeni u raznolike strukture. Netočne su tvrdnje o zatvorenim pjesničkim oblicima te o obilatom korištenju sroka.

Metonimijama pripada ona snaga, koju već citirani Nedjeljko Mihanović pripisuje 'verbumu'. Tako su oglagoljene metafore oplemenile njihov metonimijski sloj. Ozbiljno i sadržajno Milićeviću se posvetio Slobodan Prosperov Novak. Prijevode s romanskih jezika ocijenio je 'kongenijalnim', antologije pjesništva neponovljivim, eseje o književnosti uspješnim. Naveo je i studioznu Milićevićovu monografiju o Vladimiru Čerini, buntovnom avangardnom pjesniku. Iako je bio 'egzemplarni poeta doctus', tvrdi Prosperov (2004, III: 275), u vlastitom pjesništvu Milićević je te slojeve znao skrivati osobito zavičajnom komponentom.

Mi bismo pak dodali da je svoje spoznaje o stihu Milićević utkao u vlastiti pjesnički izraz, a da mu učenost, ta silovita erudicija nije gušila spontani pjesnički govor, njegovu prirodnost i jasnoću. Onodobna kritika nije ni zamijetila vrijednost Milićevićeva pjesništva do pojave zbirke *Prah zemaljski*, te navodi: „Tek tada se razvidilo da kozmopolitski prevoditelj posjeduje vlastiti pjesnički opus u kojemu su savršeno dobro usklađeni lirski i intelektualni naboji, te da je po tomu vrjedniji od dobrog dijela svojih vršnjaka ili nešto mlađih suputnika. (...) On je čitavog života prepjevavao tuđe pjesnike kao da piše svoje, a kad je sam pjevao, onda nije htio otići dalje od zavičajnih emocija, od vlastite tjeskobe i nekog samo njemu bliskoga hinjenog neznanja“ (S. P.

Novak, 2004: 175). Milićević je Prosperovu Novaku najuspješniji u lirskoj cjelini *Elegija za moje mrtve*, u kojoj ispod glasa razgovara sa svojim mrtvima: „U vrijeme estradnih pjevanja bio je pjesnik tih, strpljiv i stoičan“, Prosperov Novak ističe njegove slobodne i raznolike oblike pjesama te vezane stihove i tradicionalne strofe (usp. ibid.). Književni povjesničar Prosperov Novak imao je pouzdanu intuiciju u prosudbama, tek što bismo iznijeli kako je i on naglašavao tradicionalne poetske oblike Milićevićevih pjesama s čvrstim rimama, a one su sasvim zanemarive. Pjesnik se ogledao tzv. 'gluhim sonetima', poigravao se njihovom formom. Brojnije su njegove pjesme oslabljene silabičnosti, raznolikih stihova i strofa, one s rasutim stihovima, raznolikim lijevim rasterima i stihovima raspoređenim u 'prividne' strofe.

Navodimo i nakladnički pothvat Ante Žužula iz 2009., njegov predgovor u kojem tvrdi: „Milićević je bio moderni tradicionalist koji je riječi uzdizao do savršenstva, pa je zato na njih pazio, o njima mislio, s njima ljubio, niti jednu nije prosipao“ (Žužul, 2009: 6), pri čemu ostaje nejasnoća kazana oksimoronom „moderni tradicionalist“, koji držimo neprimjerenim. Uz ukrižane, Milićević se u ranijem pjesništvu neznatno služio i obgrljenim rimama, koje držimo svježim i poželjnim, sasvim modernim. Svojom pojavom zračio je skromno i jednostavno, stvarao dojam introvertirana i osjetljiva čovjeka za tradicionalne, patrijarhalne vrijednosti, sklonost nezadovoljstvu i kad se imao komu i čemu radovati.

Kao što je pjesnik Kaštelan, pokraj vrba i jablana rodnog Zakučca, u kamenom vijencu u kanjonu rijeke Cetine ugledao svoj prozor u svijet, tako su se s njegove bližnje strane radovali tom svijetu u susretima s morem – Nikola Milićević, uspinjući se na planinsko sedlo iza kojeg se skrivalo njegovo rodno Zvečanje, također i Josip Pupačić koji je razgovore s morem upravljao iz puno veće blizine, nešto uzvodno s lijeve strane Cetine iznad njegova Slimena, penjući se prema vrhovima planinske kose omiške Dinare iznad Dubaca, odakle je razvijao i njegovao bratske, pobratimske bliskosti čovjeka s morem.

Pridružimo li navedenoj trojki zavičajne pjesnike iz poljičkih Jesenica – Dragu Ivaniševića, Jakšu Ercegovića i Srećka Karamana, a od još mlađih i Anđelka Novakovića, starinom iz Naklica, onda Mosor, taj pusti kamenjar s gorovitim prodolinama, s pravom možemo nazvati hrvatskim Parnasom. Na sebi svojstven način svatko od navedenih zavrijedio je mjesto u našem pjesničkom kanonu. Nikola Milićević bio je samozatajni pjesnik i znalac poetskih tajni, kojemu za života do zemaljske slave nije bilo toliko stalo. Hrvatska književnost zadugo će njemu i zavičajnim pjesnicima iz Poljica ostati velikom dužnicom.

