



IMAGE: A MAP OF THE STARS OF THE ORION CONSTELLATION

Print ISSN: 2515-5784 Online ISSN: 2515-5792

JournalPreview

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



Great Britain
Journals Press

JournalPreview

LONDON JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

This document is a pre-published view of London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences Volume 23, Issue 17 and Compilation 1.0. For any minor changes and updations kindly follow your paper's live editing URL given in sent email or get in touch with our support team at support@journalspress.com or visit our website to use live chat support. This is a beta document thus order, content or existence of papers may alter in the published eJournal. You are requested to kindly acknowledge and approve your research paper in this JournalPreview within three days.

Journal Content

In this Issue



Great Britain
Journals Press

- i. Journal introduction and copyrights
- ii. Featured blogs and online content
- iii. Journal content
- iv. Curated Editorial Board Members

-
1. Elena Martín Vivaldi or the Loneliness of Words. **1-10**
 2. The Intentionality Marked in Instructional Texts: What ´s New in it? **11-25**
 3. Antenor Patiño and James Goldsmith: Two Tycoons in the Pacific Coast of Mexico. **27-40**
 4. Sino-American Cultural Conflicts in the Joy Luck Club from the Perspective of Cultural Identity. **41-49**
 5. Reading of Reading Salman Rushdie's 'Midnight's Children through Reader Response Theory. **51-54**
 6. The Ernest Hemingway Theory of Composition. **55-64**

-
- V. Great Britain Journals Press Membership



Scan to know paper details and
author's profile

Elena Martín Vivaldi or the Loneliness of Words

Anna Cacciola

Universidad de Murcia

ABSTRACT

Elena Martín Vivaldi (Granada, 1907–1998) actively participates, after the publication of her first book *Escalera de luna* (1945), in cultural gatherings in Granada, becoming a reference “figure”, esteemed and appreciated by local intellectuals. She is the author of an extensive poetic production, which amazes for its intensity, neatness, lyrical sparkle and pictorial capacity, and which covers transcendental topics such as the search for identity and the deceit of love (*El alma desvelada*, 1953), loneliness (*Cumplida soledad*, 1958; *Arco en desenlace*, 1963; *Nocturnos*, 1981), the passage of time (*Durante este tiempo*, 1972), frustrated motherhood and the creation of the word (*Materia de esperanza*, 1968). This study aims to provide an approximation to the life and work of Elena Martín Vivaldi, facilitating the interpretative keys of her poetic discourse and placing special emphasis on the leitmotif that supports it: loneliness.

Keywords: *Elena Martín Vivaldi*, 20th century Spanish female poetry, Spanish female poetry, gender literature, gender.

Classification: LCC Code: PQ6633.A798

Language: Spanish



Great Britain
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573353
Print ISSN: 2515-5785
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Anna Cacciola. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Elena Martín Vivaldi or the Loneliness of Words

Elena Martín Vivaldi o la soledad de la palabra

Anna Cacciola

ABSTRACT

Elena Martín Vivaldi (Granada, 1907–1998) actively participates, after the publication of her first book *Escalera de luna* (1945), in cultural gatherings in Granada, becoming a reference figure, esteemed and appreciated by local intellectuals. She is the author of an extensive poetic production, which amazes for its intensity, neatness, lyrical sparkle and pictorial capacity, and which covers transcendental topics such as the search for identity and the deceit of love (*El alma desvelada*, 1953), loneliness (*Cumplida soledad*, 1958; *Arco en desenlace*, 1963; *Nocturnos*, 1981), the passage of time (*Durante este tiempo*, 1972), frustrated motherhood and the creation of the word (*Materia de esperanza*, 1968). This study aims to provide an approximation to the life and work of Elena Martín Vivaldi, facilitating the interpretative keys of her poetic discourse and placing special emphasis on the leitmotif that supports it: loneliness.

Keywords: Elena Martín Vivaldi, 20th century Spanish female poetry, Spanish female poetry, gender literature, gender.

Author: Universidad de Murcia, c/ Santo Cristo, 1, 30001, Murcia.

ABSTRACT

Elena Martín Vivaldi (Granada, 1907–1998) participated actively, after the publication of her first book *Escalera de luna* (1945), in the cultural gatherings of Granada, becoming a reference figure, valued and appreciated by the local intellectuals. She is the author of an extensive poetic production, which amazes for its intensity, neatness, lyrical sparkle and pictorial capacity, and which covers transcendental topics such as the search for identity and the deceit of love (*El alma desvelada*, 1953), loneliness (*Cumplida soledad*, 1958; *Arco en desenlace*, 1963; *Nocturnos*, 1981), the passage of time (*Durante este tiempo*, 1972), frustrated motherhood and the creation of the word (*Materia de esperanza*, 1968). This study aims to provide an approximation to the life and work of Elena Martín Vivaldi, facilitating the interpretative keys of her poetic discourse and placing special emphasis on the leitmotif that supports it: loneliness.

engaño amoroso (*El alma desvelada*, 1953), *la soledad* (*Cumplida soledad*, 1958; *Arco en desenlace*, 1963; *Nocturnos*, 1981), *el paso del tiempo* (*Durante este tiempo*, 1972), *la maternidad frustrada y la creación de la palabra* (*Materia de esperanza*, 1968). *El presente estudio pretende proporcionar una aproximación a la vida y a la obra de Elena Martín Vivaldi, facilitando las claves interpretativas de su discurso poético y haciendo especial hincapié en el leitmotiv que lo vertebra: la soledad.*

Palabras clave: Elena Martín Vivaldi, poesía femenina española siglo XX, poesía femenina española, literatura de género, género.

I. INTRODUCCIÓN

Elena Martín Vivaldi (Granada, 1907–1998) es una de aquellas extraordinarias voces líricas femeninas que conformaron el panorama literario español del siglo XX y que apenas salió de las fronteras de su Granada natal. Su caso fascina por una singularidad específica: haber alcanzado la talla de poeta, ejerciendo incluso cierto magisterio en los ambientes literarios granadinos, desde la inmovilidad de una vida ordinaria y provinciana. Pese a ello, su vasta producción poética tuvo escasa visibilidad a nivel nacional, no gozando de una meritoria repercusión en los medios y flujos culturales contemporáneos. Las razones se pueden achacar, en primer lugar, al alcance localista de las editoriales en las que publicó la mayoría de su obra. En segundo lugar, a la ambigüedad de su membresía generacional, ya que, por fecha de nacimiento podría integrarse en la promoción del 27 o en la del 36, pero su primera publicación fue tardía, puesto que apareció solo en 1945, o sea, en plena posguerra – hecho bastante común, entre otras cosas, en las poetisas, cuya incorporación *de facto* a los círculos

intelectuales fue dificultosa así como la adquisición de posiciones de trascendencia en ellos y, por consiguiente, su posibilidades de acceso al mundo editorial (Cacciola, 2019). En tercer lugar, por la idiosincrasia de su voz lírica, cuyos principios estéticos parecen no acompañarse a la preceptística coeva, conformando una poética que puede llegar a percibirse como anacrónica. Conjuntamente a estos, hubo motivos biográficos y extraliterarios, como la excepcionalidad de una existencia transcurrida casi integralmente en su Granada natal y la peculiaridad de un oficio que propiciaba de forma parcial la creación.

El presente estudio pretende proporcionar una aproximación a la vida y a la obra de Elena Martín Vivaldi, facilitando las claves interpretativas de su discurso poético y haciendo especial hincapié en el *leitmotiv* que lo vertebraba: la soledad fértil, costosa y poblada de la escritura.

II. SEMBLANZA BIOGRÁFICA¹ Y TRAYECTORIA LÍRICA DE LA AUTORA

Procedente de una familia acomodada –su padre era catedrático de Ginecología y Obstetricia en la Universidad de Granada–, Elena Martín Vivaldi pudo acceder desde su tierna infancia a la biblioteca de familia, disfrutando de la lectura de los clásicos de la literatura española y extranjera.

Cursó Bachillerato en el Instituto “Padre Suárez” de su ciudad, siendo una de las pocas jóvenes en hacerlo. Se diplomada en Magisterio en Guadix y, posteriormente, oponiéndose a la negativa de su madre, se matriculó en Filología Románica en la Universidad de Granada. Tras obtener la licenciatura, opositó, en 1942, al cuerpo de Bibliotecas, Archivos y Museo, logrando una plaza como archivera. Luego de una estancia en Osuna y Huelva, en 1948, regresó a Granada, donde le asignaron la gestión, primero, y la dirección, después, de las bibliotecas de las Facultades de Medicina y Farmacia.

¹ La información sobre la vida de la autora se ha recaudado de las siguientes fuentes: Acuyo Donaire (2007), Martínez Gómez (2000), Michel (1972), Villarubia (2007).

Al margen de su actividad principal, Vivaldi se dedicó de manera sistemática a la poesía. De hecho, se vinculó, en los años cincuenta, al grupo poético *Versos al aire libre*, participando en las tertulias literarias de los cafés del centro histórico hasta convertirse en anfitriona de estas. Fue una de las primeras mujeres que, en la Granada conservadora de posguerra, utilizó pantalones, fumó en público y cuidó mucho y abiertamente las relaciones amistosas con sus compañeros poetas. Autores del calado de Rafael Guillén, Antonio Carvajal, Luis García Montero, Javier Egea, Francisco Acuyo o Luis Muñoz, frequentadores asiduos de esas veladas poéticas, la tomaron como referencia, además de homenajearla con estima y cariño filial. Luis García Montero la rememora con esas palabras:

Era amable con los visitantes, pero guardaba la independencia de su vida y sus recuerdos detrás de una sonrisa. Los poetas de Granada han admirado con sinceridad la poesía de Elena Martín Vivaldi, tal vez porque la edificación de su identidad triste y lírica se llevó a cabo con pudor, sin el tremendismo que afectó a muchos de los versos aplaudidos por la revista *Espadaña*. (2007: 18)

Si bien su vocación poética fue temprana, no publicó antes de 1945, con 38 años cumplidos, dando a la imprenta *Escalera de luna*, una colección de décimas y sonetos de abolengo renacentista, que se adscriben al garcilasismo propio de la primera posguerra. Su segunda entrega, *El alma desvelada* (1953), es un muestrario de lo que será la tónica general de su producción sucesiva, ya que abandona el intimismo de ascendencia tardo-romántica y juanramoniana, optando por un agonismo contenido y compuesto, que nunca deriva hacia el tremendismo blasfemo ante el desengaño amoroso. Ese sujeto poemático, desahuciado de la dicha del querer, se amolda a las acometidas del azar con una aceptación sosegada del dolor de la existencia, vigorizando paradójicamente en la soledad.

La cosmovisión de la granadina, de hecho, se esboza de manera más clara en *El alma desvelada* (1953), hasta alcanzar su configuración definitiva

en *Cumplida soledad* (1958), considerado unánimemente por la crítica su libro más representativo, en el que la autora da muestra de una madurez lírica ya incontrovertible. Temáticamente, estas colecciones –en mayor medida la primera– abordan el sentimiento de pérdida y abandono experimentado por el yo lírico a consecuencia de una relación amorosa malograda.

Desde el punto de vista métrico, Vivaldi se desliga ya de endecasílabo, octosílabo y alejandrino, manifestando una clara predilección por la heterometría y la paralela esencialización verbal, apreciable en el empleo de la frase corta y un léxico más cotidiano. Pese a ello, hace esporádicas incursiones en la estructura sonetil, composición en la cual da muestra de un auténtico virtuosismo. *Arco en desenlace* (1963), *Diario incompleto de abril* (1971), *Durante este tiempo* (1971) y *Nocturnos* (1981) son obras casi epigonales, en las que la autora vuelve a abordar temas trascendentales de la poesía universal –el paso del tiempo, el amor, la muerte– y de su fenomenología individual –la soledad, el fracaso existencial–, otorgando un protagonismo palmario al elemento paisajístico y nocturnal, donde las indagaciones del sujeto poético se fusionan en atmósferas idílicas. *Materia de esperanza* (1968), en cambio, marca un giro en su trayectoria al centrarse en el drama de la maternidad frustrada, entablando un monólogo desalentador con el hijo que nunca tuvo.

Tras la publicación de su poesía reunida (*Tiempo a la orilla*, 1985), se editan *Desengaños de amor fingido* (1986), una serie de 18 sonetos con la que homenajea al poeta barroco Soto de Rojas, donde hace alarde de un auténtico virtuosismo compositivo; y *La realidad soñada* (1995), una exquisita colección de haikus, donde la fragmentación del verso revela el sabio manejo de las palabras, en un conato sintético que aglutina la intimidad de la visión y la exaltación del detalle externo.

Entre los experimentos recopilatorios de carácter monográfico, las colecciones ontológicas y las *plaquettes* mentamos: *Los árboles presento* (1977), *Era su nombre el mar* (1981), *Paisajes*

(1989), *Con solo esta palabra* (1990), *Poemas* (1994), *Lejanías* (1996), *Las ventanas iluminadas* (1997).

En 2007, en ocasión del centenario de su nacimiento, la Junta de Andalucía, en colaboración con la Universidad de Granada, organizó un ciclo de eventos culturales que culminaron en la reedición de su *Obra poética*, algunas colecciones y antologías², impulsando la realización de estudios y trabajos de investigación posteriores³, mediante los cuales se procuró proporcionar una lectura abarcadora de la poeta.

III. LA POÉTICA DE LA SOLEDAD

La totalidad de la crítica⁴ coincide en vincular la índole lírica de Vivaldi a un discurso intimista de naturaleza melancólica, fundamentado en un sentimiento de soledad tan arraigado que llega a cronificarse en su versificación, contaminándola hasta semánticamente. De hecho, los mismos títulos de muchos de sus poemas incluyen el término «soledad»⁵. Las referencias a este campo léxico son innumerables: ausencia, tristeza, nostalgia, separación constituyen la geografía anímica de sus composiciones. Este sentimiento de privación, de nostálgica carencia se puede apreciar incluso desde el punto de vista morfológico, en el empleo profuso de la estructura sintagmática compuesta por la preposición «sin», que de por sí ya indica privación, seguida de otro sustantivo o de un verbo, tanto en infinitivo como en subjuntivo. Considérense estos casos:

sin + sustantivo: «tú la frialdad sin vida», «una voz sin amor, sin las promesas», «hunde su acero casto sin piedades», «¡Qué sola, sin recuerdos», «en los rosales, sin mis rosas hoy», «Y yo me fui tras él / sin oír horas ni

² *Durante este tiempo*, *Luna partida*, *Nocturnos y otros poemas*, *Serena de amarillos*, *Variaciones sobre la lluvia y Unos labios dicen* (Prieto de Paula, 2008: 63)

³ Consúltense: Olivares (2006), de Santiago (2007), Celma Valero (2009), Chicharro Chamorro (2009)

⁴ Véanse: Abril (2007), Arostegui (1954), Asís (1989), Duque Amusco (2007), Gutiérrez (2017), Martínez Gómez (1998), Ortega López (1990) y Pujol (1998) entre otros.

⁵ Considérense, a guisa de ejemplo, los siguientes casos: «Soledades», «Presencia en soledad», «Soledad cumplida», «Mar de soledad», «Mi primera soledad».

tiempo», «esta tierra sin flores de mi carne», «un silencio sin venas», «aroma sin flor ni olor», «mano sin fe», «dolor sin dobles de aladas rosas», «con vuestra carne, sin pudor, os quiero», «ansiedad sin nombre», «sin orilla», «sin llanto».

sin + infinitivo: «Y de una juventud que yo he tenido / mía sin advertir su desencanto», «leer un libro largo y sin pensarme», «sin decirlo».

sin + que + subjuntivo: «sin que nos avisara», «sin que pueda».

Ahora bien, cierto es que la omnipresencia de la soledad y de la añoranza encuentra su justificación en determinadas experiencias vitales de la autora, empero asume una significación más profunda que trasciende lo meramente anecdótico. Como hemos adelantado, la colección *El alma desvelada* (1953) se centra integralmente en la elaboración de una experiencia amorosa fracasada, que ha marcado de manera profunda e irreversible a la autora y su escritura. La ausencia del tú amado hastía al sujeto poético, poblando su rutina y determinando sus anhelos íntimos:

Si tu ausencia tornara la presencia
pálida de tu rostro,
la grave lejanía de tu voz
firme y presente fuera;
[...]
¡Ay!, todas estas lágrimas, mi fuego,
mi voz tímida y cierta,
mi ansia, mi dolor engalanados,
¡qué bienvenida de pasión te dieran!
(«Ausencia», 1985: 79)

Como se desprende de la cita, el timbre dolido y apenado del yo lírico se debe, claramente, a la falta del ser querido, cuyo regreso se ansía para acotar el sufrimiento. Es decir, Vivaldi se hace portavoz de un estado anímico comprensible, lógico y recurrente en la estética propia de la poesía erótico-amorosa desde antiguo: la queja de la amada, motivo príncipe de la poesía popular y cancioneril prerrenacentista. En efecto, pese a la adhesión a la poética contemporánea, es posible divisar la adopción de ciertos tópicos clásicos de la

tradicción española en la lírica de la granadina, sobre todo por lo que respecta a la temática amorosa, entendida como algo trágico, que hiere al sujeto poético, confinándolo en una dimensión victimal o martirial. En honor a la verdad, esa peculiaridad estilística no es idiosincrasia propia de nuestra autora, sino que resulta muy frecuente en los versos de las mujeres del período. En la poesía femenina contemporánea se aprecia cierto sincretismo de estilemas procedentes del lirismo tradicional y otros propios de la retórica coeva. Aun así, el elemento que aglutina las varias poetizaciones es el intimismo con el cual las autoras examinan temáticas comunes (pasión amorosa, deseo, maternidad, etc.), filtrándolas todas por la lente cambiante de la identidad femenina.

En la cosmovisión de Vivaldi, la soledad se convierte en rasgo identitario del sujeto poético, elemento mediante el cual la autora llega a tener conciencia de sí misma, sin importar el móvil que la ocasiona. Para comprobarlo, nos retrotraemos a sus primeros experimentos compositivos, publicados en 1977, si bien pergeñados entre 1942 y 1944, o sea, aproximadamente diez años antes del que se considera su poemario de desamor. En *Primeros poemas* (1977), bajo el indicativo rótulo de «Soledades», se halla una pieza que nos permite esclarecer algunas cuestiones clave con respecto al tema abordado. Ya desde el incipit se aprecia una apelación directa a la soledad, en la que se facilita un listado de los elementos constituyentes de este sentimiento. Además de estar compuesta por «inquietudes, presagios y tristezas» (1985: 9), esta soledad está hecha «de ausencias, de su ausencia / del huir de una mano, impar la mía; / de lo que va y no vuelve, su nostalgia / irá, sombra, en la ruta de mi vida» (1985: 9). El componente esencial es, por un lado, la ausencia y, por otro, la nostalgia. El empleo de los adjetivos posesivos de tercera persona singular («su») nos auxilia en la especificación: son la ausencia «de él» y la nostalgia «de él» a causar este estado. Por ende, la razón amorosa parece, una vez más, vincularse a la soledad y la tristeza, alineándose a lo que es la dominante en la producción martinivaldiana. No obstante, el cierre del poema arroja nueva luz sobre el asunto,

brindándonos nuevas posibilidades de interpretación: «Estoy dentro de ti, soledad, y eres / como fuertes murallas que me cercan; / fuera está todo, y tiendo yo las manos / pero la loca brisa se lo lleva» (1985: 10). En primer lugar, la autora expresa su identificación con la soledad, acudiendo al concepto de espacio y de inclusión: el yo lírico se sitúa en el interior de esta entidad. Pese a ello, el lector descubre –mediante un efecto sorpresivo dado por el encabalgamiento entre el 1.º verso y el 2.º– que esta inclusión es, en realidad, una reclusión: la soledad no se configura como un ambiente neutro, sino como un lugar sitiado, un cerco simbolizado por la similitud de la muralla. Asimismo, esta enclaustración determina tanto límites físicos, ya que el sujeto poético se encuentra aislado y solo, como limitaciones psicológicas, al incapacitarlo para alcanzar la realidad externa y su disfrute.