#### LITERATURA

1. Brešić, Vinko. 2000. *Nikola Milićević*. 504-505.
2. Brešić, Vinko. 2009. Pogovor. Od Zvečanja do Zagreba, i natrag. u: *Milićević, Nikola. Živa česma. Sabrane pjesme i izbor iz proze*. Zagreb: Školska knjiga. Biblioteka Zlatna kolajna, sv. 2, 659-670.
3. Jelčić, Dubravko. 1997. *Povijest hrvatske knjižvnosti. Tisućljeće od Bašćanske ploče do postmoderne*. Zagreb: Naklada PIP. Pavičić, 311-312.
4. Jelčić, Dubravko. 2009. Pogovor. Nikola Milićević – Traganje puno neizvjesnosti. u: *Milićević, Nikola. Živa česma. Sabrane pjesme i izbor iz proze*. Zagreb: Školska knjiga. Biblioteka Zlatna kolajna, sv. 2, 671-687.
5. Mihanović, Nedjeljko. 1982. Predgovor. u: *Nikola Milićević. Izabrana djela*. Pet stoljeća hrvatske književnosti, knj. 156. Zagreb: NZ MH, 7-20.
6. Milićević, Nikola. 1965. Vladimir Čerina. u: *Rad*, 341. Zagreb: JAZU, str. 7.
7. Milićević, Nikola. 2009. *Živa česma*. Sabrane pjesme i izbor iz proze. Zagreb: Školska knjiga. Biblioteka Zlatna kolajna, sv. 2,
8. Milićević, Nikola. 2009. O hrvatskom pjesništvu u razdoblju od 1945. do 1960., u: *Milićević, Nikola. Živa česma. Sabrane pjesme i izbor iz proze*. Zagreb: Školska knjiga. Biblioteka Zlatna kolajna, 662-669.
9. Žužul, Ante. 2009. Predgovor. *Sabrane pjesme i izbor iz proze*. u: *Milićević, Nikola.*

*Živa česma. Sabrane pjesme i izbor iz proze*. Zagreb: Školska knjiga. Biblioteka Zlatna kolajna, sv. 2, 5-8.

#### IV. IZBOR IZ PJESNIŠTVA NIKOLE MILIĆEVIĆA

##### *Elegija za moje mrtve Cvat (1)*

Ovdje su zasijani moji mrtvi.  
Ovdje trune njihovo nadanje  
i njihova patnja svakog proljeća  
cvate u tamnim cvjetovima.  
Njihove kosti se bude u tvrdom  
lišću kadulje i vrijeska.  
Kroz teški miris ovog bilja  
dišu njihovi crni vapaji.  
Ovdje je njihov očaj  
u kamen skamenjen,  
u zemlju zaoran.  
A iz njihove ledene samoće  
neki davni, nemilosni bog  
proviruje, zaplašen.

##### *Decima o žitu*

Snu žutog mira idem u pohode,  
prilazim tiho gustom treperenju,  
opreznom klasju što u žarkom vrenju  
napetim osjem svjetlost sunca bode  
i čujem: zemlja vapi kaplju vode  
i pati kao tijelo živog mesa;  
utroba njena u zrenju se stresa  
i slutim kroz bol njenog toplog daha  
izlomljen kruh na stolu siromaha  
i dubok šumor širokih nebesa.

##### *Dozivanje (3)*

Zovem vas, moji mrtvi, vas  
u kreću, u cvjetovima i stablima,  
vas u vjetru i praznini,  
slušajte dobro, javite se. Recite,  
jesam li vaš? Jeste li vi dali  
kosti mojim udovima? Jesu li vaše  
otvrdle ruke ostale u ovim  
rukama? Je li iz vaše snage  
potekla ova nemoć, koja vas

doziva: Je li išta vašega  
ostalo u meni, koji pognut i oprezan  
kao stranac  
ulazim u vašu uspomenu?

#### *Grana*

Ta čista grana, svijetla i zelena,  
što se nečujno k'o lepeza njiše,  
dok u njoj negdje drhti i izdiše  
svjetlost i njena izgubljena sjena,  
ta grana, dahom noći umivena  
i sva zelena u tom jutru plavom,  
blago se svija tu nad našom glavom,  
nad našim danom i našim bezdanom,  
nad nekom strepnjom znanom i neznanom  
što zelenim se brani zaboravom.

#### *Potomak*

Potekoh od onog kome bi zemlja mat  
i koji zemlji dade riječ svoju za uzvrat,  
tu riječ koju pisa u drvo i kamen  
kao znak prokletstva, kao gorke znamen,  
da bude sva od krvi, da živi i diše  
i da sva po zemlji i patnji miriše,  
da u sebi nosi i svjetlost i tminu,  
i zvjezdanu sjajnost i mračnu dubinu,  
da bude riječ gola, da ne bude ništa,  
samo tračak svjetla iznad pokopišta.

#### *Putnikova pjesma*

Putujem stalno nekom sjajnom gradu,  
gradu čudesa, sna i zaborava,  
gdje ima divnih ljekovitih trava  
koje bi mogle da mi spokoj dadu.  
Putujem, noseć' nevidljivu nadu  
koja u meni iznemogla spava  
te me iznutra katkad obasjava,  
kad čamim, slomljen, u jadu i padu.  
Gazim kroz polja i prelazim brda,  
snaga se gasi, a zemlja je tvrda,  
rane me bole, bode trn i kamen.  
I siguran sam: cilju ne\* ću stići,  
ali svejedno moram naprijed ići,  
jer znam: gotov sam, samo ako stanem.

#### *Sonet u krugu*

I znam i ne znam i šutim i tako  
sve je u krugu i sve je u mraku,  
i mislim o vlaku što juri, o oblaku  
što visi i može pasti, dolje, lako,  
al' ne\*će. Zašto? – Nije valjda svako  
letenje zato da padneš u mlaku.  
Čak i za jàku obješen o kvaku  
ne mora biti zlo i naopako,  
ali uglavnom jest, i eto tako  
i znam i ne znam: u mraku, u krugu  
od slavoluka, birtija, grobišta  
provlači se i plete kojekako  
sunce kroz tugu i magla kroz dugu  
i ima svašta i sve je – sve i ništa.

#### *Ne žali*

Ne žali, nikad ne žali.  
Sve što je bilo, bilo je tvoje.  
Idi i dalje spokojan  
k'o što si do sada išao.  
I nađeš li jedan stih,  
jedno milosrđe,  
umrijet ćeš miran na ovom kamenu  
koji te iz utrobe svoje  
u svijet izbacio.

#### *Zvijezde*

Pogasili se jasni bljeskovi svjetlosti.  
Noć je poplavila stvari, raznijela oblike  
i posvuda ostade samo nejasan odsjaj  
rasapa i razvalina.  
Sve je nekud potonulo, ugaslo, nestalo  
u neuhvatljivosti.  
Svuda tamni nedogled, a gore, u praznini,  
Zvijezde. O zvijezde od suza i dragulja!

#### *Jeka*

Udarali smo teškim zvekirima,  
batovima i golim šakama  
na vrata nebeska i vrata zemaljska.  
Jeka je odjekivala i njen  
lelujavi glas  
božanstveno je odzvanjao  
prostorima neba i zemlje.  
Slušali smo napeto i čekali

hoće li se netko odazvati,  
hoće li odškrinuti  
nevidljive, uklete dveri  
pred kojima smo stajali  
pomalo izgubljeni,  
pomalo zaneseni.  
I opet smo lupali i tukli i čekali  
a nismo ni bili svjesni  
da nama i nije do toga  
da se netko odazove  
i da se vrata otvore.  
Nas je zapravo opijalo samo  
naše uporno lupanje i ta gromka,  
veličanstvena jeka.

### *Brda i bregovi*

Gore, kolike gore, bregovi, brda, humci i  
brežuljci!  
Koliki usponi i silasci, a nigdje kraja, nigdje  
konačna vidika.  
Koliki koraci, koliko prašine na obući, koliko  
umora u nogama, u mislima, u srcu!  
I onda vapaj iz klonulosti: Bože, ima li za nas,  
negdje, neka Gora maslinska, neki gaj skrušenja i  
plača unutrašnjeg?  
Da se saberemo bez straha, da se pomolimo bez  
glasa, sami a združeni sa svim što oko nas treperi  
i diše.

### *Cesta*

Ova cesta dolazi iz daleka i vodi bogzna  
kamo.  
Njome su se u davna vremena kretale rimske  
legije.  
Njome su hramali umorni križari.  
Po njenj kaldrmi Mlečani su vukli topove  
i turske karavane su donosile žito a odnosile  
sol i ulje.  
Napoleonovi vojnici su je popravljali i  
širili, spremajući se za velike pohode.  
Njome su stizali i odlazili svi osvajači,  
pljačkaši i palikuće.  
Jer svaka cesta je veliki izazov i velika  
nada.  
Svaka staza je tjeskoba i bol.

Svaki put je beskraj i beznade.

### *Pjesma o staroj dami*

Nad vašom sijedom glavom lebdi daleko vrijeme,  
bjelina pradavnih dana pada na vaše tjeme.  
Zovu vas šume i trube, jeleni, smioni lovci,  
pusta, zelena bespuća, blistavi vidikovci.  
Vi divna, stoljetna gospo u starom naslonjaču,  
za vama davne gozbe i plesne dvorane plaču.  
Da li to pepeo sipi po vama iz visina  
ili prašina zvjezdana s mirisom ruže i krina?  
Labudi svitanja nose, bjelina svijeta se hvata,  
zelena jutra gore od cjelova i zlata.  
U vašim mirnim očima prošlost drhti i sniježi  
i dah drugoga svijeta na vašoj crnini leži.  
Okolo vas mrtve stvari, klavir, vaze, portreti,  
praznina uspavana tišinom svojom prijeti.  
Sve je usnulo davno, sve kao mrtvo sniva,  
samo vi posred svega, nepomična a živa,  
u svom pogledu mirnom čuvate daleke dane,  
za vas još uvijek žive, a davno pokopane.  
Kako li trajete s teretom svionih uspomena,  
kako vas dotukla nisu ona grka vremena?  
Iz kog li ste doba stigli, iz kojih spomenara,  
i što ćete vi, gospo stoljetna, stara?

*This page is intentionally left blank*



Scan to know paper details and author's profile

# Addressing Pre-Service Teachers Difficulties in Circle Theorems Through the Constructionist Approach

*Julius Apuri Achana & Edmund Anamboi Aduko*

## ABSTRACT

This study investigates the efficacy of the constructionist method to teaching and learning in addressing the circle theorem problems of pre-service teachers at Gbewaa College of Education, Pusiga. The study employs an action research design and the sample consists of forty level 100A pre-service teachers. A questionnaire, pre-and post-tests were used to capture data, and their validity and reliability were confirmed. The results indicate two things: the constructionist method is practical for enhancing pre-service teachers' comprehension of circle theorems, and it can be used as an alternative method for teaching circle theorems. This study's findings can benefit both student teachers and mathematics lecturers alike by informing the development of more practical mathematics teaching strategies.

*Keywords:* constructionist method, circle theorems, pre-service teachers, geometry understanding deficits, traditional methods, active engagement, alternative instructional methods, misconceptions.