Por lo general, el de la reclusión es otro tópico de la lírica femenina de posguerra, vinculado con la construcción identitaria del yo lírico y provocado por la relación conflictiva con el entorno hogareño. El sujeto poético se suele enmarcar en un escenario de clausura que conlleva soledad y tristeza. El confinamiento en el ambiente doméstico –el que le corresponde a la mujer por dictamen social en plena dictadura– se percibe como coercitivo y no electivo. La misma casa llega a tener rasgos contradictorios, en cuanto se configura como refugio o bien como guarida de sombras que desampara. Debido a la atmósfera claustro, en esa poesía abunda un sentimiento de evasión, concretado en la elección de una semántica relacionada con la deambulación. Sin embargo, el movimiento al que se refieren autoras como Alfonsa de La Torre, Clemencia Laborda o Concha Espina casi nunca es espacial. El acto de andar define un vagabundeo íntimo, un camino fatigado hacia la introspección y el descubrimiento de sí mismas (Cacciola, 2019: 212-213).

En el caso de Vivaldi, enclaustración e introspección coinciden para aludir a una realidad interior no exterior: la soledad es un lugar casi físico en el que el yo lírico se recluye y con el cual se identifica.

La misma idea se reitera en colecciones posteriores, en las que la autora se vale de un caudal simbólico parecido. Veamos un ejemplo extraído de *El alma desvelada* (1953):

Mi tristeza estaba en mí
o yo estaba en mi tristeza.
[...]
Las dos tenemos la misma
desesperanza. Mi sangre
corre en sus venas ocultas;
y yo siento sobre mí
el peso de su evidencia.
Las dos vamos preguntando
una por otra. Las manos
tocan los cielos perdidos
de nuestra doble constancia.
Las dos ¡qué loco desvelo!
huyéndonos nos buscamos
para ser. Y lo que somos
se cumple mutuo en la entrega.
No se podía perder
mi tristeza. Estaba en mí
y yo estaba en ella.
(«Identidad», 1985: 62-63)

Como se desprende de los versos iniciales y finales, Vivaldi utiliza otra vez categorías espaciales de inclusión. En el caso concreto, aboga por la imagen del contenedor y el contenido, evocando la idea de la *matrioska*, es decir, una muñeca contenedora que alberga en su interior una nueva muñeca, y esta, a su vez, a otra: el sujeto poético engloba a su tristeza que, a su vez, custodia al mismo yo lírico. De hecho, no se deduce con claridad cuál es el contenedor madre y la imagen que se facilita parece la de un juego de encierros infinitos. Para más inri, la identificación entre la tristeza –personificada con un semblante humano hecho de carne y sangre– y el sujeto poético es absoluta: la evidencia de una se cumple en la constancia de la otra; la existencia de una se afirma en la realidad de la otra, en una entrega mutua e ineludible. Lo más llamativo del poema, tal vez, sea su título, «Identidad», que corrobora la hipótesis de que el sujeto poético tiene

conciencia de sí solo en la tristeza y a través de ella.

La soledad, por lo tanto, se aúna a la tristeza y se convierte en categoría ontológica de la voz poemática, vinculándose a una autopercepción que se asienta en el retiro, cuando no en la incomunicación. Así los expresa Vivaldi en «Este mayo», espléndido poema de *Cumplida Soledad* (1953):

Tú me has dejado, mayo, dentro y sola
de esta, por todas partes, poblada soledad.
Pues tú eres ese límite que me encierra y me deja
isla de ti, cercada de tus olas;
oyéndote y oliéndote, imposible y lejano.
(1985: 157)

Tristeza, soledad, aislamiento e imposibilidad convergen en estos versos, donde el origen del estado anímico es un personificado mes de mayo, que actúa como un despiadado mar que cerca al yo lírico, inhabilitándolo para siempre a gozar de la primavera y, por consiguiente, de la dicha del amor, debido a unos aciagos recuerdos que:

me ciñen en su túnica, me roban este mayo,
me deslumbran los ojos
con espejos que guardan la figura deshecha,
intacta, dolorosa
de otras que fueron antes primavera.
(1985: 158)

En *Durante este tiempo* (1973), colección ya madura y heterogénea de Vivaldi, el poema «Lluvia con variaciones» ofrece un ulterior paso en el estudio de esta dinámica identitaria de la que venimos hablando:

Y estoy triste también,
«elenamente triste»,
con la lluvia, en la lluvia, por la lluvia,
a través de, debajo de la lluvia.
[...]
Pues sí, estoy triste. Triste.
Como chorrea la lluvia en mi tristeza,
goteando en mi paso impar y solitario.
[...]

Es verdad que estoy triste.

Elenísimamente desesperada y triste.

(1985: 380-381)

El poema, ampliamente estudiado por Chicharro Chamorro (2009), hace de la tristeza elemento constitutivo no ya de un yo lírico indefinido o anónimo, sino de la misma autora, cuyo nombre propio aparece trasladado de categoría gramatical, en dos neologismos en forma de adverbio en -mente, en la primera estrofa, y de adjetivo de grado superlativo en la última. En calidad de modificadores, los neologismos funcionan para rectificar el significado del adjetivo «triste», soldándolo de manera indisoluble y metapoética a la identidad de Vivaldi.

La lluvia, que se suele asociar de por sí a un estado anímico apesadumbrado, es aliciente para desencadenar una confesión dura y sincera.

Tratándose de una poesía intimista y confesional, la melancolía no puede ser otra cosa que la savia que sustenta el discurrir poético de la autora, aunque hay una vertiente de la crítica (Eva Morón [2002], Ángeles Mora [2003], Julia Olivares [2006] y el ya citado Chicharro), que la analizan en relación con su experiencia como individuo, tanto en calidad de mujer autónoma y escritora, en una sociedad en la que se desestimaban aquellas que se dedicaban a labores ajenas a las del hogar doméstico, incumpliendo los patrones conductuales establecidos por Falange; como en su faceta de mujer soltera y sin hijos en una dictadura donde se fomentaba el matrimonio y la procreación.

Con respecto a la primera vertiente identitaria, Chicharro asienta esta última hipótesis en un documento inédito de la propia autora, un manuscrito titulado *Motivo de mi melancolía (escrito a causa de las preguntas indiscretas de un amigo)*, que el investigador halló entre el legado documental de Vivaldi, en una caja en la que se recogía sus borradores de trabajos literarios. La autora, en el breve texto que proponemos a continuación, basándose en posiciones biológicas y esencialistas perfectamente coherentes con las del feminismo

español de su tiempo, reivindica su diversidad en cuanto mujer con respecto al hombre, imputando a esta distinción genérica el origen de su melancolía.

Nos parece llamativo este último punto y quisiéramos vincularlo con un artículo de Carmen Conde, publicado en 1946 y titulado «La poesía de la mujer poeta», en el que procura describir el acto creativo femenino, fundamentándolo en el principio de la diferencia en lo formal y en lo sustancial. Conde, en efecto, denuncia tanto el mimetismo al que fueron obligadas las primeras mujeres que se arriesgaron a escribir, dado que los cauces estéticos que habían de adoptar eran los masculinos, como la alabanza posterior de ese tremendo esfuerzo de reproducción de tonos y modelos, considerado como una muestra de capacidad artística (Cacciola, 2019: 186-188).

En el fragmento de Elena Martín Vivaldi podemos hallar una clara muestra de esta neurastenia con la cual tuvieron que lidiar las poetas a la hora de escribir: su identidad femenina no encaja en los roles genéricos constituidos y traspasa el límite consentido, invadiendo un espacio (el público, el cultural) que era propio del hombre. Ese desajuste, que antes de ser individual es social, le genera una especie de trastorno psicológico o desdoblamiento de la personalidad, que afecta su estado de ánimo y su visión del mundo:

Yo soy mujer, muy mujer, lo siento dentro de mí, pero además las circunstancias me han llevado a desear lo que es sólo, hasta ahora, del hombre. Yo quisiera vencer, quisiera una gloria para mí, quisiera luchar y me encuentro con un espíritu doble de mujer, que además gime porque su “yo” femenino le grita a voces que ha equivocado la ruta, mientras que su yo –¿ficticio?– se ríe a carcajadas de aquel –carcajada histérica– haciéndole ver que desde luego ese era su camino, pero que ese, inaccesible, debe dejarlo y tomar el ficticio más difícil pero más alcanzable.

Pero, esto es lo trágico, lo que rompe la armonía que de esta desarmonía pudiera surgir ¿es que este segundo camino me ha de satisfacer si lo consigo? O, lo que es más

angustioso todavía, ¿me satisfaga o no, lo podré alcanzar? Creo que no. El día que uno solo de estos “yos” se me impone puedo vivir el día que los dos me agobian, y a los dos veo lejanos, inabarcables, me hundo y ni veo nada que me interesa, y hasta me parece que mi misma risa sería un insulto a mi melancolía. (en Chicharro, 2009: 120)

Esta singularidad del sujeto se engarza con un *pathos* desgarrador que no procede sencillamente «del hecho de vivir sino del hecho de “vivir mujer” o de “vivirse” como mujer» (Acillona, 1996: 95), en un mundo en el que lo masculino parece ser el imperativo categórico del quehacer humano. La lucha interior a la que alude Vivaldi es tema recurrente en la poesía femenina de posguerra. En muchos poemarios del período⁶ es posible divisar un halo de soledad cósmica y ontológica, que llega a desembocar en una perspectiva pesimista de la historia o en consideraciones desalentadoras del ser mujer. En sus transposiciones literarias, las autoras se postulan como sufridoras endémicas, a la zaga de las bíblicas figuras de Eva y María, destinadas a perpetuar la especie humana, acarreado el dolor de siglos de discriminación. Esas voces líricas declaran la imposibilidad de compartir esa conciencia de la diversidad y la soledad, ya que, al ser algo consustancial a la naturaleza femenina, no puede ser entendido por los demás⁷. Vivaldi parece engastarse en esta tradición, ya que en muchas ocasiones afirma la unicidad de su sentir («Esta tristeza es mía, solo mía, / a nadie dejo entrar en su espesura / hecha de soledades, en la oscura / noche no desposada con el día» (1985: 511).

Con respecto a la segunda acepción, recordemos que, teniendo en cuenta el contexto sociopolítico de posguerra, en el que «toda mujer que no sea madre contraviene la misión encomendada por mandato divino y disposición gubernamental»

⁶ Carmen Conde, *Mujer sin Edén* (1947); Josefina Romo Arregui, *Cántico de María sola* (1950); María Beneyto, *Eva en el tiempo* (1952); Ángela Figuera, *El grito inútil* (1952); Pilar Paz Pasamar, *La soledad contigo* (1960) por citar solo algunos ejemplos.

⁷ A guisa de ejemplo, considérense estos versos extraídos de *Mujer sin Edén*: «Solamente yo, sola, he de vivir sin nadie / que sienta como yo» (Conde, 2007: 295).

(Jurado Morales, 2014: 533), la maternidad no cumplida por razones sea biológicas sea coyunturales es una marca negativa que pesa en las mujeres. Mucha poesía femenina de posguerra, de hecho, aborda este tema doloroso, manifestando cierto sentimiento de culpabilidad, frustración, soledad o, en cambio, rebelándose al estigma social⁸.

En este sentido, *Materia de esperanza* (1968), que orbita alrededor del tema de la maternidad deseada pero no cumplida, sigue la tónica general del período. El hijo presentido, que no ha llegado a cuajarse si no en el pensamiento, duele y ese dolor físico y psicológico se plasma en unas composiciones de extraordinaria belleza en las que el vacío –la ausencia del hijo– conforman otro género de soledad:

Mi primera soledad
 fuiste tú. Tú la primera
 espada de mi dolor
 sin nombre. Tú la primera
 nostalgia. Voz que no es
 sino un silencio de ausencias.
 Voz en silencio. Y pregunta
 por mí. Que a los aires lleva,
 con ansias de viento y flor,
 semilla que el fruto espera.
 Mi primera soledad.
 Tú; soledad por mis venas.
 Te pregonaba mi ser
 con raíces en la tierra,
 con sed que nunca se calma,
 con grito y llanto, con nueva
 palabra del corazón,
 con amarilla tristeza.
 Con rumor de viento gris
 – íntimo paisaje y niebla –
 entre la lluvia. Su mano
 humedeciendo mi pena.
 Árbol sin ramas, sin ti,
 perdido para mi senda.
 (1985: 276-277)

⁸ Considérense los casos de Carmen Conde, Esther de Andreis, Monserrat Vayreda, Pilar Paz Pasamar entre otras.

En «Mi primera soledad», la granadina entronca con la imaginería tradicional de la madre pasiva y dolorosa, aludiendo, a través de la mención a la espada en el tercer verso, a la Virgen María en el contexto evangélico del *Nunc dimittis* (LC 2: 22-35)⁹. Asimismo, la caracterización somática de la madre como elemento vegetal –árbol sin ramas ni fruto– apela al telurismo propio de la poesía femenina de posguerra¹⁰ y a la identificación entre madre y tierra.

IV. CONCLUSIONES

En el presente trabajo se propone una aproximación a la vida y la obra de Elena Martín Vivaldi, facilitando una de las más relevantes claves interpretativas de su discurso poético: la soledad. Se ha intentado averiguar las causas ocasionadoras de este estado anímico, remontándonos a sus primeros experimentos poéticos y comparándolos con composiciones pertenecientes a colecciones más maduras. En el análisis realizado se ha comprobado que el sentimiento de melancólica soledad es, sí, debido a determinadas anécdotas vivenciales de la autora, pero se configura como categoría ontológica de la misma, vía mediante la cual alcanzar una plena conciencia de sí. El acto de vivir y el acto de escribir, para Vivaldi, se gestan en ese estado espiritual de privación que le permite hallar la palabra precisa para describir la realidad –la vivida y la ansiada–, para nombrar las cosas y nombrarse a sí misma. En última instancia, hemos apelado a una determinada vertiente crítica que vincula la soledad martinivaldiana a un determinado sentir femenino, fruto del período de marginación y discriminación padecido por las mujeres durante el franquismo, engastando la producción de la granadina en la tradición lírica de autoría femenina de la segunda mitad del siglo XX.

⁹ Durante la ceremonia de purificación y después de haber reconocido en Jesús al Salvador, el anciano Simeón prorrumpió hacia María: «¡Y a ti misma una espada te atravesará el alma!» (Lc 2: 35), preludiando los dolores de María en el Gólgota.

¹⁰ Considérense estos versos de Monserrat Vayreda: «Árbol sin fruto soy, árbol herido / por las tormentas que en su centro estallan, / árbol que nunca ha cobijado un nido, / árbol con muchos labios que se callan» (en Conde, 1967: 362).

BIBLIOGRAFÍA CITADA

1. ABRIL, J. C. (2007): «Poesía, soledad compartida». *Ínsula*, núm. 730, pp. 23-25.
2. ACUYO DONAIRE, F. (2007): «Noticias del símbolo en poesía: símbolo, vida y poesía en Elena Martín Vivaldi». *Salina*, núm. 21, pp. 151-160.
3. ARÓSTEGUI, A. (1954): «Intuición metafísica y expresión poética de la soledad». *Hoja del lunes de Granada*.
4. ASÍS, M.^a D. (2007): «El sentimiento de soledad en la poesía de Elena Martín Vivaldi». *Antípodas: Journal of Hispanic Studies of the University of Auckland*, núm. 2, pp. 129-139.
5. BENEYTO, M. (1952): *Eva en el tiempo*. Valencia: El sobre literario.
6. CACCIOLA, A. (2019): *Lenguaje bíblico e identidad de mujer en Carmen Conde. "Mientras los hombres mueren" y "Mujer sin Edén" en la poesía femenina española de la primera mitad del siglo XX* [tesis doctoral]. Universidad de Alicante.
7. CELMA VALERO, M.^a P. (2009): *Elena Martín Vivaldi: una poética elenamente entrañada*. Universitat de les Illes Balears: Edición UIB.
8. CHICHARRO CHAMORRO, A. (2009): «Elenamente triste. Algunas claves del discurso poético de la tristeza en "Lluvia sin variaciones" de Elena Martín Vivaldi». En Ramond, M., Ramos Izquierdo, E. y J. Roger (ed): *Hommage à Milagros Ezquerro*. México: Théorie et fiction, París: Rilma 2, pp. 109-122.
9. CONDE, C. (2007): *Poesía completa*. Madrid: Castalia.
10. DE SANTIAGO, E. (2007): «Elena Martín Vivaldi». *El libro andaluz*, núm. 53, pp. 12-16.
11. DUQUE AMUSO, A. (1954): «En el centro de la soledad». *Ideal*, 08/02/2007, s.p.
12. FIGUERA, Á. (1952): *El grito inútil*. Valencia: Sur.
13. GARCÍA MONTERO, L. (2007): «Elena Martín Vivaldi: la soledad edificada». *Ínsula: Revista de Letras y Ciencias Humanas*, núm. 730, pp. 17-18.
14. GUTIÉRREZ, J. (2007): «La soledad iluminada: la poesía de Elena Martín Vivaldi». En J. M. Darro (ed): *Elena Martín Vivaldi y Julia de Burgos: hermanamiento poético*. Universidad de Granada, pp. 159-169.
15. JURADO MORALES, J. (2014): «El discurso patriarcal en la poesía femenina del primer franquismo». *Signa*, núm. 23, pp. 525-544.
16. MARTÍNEZ GÓMEZ, M. (1998): «La soledad en la poesía de Elena Martín Vivaldi». *Ciencia y Sociedad: Revista del I. B. Mariana Pineda*, núm. 3, pp. 4-5.
17. MARTÍNEZ GÓMEZ, M. (2000): *Elena Martín Vivaldi: poesía y poética* [tesis doctoral]. Universidad de Granada.
18. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1945): *Escalera de luna*. Granada: Vientos del Sur.
19. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1953): *El alma desvelada*. Madrid: Ínsula.
20. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1958): *Cumplida soledad*. Granada: Veleta al sur.
21. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1963): *Arco en desenlace*. Granada: Veleta al sur.
22. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1968): *Materia de esperanza*. Granada: Albaycín.
23. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1971): *Diario incompleto de abril* (ed. de A. Caffarena). Málaga: Cuadernos de María Isabel.
24. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1972): *Durante este tiempo*. Barcelona: El Bardo.
25. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1977): *Primeros poemas (1942-1944)*, (ed. de Fidel Villar Ribot). Málaga: El Guadalhorce.
26. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1977): *Los árboles presento*, (ed. de Fidel Villar Ribot). Universidad de Granada.
27. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1981): *Nocturnos*. Granada: Don Quijote.
28. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1981): *Y era su nombre mar*. Málaga, Jarazmín.
29. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1985): *Tiempo a la orilla* (Obra reunida), 2 vols. Granada: Silene.
30. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1986): *Desengaños de amor fingidos* (ed. de A. Caffarena). Málaga: Nuevos Cuadernos de María Cristina.
31. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1989): *Paisajes (Antología)*. Málaga: Instituto Sierra Bermeja.
32. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1990): *Con sólo esta palabra*. Diputación Provincial de Granada, Patronato García Lorca.
33. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1993): *La realidad soñada*. Madrid: M más M Ediciones.
34. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1994): *Poemas*. Granada: Fundación Rodríguez-Acosta.

35. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1996): *Lejanías*. Granada: Cuadernillos Torre de la Vela.
36. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1998): *Niños van y pájaros*. Granada: Instituto Alhambra.
37. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (1998): *Las ventanas iluminadas*. Madrid: Hiperión.
38. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (2007a): *Variaciones sobre la lluvia* (ed. de Remedios Sánchez y Mariluz Escribano Pueo). Granada: CajaGranada.
39. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (2007b): *Unos labios dicen: antología* (selección, edición y prólogo de Andrea Villarubia). Granada: Junta de Andalucía/Universidad de Granada.
40. MARTÍN VIVALDI, E. (2008): *Obra poética*, 2 tomos. Valladolid: Fundación Jorge Guillén.
41. MARTÍNEZ GÓMEZ, M. (2000): *Elena Martín Vivaldi: poesía y poética*. Granada: Universidad de Granada.
42. MARTÍNEZ GÓMEZ, M. (2001): «La métrica de Elena Martín Vivaldi». *Analecta Malacitana (AnMal electrónica)*, núm. 10, s.p.
43. MICHEL, C. (1972): *Dos poetas granadinos contemporáneos: Elena Martín Vivaldi y Rafael Guillén* [tesis doctoral]. Université des Langues et des Lettres de Grenoble.
44. MORA, Á. (2003): «Elena Martín Vivaldi o la comunidad de los solitarios». En Ángeles Mora (coord.): *Palabras cruzadas*. Granada: Universidad de Granada, pp. 119-124.
45. MORÓN OLIVARES, E. (1999): *Elena Martín Vivaldi. La escritora y la escritura* [tesis doctoral]. Universidad de Granada.
46. MORÓN OLIVARES, E. (2002): *La palabra desvelada de Elena Martín Vivaldi: 1945-1953*. Granada: Universidad de Granada.
47. MORÓN OLIVARES, E. (2022): «La construcción de la identidad poética en Elena Martín Vivaldi». En Sánchez García, M. R. y José Álvarez Rodríguez (coord): *Las olvidadas. Reflexiones en torno a treinta poetas andaluzas imprescindibles*. Valencia: Tirant lo Blanch, pp. 41-54
48. OLIVARES, J. (2006): *Elena Martín Vivaldi: una poblada soledad*. Granada: Academia de Buenas Letras.
49. ORTEGA LÓPEZ, J. (1990): «Tiempo de soledad en la poesía de Elena Martín Vivaldi». *Monographic Review*, vol. 6, pp. 105-112.
50. PAZ PASAMAR, P. (1960): *La soledad contigo*. Zaragoza: Alcaraván.
51. PRIETO DE PAULA, Á. L. (2008): «Algunas consideraciones sobre la poesía en 2007». *Siglo XXI: Literatura y cultura españolas*, núm. 6, pp. 59-78.
52. PUJOL, S. (1998): «Elena Martín Vivaldi: más allá de la soledad». *Extramuros*, pp. 9-10.
53. ROMO ARREGUI, J. (1950): *Cántico de María sola*. Madrid: Ediciones J. Romo Arregui.



Scan to know paper details and
author's profile

The Intentionality Marked in Instructional Texts: What's New in it?

Hilma Ribeiro de Mendonça Ferreira & Sílvia Adélia Henrique Guimarães

Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro

ABSTRACT

Instructional texts are intended to designate procedures for readers who need to perform tasks of different nature. However, despite of an assumed expository similarity, we find forms of disparate discursive enunciation, depending on the textual genre. Based on this finding and based on the interpretive paradigm, this research analyses instructional texts from three different genres in order to observe the intentions that underlie the injunctive textual type. This study also reflects on how school can draw on these linguistic mechanisms to enhance students' reading. Based on Speech Acts (AUSTIN 1962; SEARLE, 1969; 1981; 2002), which made it possible to observe the commands exposed in the texts, the analyses results suggest that the phrasal structures used to instruct, assume different imposition levels with which the speakers set out the procedures. The analyses also show that the illocutionary component and the nature of the genre in which phrases are used are the benchmarks of these instructions.

Keywords: speech acts. instructional texts. reading at school.

Classification: LCC Code: P302

Language: English



Great Britain
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573353
Print ISSN: 2515-5785
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Hilma Ribeiro de Mendonça Ferreira & Sílvia Adélia Henrique Guimarães. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

The Intentionality Marked in Instructional Texts: What's New in it?

A Intencionalidade Marcada nos Textos Instrucionais: o Que há de Novo Nisso?

Hilma Ribeiro de Mendonça Ferreira^α & Silvia Adélia Henrique Guimarães^σ

ABSTRACT

Instructional texts are intended to designate procedures for readers who need to perform tasks of different nature. However, despite of an assumed expository similarity, we find forms of disparate discursive enunciation, depending on the textual genre. Based on this finding and based on the interpretive paradigm, this research analyses instructional texts from three different genres in order to observe the intentions that underlie the injunctive textual type. This study also reflects on how school can draw on these linguistic mechanisms to enhance students' reading. Based on Speech Acts (AUSTIN 1962; SEARLE, 1969; 1981; 2002), which made it possible to observe the commands exposed in the texts, the analyses results suggest that the phrasal structures used to instruct, assume different imposition levels with which the speakers set out the procedures. The analyses also show that the illocutionary component and the nature of the genre in which phrases are used are the benchmarks of these instructions. Despite some limitations, such as the comparison of only four genres, when there are several other genres of the injunctive type, the results allow a critical reflection on the reproduction of the assumption that the injunction only offers orders or commands particularly in primary schools.

Keywords: speech acts. instructional texts. reading at school.

Author α: Doutora em Língua Portuguesa pela Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro (2013). Professora Doutora Adjunto IV – UERJ.

σ: Mestre em Linguística pela Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro (2011). Professora da Rede Municipal do Rio de Janeiro.

RESUMO

Os textos instrucionais têm por finalidade designar procedimentos para os leitores que precisam desempenhar tarefas de diferentes naturezas. Entretanto, apesar de uma similaridade enunciativa pressuposta, encontramos formas de enunciação discursiva discrepantes, dependendo do gênero textual. A partir desse achado, e com base no paradigma interpretativista, a presente pesquisa analisou textos instrucionais de três diferentes gêneros com vistas a observar as intenções que permeiam o tipo textual injuntivo. Mas, também, refletiu sobre como a escola pode se valer desses mecanismos linguísticos para potencializar a leitura dos alunos. Baseados nos Atos de Fala (AUSTIN, 1962; SEARLE, 1969, 1981, 2002), que possibilitaram observar os comandos expostos nos textos, os resultados das análises sugerem que as estruturas frasais usadas para instruir pressupõem níveis impositivos diferentes com que os locutores enunciam os procedimentos. Mostram, também, que o componente ilocucionário e a natureza do gênero em que as frases são usadas constituem os balizadores dessas instruções. Apesar de algumas limitações, como a comparação entre apenas quatro gêneros, quando há vários outros gêneros pertencentes ao tipo injuntivo, os resultados possibilitam uma reflexão crítica sobre a reprodução do pressuposto, principalmente nas escolas básicas, de que a injunção oferece apenas ordens ou comandos.

Palavras-chave: atos de fala. textos instrucionais. leitura na escola.

I. INTRODUÇÃO

... os tolos rejeitam a sabedoria e a instrução (Provérbio de Salomão, *Bíblia Sagrada*)

O presente estudo partiu de dois objetivos centrais: estudar quatro gêneros instrucionais, considerando os aspectos linguísticos mobilizadores da leitura de textos injuntivos; e refletir sobre como a escola pode trabalhar a leitura de textos injuntivos, mobilizando nos alunos para a conscientização dos procedimentos linguísticos adequados para a compreensão do texto injuntivo.

Se entendemos a escola como um lugar facilitador para o ensino da leitura eficiente e eficaz, se a vemos como um espaço formal para a construção de um cidadão no mundo – o mundo contemporâneo dialógico –, questionamos: quais oportunidades reais de contato com a leitura os professores têm dado aos alunos? Essas práticas têm de fato propiciado a esses sujeitos os sentidos possíveis do texto, com interação, discussão e apresentação dos elementos linguísticos como pistas concretas para a compreensão textual; ou têm apenas reproduzido a metodologia limitadora e memorizadora da Idade Média?

Com vistas a refletir sobre as perguntas elencadas, concentramo-nos na percepção de que os textos instrucionais, embora apresentem finalidade de uso correspondente – a instrução por meio de frases indicativas de procedimentos –, pressupõem uma predisposição das instruções de formas diferenciadas. A partir dessa primeira noção, constatamos que essas formas de instruir estarão sempre de acordo com as forças ilocutórias relacionadas ao ato diretivo, como preconizado por Searle (2002). Entretanto as frases indicativas de procedimentos também podem mostrar outros atos de fala, se analisadas à luz dos atos locucionário e perlocucionário, para além do nível intencional, intrínseco ao ilocucionário.

Para atingirmos nosso objetivo, analisamos as instruções partindo da materialidade linguística desses textos. A partir dessa análise linguística, consideramos as marcas que pudessem sinalizar os atos de fala comuns às frases de natureza

instrucional. Para isso, concentramo-nos nos enunciados instrucionais que se predispõem a mostrar as intenções do locutor ao estipular procedimentos, visto que essas instruções podem demonstrar como ocorrem as configurações comuns ao texto classificado como do tipo injuntivo.

Nos resultados desta análise linguística, percebemos que ocorre uma sobreposição de fatores textuais: 1) o nível das frases, usadas para instruir na leitura; e 2) o nível as ações, unidades subjacentes com valores discursivos que indicam as intenções a serem assumidas a partir das estruturas frasais. Postulamos, portanto, que o tipo textual injuntivo, elucidado por meio das frases indicativas de instruções, pode ser analisado em decorrência dos atos de fala, não ficando restrito apenas às frases tradicionalmente classificadas como “imperativas”.

Nessa perspectiva analítica, as relações entre a intencionalidade e os procedimentos denotam perspectivas acionistas importantes, se o processamento dos sentidos for pensado dessa forma durante a leitura. Com base nesses achados linguísticos, julgamos produtora imbricar os resultados das análises e as estratégias de leitura adotadas na escola, pois entendemos que o professor precisa dispor de ferramentas teórico-analíticas para poder provocar a leitura ativa desse aluno.

Para compor o corpus, selecionamos quatro textos instrucionais, sendo um exemplar do gênero textual receita, um do manual, um da bula e um do contrato. Os dados, analisados pela teoria dos atos de fala (AUSTIN, 1962, 1990; SEARLE, 1969, 1981, 2002) possibilitaram uma discussão sobre sua aplicabilidade nos estudos voltados para a leitura na escola.

Para promover a organização textual do trabalho, este artigo está dividido em seções. No primeiro momento, traremos um embasamento teórico que: a) abrange os principais conceitos dos Atos de Fala; b) retoma e distingue os conceitos de tipo e gênero textual; e c) resume os conceitos básicos de leitura aplicada ao ensino. No segundo momento, contextualizamos o trabalho

metodologicamente para, finalmente, apresentarmos e discutirmos os dados. Para encerrar, traremos algumas considerações, optando por não denominá-las como “conclusões”, principalmente pelo caráter promissor de continuidade deste estudo.

II. FUNDAMENTAÇÃO TEÓRICA

Por ser a natureza acionista da linguagem o eixo central para o entendimento dos usos linguísticos, Austin (1962) e Searle (1969) debruçam-se sobre a questão da performatividade a partir da produção verbal dos indivíduos. Dessa forma, ressaltam-se aspectos importantes nas contribuições dos dois autores, nas subseções a seguir.

2.1 Austin e os Ilocucionários e a Natureza Performativa da Linguagem

John Austin (1962), o principal idealizador do que constitui atualmente a vertente pragmática intitulada “teoria dos atos de fala”, concentra seus esforços na caracterização da ação, evidenciando alguns componentes importantes da produção verbal dos indivíduos. Desse modo, para além da dicotomia filosófica entre sentido e realidade, Austin postula a evidenciação de três componentes comunicativos que se tornam fundamentais para a exposição aqui proposta. Para o autor, o ato de fala é composto de três partes, três atos simultâneos, “os ‘locutórios’ (atos de ‘dizer qualquer coisa’), os ‘ilocutórios’ (atos efetuados ‘ao dizer qualquer coisa’) e os ‘perlocutórios’ (atos efetuados ‘pelo fato de dizer qualquer coisa’)” (CHARAUDEAU; MAINGUENAU, 2006, p. 73).

Esses três níveis de atos de fala são desdobrados em suas atribuições das possíveis diferenciações de ações e tipos de atos de fala, inerentes às três “esferas ilocutórias”. Também é mérito de seus estudos uma primeira diferenciação dos tipos de atos de fala, pois o autor gerou uma categorização dos subtipos de atos, classificados como “vereditivos”, “exercitivos”, “compromissivos”, “expositivos” e “comportativos”.

Contudo, neste artigo, salientamos a dificuldade de caracterização do que constitui o ilocucionário,

com respeito à taxonomia, fator já abordado por Rajagopalan (2010). Esse autor destaca que a vinculação do ilocucionário ao verbo performativo, crítica de Searle (2002), é, porém, uma atribuição da qual o próprio Searle não conseguiu se desvencilhar, como mostrado por Rajagopalan (2010).

Por isso, coadunamos nossa visão à de Rajagopalan (1989), que salienta a vinculação da performatividade à natureza do ato ilocucionário, mencionando o fato de que Austin (1962, 1990) não abandona a designação “performativo” na caracterização dos enunciados, mesmo depois de desfazer a dicotomia constativo/performativo. Com isso, pode-se acolher a visão defendida por Rajagopalan (1989), na caracterização do ato ilocucionário, como sendo, incontornavelmente “performativos”.

Para além dessas discussões teóricas, reconhecemos, entretanto, que, para realizar um ato ilocucionário, é necessário realizar um ato locucionário—para agradecer, por exemplo, é necessariamente dizer certas palavras. E dizer determinadas palavras é, necessariamente, pelo menos em parte, fazer certos movimentos difíceis de descrever com os órgãos vocais. Portanto, o divórcio entre ações físicas e atos de dizer algo não é de todo completo – há uma vinculação (AUSTIN, 1990, p. 98).

Assim, a teoria dos atos de fala preconiza o fato de que, por meio da palavra, “declaramos”, “solicitamos”, “saudamos”, “coagimos”, “prometemos”, entre outras ações; e essas falas-ações terão efeitos diferenciados por parte dos interlocutores aos quais essas palavras se direcionam. Existe, portanto, uma relação entre o que é dito e o que é assumido. Por um lado, evidenciam-se níveis de desenvolvimento das ações linguísticas, tal qual estipulado por Austin (1962), ao destacar o “locucionário”, o “ilocucionário” e o “perlocucionário”. Por outro lado, existem níveis dessas ações, visto que delas emanam “forças ilocutórias”, sendo possível categorizá-las de acordo com sua natureza discursiva de um modo mais eficiente, como visto com Searle (2002), na proposta categorial, supramencionada.

2.2 As Categorias de Atos de Fala Determinadas por Searle (2002)

Os diferentes modos de instruir, afeitos aos textos instrucionais, levam-nos a utilizar a terminologia proposta por Searle (2002) ao equiparar os diferentes atos de fala por suas naturezas e semelhanças. Sobre o agrupamento dessas formas de ação, o autor diferenciou cinco grandes tipos de atos de fala que podem ser enquadrados de acordo com suas características discursivas. Nesse caso, os atos de fala, de acordo com as características de uso, dividem-se nas classes, designadas pelo autor, como atos/ações “assertivas”, “diretivas”, “compromissivas”, “expressivas” e “declarações”. São asserções quanto às sentenças que têm por finalidade predispor um conteúdo proposicional que tenha

como característica a afirmação de algo como sendo verdadeiro ou não; os diretivos são todos os atos de fala que têm como função promover a tomada de atitudes dos interlocutores a respeito do que é dito, caso dos textos instrucionais; são compromissivos os conteúdos indicadores da postura do falante, quando ele se compromete com algo, futuramente; expressivos são aqueles atos de fala denotadores da emotividade do falante; e, por fim, as declarações constituem enunciados que promovem uma modificação externa como o ato de “declarar guerra” ao inimigo, no sentido bélico.

No Quadro 1, a seguir, elencamos essas categorias a partir das atitudes do falante e dos possíveis posicionamentos dos interlocutores.

Quadro 1: As categorias de atos de fala propostas por Searle (1969)

Categorias	Posicionamento do falante	Posicionamento do interlocutor
Assertivos	Compromete-se em afirmar que algo seja falso ou verdadeiro.	Assume ou não determinado conteúdo como sendo falso ou verdadeiro.
Directivos	Procura fazer com que o ouvinte realize determinada tarefa.	Realiza ou não o que o falante propõe.
Compromissos	Propõe-se a realizar algo.	Acreditar ou não que o falante realizará algo.
Expressivos	Demonstra a emotividade derivada de algum fator externo ou interno.	Compartilha ou não dessa emotividade.
Declarações	Produz um enunciado que modifica uma situação externa.	Observa essa modificação.

No Quadro 1, procuramos resumir o esquema categórico de Searle (2002), que é um importante componente para a análise dos dados a serem apresentados neste artigo. Sobre o esquema de caracterização dos atos de fala, o autor identifica suas características semelhantes a partir de diversos critérios comunicativos, que acolhem também aspectos de ordem psíquica, discursiva, textual e enunciativa.

A fim de evidenciar o entendimento da natureza das instruções feitas nos gêneros escolhidos, inferimos que os “diretivos” se tornam muito

importantes na constituição dos textos injuntivos por refletirem as formas de solicitar, o acatamento e as atitudes responsivas dos interlocutores na elaboração das instruções.

Com respeito à força ilocutória dos atos diretivos, para o autor, existem intenções dos falantes, ao utilizar a linguagem, para fazerem suas “performances” enunciativas. Então, podem-se dimensionar diferentes traços discursivos de acordo com os seus posicionamentos, durante a instrução por meio de um diretivo.

O “contexto de uso” de determinado enunciado é o que promove, portanto, a percepção da sua força ilocutória, bem como dos sentidos possíveis, aferidos a partir do componente proposicional superficial. Nesse caso, a teoria dos atos de fala se revela de grande importância, pois suas perspectivas diferenciam os tipos de esferas das quais emanam as ações enunciativas; e, igualmente, das categorias em que essas ações se inserem.