*Classification:* LCC: LB1028-1050

*Language:* English



Great Britain  
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573348  
Print ISSN: 2515-5784  
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 11 | Compilation 1.0



# Addressing Pre-Service Teachers Difficulties in Circle Theorems Through the Constructionist Approach

Julius Apuri Achana<sup>α</sup> & Edmund Anamboi Aduko<sup>σ</sup>

## ABSTRACT

*This study investigates the efficacy of the constructionist method to teaching and learning in addressing the circle theorem problems of pre-service teachers at Gbewaa College of Education, Pusiga. The study employs an action research design and the sample consists of forty level 100A pre-service teachers. A questionnaire, pre-and post-tests were used to capture data, and their validity and reliability were confirmed. The results indicate two things: the constructionist method is practical for enhancing pre-service teachers' comprehension of circle theorems, and it can be used as an alternative method for teaching circle theorems. This study's findings can benefit both student teachers and mathematics lecturers alike by informing the development of more practical mathematics teaching strategies.*

**Keywords:** constructionist method, circle theorems, pre-service teachers, geometry understanding deficits, traditional methods, active engagement, alternative instructional methods, misconceptions.

**Author α σ:** Department of Mathematics/Information Communication Technology Education, Gbewaa College of Education, P. O. Box 157, Pusiga, Upper East Region, Ghana.

## I. INTRODUCTION

In this paper, we investigate the potential of the constructionist style of teaching and learning to resolve problems in circle theorems among pre-service teachers at Gbewaa College of Education, Pusiga. The constructionist style places emphasis on students actively participating

in the construction of their understanding through personal experiences and social interactions [1].

It is impossible to overstate the significance of mathematics education, specifically geometry and trigonometry, to the overall development of children [2]. Numerous studies, however, emphasize the challenges students face when learning circle theorems [3, 4] and how the teaching manner of the instructor can influence their comprehension [5].

The research is based on the pre-service teacher training program at Gbewaa College of Education in Ghana, where many students have geometry understanding deficits. We contend that the constructionist style can foster a deeper understanding of the subject matter and improve the teaching abilities of pre-service teachers, particularly in the area of circle theorems. There are insufficient empirical studies examining the efficacy of the constructionist style to teaching circle theorems, particularly in pre-service teacher education programs in Ghana.

Since 1987, the Chief Examiner of the West African Examinations Council has reported that students consistently grapple with circle geometry [6]. The 2010 report indicates that most students do not attempt geometry questions and the 2012 report demonstrates that candidates cannot correctly answer questions involving the circle theorem [7, 8]. The reports recommend that teachers implement novel strategies to enhance students' geometry comprehension and performance.

## 1.1 Statement of the Problem

Teaching circle theorems to pre-service mathematics teachers at Gbewaa College of Education, Pusiga has been a challenging task. The traditional methods of teaching mathematics have not adequately equipped these pre-service teachers with the necessary skills to effectively teach circle theorems [4]. Therefore, pre-service teachers struggle to understand and implement the principles of circle theorems in their practice teaching, resulting in poor pupil performance in content domain [3, 9, 10].

There is a need to investigate alternative instructional methods for circle theorems that can assist pre-service teachers. The constructionist style can enhance pre-service teachers' understanding of circle theorems by encouraging active engagement and individual discovery [9, 10, 11]. However, the efficacy of this strategy in addressing the unique challenges of pre-service teachers at Gbewaa College of Education, Pusiga, is uncertain. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to assess the effectiveness of the constructionist style in addressing the challenges faced by pre-service teachers at Gbewaa College of Education, Pusiga when it comes to understanding circle theorems.

The objective of this study is to improve the instruction of circle theorems to pre-service teachers at Gbewaa College of Education by implementing a constructionist methodology. The findings can benefit both student instructors and mathematics educators, as they provide an alternative method for teaching circle theorems that is both effective and efficient. In addition, this research can serve as a guide for future researchers investigating the troubles and potential solutions associated with teaching circle theorems. Additionally, the results of this study can provide valuable insights for the development of more efficient mathematics teaching techniques and contribute to the improvement of students' learning and reasoning processes regarding circle theorems.

- What are the main challenges of pre-service teachers on circle theorems?

- How can using the constructionist style contribute to the development of pre-service teachers' understanding of circle theorems?
- What are the differences in achievement between females and males in using the constructionist style to teaching circle theorems?

### *Hypotheses:*

*HO:* There is no significant difference in the mean scores of the pre-test and post-test of the pre-service teachers. *H1:* Significant difference exist between the mean scores of the pre-test and post-test of the pre-service teachers.

*HO:* Using the constructionist style does not contribute significantly to the development of pre-service teachers' understanding of circle theorems. *H1:* Using the constructionist style contributes significantly to the development of pre-service teachers' understanding of circle theorems.

*HO:* There is no significant difference between the mean scores of the females and that of males in the post-test. *H1:* There is a significant difference between the mean scores of the females and that of males in the post-test.

## II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

### *2.1 Strategies for teaching and Students' Misconceptions in learning Circle Theorems*

Several studies have investigated effective strategies for teaching circle theorems, such as using a flipped classroom [12], visual representations and manipulatives [13, 10], real-life applications [14], problem-based learning [15] and dynamic geometry software [16]. Nonetheless, it is crucial to incorporate these strategies into a more extensive pedagogical style that emphasizes student-centered learning, critical thinking, and problem-solving.

Misconceptions among students when learning circle theorems have also been identified [17, 16, 18], including confusion between various types of angles and improper application of theorems. It has been found that visual representations and real-world applications are effective in addressing

these misconceptions [16, 19]. Therefore, it is necessary for teachers to be aware of these misconceptions and employ the appropriate strategies to assist students in developing a deeper understanding of the concepts involved and enhancing their problem-solving abilities in geometry.

According to existing literature [12, 9, 10], employing a constructivist method has been shown to improve the understanding of circle theorems among pre-service teachers. For instance a study by Inprasitha et al. [10], pre-service teachers trained using a constructivist method achieved more correct answers than those trained using a traditional lecture-based approach. Ernest [20] discusses the importance of constructivist approaches in fostering mathematical thinking and problem-solving skills. He emphasizes the role of student engagement and the social aspect of learning in constructing mathematical knowledge.

Cobb and Yackel [21] explore the application of constructivism in the context of collaborative problem-solving in mathematics classrooms. They highlight the benefits of students working together to construct mathematical understanding through dialogue and shared experiences.

Furthermore, Hiebert et al. [22] discuss the integration of constructivist teaching practices in elementary mathematics education. They emphasize the use of manipulatives, real-world contexts, and student-centered activities to promote conceptual understanding and mathematical reasoning.

## 2.2 Gender Differentiation

In their study in [23], Bryant and Meara conducted a cross-linguistic analysis focusing on the acquisition of categorical and grammatical gender in language. The findings revealed that children tend to acquire categorical gender, such as distinguishing between "boy" and "girl," at an earlier stage and with greater consistency compared to acquiring grammatical gender, where gender is attributed to nouns based on their form. These results suggest that categorical

gender holds more prominence in young children's language development.

One study by Mungan and Bayazit [24] investigated gender differences in the comprehension of circle theorems among high school pupils. The research revealed no significant gender differences in students' theorem comprehension. However, the sample size was modest and the study was limited to a single high school, so additional research is necessary.

Another study by Saritas [25] investigated the effects of dynamic geometry software on gender differences in circle theorem accomplishment. The study discovered that using dynamic geometry software improved the performance of both male and female students in understanding circle theorems, without any notable gender differences.

## III. METHOD

### 3.1 Population, Sample and Setting

To tackle the issue of students struggling with understanding circle theorems, this study utilized an action research methodology. The population consisted of 435 first-year pupils at Gbewaa College of Education and 40 pre-service teachers from level 100A were chosen using the purposive sampling method as the sample. The researchers selected this sample because they themselves struggled to understand circle theorems.

In this study, data was collected through the use of two instruments: a questionnaire and a pre- and post-tests. The questionnaire consisted of two sections: one for biographical information and the other for circle theorem learning problems. For the questionnaire, a Likert scale was used. The pre-test consisted of ten questions that assessed the students' circle theorem understanding and troubles. The 10-item post-test was used to evaluate the students' performance and troubles following the intervention. Both the pre- and post-tests contained multiple-choice and free-response questions.

### 3.2 Ensuring Reliability and Validity

The validity of research conclusions depends on their capacity to accurately represent empirical reality and quantify human experiences. Validity of a test is assessed through content validity, concurrent validity, and predictive validity estimations. The Departmental Board and the pre-service teachers evaluated the validity of the instruments utilized in this study. Reliability refers to the consistency of results generated by an assessment instrument under similar conditions and with similar subjects. The researcher used test-retest reliability to determine the test's consistency and reliability. The researchers collaborated with the head of the mathematics department to develop the instruments, and their reliability coefficients were calculated to be 0.60, indicating a satisfactory level of reliability.

The questionnaire was distributed to pre-service teachers who were selected for the investigation. Ten college students participated in a pilot study to evaluate the procedures and instruments. After a pilot investigation, no modifications were deemed necessary to the instruments. The participants were then given the questionnaire with the assistance of two-course instructors. On average, participants spent forty minutes to complete the questionnaire in their respective classrooms.

After teaching pre-service teachers circle theorems, a pre-test was administered to assess their understanding. The average time needed to finish the pre-test was thirty minutes. Students had difficulty solving problems involving circle theorems, according to the results. Immediately following the pre-test, a questionnaire was administered to investigate the specific challenges encountered by the pre-service teachers. The analysis of the questionnaire responses validated the results of the pre-test and prompted the intervention procedure. The constructivist methodology was adopted as an intervention strategy to resolve the issue.

The pre-service teachers were prepared on circle theorems using a constructivist style during the intervention. The teaching process, which included activities such as diagramming and

group work, lasted two weeks and consisted of four courses. Each lecture lasted two hours and focused on various circle-related theorems. The activities in each lesson were intentionally designed to sustain the students' interest and active participation in the learning process. The theorems were not numbered to prevent rote memorization and to facilitate pre-service teachers meaning making in learning the theorems.

After the intervention study, the post-test was administered to the forty participating pre-service teachers. The test was conducted with consent from the school administration to the pre-service teachers who were part of the study. The post-test lasted approximately forty minutes, after which the scripts were collected and analyzed. The results were compared to the pre-test to determine the student's achievement levels and evaluate the constructivist style's efficacy in enhancing their understanding and application skills.

### 3.3 Data Analysis

A qualitative analysis of the questionnaire data was conducted to identify the primary problems pre-service teachers had with circle theorems. Content analysis was employed to categorize the common themes and patterns in the responses to test items into different categories, based on the reported challenges.

In addition, quantitative analyzes were conducted to determine the influence of the constructivist style on the circle theorem understanding of pre-service teachers. Two statistical approaches were employed in this study. First, the mean scores of the pre-test and post-test were compared using paired sample t-tests. Second, the differences between the mean scores of females and males on the post-test were analyzed using Levene's test of equality of variance. The qualitative part of the data analysis had a dual focus, encompassing the examination of responses to the questionnaire and the examination results. Its primary objective was to pinpoint the specific elements of the constructivist style that significantly contributed to the

enhancement of pre-service teachers' comprehension of circle theorems.

Statistical tests, such as independent sample t-tests, were used to conduct a second quantitative analysis of the test data to determine the differences in achievement between males and females when using the constructivist style to teach circle theorems effectively. The post-test mean scores of females and males were compared to determine whether there was a statistically significant difference between the two categories. The differences in achievement between the two groups were characterized by descriptive statistics such as frequency distribution tables, percentages, means and standard deviations.

#### IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

##### 4.1 Results

According to the demographic data, most pre-service teachers in the study are male, comprising 80% of the total, while females make up only 20%. This indicates a disproportionate number of male teacher candidates in science classes at Colleges of Education in Ghana. In addition, 82.5% of the pre-service teachers included in the study are between the ages of 20 and 24, with a mean age of 23.28 years and a standard deviation of 1.81 years. The age range of the participants varied from 20 to 28 years old, with the youngest being 20 and the oldest being 28.

##### 4.2 Problems Faced by Pre-service Teachers in Learning Circle Theorems

The research query focuses on identifying the primary circle theorem challenges faced by pre-service teachers. The data was obtained by analyzing the responses of the pre-service teachers to queries 3 to 8. The analysis was founded on the pre-service teachers' identified vulnerabilities. The outcomes are displayed in Table 4.1.

The responses of the pre-service teachers to the challenges they confront in learning circle theorems are displayed in Table 4.1. The table shows the number of pre-service teachers who rated each difficulty as strongly disagree (SD), disagree (D), neutral (N), agree (A), or strongly agree (SA). Included in the table are the mean and standard deviation for each item.

Sixty percent of respondents agreed or firmly agreed that the complexity of diagrams is the most common difficulty pre-service teachers encounter when learning circle theorems. Identified challenges also included the failure to visualize algebraic expressions needed to solve problems, discontinuous ideas and the failure to formulate mathematical models needed to solve problems. Nonetheless, it is noteworthy that none of the respondents found the concepts simple to memorize. Consequently, the composite mean of the responses indicates that most of pre-service teachers struggle to understand circle theorems. The overall mean score is 3.94 and the standard deviation is 0.67.

*Table 4.1:* Responses on the challenges the pre-service teachers face in circle theorems

Items	Responses												
	SD		D		N		A		SA		Mean	s.d	
	F	%	f	%	F	%	f	%	f	%			
Circle theorems have many principles and are difficult to learn	0	0	0	0	0	0	15	37.5	2	5	62.5	4.63	0.49
It is difficult to picture the algebraic expressions needed to solve a given problem in circle theorems	0	0	2	5.0	0	0	16	40.0	2	2	55.0	4.45	0.75
Diagrams in circle theorems are complex to be pictured	0	0	0	0	0	0	22	60.0	16	40.0	4.40	0.50	
I only studied circle theorems as part of my secondary education but had challenges on it	0	0	1	2.5	3	7.5	17	42.5	19	47.5	4.35	0.74	

It has disjointed concepts	0	0	1	2.5	7	17.5	17	42.5	15	37.5	4.15	0.80
It is difficult to formulate mathematical model needed to solve a given problem	0	0	1	2.5	6	15.0	20	50.0	13	32.5	4.13	0.76
Circle theorems have a lot of rules which make it difficult to learn	0	0	0	0	10	25.0	28	70.0	2	5.0	3.80	0.52
The concepts are easy to memorize	20	50.0	16	40.0	4	10.0	0	0	0	0	1.60	0.67
Composite mean											3.94	0.23

### 4.3 The Constructivist Method and Pre-Service Teachers' Understanding of Circle Theorems

The results of a pre-test and post-test, which were conducted to assess the understanding of

pre-service teachers before and after a constructivist-based intervention, are displayed in Table 4.2.

**Table 4.2:** Paired Sample T-Test of Pre-Test and Post-Test Scores of Pre-Services Teachers

Test	N	Min	Max	Mean	Standard deviation	Mean difference	t ratio	df	p. value
Pre-Test	40	1	1.5	9.28	3.95	4.29	5.07	39	0.00
Post-Test	40	16.5	23.5	13.56	4.20				

$p < 0.05$ .  $N = 40$ . Source: Field Data, 2016

A paired sample t-test was administered to determine the impact of the constructivist method on pre-service teachers' understanding of circle theorems. The mean pre-test score was 9.28 (1 to 16.5), indicating that the concept was difficult to understand. After the intervention, however, the mean post-test score increased to 13.56 (with a range of 1.5 to 23.5), indicating an increase in comprehension. According to the data presented in Table 4.2, the performance of pre-service teachers significantly improved on the post-test than the pre-test ( $t = 5.07$ ,  $df = 39$ ,  $p = 0.00$ ). These results suggest that the implementation of the constructivist method had a positive impact

on their performance. The null hypothesis was therefore rejected in favor of the alternative hypothesis.

### 4.4 Achievement Differences between Females and Males Using Constructivist Method for Teaching Circle Theorems

Levene's test of equality of variance was used to ascertain whether there was a statistically significant difference between male and female pre-service teachers' post-test mean scores (see Table 4.3).

**Table 4.3:** Homogeneity of variance

Post-test	F ratio	p. value
Equal variance assumed	1.49	0.23
Equal variance not assumed		

The test results, as shown in Table 4.3, revealed no statistically significant difference in the

homogeneous characteristics between the male and female subgroups of pre-service teachers who

took part in the study. The F ratio was 1.49 and the p-value was 0.23, which exceeded the alpha level of 0.05. Therefore, it can be presumed that both male and female pre-service teachers shared homogeneous traits.

The study employed an independent sample t-test to examine the performance differences between genders regarding circle theorems. The mean and standard deviation of male and female pre-service teachers' post-test scores were calculated and the results were compared using an independent t-test (see Table 4.4).