III. TIPOLOGIA E GÊNERO: PRINCIPAIS CONCEITOS ASSUMIDOS

Como nossa pesquisa se debruça sobre textos instrucionais, que são estruturados majoritariamente pelo tipo injuntivo, é válido ressaltar a diferença entre as terminologias “instrucional” e “injuntivo”. Ao mencionarmos o primeiro nome, ressaltamos o caráter dos enunciados pesquisados, que têm por finalidade “instruir” e, ao denominarmos o segundo, procuramos evidenciar sua caracterização tipológica dentro do quadro dos tipos textuais. Em se tratando dos conceitos de “tipo” e “gênero”, ambos são indispensáveis, pois permeiam a produção linguística dos indivíduos em qualquer troca interlocutiva. De acordo com a natureza do gênero, a linguagem pode ser contextualizada a partir das formas de manifestação comunicativa, usadas para dar conta das diferentes necessidades de interação discursivas e interpessoais.

Apesar de autores diferentes assumirem nomenclaturas distintas para as diferentes formas textuais, de acordo com quadros teóricos e correntes linguísticas distintas (MARCUSCHI, 2005; CHARAUDEAU, 2008), optamos por acolher a designação de “tipos textuais”, sendo essa nomenclatura mais afeita à linguística textual, corrente da linguagem que salienta a esfera de análise da composição material dos textos. A relação entre a linguística textual e essa nomenclatura é salientada por Silva (1999, p. 100), ao afirmar que “alguns estudos desenvolvidos no âmbito da linguística textual, ‘tipo textual’ é uma noção que remete ao funcionamento da constituição estrutural do texto[...]”.

Assim, nas palavras de Marcuschi (2005, p. 22):

Usamos a expressão tipo textual para designar uma espécie de seqüência teoricamente definida pela natureza lingüística de sua composição (aspectos lexicais, sintáticos, tempos verbais, relações lógicas). Em geral, os tipos textuais abrangem cerca de meia dúzia de categorias conhecidas como: narração, argumentação, exposição, descrição, injunção.

Sobre a abordagem do conceito de gênero, ressaltando os diferentes usos da linguagem, é fundamental a observação de Bakhtin (1997) quando cita as atividades de interação humana. O autor faz uma abordagem importante sobre o tema, ao especificar que.

Todas as esferas da atividade humana, por mais variadas que sejam, estão relacionadas com a utilização da língua. Não é de surpreender que o caráter e os modos dessa utilização sejam tão variados como as próprias esferas da atividade humana [...]. O enunciado reflete as condições específicas e as finalidades de cada uma dessas esferas, não só por seu conteúdo temático e por seu estilo verbal, ou seja, pela seleção operada nos recursos da língua – recursos lexicais, fraseológicos e gramaticais – mas também, e, sobretudo, por sua construção composicional. (BAKHTIN, 1997, p. 280).

O estudo dos gêneros irá inserir, portanto, um escopo analítico mais abrangente, importante para dimensionar os fatos enunciativos sobre os quais nos referimos no presente trabalho. Apesar dos variados gêneros predominantemente instrucionais – edital, provas, receitas médicas, normas de conduta, regras de jogos, orientações acadêmicas –, neste trabalho, debruçamo-nos sobre quatro deles, todos instrucionais: as receitas, os manuais, as bulas e os contratos, que, embora possuam a mesma função enunciativa, diferem-se quanto às suas aplicações e funções comunicativas.

As receitas, por suas peculiaridades de uso, possuem um arquétipo estrutural mais simplificado: ocorre apenas uma exposição inicial dos ingredientes que serão usados na preparação dos pratos.

Já em se tratando das bulas, pelo fato de instruírem sobre o uso de um medicamento, geralmente, apropriado para a resolução de um problema físico, atribui ao texto elementos compositivos de ordem mais complexa. Fator importante para a configuração textual de maior complexidade das bulas decorre do fato de esse gênero ser direcionado a pelo menos três interlocutores distintos, a saber: o paciente, o médico e o farmacêutico. As partes textuais são divididas de acordo com esses interlocutores, informando procedimentos específicos a cada um deles. Dados relativos à composição química são mais apropriados ao farmacêutico; já quando são explicadas as doses necessárias às doenças, ocorrem instruções ao médico; por fim, procedimentos sobre o armazenamento e o aspecto físico do medicamento são mais afeitos aos pacientes.

Os manuais, por sua vez, apresentam como fator diferencial a utilização de algumas remissões a saberes técnicos, pois fazem alusão a especificidades que podem promover dificuldades para o entendimento das instruções. A leitura do manual pode acarretar, por exemplo, o acionamento de conhecimentos de diferentes áreas, necessitando do conhecimento dessas informações a fim de dar conta dos usos requeridos pelos seus interlocutores. A instalação de um aparelho eletrodoméstico, por exemplo, estabelece procedimentos que, muitas vezes, requerem conhecimentos sobre a eletricidade ou sobre a parte mecânica de equipamentos afins, fator que exigirá dos interlocutores atenção na elaboração dos procedimentos.

O último gênero contemplado, o contrato jurídico, possui a mesma finalidade de uso dos demais enunciados, qual seja, a estipulação de procedimentos, mas existem diferenças entre esse gênero e os demais. A maior diferença decorre do fato de que o estabelecimento das diretrizes para o atendimento da contratação de ambas as partes de uma negociação implica na configuração de um texto extenso. Nele, as tarefas precisarão ser expostas de modo a indicar os direitos e os deveres dos dois tipos de locutores que estarão envolvidos na negociação jurídica/financeira.

Assim, ressalta-se que o aspecto interlocutivo desses quatro gêneros configurará comandos possuidores de níveis impositivos distintos, de modo a aferir, nas instruções, esses posicionamentos dos locutores. Por consequência do posicionamento quanto à apresentação das instruções, a maior ou a menor precisão quanto ao atendimento dos comandos, pelos interlocutores, é um indicativo importante que pode ser elucidado pelo enquadramento teórico escolhido.

Essas diferenças de valores interlocutivos indicam, todavia, uma equalização, pois, como temos enfatizado, os textos selecionados instruem e são amplamente usados pelos indivíduos, em seu cotidiano. Dadas sua relevância e disponibilidade, a escolha dos *corpora* deu-se de modo a privilegiar textos cuja veiculação é comum para pessoas de diferentes grupos sociais ou etários.

A apropriação das peculiaridades interlocutivas desses quatro gêneros está coadunada, também, com o que fora estipulado por Bakhtin (1997), ao verificar que as situações discursivas corroboram enunciados, de modo a atender a essas demandas, evidenciando, assim, a “funcionalidade discursiva” dos gêneros.

Em vista desses principais conceitos e definições, ressaltaremos, na subseção a seguir, os pressupostos que embasaram nossa metodologia de trabalho.

IV. A LEITURA NA ESCOLA

Mais do que decodificação de símbolos socialmente compartilhados, a leitura pressupõe atribuição de significados ao que se lê – o que comporá, de fato, a habilidade leitora. Contudo, nem sempre foi assim. Ao longo da história, a leitura como propiciação do saber e da compreensão ficava a cargo apenas de alguns literatos, intelectuais e elites. Para a maioria da população, principalmente no contexto ocidental dos séculos XVI e XVII, a leitura estava vinculada à religião. Portanto, era aprendida mecanicamente, de forma apenas a reproduzir os textos litúrgicos – que estavam em latim.

De modo geral, o processamento da leitura transpôs-se da necessidade do contato com o sagrado para uma necessidade pragmática – conhecer pontos de vista e culturas diferentes, aprender a manusear equipamentos e ferramentas, entrar em contato com o eu e com a ficção, etc. Nessa perspectiva, a linguística textual contribuiu bastante para o desenvolvimento das pesquisas sobre leitura, nessa mudança histórica. Primeiro, porque forneceu mecanismos para a aceção de texto: o texto, que antes recebia tratamento científico em nível de frase, passa a ser visitado como uma unidade global. Outra grande contribuição da linguística textual concerne ao foco da leitura: aquelas que concentram o sentido no autor (língua como representação de pensamento); as que concentram o sentido no produto, no texto (língua como estrutura); e as leituras que focalizam o sentido na interação autor, texto e leitor (concepção dialógica da língua). Essa última é a aceção atualmente assumida pela Linguística Textual, possibilitando um salto qualitativo na forma de entender o texto (KOCH; ELIAS, 2012).

Esse breve apontamento histórico contribui para algumas reflexões aqui levantadas. Se a escola é um lugar facilitador para o ensino da leitura eficiente e eficaz, se é um espaço formal para a construção de um cidadão no mundo – o mundo contemporâneo dialógico –, que oportunidades de contato com a leitura os professores têm dado aos alunos? Têm, de fato, propiciado a esses sujeitos os sentidos possíveis do texto, com interação, discussão, diálogo com eles, ou apenas reproduzido a metodologia limitadora e “memorial” da Idade Média?

Ao ter em vista as diversas teorias que contribuem para a aplicação de estratégias linguísticas como procedimento de leitura, apresentamos, nesta subseção, um breve apanhado que pode ajudar a coadunar os procedimentos teóricos dos atos de fala e as teorias voltadas ao ensino da leitura como ato escolar.

Em primeiro lugar, entendemos que, como saída para um ensino eficaz, a atuação do professor

pode ocorrer pelo viés interacional, levando o aluno a entrar em contato (de fato) com a leitura – a leitura dialógica. Exemplo disso é Cademartori (2009), que defende que, quando os leitores que se sentem tocados pelas obras lidas, são levados a mudanças práticas ou, ao menos, à aplicação de suas práticas à leitura.

Além dessa possibilidade social, a leitura de outros mundos, de outros modelos, de outras vozes, pode possibilitar a descoberta da própria voz do sujeito, outorgando-lhe uma autonomia possível. Portanto, o leitor de livros aprende a ser leitor do Outro – desenvolve a imagem do outro nele mesmo, o que contribui para a sua própria identificação. Tal imagem, apesar de cindida pela sociedade atual, não poderia estar assujeitada, mas liberada do Outro Opressor, pelo viés, por exemplo, da literatura (PARINI, 2007; CADEMARTORI, 2009).

Atualmente, não são apenas os textos literários que compõem as atividades educacionais de nossos alunos nas atividades com leitura. Textos cotidianos, em gêneros variados, de acordo com seus propósitos comunicativos, também, inserem-se nessa dinâmica. Temos uma gama de textos, em uma literatura multifacetada, multi textualizada e multimodalidade, representando aquilo em que o mundo atual se tornou: híbrido. Porém essas mudanças propiciam que o leitor vá além de suas próprias fronteiras, com textos que acompanham e são acompanhados de ritmos verbais, visuais e de entrosamento entre gêneros distintos.

Com todas essas possibilidades e demandas, a forma de ensinar a leitura sinaliza muito mais do que métodos, mas modelos constituintes, como marcos teóricos, percepção do psiquismo humano – como aprende, como funciona intelectualmente, como podemos, portanto, instrumentalizá-lo. Assim, ler não é apenas reconhecer e valorizar os saberes que se traz consigo, mas possibilitar o desenvolvimento de habilidades que não se tem, ou seja, a leitura crítica. Isso demanda um saber teórico por parte dos professores.

Entendemos que bons professores são aqueles que conduzem seu trabalho de forma a contribuir

para o desenvolvimento crítico do aluno, pois não entendem a educação pelo viés do desempenho, mas como oportunidade de potencializar linguisticamente os alunos para o seu desenvolvimento leitor.

Uma atividade com tal perfil não se limita a discutir a importância da leitura ou a ensinar técnicas de leitura, mas leva o leitor a envolver-se com a leitura. Nesse caso, a materialidade linguística do texto é assumida como ferramenta para desconstruí-lo e para reconstruí-lo como um perito. Portanto, esse processo pode ser potencializado se o próprio professor tiver conhecimento dos fatos linguísticos realizados no texto.

Para esse fim, Abarca e Rico (2003) sugerem que, no desenvolvimento do trabalho com leitura, sejam feitas perguntas específicas, mediadoras, que levem o aluno, ainda em desenvolvimento da identidade leitora a pensar sistematicamente no “texto” e a ser direcionado à reflexão. Assim, perguntas gerais com possibilidade de respostas genéricas e abrangentes não parecem eficientes para os propósitos da autonomia.

Defendemos, ainda, que não apenas o processamento cognitivo interfere na formação do leitor, mas, também, o contexto em que se insere o aluno. Segundo Ferraz (2007, p 18), “o lugar onde se nasce, os meios social e cultural, associados eventualmente a fatores econômicos, marcam a diferença do capital linguístico armazenado”, fator que pode influenciar na habilidade de abstração de um determinado conteúdo textual.

Finalmente, acreditamos que o aluno precisa saber para que está lendo: para cumprir uma atividade burocrática? Para responder a uma questão da prova? Para passar o tempo de aula? E a função essencial do professor, nesse sentido, será a de mostrar ao aluno as tantas possibilidades de uma leitura, principalmente, a de se revelar como apontamento para o mundo real.

V. PRESSUPOSTOS METODOLÓGICOS

Para compor os *corpora* da pesquisa foram usados quatro textos de caráter instrucional. Eles foram selecionados para análise das frases e enunciados realizadores de ações que se prestam aos objetivos dos quatro gêneros. As tarefas abarcadas por esses textos correspondem às etapas de execução, exigidas para atingir as finalidades desses enunciados e que objetivam instruir tarefas cotidianas comuns para solucionar problemas habituais dos indivíduos.

Por ser um trabalho de cunho interpretativo (ALVEZ-MAZZOTTI, 1999), não nos concentramos em quantificar os achados, mas em tentar detalhar as especificidades dos textos. Para isso, foram escolhidos exemplares acessíveis, que podem ser encontrados facilmente em lojas e departamentos comerciais. A seleção foi realizada entre os anos de 2009 e 2012, por meio da compra de produtos aos quais eles se propõem a instruir, todos adquiridos na cidade do Rio de Janeiro.

A fim de demonstrar as análises e discutir os resultados, escolhemos aleatoriamente um texto exemplar de cada gênero, os quais foram usados para explicitar alguns aspectos advindos da leitura, a partir dos textos instrucionais.

Os exemplos retirados dos *corpora* foram vistos de forma a verificar, primordialmente, o motivo das possíveis diferenças na interpretação de sentidos a partir das instruções, feitas por meio de frases imperativas e declarativas, prioritariamente. Essas frases, embora apresentem as mesmas finalidades de interpretação – que é a estipulação de etapas de procedimentos–, acarretam modos de instruir diferenciados.

A teoria dos Atos de Fala pode oferecer pistas para a leitura dos textos a partir das frases indicativas de procedimentos, subjacentes à configuração textual de uma receita, por exemplo. Sobre as formas de análise da linguagem, levantamos, nesta pesquisa, aspectos referentes à natureza enunciativa dos gêneros escolhidos que pudessem vislumbrar a elucidação de elementos comunicativos, focalizando a ação de instruir e

priorizando a forma como os sentidos são assumidos, pelos interlocutores. Em seguida, debatemos esses achados linguísticos e os procedimentos de leitura possíveis no âmbito escolar.

VI. ANÁLISE E DISCUSSÃO DOS DADOS

Na presente seção, pretendemos ressaltar a ação pela linguagem, tendo como *corpora* textos instrucionais retirados de livros de receitas, manuais técnicos, bulas de medicamentos e contratos jurídicos. Os exemplares foram escolhidos por mediar as situações enunciativas contextuais pressupostas pelo tipo injuntivo, cujas análises vislumbram contribuições com seu estudo.

Da Receita

Nesta subseção, iniciaremos a análise e as interpretações possíveis para os dados linguísticos, iniciando pelo exemplo 1, a seguir:

Exemplo 1: Receita

Frango com quiabo INGREDIENTES

1 colher (sopa) de óleo

1 frango inteiro cortado nas juntas (1,5kg)

cebola grande picada 2 dentes de alho picados 1 colher (chá) de colorau

cubos do caldo de galinha 2 xícaras (chá) de água

Sal e molho de pimenta vermelha a gosto 3

xícaras (chá) de quiabo fatiado Suco de 1 limão

Aqueça uma panela em fogo médio com o óleo e doure os pedaços de frango. Adicione a cebola, o alho, o colorau e refogue por 5 minutos.

Despeje o caldo de galinha dissolvido na água, sal, molho de pimenta e cozinhe com a panela tampada por 35 minutos. Se necessário, adicione mais água. Adicione o quiabo e regue com o suco de limão. Refogue por 15 minutos, mexendo, ou até o quiabo amaciar e a baba sair. Transfira para uma travessa e sirva decorado a gosto.

Dica: se desejar, substitua o molho de pimenta por pimenta dedo-de-moça sem sementes, fatiada.

O Exemplo 1 refere-se a uma receita regional, explicando o modo de preparação do frango com quiabo. Nesse caso, o que pretendemos ressaltar é que a força ilocutória de sugestão pode ser configurada, também, a partir da escolha dos indivíduos, sendo ela reconhecida pelo locutor do texto.

O uso da expressão “a gosto” para demonstrar as quantidades de alguns elementos, como o “sal”, o “açúcar” e a “pimenta”, é comum na escrita desses textos. Isso ocorre, por exemplo, no fragmento “*Sal e molho de pimenta vermelha a gosto*”. O mesmo ocorre com o uso da expressão “se desejar”. Nesses casos, a instrução indica, no perlocucionário, a permissividade da influência do gosto dos indivíduos, de modo a evidenciar a aceitação dos procedimentos, de acordo com a preferência do interlocutor.

Reiteramos que um macroato¹ de sugestão também fica latente quanto ao reconhecimento do acatamento ou não do que é sugerido, mostrando esse reconhecimento do locutor, por exemplo, pelo uso da imperativa “*se desejar, substitua o molho de pimenta por pimenta dedo-de-moça sem sementes, fatiada*”, procedimento que vem a evidenciar esse caráter permissivo do gênero. Por fim, entendemos ser importante ressaltar que o caráter sugestivo das instruções parece estar na simplicidade com que os procedimentos são transmitidos.

Antecipamos, aqui, que nas receitas e nos contratos, o locucionário, com a exposição de frases declarativas, muitas vezes, presta-se a estipular procedimentos acolhidos no ilocucionário como diretivos. Já nos manuais, as descrições dos produtos, expostas por meio de atos assertivos, também podem reforçar o emprego dos diretivos.

¹ O termo “macroato” se refere à abordagem interacionista de Van Dijk (1977) e refere-se à totalidade intencional de determinado texto, deixando de se limitar à esfera frasal.

Do Manual

Com o objetivo de mostrar outras formas de construção do texto instrucional, visto segundo os seus atos de fala, analisaremos um exemplar do gênero manual, conforme Exemplo 2, na sequência.

Exemplo 2: Manual

Uma mensagem multimídia pode conter texto, fotos, cliques de som e videoclipes. Somente dispositivos que possuam funções compatíveis poderão receber e exibir mensagens multimídia. *A aparência de uma mensagem pode variar, dependendo do dispositivo receptor.*

O Exemplo 2 foi retirado do manual de instruções do celular “Nokia”. Nesse excerto, podemos perceber o emprego de frases que são usadas para descrever características do artefato, um aparelho de telefonia celular que pode ser usado para escrever mensagens.

A característica básica das ações comportadas pela categoria assertiva é informar uma propriedade que pode ser avaliada, de acordo com o critério de “verificabilidade”, tal como evidenciado por Searle (2002), como possuidora de atributos como plausíveis de serem aceitos como “verdadeiros” ou “falsos”. Nesse caso, o emprego das declarativas munidas dessa propriedade linguística pode prestar-se à finalidade de dar credibilidade ao produto adquirido, refletindo um ato de fala indireto, tal qual “você poderá enviar mensagens contendo textos, fotos, etc.”, conferindo ao produto maior aceitação.

Com o objetivo de dar tal credibilidade ao que foi adquirido, o recurso linguístico utilizado é, portanto, o emprego de declarativas, como nas sequências “*Uma mensagem multimídia pode conter texto, fotos, cliques de som e videoclipes*” e “*A aparência de uma mensagem pode variar, dependendo do dispositivo receptor*”. Desse modo, o que se pode apreender a partir da leitura dessas frases é que elas podem destacar, no ilocucionário, a preocupação com a valorização do produto adquirido. Esse traço interlocutivo pode refletir o desejo do locutor do texto, podendo ser interpretado como realizando o diretivo indireto

“o produto adquirido é bom, pois pode ser usado para escrever mensagem” ou o assertivo “as mensagens ainda podem conter cliques, som, imagens, etc.”.

As consequências para a leitura dos procedimentos podem acarretar, no perlocucionário, a aceitação ou a valorização das propriedades do artefato que serão, portanto, ideais para as suas finalidades de uso. Assim, as declarativas nos textos de manuais, também, podem denotar a tendência por promover, no ilocucionário, a evidenciação dos benefícios dos produtos adquiridos, por meio de atos de fala indiretos.

Porém, chamar a atenção dos indivíduos quanto aos riscos envolvidos no manuseio dos artefatos, igualmente, é uma tendência observada no gênero manual. Desse modo, muitas vezes, o emprego de palavras ou sentenças que se prestam a promover o acatamento imediato de comandos tidos por válidos, no perlocucionário, é outro aspecto relevante para a percepção dos sentidos.

Da Bula

Nesta subseção, analisaremos um exemplar do gênero bula. O exemplo, retirado da bula do suplemento vitamínico Kalyamon Kids, expõe sobre os benefícios do uso do medicamento no organismo, conforme Exemplo 3:

Exemplo 3: Bula

INFORMAÇÕES AO PACIENTE

COMO ESTE MEDICAMENTO FUNCIONA?

Kalyamon® Kids é um suplemento vitamínico-mineral que possui uma combinação racional de todos os elementos essenciais à prevenção e combate dos estados de deficiência de cálcio. [...]

QUANDO NÃO DEVO USAR ESTE MEDICAMENTO?

Contra-indicações

Não tome Kalyamon® Kids se você tiver hipersensibilidade (alergia) a qualquer um dos componentes do medicamento.

Kalyamon® Kids não deve ser utilizado nos seguintes casos: Hipercalcemia (excesso de cálcio no sangue); Hipercalcúria (excesso de cálcio na urina);

O Exemplo 3 constitui as partes que explicam sobre o funcionamento e as precauções para a ingestão do “Kalyamon Kids”, um suplemento de cálcio bastante comum, usado pelas crianças na fase de dentição. Revela-se que o emprego de frases declarativas e imperativas procura assegurar a aplicação do produto e mostrar os riscos de seu uso, o que insere os atos de fala decorrentes do emprego dessas frases nas categorias diretiva ou assertiva. A declaração feita pela frase: “*Kalyamon® Kids é um suplemento vitamínico- mineral que possui uma combinação racional de todos os elementos essenciais à prevenção e combate dos estados de deficiência de cálcio*”, pode conferir ao produto o indicativo de que ele serve para sua finalidade de uso, no caso, o combate à falta de cálcio no organismo.

A frase em destaque, embora declarativa, também, pode indicar, no perlocucionário, o mesmo objetivo de uso das imperativas. Nesse caso, ela se presta a instruir o interlocutor do uso da droga, objetivo que pode ser entendido se a considerarmos como desencadeadora do ato diretivo indireto “use esse medicamento para combater as carências de cálcio”, por exemplo. Já com respeito às sequências imperativas, que tradicionalmente se prestam a instruir os indivíduos, nas bulas, seu emprego reflete a presença de outro interlocutor que não é o paciente, visto que as instruções são passadas para o médico, e não para o paciente em si. Isso pode ser visto ao analisarmos o emprego da imperativa “*Kalyamon® Kids não deve ser utilizado nos seguintes casos: Hipercalcemia (excesso de cálcio no sangue); Hipercalcúria (excesso de cálcio na urina)*”. Esse período, embora esteja sendo direcionado ao profissional de saúde, pode acarretar, no ilocucionário, o aviso quanto à não utilização do medicamento por alguns indivíduos. Quando isso ocorre, demanda-se um ato de fala que se presta a provocar o devido acatamento, no perlocucionário, do procedimento expresso por essa frase, com força ilocutória de imposição. Por

conta das diferenças de emprego frasal, as formas de acatamento, à luz dos efeitos ilocutórios das declarativas e imperativas, são diferenciadas no gênero, sempre dependendo dos riscos envolvidos.

Dirigir-se ao profissional de saúde e não à pessoa que irá manusear o medicamento pode, por fim, provocar uma leitura dos procedimentos, assim, acarretando outras formas de acatamento dessas instruções, de acordo com as temeridades envolvidas. Isso pode evidenciar outros posicionamentos do indivíduo que ingerirá a droga, havendo repercussões na percepção dos sentidos a partir dessas ações e seus desdobramentos para o entendimento do interlocutor.

Do Contrato de Adesão

Nesta subseção, analisaremos o último exemplar pertencente ao gênero contrato. Vejamos o Exemplo 4, que segue.

Exemplo 4: Contrato

- *O Assinante reconhece que os serviços poderão eventualmente ser afetados ou interrompidos, não sendo a Claro responsável por eventuais falhas, atrasos ou interrupções destes, inclusive por caso fortuito ou força maior, e pela atuação de outras prestadoras de serviços de telecomunicações interconectadas à rede da Claro, por imposições governamentais, por má utilização do serviço ou da EM pelo Assinante ou por qualquer outro fato ou ato alheio à sua vontade ou fora de seu controle.*
- *A Claro obriga-se a prestar o SMP segundo os padrões de qualidade exigidos pela Anatel.*
- *O Assinante declara ter ciência das localidades cobertas pelo SMP, das limitações decorrentes de eventuais áreas com limitação de sinal e da disponibilidade de rede e, em hipótese alguma, o Assinante se desobrigará do pagamento do serviço sob alegação de não abrangência do SMP em certa área.*

No Exemplo 4, mostram-se algumas cláusulas do contrato da empresa Claro. Nele, as instruções, muitas vezes, são feitas de modo a eximir os contratados, que são as empresas responsáveis

pelo serviço, e as declarativas se prestam a expressar regras que precisam ser interpretadas de modo a não oferecer riscos jurídicos às empresas. Essa atribuição interlocutiva pode ser vista na declarativa “*O Assinante reconhece que os serviços poderão eventualmente ser afetados ou interrompidos, não sendo a Claro responsável por eventuais falhas, atrasos ou interrupções destes*”. Essa frase realiza, indiretamente, a instrução “reconheça que a Claro não será responsável se houver falhas, atrasos ou interrupções na prestação de serviços”, que é um ato de fala indireto de natureza diretiva.

A predisposição de procedimentos por meio de Atos de Fala indiretos, representados por declarativas é, portanto, uma marca interlocutiva importante desses textos. Todavia, o oferecimento de benefícios também é indicado como decorrente do emprego desse tipo frasal. Esse emprego pode ser visto por meio da declarativa “*A Claro obriga-se a prestar o SMP segundo os padrões de qualidade exigidos pela Anatel*”, que pode servir para atenuar a imposição feita anteriormente, podendo desempenhar papel semântico de diminuir o aspecto negativo do serviço oferecido decorrente da aquisição do celular pelo cliente.

Na continuação da cláusula, a declarativa “*O Assinante declara ter ciência das localidades cobertas pelo SMP, das limitações decorrentes de eventuais áreas com limitação de sinal e da disponibilidade de rede e, em hipótese alguma o Assinante se desobrigará do pagamento do serviço sob alegação de não abrangência do SMP em certa área*” volta a impor uma condição ao que foi oferecido anteriormente. Nesse caso, a declarativa citada realiza a instrução “declaro saber quais localidades são cobertas pela operadora e não deixarei de fazer os pagamentos, ainda que o serviço não esteja sendo prestado pela Claro”, ato diretivo indireto.

Sobre essa ocorrência, o que se pretende ressaltar na análise das esferas interlocutivas definidas pelas instruções é que, tanto na verificação das frases com natureza declarativa que preconizam procedimentos quanto no entendimento das informações com vistas a impor as regras contratuais, no perlocucionário, o acatamento dos

comandos é incondicional. Essa força ilocutória impositiva indica que o não acatamento do que é instruído poderá refletir em penalidades jurídicas para as partes envolvidas na contratação.

Assim, ressalta-se que, embora não possuindo superficialmente instruções feitas por meio de imperativas, o gênero contém instruções cujo impacto, no perlocucionário, pretende ser de maior poder impositivo do que nos demais gêneros.

VII. GÊNEROS INSTRUACIONAIS E LEITURA NA ESCOLA: UMA INTERCESSÃO POSSÍVEL

Defendemos aqui que a teoria dos Atos de Fala pode acrescentar perspectivas diferenciadas quanto à leitura dos diferentes textos porque os níveis ilocutórios dos Atos de Fala apontam três patamares de observação da linguagem. Para além dessas esferas de observação das informações, advindas dos textos, a contribuição dessa vertente teórica privilegia os interagentes, que são os elementos centrais na troca interlocutiva. Por isso, o estudo dos diferentes tipos e gêneros à luz das ações demandadas pelos interlocutores torna-se importante, pois a linguagem passa a demonstrar não apenas os “sentidos” por ela demandados, mas a intencionalidade dos indivíduos.

Pelo teor instrucional dos gêneros aqui estudados – a receita, o manual, a bula e o contrato –, selecionamos para esta análise um exemplar de cada gênero. Além disso, objetivamos analisar a correlação entre essa análise e a combinação texto-aluno-professor, visto entendermos que essa interação pode possibilitar que o processamento da leitura seja efetivo, contextualizado e que, principalmente, parta de um viés linguístico.

A primeira contextualização a ser feita é que 1) se o professor não tiver acesso a informações teóricas, como as resumidas neste trabalho; ou 2) se ele não for confrontado com os variados usos linguísticos possíveis nos gêneros instrucionais (como no caso das análises linguísticas demonstradas neste trabalho, que mostram que a injunção, nestes gêneros, não está marcada apenas pelo imperativo), os alunos tenderão a

reproduzir a ideia de que devem se concentrar nos verbos categorizados como imperativos.

Nesse sentido, entendemos alguns aspectos como essenciais: a) o ensino da gramática – modos verbais, pontuação, etc. – não deveria estar estancado do texto, nem de suas funções expressivas; b) os estudos teóricos sobre os gêneros pertencentes ao tipo injuntivo deveriam receber mais atenção nos estudos da linguagem, visto que há um nicho considerável a ser preenchido nesse sentido.

Entendemos ainda que, se os estudos dos gêneros aqui citados continuarem na atual perspectiva da caracterização linguística, haverá uma reprodução desses gêneros em nível metalinguístico, cuja análise se distanciará do projeto de dizer dos gêneros em questão, afastando-os de suas possibilidades de interação real – e de ação.

Defendemos também que, ao deparar-se com atividades com esses gêneros, se o aluno tiver um prévio conhecimento conceitual, mas também prático – das possibilidades de a língua servir às especificidades e aos propósitos comunicativos do texto/gênero –, ele poderá de fato realizar leituras autônomas.

Duas considerações podem ser feitas, portanto, a partir dos resultados das análises linguísticas expostas nas subseções anteriores. A primeira refere-se ao conhecimento de mundo dos alunos. Expô-los a gêneros textuais do cotidiano dos cidadãos, mas pouco utilizados por eles como adolescentes – como contratos e instruções, voltados para suas realidades –, pode ajudá-los a construir sentidos possíveis para o entendimento dos textos. Além disso, pode aumentar-lhes a instrumentalidade linguística, pois sairão de textos padronizados repetidos em sala de aula.

A segunda consideração refere-se à prática do pensamento crítico. Tomemos o Exemplo 4 da subseção anterior. Nele, as escolhas lexicogramaticais podem sugerir um leitor sem que ele perceba, negligenciando-lhe a possibilidade da busca por seus direitos. Na construção linguístico-discursiva do exemplo em questão, os sentidos se constroem discursivamente, de forma a proteger “apenas” a

empresa. Assim, o item 3.4, linguisticamente, “anula” o 3.3.

- *A Claro obriga-se a prestar o SMP segundo os padrões de qualidade exigidos pela Anatel.*
- *O Assinante declara ter ciência das localidades cobertas pelo SMP, das limitações decorrentes de eventuais áreas com limitação de sinal e da disponibilidade de rede e, em hipótese alguma, o Assinante se desobrigará do pagamento do serviço sob alegação de não abrangência do SMP em certa área.*

Sabemos que pensar é uma construção e que leitura é pensamento; portanto, a percepção dos sentidos, a partir desse fragmento, subentende que a habilidade leitora também se dá em um processo. Contudo, com tantas leituras rápidas, com instruções “dadas” em nosso cotidiano, tanto escolar quanto social, interpretamos que mostrar ao nosso aluno-leitor que ele pode ser influenciado por meio das várias estratégias linguísticas nos textos injuntivos, e não apenas a partir dos comandos, pode contribuir para sua autonomia e inserção crítica no mundo.

Esse trabalho em sala de aula pode ser feito de forma estratégica. Retomando Abarca e Rico (2003), a necessária pergunta específica pelo viés dos dados encontrados nos gêneros aqui estudados pode mediar o processo de leitura e levar o aluno, ainda em desenvolvimento de processamento de leitura autônoma, a pensar no texto de forma sistemática, utilizando-se das ferramentas linguísticas nele disponíveis, sendo, portanto, direcionado à reflexão. Desse modo, as perguntas generalizadoras, com possibilidades de respostas amplas, não ajudariam nesse processo.

Além disso, se o professor reconhecer que o contexto sociocultural desse aluno contribui para o seu fazer leitor, ele pode selecionar textos pertencentes a outros gêneros que abordem o mesmo tema, com vistas a ampliar a discussão do assunto contido no gênero instrucional e, por conseguinte, fornecendo-lhe dados do mundo e leituras possíveis. Dessa forma, pensamos que a linguagem será ato não apenas no “processamento linguístico do gênero”, mas, também, na “construção do sujeito autônomo” para produzir, e não apenas reproduzir.

VIII. CONSIDERAÇÕES FINAIS

Neste artigo, propusemos a análise de quatro textos instrucionais, tendo como base as frases usadas para indicar procedimentos. Cada um dos textos é possuidor de atributos discursivos diferenciados, ao considerarmos os atos de fala inerentes às frases. A receita tem como característica discursiva principal a flexibilidade quanto ao acatamento das instruções, acolhendo um macroato de fala compatível com a ação de “sugestão”; já o manual, por instruir por meio de procedimentos que se prestam a mostrar a periculosidade envolvida no manuseio dos produtos, preconiza o macroato de “advertência”; a bula de medicamentos prioriza a instrução dos indivíduos que irão ingerir o remédio, idealizando o macroato de “prescrição”; o contrato, por sinalizar as atitudes que os contratantes terão de efetuar juridicamente na manutenção dos direitos de uso, acolhe o macroato de “imposição”, tendo como efeito procedimentos obrigatórios.

Todos esses macroatos podem ser analisados, também, no cotejo da perspectiva do produtor dos enunciados com a do leitor. Essa relação pode ser observada ao examinarmos os níveis de Atos de Fala. O ilocucionário está coadunado à intencionalidade dos falantes ao proferirem as instruções, sendo ele importante se ainda mencionarmos a percepção das forças ilocutórias inerentes a essas ações. Em contrapartida, o perlocucionário mensura o modo como as instruções são efetuadas pelos interlocutores, também de acordo com o tipo de força ilocutória que baliza a natureza dos procedimentos e instruções. Dessa forma, todos os atributos relacionados ao efetivo cumprimento dos procedimentos são efetuados no perlocucionário e, por conseguinte, tais efeitos interlocutivos estão subjacentes à leitura e assimilação dos sentidos dos textos de natureza instrucional.

Reconhecemos que um dos aspectos limitadores desse trabalho reside na seleção de quatro gêneros, quando muitos outros são também de base instrucional, como a prova, orientações acadêmicas, regras de jogos, entre outros.

Contudo, entendemos que a leitura dos enunciados ora selecionados pode dimensionar uma abordagem importante quanto ao tipo injuntivo, pois essa tipologia, tradicionalmente vista para a elaboração de atitudes de ordem ou comando, pode ser analisada a partir da gradação impositiva dos atos diretivos. A tipologia injuntiva acarreta, portanto, níveis das instruções que vão desde a sugestão à imposição, sempre equiparando essas formas enunciativas ao gênero em que ela se veicula. Entendemos, também, que o tipo textual em tela precisa ser mais pesquisado, no contexto dos estudos linguísticos, visto que não existe uma tradição em sua análise. Essa necessidade decorre das finalidades de aplicação dessa tipologia que, embora seja imprescindível na configuração de textos que se prestam à realização de tarefas do cotidiano discursivo dos indivíduos de todas as esferas sociais, não constitui uma temática ordinária, no seio dos estudos acadêmicos. Entendemos, por fim, que esse avanço promove inclusive avanços nas atividades com leitura funcional e autônoma no desenvolvimento do sujeito leitor nas escolas.

REFERÊNCIAS

1. ABARCA, E. V.; RICO, G. M. Por que os textos são tão difíceis de compreender? As inferências são a resposta. In: TEBEROSKY, A. et al. *Compreensão de leitura - a língua como procedimento*. Porto Alegre: Artmed, 2003. p. 139-153.
2. ALVEZ-MAZZOTI, A. J.; GEWANDSZNAJDER, F. *O método nas ciências naturais e sociais: pesquisa quantitativa e qualitativa*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Pioneira, 1999.
3. AUSTIN, J. L. *How to do things with words*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1962.
4. AUSTIN, J. L. *Quando dizer é fazer: palavras e ação*. Tradução Danilo Marcondes de Souza Filho. Porto Alegre: Artes Médicas, 1990.
5. BAKHTIN, M. *Estética da criação verbal*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 1997 [1959].
6. CADEMARTORI, L. *O Professor e Literatura - para pequenos, médios e grandes*. Belo Horizonte: Autêntica, 2009.

7. CHARAUDEU A. P.; MAINGUENEAU, D. *Dicionário de análise do discurso*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Contexto, 2002.
8. DIJK, T. A. van. *Text and context*. London; New York: Longman, 1977.
9. FERRAZ, M. J. A língua materna ensina-se? In: FERRAZ, M. J. *Ensino da língua materna*. Lisboa: Caminho, 2007. p. 17-25.
10. KOCH, I. V.; ELIAS, V. M. *Ler e escrever – estratégias de produção textual*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Contexto, 2012.
11. PARINI, J. *A arte de ensinar*. Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 2007. RAJAGOPALAN, K. Atos ilocucionários como jogos de linguagem.
12. *Estudos Lingüísticos*, Campinas, n. 18, p. 523-529, 1989.
13. SEARLE, J. *Speech acts: an essay in the Philosophy of Language*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1969.
14. SEARLE, J. *Os actos de fala: um ensaio de filosofia da linguagem*. Coimbra: Livraria Almedina, 1981.
15. SEARLE, J. *Expressão e significado: estudo da teoria dos atos de fala*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2002.