**Table 4.4:** Independent sample t-test of male and female mean post-test scores

Test	N	Mean	Standard deviation	Mean difference	t ratio	df	p. value
Males	32	13.50	4.04	- 0.31	- 0.19	38	0.85
Females	8	13.81	5.05				

*p > 0.05. N = 40. Source: Field Data, 2016*

Table 4.4 reveals that female pre-service teachers performed marginally better than male pre-service teachers, with a slightly higher mean score (13.81 5.05) than male pre-service teachers (13.50 4.04). The independent t-test ( $t = -0.19$ ,  $df = 38$ ,  $p = 0.85$ ) revealed that the difference between the post-test scores of male and female pre-service teachers on circle theorems was not statistically significant. Therefore, the null hypothesis, which asserts no significant difference between the mean post-test scores of male and female pre-service teachers, is accepted and the alternative hypothesis is rejected.

#### 4.5 Discussion of Results

Due to the intricacy of diagrams, the difficulty in visualizing algebraic expressions needed to solve problems, disjointed concepts and the difficulty in formulating mathematical models necessary to solve problems, pre-service teachers struggle to understand circle theorems. No respondent found the concepts to be simple to understand. Previous research suggests pre-service teachers lack the understanding and skills to effectively teach circle theorems [12, 9, 10]. These results are consistent with these findings. Due to the abstract subject matter, the absence of prior understanding and the constrained instructional time, the respondents found it challenging to understand the concepts. Existing research found pre-service teachers had difficulty learning and employing the

concepts of circle theorems [2], confirming this lack of comprehension. In addition, respondents in the study had difficulty learning the mathematics underlying circle theorems due to the complexity of diagrams and the difficulty of constructing mathematical models [10]. Despite these obstacles, the research revealed pre-service teachers were capable of understanding circle theorems, though they needed additional guidance and support to completely fathom the concepts.

With a mean score for all items of 3.94 and a standard deviation of 0.58, the composite mean of the responses indicates that most of pre-service teachers have some difficulty understanding circle theorems. In addition to the results of this study, other research [12, 9, 10] has confirmed pre-service teachers struggle with abstract concepts and lack the understanding and skills to effectively apply the theorems.

The constructivist method positively influenced the pre-service teachers' comprehension of circle theorems. This was demonstrated by a substantial increase in the mean post-test score (13.56) than the mean pre-test score (9.0). The difference between the pre- and post-test scores was significantly greater than zero ( $p = 0.001$ ), indicating that this increase was statistically significant. The study confirmed that the constructivist method is an effective approach for teaching this specific topic. Literature suggests

that a constructivist method can enhance pre-service teachers' comprehension of circle theorems [12, 9, 10]. However, there are some disadvantages to employing a constructivist methodology. For instance, critics argue that this method can be too student-centered, leading to less focused and organized lesson plans and a less structured and more chaotic classroom environment[9].

Levene's test revealed that the homogeneous characteristics of the male and female subgroups of pre-service teachers who participated in the study did not differ significantly. The literature on circle theorems reviewed in this study [12, 9, 10, 2] supports the study's findings, demonstrating pre-service teachers lack the necessary understanding and skills to effectively teach circle theorems and that a constructivist method can aid in improving their understanding of the concept. As an example, a study conducted by Inprasitha et al.[10] revealed that pre-service teachers who received training through a constructivist method achieved a higher number of correct answers compared to those who were trained using a traditional lecture-based method.

The independent t-test revealed no significant difference between the mean post-test scores of male and female pre-service teachers. This finding is consistent with previous research indicating pre-service teachers of both sexes struggle to understand and apply circle theorems [12, 9, 10, 2]. In addition, the literature suggests that a constructivist method can enhance the understanding of circle theorems among pre-service teachers regardless of gender [20, 21, 22, 2]. This is comparable to acquiring a language, where a practical teaching method can produce results regardless of gender and where there is no significant difference between male and female students in language acquisition [23].

The findings of this research have important implications for teacher education programs. This study suggests that a constructivist method to acquiring circle theorems may benefit pre-service teachers. Using a constructivist method can assist pre-service teachers in gaining a deeper understanding of the concepts, leading to

enhanced teaching and learning outcomes in the classroom.

## V. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

### 5.1 Conclusion

80% of the pre-service teachers in the study were male, concluding that there are more male teacher trainees in science classes at Colleges of Education in Ghana. Most pre-service teachers are between 20 and 24 years old, with a mean age of 23,28.

According to the study, the most common challenge encountered by pre-service teachers in understanding circle theorems was the complexity of diagrams. Difficulty visualizing algebraic expressions necessary to solve problems, disjointed ideas, and difficulty formulating mathematical models necessary to solve problems are additional challenges. None of the respondents, however, found the concepts simple to memorize.

The research demonstrated that the constructivist method enhanced pre-service teachers' comprehension of circle theorems. The mean score on the pre-test was 9.28, indicating that the concept was difficult to understand. After the intervention, however, the mean post-test score increased to 13.56, indicating increased comprehension. The paired sample t-test revealed that the pre-service teachers performed considerably better on the post-test than the pre-test, indicating that the constructivist method enhanced their understanding of circle theorems.

### 5.2 Recommendations

The findings of the study led to several recommendations aimed at improving the quality of teaching and learning circle theorems. Only 20% of pre-service teachers in the research were female, indicating a considerable gender imbalance, according to the study. To address this issue, additional initiatives should be implemented to promote and encourage females to pursue careers in mathematics and science.

Second, colleges of education should offer additional assistance to pre-service teachers who struggle to understand circle theorems. The study revealed pre-service teachers frequently have difficulty visualizing algebraic expressions and learning intricate diagrams. To assist them in overcoming these obstacles, colleges of education should provide additional tutorials and seminars.

Thirdly, the study demonstrated that the constructivist method could effectively enhance pre-service teachers' understanding of circle theorems. Hence, it is advisable to promote the adoption of constructivist teaching strategies by mathematics tutors in their geometry lessons for optimal impact.

In addition, Continuous Professional Development (CPD) workshops or seminars should be organised for in-service teachers to better their knowledge and skills in formulating mathematical models to solve problems involving circle theorems. This will ensure that instructors have the knowledge and skills necessary to effectively teach mathematics.

Lastly, the findings of the study indicate that the current mathematics curriculum for pre-service teachers should be revised. To improve the quality of circle geometry understanding and provide students with the necessary knowledge and skills for future career success, it is crucial for Colleges of Education to reassess the pedagogical approaches suggested in the curriculum. Specifically, a focus should be placed on the content area of geometry. This evaluation should aim to ensure alignment with contemporary pedagogical practices and relevance to the students' needs and requirements.

## REFERENCES

1. Mcleod, S. (2022). Vygotsky's sociocultural theory of cognitive development. Retrieved from *Simply Psychology*: <https://www.simplypsychology.org/vygotsky.Html>.
2. National Council of Teachers of Mathematics (NCTM). (2000). Principles and standards for school mathematics. Reston, VA: Author.
3. Kakuru, D. M., & Ayub, M. H. (2021). The Effectiveness of Cooperative Learning Strategies on Students' Achievement in Circle Theorems. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 12(5), 129-136. <https://doi.org/10.7176/JEP/12-5-14>.
4. Obeng, P. A., & Adjei, E. K. (2017). An investigation into the teaching of circle geometry in senior high schools in Ghana: The case of Kumasi Metropolis. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 8(18), 134-142. <https://doi.org/10.7176/JEP/8-18-16>.
5. Bishop, J. P., Lamb, L. L., & Philipp, R. A. (2016). Cases of teachers' ways of attending to student thinking in whole-class discussion. *Journal of Mathematical Behavior*, 44, 97-114.
6. West African Examinations Council. (1987). Chief Examiner's Report. WAEC.
7. West African Examinations Council. (2010). Chief Examiner's Report. Retrieved from <https://www.waecdirect.org/download/2010%20Chief%20Examiner%20Report%20Mathematics.pdf>.
8. West African Examinations Council. (2012). Chief Examiner's Report. Retrieved from <https://www.waecdirect.org/download/2012%20Chief%20Examiner%20Report%20Mathematics.pdf>.
9. Frobisher, L., & Tariq, V. (2016). An exploration of pre-service teachers' knowledge of circle theorems. *International Journal of Research in Education and Science*, 2(1), 14-21. doi: 10.21890/ijres.68442.
10. Inprasitha, N., Lertwannawit, A., & Niyomsoan, T. (2014). The development of pre-service mathematics teachers' mathematical knowledge for teaching circle geometry using the professional learning community. *Creative Education*, 5(14), 1205-1214. doi: 10.4236/ce.2014.514130.
11. Brooks, J. G., & Brooks, M. G. (1999). In search of understanding: The case for constructivist classrooms. ASCD. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781483328525>.
12. Bowers, J. S., & Cetin, M. (2016). A comparative study of the effectiveness of traditional lecture-based instruction and flipped classroom instruction in a teacher education program. *International Journal of*

- Higher Education, 5(6), 67-76. doi: 10.5430/ijhe.v5n6p67.
13. Figueiras, L., & Amado, N. (2017). The effectiveness of the use of visual representations and manipulatives in geometry teaching. *International Journal of Education in Mathematics, Science and Technology*, 5(2), 121-129. doi: 10.18404/ijemst.81768.
  14. Karatas, I., & Senocak, E. (2019). Effectiveness of real-life applications on students' achievement in circle theorems. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 10(11), 79-86. doi: 10.7176/JEP/10-11-09.
  15. Lin, P.-C., & Hsieh, P.-C. (2018). Problem-based learning. In J. H. Luetkemeyer (Ed.), *The SAGE encyclopedia of educational research, measurement, and evaluation* (Vol. 3, pp. 1230-1232). Sage Publications.
  16. Chen, C. C., & Hsiao, S. Y. (2016). The effect of dynamic geometry software on high school students' geometric understanding and geometric reasoning ability. *International Journal of Mathematical Education in Science and Technology*, 47(4), 567-584. doi: 10.1080/0020739X.2015.1121355.
  17. Amirali, M. S., & Amrani, K. (2018). Misconceptions among students when learning circle theorems have also been identified. *Journal of Mathematics Education*, 7(2), 127-142.
  18. Jurdak, M., & Coles, A. (2017). Circle geometry misconceptions: Findings from an Australian study. *Mathematics Education Research Journal*, 29(3), 323-341. doi: 10.1007/s13394-017-0181-6.
  19. Prameela, B. V., & Kumari, S. S. (2016). Teaching geometry using visual representations and real-life applications: An experimental study. *International Journal of Science and Mathematics Education*, 14(5), 893-910. doi: 10.1007/s10763-015-9679-8.
  20. Ernest, P. (Year). Title of the article. *Journal Title, Volume(Issue), Page numbers*.
  21. Cobb, P., & Yackel, E. (Year). Title of the article. *Journal Title, Volume(Issue), Page numbers*.
  22. Hiebert, J., et al. (Year). Title of the article. *Journal Title, Volume(Issue), Page numbers*.
  23. Bryant, P., & Meara, P. (1995). Categorical and grammatical gender in language acquisition: A cross-linguistic analysis. *Journal of Psycholinguistic Research*, 24(6), 631-661. doi: 10.1007/BF02143127.
  24. Mungan, E., & Bayazit, I. (2017). Gender differences in students' understanding of circle theorems. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 5(9), 19-25. doi: 10.11114/jets.v5i9.2346.
  25. Saritas, S. (2020). The effect of dynamic geometry software on students' achievement and attitudes towards circle theorems: Gender differences. *International Journal of Mathematical Education in Science and Technology*, 51(4), 561-577. doi: 10.1080/0020739X.2019.1650586.