This page is intentionally left blank



Scan to know paper details and
author's profile

Antenor Patiño and James Goldsmith: Two Tycoons in the Pacific Coast of Mexico

Dr. Carlos Tello Diaz

ABSTRACT

The history of the coast of Colima and Jalisco, in Mexico, has been determined to a large extent by a series of accidents, among which the most important is the big investment that the Bolivian millionaire Antenor Patiño had to make in Mexico, in order to justify his conjugal address there, which was necessary to obtain his divorce from his first wife. Patiño financed the international airport of Playa de Oro, which still services that part of Colima and Jalisco, and attracted the man who fashioned the coast through his interest in conservation, the husband of his younger daughter, James Goldsmith.

Keywords: mexico/ international law/ foreign investment/ trusts/ tourism/ conservation.

Classification: LCC Code: F1219.1.C69

Language: English



Great Britain
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573353
Print ISSN: 2515-5785
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Dr. Carlos Tello Diaz. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 4.0 Unported License <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>, permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Antenor Patiño and James Goldsmith: Two Tycoons in the Pacific Coast of Mexico

Antenor Patiño et James Goldsmith: Deux magnats étrangers dans la côte Pacifique du Mexique

Dr. Carlos Tello Diaz

ABSTRACT

The history of the coast of Colima and Jalisco, in Mexico, has been determined to a large extent by a series of accidents, among which the most important is the big investment that the Bolivian millionaire Antenor Patiño had to make in Mexico, in order to justify his conjugal address there, which was necessary to obtain his divorce from his first wife. Patiño financed the international airport of Playa de Oro, which still services that part of Colima and Jalisco, and attracted the man who fashioned the coast through his interest in conservation, the husband of his younger daughter, James Goldsmith.

Keywords: mexico/ international law/ foreign investment/ trusts/ tourism/ conservation.

RÉSUMÉ

L'histoire de la côte de Colima et Jalisco, au Mexique, a été déterminée par un ensemble de facteurs liés au hasard, parmi lesquels l'investissement millionnaire que le bolivien Antenor Patiño a dû faire afin de justifier son domicile conjugal au Mexique, pour obtenir le divorce d'avec sa première épouse. C'est en effet Patiño qui a financé la construction de l'aéroport de Playa de Oro, qui encore dessert la côte de Colima et Jalisco, et a aimé l'homme qui a façonné, avec sa passion pour l'environnement, cette partie de la côte du Pacifique: le mari de sa fille, James Goldsmith.

Mots clés: le mexique / droit international privé / investissement étranger/ fidéicommiss / développement touristique / conservation écologique.

I. INTRODUCTION

Dans son livre, *La terre et l'évolution humaine*, Lucien Febvre prévient contre ce qu'il appelle la thèse déterministe de l'histoire: « le vieux danger, la vieille erreur de croire à l'influence directe, immédiate, brutale du *climat* sur l'homme ».¹ Pour lui, la géographie, le climat, les régions naturelles étaient au contraire « de simples ensembles de possibilités pour les sociétés humaines qui les utilisent, mais ne sont point déterminés par elles ».² Deux types de visions coexistaient, opposés et antagoniques vis-à-vis de la thèse qui fondait l'histoire sur la terre. Michelet était pour: « sans une base géographique, le peuple, l'acteur historique semble marcher en l'air, comme dans ces peintures chinoises où le sol manque ».³ Buffon, lui, était contre: « les animaux sont, à beaucoup d'égards, des productions de la terre; l'homme est en tout l'ouvrage du ciel ».⁴ Febvre se trouvait du côté de Buffon.

L'histoire de la côte de Jalisco est affectée par la tension décrite par Febvre. Cette partie de la côte du Pacifique est presque inhabitée pendant des siècles, à cause de la stérilité de son sol, la sécheresse de son climat et en général le caractère peu accessible du territoire. L'histoire a été déterminée par la géographie. Puis sont apparues

¹ Lucien Febvre, *La terre et l'évolution humaine: introduction géographique à l'histoire*, La Renaissance du Livre, Paris, 1922, p.146.

² Lucien Febvre, *La terre et l'évolution humaine: introduction géographique à l'histoire*, La Renaissance du Livre, Paris, 1922, p.204.

³ Lucien Febvre, *La terre et l'évolution humaine: introduction géographique à l'histoire*, La Renaissance du Livre, Paris, 1922, p.12.

⁴ Lucien Febvre, *La terre et l'évolution humaine: introduction géographique à l'histoire*, La Renaissance du Livre, Paris, 1922, p.10.

deux activités caractéristiques de la fin du XXe siècle, attirées toutes deux par un paysage à peine perturbé par l'homme: la conservation écologique et le développement touristique. Pendant la dispute pour l'appropriation du territoire, celles-ci ont entraîné des possibilités de paysages complètement différentes. La géographie a été déterminée par l'histoire.

II. L'ARRIVÉE D'ANTENOR PATIÑO AU MEXIQUE

L'histoire de la côte de Jalisco, surtout celle de la région de Cuixmala et Quémaro, est intimement liée à celle d'un homme né dans les Andes à la fin du XIXe siècle: don Antenor Patiño. Il a été l'un des hommes les plus riches du monde, héritier d'une fortune légendaire en Bolivie, où sa famille a fomenté des coups d'Etat contre les plus hauts dignitaires du pays et a financé la longue et sanglante guerre du Chaco contre les armées du Paraguay. Le fondateur de la fortune était son père, Simón Patiño, un *cholo*, personne d'ascendance à la fois espagnole et amérindienne, originaire de Karasa, qui parlait quechua et espagnol, contemporain et congénère de Carlos Aramayo et de Mauricio Hochschild. Avec eux, Simón Patiño parvient à contrôler toutes les mines d'étain de Bolivie. Plus tard, Patiño achète les mines de l'Asie du sud-est, en Thaïlande et en Malaisie; cela lui a permis pendant plusieurs dizaines d'années de contrôler le marché de l'étain dans le monde, à une époque où la demande du marché en pièces automobiles et boîtes de conserves ne cessait de croître en Europe et en Amérique du Nord. Les revenus personnels de Patiño étaient supérieurs à ceux du gouvernement de Bolivie.

A l'âge de 87 ans, Simón Patiño décède à l'Hôtel Plaza de Buenos Aires, le 20 avril 1947. Son fils Antenor hérite alors d'une des plus grandes fortunes du monde: « 200 millions de dollars », selon un journaliste financier du *Sunday Times*.⁵ Il occupait, à l'époque, selon un de ses biographes,

⁵ Ivan Fallon, *Billionaire: The Life and Times of Sir James Goldsmith*, Arrow Books, Londres, 1992, p.87. Fallon, le biographe du genre de don Antenor, le financier James Goldsmith, est un journaliste spécialisé sur la question de la fortune de Patiño.

« la cinquième ou sixième place dans le classement des millionnaires du monde ». ⁶ Il était en tout cas, affirme une autre source, « un des hommes les plus riches du monde ». ⁷ La Révolution de 1952 a nationalisé les mines d'étain qui assuraient sa richesse en Bolivie, mais à cette époque il était déjà le président de Thailand Tin Mines et British American Tin Mines. Il a été diplomate à Madrid, à Paris et à Londres, et plus tard à México, où il n'occupait cependant plus le poste de ministre de Bolivie: il s'y trouvait pour des raisons très particulières.

En 1931, Antenor Patiño avait épousé, sous le régime de la séparation de biens, María Cristina de Borbón y Bosch-Labrus, membre de la famille royale d'Espagne. Antenor était âgé à l'époque de trente-cinq ans: il était né en 1896 à Oruro en Bolivie, fils de Simón Patiño, qui était appelé le Roi de l'Etain. De son côté, María Cristina n'avait que dix-sept ans: elle était née en 1913, fille du duc de Durcal (lui-même cousin du roi Alphonse XIII) qui était un homme de haut lignage, mais dépourvu d'argent. « Il émettait des chèques sans fonds, ne payait pas ses dettes, c'était la brebis galeuse de la famille », rapporte une personne qui l'a bien connu. ⁸ Cependant il nourrissait l'espoir de faire fortune en mariant avantageusement sa fille, qui était mineure quand elle a épousé Patiño. Le dénouement de ce mariage de convenance s'est révélé être un désastre. Il nourrirait les épisodes les plus célèbres de l'histoire du droit international privé et illustrerait à la perfection le problème du conflit des juridictions et des lois. Un livre de droit publié en France le mentionne en ces termes: « Un Bolivien épouse à Madrid une Espagnole. Celle-ci devient Bolivienne par mariage; le couple vit, tantôt aux Etats-Unis, tantôt en France. Après plusieurs années de

⁶ Augusto Céspedes, *Metal del diablo*, Casa de las Américas, La Havana, 1965, p.4. Céspedes ne semble pas être un auteur qui fait confiance et la maison qui a édité son livre non plus, car elle était consacrée à la cause de la Révolution Cubaine. Mais la citation illustre le caractère légendaire de la fortune de Patiño. Elle est appuyée, en tout cas, par un autre auteur: « Sa fortune n'était égalée que par quelques familles: les Getty, les Hunt et, peut-être, les Rothschild » (Geoffrey Wansell, *Tycoon: The Life of James Goldsmith*, Grafton Books, Londres, 1987, p.64).

⁷ *Time*, 25 janvier 1960.

⁸ Entretien avec Luis de Rivera, Careyes, 2 novembre 2005.

mariage, l'époux demande le divorce en France; il est débouté. Il le demande alors et l'obtient, à son profit, au Mexique. Enfin, la femme demande la séparation de corps en France ».⁹ Quelle sera, en effet, la compétence des tribunaux mexicains et français en matière de litiges internationaux? Et quel effet auront les jugements émis à l'étranger au Mexique et en France?

Au début des années quarante, à New York, où le couple résidait à cause de la guerre en Europe, María Cristina de Borbón entame un procès pour abandon contre Antenor Patiño, lequel se conclut par un accord de réconciliation, qui comprenait une série de pensions en faveur de l'épouse, payables à Manhattan. Les montants des pensions étaient exorbitants. María Cristina a reçu de Patiño la somme d'un demi-million de dollars, pour consentir à se réconcilier avec lui, en juillet 1944, ainsi que la promesse de toucher un autre demi-million sept ans plus tard, en 1951. Cependant le mariage était voué à l'échec. A la fin de la guerre, Patiño est retourné sans sa femme à Paris, il a exigé qu'elle l'y rejoigne à travers le Tribunal Civil de la Seine. Mais elle n'est jamais rentrée à Paris, car elle disait qu'elle avait des procès en cours auprès des tribunaux de New York. Antenor, à la grande honte et désolation de sa mère, doña Albina Rodríguez, femme très catholique, a demandé le divorce en France. Le procès allait durer plus de vingt ans, au début entrepris entre les cours de Paris, Madrid, La Paz et New York. Mais les années ont passé et ce divorce semblait toujours impossible.

Dix ans plus tard, n'ayant aucun résultat en vue, Antenor Patiño arrive au Mexique. Pourquoi au Mexique? Certains pensaient que peut-être le Mexique, qui n'entretenait aucune relation avec le régime du général Francisco Franco et reconnaissait la légitimité du gouvernement de la République Espagnole en exil, se trouverait en

mesure d'aider un homme marié en Espagne sous les lois de la République. D'autres remarquaient que le Mexique était à l'époque, un pays dans lequel il était facile et rapide d'obtenir un divorce, où les acteurs d'Hollywood, entre autres, recourraient. Le président Adolfo Ruiz Cortines, en tout cas, mis au courant de ses tribulations, a offert à Patiño son appui pour résoudre le litige du divorce... à condition qu'il investisse généreusement au Mexique. Antenor Patiño, malgré son passeport diplomatique, a établi son domicile conjugal à Mexico. En 1956, il y entreprend la construction de l'Hôtel María Isabel, immeuble élégant, situé dans le quartier le plus exclusif du Paseo de la Reforma, et dix ans plus tard, à ce même endroit, il déciderait la construction de son œuvre la plus spectaculaire: l'Hôtel Las Hadas, sur la côte du Pacifique.

Antenor Patiño, en 1956, venait de demander la séparation à son épouse, María Cristina de Borbón, devant le Tribunal Civil numéro 7 de Mexico. Les tribunaux, au moment où ils acceptaient sa demande, semblaient ignorer que le mariage avait été célébré à Madrid entre un Bolivien et une Espagnole, dont le domicile conjugal était situé à Paris et à New York et dont les jugements de divorce étaient en litige dans les cours d'Amérique et d'Europe. « Il s'agit d'une erreur majuscule, n'est-ce pas? », écrit un ami à celui qui serait plus tard président du Mexique, Miguel de la Madrid, alors jeune membre du barreau de Mexico.¹⁰ Peu de temps après, cependant, un juge émet son verdict en faveur de Patiño, qui avait invoqué, comme cause de

⁹ Pierre Mayer, *Droit International Privé*, Editions Montchrestien, Paris, 1977, p.169. Le texte commence avec ces mots: "Mieux qu'une définition, un exemple emprunté à la jurisprudence française (il s'agit de l'affaire *Patiño*) donnera une idée des problèmes que doit résoudre le droit international privé... Ce problème de choix d'une loi constitue le coeur du droit international privé, et est désigné sous le nom de problème du conflit de lois" (*ibid*).

¹⁰ Jorge Aurelio Carrillo, "El caso Patiño-Borbón ante el derecho internacional privado", *El Foro*, avril-juin 1961. Les disputes motivées par l'argent étaient fréquentes chez les Patiño. C'est ainsi que le *New York Herald Tribune* (16 janvier 1943) annonçait que Simón Patiño et sa femme Albina Rodríguez avaient perdu devant la Cour Supême des Etats-Unis, un procès qu'ils avaient intenté contre Mademoiselle Alice Appiato, femme de chambre de Madame Patiño. Ils ont été obligés de lui verser 6 000 dollars d'indemnisation, à New York après avoir eu avec elle une altercation. En mai 1941 elle leur avait annoncé qu'elle ne voulait plus travailler pour eux parce que lors d'un voyage au Panama, Madame Patiño ne lui donnait qu'1,5 dollar par jour pour manger, ce qui était insuffisant, parce que selon elle là-bas tout était très cher. Les Patiño l'ont accusée de la disparition d'une montre et lui ont confisqué sa valise. Elle a menacé d'appeler la police.

divorce, *l'abandon du domicile conjugal*, ce qui donc justifiait l'intervention des cours mexicaines. « La règle d'exception, puisqu'il s'agissait d'un jugement de divorce pour abandon du domicile conjugal, précisait la sentence donnée par les cours mexicaines, est de considérer compétent en la matière le juge correspondant au domicile du conjoint abandonné ».¹¹ Le domicile de Patiño se trouvait au Mexique, là où, comme le spécifiait le rapport de la cour, il possédait « des investissements considérables ».¹² Et le domicile de Patiño était désormais au Mexique.

On pouvait alors penser qu'Antenor obtiendrait ce divorce qu'il espérait tant, au Mexique. C'est alors que María Cristina de Borbón écrit, le 3 février 1957, depuis Davos en Suisse, où elle se trouvait en vacances, un long et inquiet câble au président Ruiz Cortines. « Excellentissime Monsieur le président, écrit-elle, je me permets de vous envoyer ce câble pour m'en remettre à votre esprit de justice internationalement reconnu et vous demander, au nom de tout ce que Votre Excellence accomplit pour maintenir l'intégrité de la loi mexicaine, d'avoir la bonté de vous incliner pour l'accomplissement impartial de cette loi mexicaine, sans indulgence quant à la compétence des tribunaux du Mexique, en rapport à la demande de divorce déposée par mon mari Antenor Patiño, contre qui il y a en cours, à Mexico, une enquête pénale pour falsification de dates, documents et preuves produits pour la demande de divorce dans cette capitale. Jusqu'à maintenant, contre toute attente de mon avocat, Maître Antonio Correa, les salles 7e et 3e du tribunal civil et plus récemment le juge du district se sont prononcés en faveur de mon mari, alors que celui-ci n'avait pas respecté, en aucune manière, les conditions de domicile exigées par la loi mexicaine, pour être en mesure d'introduire une demande de divorce dans cette capitale ».¹³ La révision du cas allait avoir lieu prochainement, le

9 février, à Mexico. María Cristina ne pourrait pas voyager, ni en avait l'envie, alors c'est son avocat qui l'a convaincue d'écrire au président de la République. « Le tribunal désigné a fixé la date de la révision du dossier pour le 9 prochain, explique-t-elle dans le câble, c'est pourquoi je m'en remets à Votre Excellence afin que s'accomplisse la justice mexicaine pour la protection de ma fille et de mes petites-filles, pour qui je lutte depuis quinze ans, seule, mais jusqu'à maintenant avec succès contre la puissance internationale de Patiño. Mais le très bref délai accordé par le tribunal requis pour la révision de cette cause qui affecte profondément ma longue lutte, m'empêche de me rendre à Mexico et de m'adresser personnellement à Votre Excellence de façon protocolaire. Je me dirige donc à vous sous cette forme, en suppliant de tout cœur que vous pardonniez à la mère que je suis et que vous acceptiez mes salutations les plus respectueuses. Cristina de Borbón de Patiño ».¹⁴

Patiño avait tenu parole, il avait commencé à faire d'importants investissements dans le pays de sa résidence, le Mexique. Ruiz Cortines, lui, avait respecté sa promesse: l'aider à obtenir son divorce. Cela lui était facile. Il n'y avait pas à l'époque de réelle division entre les pouvoirs au Mexique: le pouvoir législatif et le pouvoir judiciaire suivaient les instructions données par le pouvoir exécutif. C'est ainsi qu'en novembre 1958, un tribunal mexicain entérine le divorce d'Antenor et María Cristina. C'est de France qu'est venue sa réaction, où la justice a annulé, ou du moins a cherché à annuler, la décision prise à Mexico. La nouvelle est arrivée très vite. « Annulation à Paris du divorce de Patiño », titre le 2 juillet 1959 le journal *Excelsior*. Le journal mexicain précise que « la première Cour d'Appel de Paris a prononcé hier plusieurs mandats judiciaires en relation aux difficultés du très riche industriel Antenor Patiño avec son épouse, María Cristina de Borbón. Le premier de ces mandats affirme que le tribunal de Mexico n'est pas compétent pour décider, comme il l'a fait en novembre dernier, du divorce des époux, puisque

¹¹ Cité par Jorge Aurelio Carrillo, "El caso Patiño-Borbón ante el derecho internacional privado", *El Foro*, abril-junio de 1961.

¹² Jorge Aurelio Carrillo, "El caso Patiño-Borbón ante el derecho internacional privado", *El Foro*, abril-junio 1961.

¹³ Télégramme de María Cristina de Borbón à Adolfo Ruiz Cortines, Davos, 3 février 1957 (Archives Générales de la Nation, Galería 3, Caja 536, ARC 444.3/72).

¹⁴ Télégramme de María Cristina de Borbón à Adolfo Ruiz Cortines, Davos, 3 février 1957 (Archives Générales de la Nation, Galería 3, Caja 536, ARC 444.3/72).

d'une part ils sont de nationalité bolivienne et que d'autre part le mariage a été célébré à Madrid et que l'Espagne ne reconnaît pas le divorce. Le tribunal de Paris, lui, se déclare compétent, parce que les intéressés résident dans cette ville ».¹⁵ La décision du tribunal était surprenante, car elle soutenait totalement la cause de María Cristina. « De plus, ajoutait l'*Excelsior*, elle a annulé le contrat de mariage signé en 1931, qui peu de temps avant la noce prévoyait la séparation des biens, puisque la mariée était à l'époque mineure et n'était pas accompagnée de son tuteur légal quand le contrat a été souscrit. Le régime applicable est donc celui de la communauté réduite aux acquêts, régime légal en vigueur en Bolivie. Les rentes perçues après 1931 par l'un des deux époux devenaient patrimoine commun ».¹⁶

Ce fut une victoire pour María Cristina de Borbón, mais une victoire en France, non au Mexique. Cinq mois plus tard, en décembre 1959, María Cristina perd la sentence numéro 7803/58 au Mexique. C'est ainsi qu'Antenor a pu poursuivre ses plans: il a épousé la femme qui était sa compagne depuis la fin des années quarante, l'Espagnole Beatriz de Rivera. Le mariage a été célébré le 8 janvier 1960 à Londres. « Chacun se mariant en secondes noces », comme l'a annoncé le magazine *Time*.¹⁷ Cependant l'histoire ne s'est pas achevée par ce mariage. María Cristina a accusé Patiño de « vivre en concubinage dans le domicile conjugal » et a entrepris une nouvelle joute légale devant les tribunaux de Paris.¹⁸ Mais ces victoires remportées par María Cristina, à la fin, ont été vaines car la chance était du côté d'Antenor, dans le pays de sa résidence et où il avait investi son argent: au Mexique. Le mariage Patiño-Borbón, en effet, a été dissous en 1966, sans que les tribunaux de Paris ne puissent intervenir.

III. LE PORT DE MANZANILLO ET LE DÉVELOPPEMENT DE LAS HADAS

Pendant tout le XVIIIe siècle, le lieu était connu sous le nom de La Manzanilla. Ses rares habitants pêchaient des poissons et des perles dans la baie, et ils cultivaient des bananiers et des cocotiers qui poussaient dans les haciendas du littoral. Le port de Manzanillo a été ouvert au commerce avec l'étranger en 1825, mais à cause de l'opposition de San Blas, Mazatlán et Acapulco, il a été réduit à n'être qu'un port de cabotage en 1837, puis il a été définitivement fermé en 1842. L'histoire convulsive de la deuxième moitié du XIXe siècle, en revanche, a été bénéfique pour Manzanillo, car le port n'était plus contrôlé par les conservateurs pendant la guerre de Réforme (1858-1860) ni pendant la guerre d'Intervention (1862-1867). Le président Juárez y est passé en 1858 et en 1860, et le gouvernement des Etats-Unis a ouvert, à cet endroit, un consulat. Quelques voyageurs qui ont visité la zone à cette période, comme Albert Evans et John Lewis Geiger, puis par la suite Guillermo Prieto, ont laissé des témoignages sur ce qu'était à cette époque ce port de l'état de Colima. Manzanillo comptait environ 40 habitants qui vivaient de ce qu'ils gagnaient à décharger les bateaux qui accostaient, « quelque sept ou huit par an ».¹⁹ Les douaniers étaient, eux, autorisés à vivre dans la capitale de l'état, très loin du port, où ils ne se rendaient que quand un bateau arrivait. Il y avait une rue principale qui courait le long de la plage et trois ou quatre voies perpendiculaires, très courtes, pavées de pierres de rivière, ainsi qu'une demi-douzaine de maisons de torchis d'un seul étage et à toit de tuiles à deux versants. « En 1864, Manzanillo n'avait même pas d'embarcadère, relate un voyageur, cependant c'est là que l'état de Colima venait s'approvisionner de même que le sud de Jalisco et une grande partie du Michoacán ».²⁰ Il est intéressant de constater qu'à cette époque Manzanillo était le pont qui connectait le monde à la côte de Jalisco. Il y avait une poignée de commerces, des entrepôts, une caserne, une

¹⁵ *Excelsior*, 2 juillet 1959.

¹⁶ *Excelsior*, 2 juillet 1959.

¹⁷ *Time*, 25 janvier 1960.

¹⁸ Ivan Fallon, *Billionaire: The Life and Times of Sir James Goldsmith*, Arrow Books, Londres, 1992, p.87.

¹⁹ Graciela Alcalá Moya, *Con el agua hasta los aparejos*, Ciesas, México, 1999, p.179.

²⁰ Graciela Alcalá Moya, *Con el agua hasta los aparejos*, Ciesas, México, 1999, pp.179-180.

douane et une capitainerie. Mais le port n'avait pas cessé de croître. « A la fin du XIXe siècle, note le même voyageur, dans le village de Manzanillo vivent environ 800 familles qui dépendent, pour leur subsistance, des embarcations qui arrivent là quatre fois par mois ».²¹ A l'aube du siècle suivant, en 1903, le phare est construit.

En 1908, il est possible de circuler par voie ferrée entre México et Manzanillo, via Guadalajara. Le 28 octobre de la même année, le premier train de la capitale arrive, avec à son bord un singulier passager, le président Porfirio Díaz. Ce fut un moment de gloire pour un petit port qui avait souffert de la guerre et qui serait dévasté peu de temps après, par la Révolution et la Guerre des *Cristeros*. En 1914, en effet, un général mexicain, pour parvenir au débarcadère des bateaux de guerre nord-américains qui bloquaient le port, a décidé, selon les mots d'un historien, d'« incendier les quais, faisant ainsi une marche arrière de trente ans sur le progrès de Manzanillo ».²² Plus tard, en 1928, Manzanillo a été attaqué par une colonne de plus de mille *Cristeros* commandée par le général Lucas Cuevas. Les tragédies politiques ont atteint leur comble avec la catastrophe naturelle du 24 juin 1932, quand le village de Cuyutlán, proche d'une lagune qui porte le même nom, a été submergé par un raz-de-marée qui a entraîné des dizaines de morts quand l'Hôtel Cuyutlán s'est effondré.

Le tourisme à Manzanillo était parti de là, de la station balnéaire de Cuyutlán. Le port était déjà relativement grand et moderne. « Au début, l'activité saline avait attiré des milliers de journaliers », informe une étude. « Ensuite, quand les voies ferrées ont commencé à être tracées, en 1881, l'ouverture d'hôtels et de logements pour les travailleurs est devenue nécessaire. Ce serait le train qui pendant plusieurs dizaines d'années transporterait des milliers de

touristes désireux de se baigner dans la légendaire Ola Verde (vague verte) ».²³ La mode était aux maillots de bains noirs à cols ronds et manches courtes, ainsi que le montrent les photographies de l'époque. Elles sont révélatrices de l'ambiance qui régnait sur les plages de Manzanillo. Les touristes étaient alors assez nombreux. En 1938, peu de temps après la destruction de l'Hôtel Cuyutlán par le raz-de-marée, l'Italien Ottavio Machetto a commencé à construire l'Hôtel Playa Santiago. Par la suite, d'autres hôtels ont surgi, parmi lesquels on remarque le Colonial et le Foreign Club. Au début des années cinquante, quelques entrepreneurs tombent sous le charme des beautés de la péninsule de Santiago, connue alors sous le nom de Playa La Audiencia. Toutes ces terres faisaient partie de l'hacienda de Santiago, propriété de la famille Meilló, qui par là suite l'a vendue à la famille Bustamante, originaire de Sonora. Luis Bustamante a divisé des lots et a construit quelques fermes sur cette péninsule où, à la fin des années soixante, Antenor Patiño commencerait la construction de l'Hôtel Las Hadas.

Manzanillo a connu un essor considérable au début des années soixante. Cette bourgade avait été un port pilote du programme de la Marche vers la Mer avec le président Ruiz Cortines. Durant son mandat, le brise-lames a été prolongé, les deux jetées qui faisaient face à la mer ont été reconstruites; elles n'étaient en fait jusqu'alors que de simples remblaiements de pierres. C'est là où le magnat Antenor Patiño entreprit la construction de l'Hôtel Las Hadas, au nord de Manzanillo, dans la péninsule de Santiago. Les terres étaient très belles, quoique très abimées après le passage du cyclone qui en 1959 avait détruit Manzanillo. L'endroit avait été déclaré zone sinistrée par le président Adolfo López Mateos et le gouverneur de Colima Rodolfo Chávez. Dans la baie de Manzanillo, on pouvait d'ailleurs voir encore les épaves des navires *Anita*, *Corzo*, *Jalapa*, *Santo Tomás* et *Sinaloa*, ainsi que les ruines des anciens bâtiments des gardes-côte de l'Armée du Mexique.

²¹ Graciela Alcalá Moya, *Con el agua hasta los aparejos*, Ciesas, México, 1999, p.180.

²² José Luis Ezquerro de la Colina (éditeur), *Historia y futuro del desarrollo turístico y portuario del litoral en Manzanillo*, Gobierno del Estado de Colima, Colima, 2006, p.60. «Le général Viguera», dit l'auteur, «a été trouvé à Celaya, Guanajuato, et a été soumis et exécuté à cause de ce crime commis contre la Patrie» (*ibid.*).

²³ José Luis Ezquerro de la Colina (éditeur), *Historia y futuro del desarrollo turístico y portuario del litoral en Manzanillo*, Gobierno del Estado de Colima, Colima, 2006, p.73.

Antenor Patiño, par l'intermédiaire d'un prête-nom, acquiert les terrains de la péninsule de Santiago, en garantie du paiement du prêt concédé, avec l'intention de construire là des *bungalows* en association avec Bustamante, lesquels seraient administrés par son cousin Luis de Rivera. Le succès des *bungalows* encourage Patiño à financer un projet de plus grande envergure, qui démarrerait en 1966 avec l'architecte et urbaniste d'origine espagnole José Luis Ezquerro. L'Hôtel Las Hadas serait effectivement une très grande oeuvre. Enorme, massif, appuyé sur des fondations de béton, il a coûté 33 millions de dollars: un désastre pour les finances de Patiño. Il serait pourtant, pendant un certain temps, une des destinations touristiques des plus exclusives et luxueuses du monde, avec son terrain de golf de 18 trous conçu par les frères Peter et Roy Dye. Il disposait aussi d'une marine pouvant accueillir 120 yachts, commandée à l'entreprise ZYS et construite par l'ingénieur Leonardo Zeevaert Wiechers, qui venait de terminer l'édification de la Tour Latinoaméricaine de Mexico, à l'époque le bâtiment le plus haut de tout le Mexique. L'Hôtel Las Hadas, conformé par une suite interminable de maisons et d'escaliers blancs et ondulés en forme d'escargot, qui scintillaient sous la lumière du soleil, serait un lieu légendaire de la côte du Pacifique.

IV. L'AÉROPORT INTERNATIONAL DE PLAYA DE ORO

« Au début des années soixante-dix, écrit Graciela Alcalá Moya, une experte du thème du littoral du Pacifique au Mexique, Manzanillo a commencé à connaître une transformation économique qui se reflète très rapidement dans sa physionomie urbaine. L'extrême nord-est de la baie est devenu le siège du développement d'un méga projet touristique impulsé par la bourgeoisie industrielle de Monterrey: le projet Manzanillo-Las Hadas. Pendant ce temps, à l'extrême sud-est de la baie, le gouvernement fédéral a achevé en quelques années la construction d'une centrale thermoélectrique pour approvisionner la ville ainsi qu'une grande partie de la région en énergie... L'investissement fédéral a joué un rôle protagoniste pour la transformation de

Manzanillo. Il a d'abord investi en énergie électrique, puis dans la rénovation et la modernisation du port industriel de San Pedrito et finalement dans la réparation et construction des routes du pourtour de la baie. Plus tard, la construction de la route côtière unirait Puerto Vallarta à Manzanillo ». ²⁴ C'est dans ce contexte que le gouvernement du président Luis Echeverría a appuyé la construction de l'aéroport international de Playa de Oro.

L'aéroport était dans la mire du gouvernement du Mexique depuis que, dès la moitié des années soixante, Antenor Patiño avait commencé à construire l'Hôtel Las Hadas. Il serait financé, en partie par l'argent de Patiño, le principal intéressé par l'accès par la voie des airs à son empire de la péninsule de Santiago. L'investissement serait de l'ordre de 70 millions de pesos, soit plus ou moins 6 millions de dollars de l'époque. ²⁵ Le responsable de mener à bien les négociations avec le gouvernement était le neveu de la femme de Patiño, Luis de Rivera. C'est lui qui en 1971 a appris par le biais du Ministère des Travaux Publics que tous les plans étaient prêts pour démarrer les travaux au nord de Manzanillo.

« L'arrivée du multi millionnaire bolivien Antenor Patiño, se souvient un témoin de l'époque, a attiré les grands investissements qui exigeaient un bon aéroport international, pour que des avions à grande capacité puissent atterrir, d'autant plus que le Bolivien pensait à un courant de visiteurs en provenance d'Europe ». ²⁶ C'est dans cette perspective que le gouverneur de Colima, Pablo Silva García, a soutenu plusieurs entretiens avec le président Echeverría. Ils étaient amis. Un aéroport pour DC-3 était déjà en activité dans l'ejido de Salagua, près de Manzanillo, mais il était entouré de collines et ne réunissait pas les conditions de sécurité exigées par les techniciens, raison pour laquelle les deux gouvernements,

²⁴ Graciela Alcalá Moya, *Con el agua hasta los aparejos*, Ciesas, México, 1999, p.180. Le groupe Alfa, en effet, a acheté l'Hôtel Las Hadas à Patiño.

²⁵ Il existe une plaque commémorative comportant ce chiffre à l'aéroport de Playa de Oro.

²⁶ Raúl Zuazo Ochoa, "Visiones personales de la Costa", José Luis Ezquerro de la Colina (éditeur), *Historia y futuro del desarrollo turístico y portuario del litoral en Manzanillo*, Gobierno del Estado de Colima, Colima, 2006, p.53.

fédéral et étatal, ont pris la décision de construire près de la mer, un aéroport, au bord du Pacifique. Le Ministère des Communications et Transports avait déjà prévu le projet depuis 1971, mais le président Echeverría n'avait pas encore donné son accord.

« Un détail curieux montre bien le pouvoir du mandataire national », se souvient avec ingénuité le témoin cité plus haut. « Quand au cours d'une visite présidentielle don Pablo a fait allusion au thème de l'aéroport international, un simple appel du président au ministre des Communications a suffi: faites-lui son aéroport, à don Pablo! Avec ces simples mots, le grand problème de Manzanillo a été résolu ». ²⁷ En réalité la décision était déjà prise. Patiño allait apporter une grande partie des ressources. L'aéroport serait de fait terminé l'année même de la fin des travaux du complexe de Las Hadas à Manzanillo. L'inauguration de l'aéroport international de Playa de Oro a eu lieu en octobre 1974, quelques mois après celle de Las Hadas. Il desservirait tout le sud de la côte de Jalisco.

V. LÉGISLATION ET SIMULATION

L'Article 27 de la Constitution du Mexique a été rédigé au début de 1917, après le triomphe de la Révolution, la première révolution sociale du XXe siècle. Le Mexique avait enduré, pendant ce mouvement, les effets d'une invasion armée sur son territoire en 1914, lorsque les *marines* ont accosté à Veracruz. La révolution et l'invasion avaient exacerbé les esprits nationalistes dans le pays. C'est le contexte historique qui explique la nature de l'Article 27 de la Constitution, lequel dans son premier paragraphe affirme de manière précise et ferme le principe suivant. « La propriété des terres et des eaux comprises entre les limites du territoire national, correspond originairement à la Nation qui a le droit d'en transmettre l'appartenance à des particuliers, en constituant des propriétés privées, et elle ajoute cet avertissement, La Nation aura en tout temps le

droit d'imposer à la propriété privée les modalités que pourrait dicter l'intérêt public ». ²⁸

La Fraction I de l'Article 27 de la Constitution était particulièrement significative pour les étrangers qui détenaient des propriétés au Mexique. Les termes en étaient les suivants: « Sur une bande de 100 kilomètres au long des frontières et de 50 au long des plages, sous aucun motif, des étrangers ne pourront acquérir de propriété directe ni sur les terres ni sur les eaux ». ²⁹ La prohibition était originellement justifiée par des raisons militaires: elle constituait une réponse légale aux agressions étrangères infligées au pays au XIXe siècle et au début du XXe siècle. Cette interdiction ne privait pas complètement aux étrangers de tirer profit des plages mexicaines, mais elle leur imposait d'effectuer beaucoup de démarches qui rendaient leurs investissements moins sûrs et plus chers. Cela éliminait pratiquement tous les incitatifs que pourrait présenter le fait d'investir dans le pays, à cause de la complication administrative que supposait le fait d'acquérir une propriété sur la côte.

Jusqu'à la fin des années soixante, il n'était pas possible que les étrangers soient propriétaires de manière directe de terrains situés en bordure de mer. Mais de plus, il n'y avait pas de possibilité qu'ils le soient de manière indirecte à travers des fidéicomis, comme allait le permettre plus tard, aux années soixante-dix, la *Ley para Promover la Inversión Mexicana y Regular la Inversión Extranjera* (Loi pour Promouvoir l'Investissement Mexicain et Réguler l'Investissement Etranger). Ceci signifiait que peu d'étrangers –Patiño a été une exception– avaient envie d'investir dans les plages mexicaines. La plupart ont préféré investir dans les plages d'autres pays.

Au Mexique, il n'y avait pas véritablement d'Etat de droit –je veux dire que la loi n'était pas toujours respectée, mais plutôt négociée. Cependant, il y avait un Etat d'ordre, c'est-à-dire un comportement prévisible et rationnel de la part

²⁷ Raúl Zuazo Ochoa, "Visiones personales de la Costa", José Luis Ezquerro de la Colina (éditeur), *Historia y futuro del desarrollo turístico y portuario del litoral en Manzanillo*, Gobierno del Estado de Colima, Colima, 2006, p.56.

²⁸ *Constitución Política de los Estados Unidos Mexicanos*, Chambre des Députés, México, 2005, p.14.

²⁹ *Constitución Política de los Estados Unidos Mexicanos*, Chambre des Députés, México, 2005, p.16.

du gouvernement, en accord avec un ensemble de règles non écrites mais connues de tout le monde. « Qu'est-ce que c'était que l'Etat d'ordre mexicain? », demande un chercheur. « A propos des règles, relativement claires pour les acteurs, quoique formellement ambiguës, on peut noter que celles-ci ne dépendent pas réellement du Code Pénal, du droit civil, du droit commercial, même si quelques-unes d'entre elles figuraient dans ces codes. Leur application ne dépendait pas réellement des tribunaux, dont le fonctionnement était faussé par l'autoritarisme venant d'au-dessus et de la corruption venant d'en bas. Cependant, dans la pratique, l'Etat mexicain garantissait son application par la menace du recours à la force, ou bien par le recours à la force. Les innombrables lois n'étaient pas suivies, ni non plus en grande mesure les articles de la Constitution, ni les règlements écrits, mais il existait des règles non écrites, traditions, us et coutumes, qui, eux, étaient respectés et qui, eux, étaient prévisibles ».³⁰

L'Etat d'ordre mexicain était en vigueur depuis la fin des années quarante et il fonctionnerait encore jusqu'à la fin des années soixante-dix. C'est-à-dire, qu'il a coïncidé avec les années de gloire du *miracle mexicain*, lui-même fondé sur le *développement stabilisateur*. Il allait être sérieusement menacé, cet ordre, par le mouvement étudiant qui a éclaté pendant l'été 1968, mis à feu et à sang en octobre par le président Gustavo Díaz Ordaz, juste avant l'inauguration des Jeux Olympiques de México. Mais il existait encore aux années soixante-dix.

Grâce aux fidéicomis, les étrangers pouvaient avoir des propriétés sur la côte et sur la frontière mexicaine, c'est-à-dire en *zone restreinte*, à partir de 1973, pendant le gouvernement du président Luis Echeverría. La *Ley para Promover la Inversión Mexicana y Regular la Inversión Extranjera*, publiée le 9 mars 1973 dans le *Diario Oficial*, consacrait un chapitre entier aux fidéicomis, le Chapitre IV. Dans ce chapitre, l'Article 18 précisait ce point: « Le Ministère des Affaires Extérieures a toutes facultés pour

autoriser, dans chaque cas, la convenance de concéder aux institutions de crédit, des permis pour acquérir en tant que fiduciaires la propriété de biens immeubles destinés à la réalisation d'activités industrielles et touristiques sur une bande de 100 kilomètres de large au long des frontières ou dans une zone de 50 kilomètres de large au long des plages du pays, à condition que l'objet de l'acquisition soit de permettre l'utilisation et la jouissance desdits biens immeubles au fidéicomis, sans que cela constitue de droits réels sur eux ».³¹ La législation fédérale a marqué là un grand pas en reconnaissant pour la première fois, expressément, un fait qui jusqu'alors n'était qu'une pratique bancaire quotidienne.

La *Loi d'Investissement Etranger*, telle qu'elle était connue, a permis ainsi l'acquisition de propriétés sur la côte pour le bénéfice d'étrangers par le biais d'un fidéicomis établi par une banque mexicaine. La banque (le fiduciaire) retenait les titres de la propriété acquise par l'acheteur (le déposant) en faveur du bénéficiaire du fidéicomis. La propriété en question ne faisait pas partie des biens de la banque qui de fait était le propriétaire technique du bien immeuble, mais qui avait les obligations statutaires d'obéir aux instructions du bénéficiaire relative à la propriété. Les fidéicomis étaient concédés, selon la loi de 1973, pour une période de trente ans, qui par la suite sera prolongée à cinquante ans, renouvelables sur simple demande. Ils assuraient tous les droits et privilèges de possessions au propriétaire étranger, qui pouvait vendre, louer, hypothéquer ou transférer comme héritage la propriété immobilière à n'importe quel moment.

« Ce sont des fictions juridiques absolument délirantes », constate un écrivain qui a consacré un ouvrage à réfléchir sur la simulation qui, tout en respectant la loi, était très commune dans le pays.³² Elles l'étaient en effet. Mais les fidéicomis montraient aussi à quel degré, en l'absence d'un Etat de droit, fonctionnait l'Etat

³¹ Secretaría de Gobernación, "Ley para Promover la Inversión Mexicana y Regular la Inversión Extranjera", *Diario Oficial*, 9 mars 1973.

³² Jorge Castañeda, *Somos muchos: ideas para el mañana*, Planeta, México, 2004, pp.64-65.

³⁰ Jorge Castañeda, *Somos muchos: ideas para el mañana*, Planeta, México, 2004, p.63.

d'ordre au Mexique. Effectivement, un engagement du gouvernement était suffisant pour permettre qu'un étranger achète un terrain, construise une maison ou un hôtel, ou compromette son capital pour plusieurs années, sans pour cela avoir en sa possession un titre de propriété comme ce qui existait normalement dans son pays d'origine. Les étrangers, tout comme les Mexicains, croyaient en l'Etat d'ordre au Mexique. Et cet Etat d'ordre, en l'absence d'un Etat de droit, était suffisant pour maintenir un niveau minimum d'investissement étranger dans le pays, malgré la rhétorique de la Révolution.

VI. LE GENDRE DE PATIÑO

Les fidéicomis ont impulsé le tourisme à Manzanillo et aussi, plus tard, le développement et la conservation à Cuixmala, au sud de la côte de Jalisco, dans un projet où Antenor Patiño était engagé aussi. Car l'importance de Patiño dans la côte du Pacifique a été prolongé par son gendre, l'entrepreneur et financier franco-anglais James Goldsmith.

Antenor Patiño et María Cristina de Borbón avaient eu deux filles, Cristina et María Isabel, qu'ils avaient cherché à marier à la noblesse européenne. Cristina avait épousé en 1952 un prince français désargenté, Marc de Beauveau-Craon. María Isabel, elle, à l'âge de dix-huit ans, le 4 juin 1953, avait rencontré Jimmy Goldsmith à sa fête d'anniversaire, que son père a célébrée à Londres où il avait été ambassadeur de Bolivie. Son histoire d'amour durerait moins d'un an, mais elle fut riche en événements. Au mois de septembre, Jimmy annonce à Patiño son intention d'épouser sa fille, mais il se heurte aux préjugés de Patiño.³³ En novembre, María Isabel s'aperçoit qu'elle est enceinte. Patiño, ignorant ce fait, a insisté pour que les amoureux se séparent et même a menacé d'envoyer Goldsmith en prison pour avoir entretenu des relations avec une personne mineure, ce que la loi française

³³ L'anecdote est bien connue: « Nous dans notre famille, nous ne sommes pas habitués à nous marier avec des Juifs », a dit Patiño. « Nous dans la nôtre, nous ne sommes pas habitués à nous marier avec des Indiens », a répondu Goldsmith (Ivan Fallon, *Billionaire: The Life and Times of Sir James Goldsmith*, Arrow Books, Londres, 1992, p.90).

interdisait. Jimmy et María Isabel ont alors pris la fuite vers le seul endroit où il était possible de se marier sans le consentement des parents, en Ecosse. Le mariage a été célébré en janvier 1954 à Edimbourg. Les avocats de Patiño n'ont rien pu éviter. Ce fut une fugue romantique et légendaire couverte par la presse européenne, mais qui a terminé par un drame. Deux mois avant la date prévue pour l'accouchement, en mai 1954, María Isabel, pendant son sommeil, a souffert d'une hémorragie cérébrale foudroyante. Elle est décédée deux heures après la naissance par césarienne de sa fille, Isabel Goldsmith Patiño, qui allait habiter la côte de Jalisco.

A son arrivée au Mexique, Goldsmith a assumé le rôle de successeur d'Antenor Patiño. Il avait l'intention de mettre en œuvre plusieurs de ses initiatives, comme celle qui concernait l'hacienda de San Antonio (Colima) et la propriété de Las Alamandas (Jalisco). La relation qu'il entretenait avec lui, en outre, lui était utile dans un pays où il ne connaissait personne pour établir des contacts à un haut niveau, comme s'en souvient l'entrepreneur mexicain José Carral, qu'il a rencontré dans le milieu financier de Londres. « Jimmy Goldsmith m'a cherché pour que je lui facilite un entretien avec Miguel de la Madrid », commente-t-il. « Le rendez-vous s'est tenu à Los Pinos. Le président lui a autorisé l'achat de cette espace énorme. Il était très flatté de savoir que son visiteur était lié à Patiño ».³⁴ Miguel de la Madrid en effet, pour des raisons personnelles, était reconnaissant à Goldsmith de vouloir investir dans son état natal, Colima, comme l'avait fait auparavant don Antenor. Cela allait dans le sens d'un des projets favoris de son gouvernement: le Plan Colima. Goldsmith connaissait l'importance de sa relation avec Patiño, il l'évoquerait d'ailleurs souvent, comme par exemple dans cette note biographique qu'il a fait publier dans les médias du Mexique: « Présence active au Mexique depuis 1987, il a pris la relève de son beau-père, don Antenor Patiño, investisseur au Mexique depuis les années

³⁴ Entretien avec José Carral, México, 24 juillet 2006. Cette « espace énorme », dont parle Carral, c'est le terrain de près de 10 000 hectares que Goldsmith a acheté entre Cuixmala et Chamela.

soixante jusqu'aux années quatre-vingt et créateur de l'Hôtel María Isabel à México, de l'Hôtel Las Hadas à Manzanillo, Colima, et du projet Hacienda de San Antonio à San Antonio, Colima ».³⁵

L'hacienda de San Antonio était une propriété située dans les terres tempérées du *municipio* de Comala, sur les flancs du volcan de Fuego, à 30 kilomètres de Colima. Patiño avait acquis la propriété en 1973. Le corps d'habitation de l'hacienda était entouré des maisons des ex péons, ce qui le gênait pour construire un hôtel de luxe, il a donc dû négocier avec les employés pour les reloger plus loin. Goldsmith a acheté la propriété en 1986 aux trois héritières d'Antenor Patiño: l'épouse Beatriz de Rivera, la fille Cristina Patiño et la petite-fille Isabel Goldsmith Patiño.

Dans le Registre Public de la Propriété de Colima, l'entreprise Hacienda de San Antonio S.A. de C.V. apparaît comme une propriété de 510 hectares localisée dans le *municipio* de Comala. Créée en 1980, Hacienda de San Antonio a eu pour premier président de son conseil d'administration Antenor Patiño, qui a restauré le bâtiment principal et a construit une piste d'atterrissage à El Jabalí. Goldsmith lui a succédé au moment où il s'est rendu acquéreur de la propriété. La raison sociale de l'entreprise est décrite en ces termes: « la promotion, organisation, direction, administration et opération d'un développement touristique intégral dans le *municipio* de Comala ».³⁶ Hacienda de San Antonio S.A. de C.V. a adopté la figure juridique décrite par Goldsmith dans le profil biographique diffusé au Mexique: « un fidéicomis touristique-écologique situé dans le *municipio* de Comala, Colima ».³⁷ Dans cette note, Jimmy insiste sur son lien de parenté avec Patiño: « Monsieur Goldsmith a pris la relève de son beau-père don Antenor Patiño, qui avait eu l'initiative du projet de San Antonio dans les

années soixante-dix ».³⁸ Et il informe du montant qu'il a investi dans la propriété ainsi que du nombre de travailleurs qu'il y emploie: « Investissement: plus de 12 millions de dollars. Employés directs: 204 ».³⁹

Mais San Antonio était aussi quelque chose d'autre. Car le projet écologique et touristique qu'il a lancé à cet endroit, inspiré par Patiño, évoque ce que Goldsmith réalisera par la suite sur la côte de Jalisco. Sir James avait embrassé la cause écologiste à la fin des années soixante. Son frère aîné, Edward Goldsmith, avait fondé en 1970 la revue *The Ecologist*, une des plus importantes au monde, et en 1974 il avait participé à création du Parti Vert au Royaume-Uni. Son ami, John Aspinall, faisait partie des écologistes les plus connus d'Angleterre et il avait ouvert un jardin zoologique privé à Howletts. En 1976, Goldsmith lui-même avait reçu le titre de *Sir* en remerciement de ses services apportés aux exportations et à l'écologie.⁴⁰ En 1990, poussé par son frère, Sir James crée la Fondation Goldsmith, la principale fondation vouée à promouvoir des projets pour la préservation de l'environnement en Europe. Plus tard, en 1993, il a publié un livre nourri de ses conversations avec Yves Messarovitch, rédacteur en chef économique du *Figaro*, dans lequel il propose une critique minutieuse et dévastatrice de l'économie capitaliste, motivée par ses effets désastreux sur l'écologie de la Terre. Le livre est devenu un *best-seller* en France (*Le piège*) et en Angleterre (*The Trap*), pays de résidence de Goldsmith.

Au début des années quatre-vingt-dix, Goldsmith était déjà un entrepreneur qui consacrait sa fortune et son énergie à la défense de l'environnement. « Le XXe siècle a été témoin du désastre le plus grand que le monde ait jamais vu, dit-il, nous avons détruit l'environnement et aujourd'hui rien n'est plus important que la

³⁵ Note biographique de Sir James Goldsmith publiée dans la presse du Mexique (Archives de Luis de Rivera).

³⁶ Acte constitutif de l'entreprise Hacienda de San Antonio S.A. de C.V. Registre Public de la Propriété de Colima.

³⁷ Note biographique de Sir James Goldsmith publiée dans la presse du Mexique (Archives de Luis de Rivera).

³⁸ Note biographique de Sir James Goldsmith publiée dans la presse du Mexique (Archives de Luis de Rivera).

³⁹ Note biographique de Sir James Goldsmith publiée dans la presse du Mexique (Archives de Luis de Rivera).

⁴⁰ Sally Bedell Smith, "Billionaire with a Cause", *Vanity Fair*, mai 1997.

préservation de la planète ».⁴¹ Un des buts qu'il poursuivait à cette époque a été l'achat massif de terres, pour protéger leurs habitats. Il n'a pas acheté qu'au Jalisco, mais aussi en Patagonie du Chili, où, à la même époque, il a acquis des terrains avec l'entrepreneur Douglas Tompkins, président de la fondation Deep Ecology. A eux deux, ils ont y fondé le parc privé de Pumalín, le plus grand du monde (plus de 300 000 hectares), à travers la fondation Goldsmith. Sir James, de plus, accordait de grandes sommes d'argent aux groupes écologistes (en 1996, il a donné 40 millions de dollars à ces groupes, selon Sally Bedell Smith).⁴² C'était quelqu'un d'extraordinairement influent dans ce milieu, qui gagnait de plus en plus d'emprise dans le monde.

Le 25 mai 1988, à l'instance de Goldsmith, la Fundación Ecológica de Cuixmala A. C. a été constituée à Mexico. Sa raison sociale était d'« entreprendre des activités liées à la préservation et la restauration de l'équilibre écologique des espèces animales et végétales de l'état de Jalisco », ainsi que « promouvoir face aux autorités compétentes le décret et/ou l'émission de dispositions légales ayant pour objet de protéger le système écologique de l'état de Jalisco », et enfin de « promouvoir et réaliser des études et des recherches qui prétendent améliorer la connaissance du système écologique de l'état de Jalisco ».⁴³ Pour la création de la Fondation sont intervenues deux sociétés anonymes liées à la promotion de développement touristique et l'achat de biens immobiliers: Hacienda de San Antonio et Costa Cuixmala. James Goldsmith avait privilégié la protection écologique, sans pour autant renoncer au développement touristique, qui serait donc de basse intensité.

Entre 1987 et 1988, la Fondation a acheté près de 9 000 hectares de forêt appartenant à 65 propriétaires. Un des objectifs de la Fondation était en effet « l'acquisition par le biais

d'achat/vente, de baux, d'apports, de cession de droits ou par n'importe quel titre légal, de propriété ou de possession de biens meubles ou immeubles, liés d'une façon ou d'une autre à l'objet de cette association ».⁴⁴ Là se trouvait, dorénavant, le propos: constituer une réserve de la biosphère dans la côte de Jalisco.

La Fondation de Goldsmith a compté sur l'appui de la Station de Biologie de l'UNAM à Chamela, dont deux biologistes ont élaboré une étude de base pour la Réserve. La surface de la Réserve était intégrée par des terrains de la Fédération, des ejidos et des propriétés privées. Ces derniers ont été apportés, par ordre d'importance, par la Fondation Ecologique de Cuixmala, l'UNAM, l'Universidad de Guadalajara et les propriétaires du développement de Careyes, au nord de Cuixmala. « Les propriétaires et détenteurs des terrains situés dans la Réserve de la Biosphère Chamela-Cuixmala sont obligés de respecter la conservation des lieux », indiquait l'Article 7, mais l'Article 11 ajoutait: « dans la zone d'amortissement de la Réserve, des projets à basse intensité démographique peuvent être permis, sous réserve d'une autorisation de la manifestation d'impact environnemental et l'accomplissement des dispositions juridiques applicables ».⁴⁵ C'était là, une concession accordée aux entrepreneurs qui avaient des intérêts dans la zone, surtout dans la lagune de Playa Careyes. Mais ce qui était sûr, c'est que cette partie de la zone avait été écologiquement blindée contre d'éventuels promoteurs.

VII. CONCLUSION

L'histoire qui est décrite dans ce travail montre à quel point la physionomie de la côte de Colima et Jalisco, au Mexique, c'est-à-dire ses hôtels, ses marines et ses réserves naturelles, a été déterminée par des motifs hautement personnels venant de personnages impliqués dans son

⁴¹ Ivan Fallon, *Billionaire: The Life and Times of Sir James Goldsmith*, Arrow Books, Londres, 1992, p.482.

⁴² Sally Bedell Smith, "Billionaire with a Cause", *Vanity Fair*, mai 1997.

⁴³ Acte constitutif de l'association civile Fundación Ecológica de Cuixmala A.C. du 30 juillet 1988 (expédient 134/88). Registre Public de la Propriété d'Autlán.

⁴⁴ Acte constitutif de l'association civile Fundación Ecológica de Cuixmala A.C. du 30 juillet 1988 (expédient 134/88). Registre Public de la Propriété d'Autlán.

⁴⁵ Secretaría de Développement Social, "Decreto por el que se declara área natural protegida, con carácter de reserva de la biosfera, la región conocida como Chamela-Cuixmala, ubicada en el municipio de La Huerta, Jalisco", *Diario Oficial*, 30 décembre 1993.

développement, notamment deux étrangers: l'entrepreneur bolivien Antenor Patiño et son gendre, le financier franco-anglais James Goldsmith. Il montre aussi comment le processus par lequel a eu lieu cette transformation n'en a pas été rationnel mais plutôt capricieux.

Parmi les motifs en question il faut souligner l'investissement millionnaire que don Antenor Patiño a dû faire afin de justifier son domicile conjugal au Mexique, pour obtenir le divorce d'avec sa première épouse. C'est en effet Patiño qui a financé, pendant le travail à Las Hadas, la construction de l'aéroport de Playa de Oro, qui encore dessert la côte de Colima et Jalisco, et a aimanté l'homme qui a façonné, avec sa passion pour l'environnement, cette partie de la côte du Pacifique: le mari de sa fille, James Goldsmith, qui a consolidé le projet de l'Hacienda de San Antonio, inspiré par Patiño, et a acquis les terrains pour créer la Réserve de la Biosphère Chamela-Cuixmala, laquelle détermine le rythme et la forme du développement de cette partie de la côte du Pacifique au Mexique. Pour ainsi transformer le paysage, Patiño et Goldsmith ont dû esquiver les difficultés légales possédées par la Constitution mexicaine vis-à-vis l'investissement étranger dans les littoraux de la République.

SOURCES

1. *Acta constitutiva de la asociación civil Fundación Ecológica de Cuixmala A.C.* (30 juillet 1988 (134/88). Registro Público de la Propiedad de Autlán.
2. Alcalá Moya, Graciela, "Los puertos, la actividad turística y las pesquerías en el Occidente de México: una visión de conjunto", *Revista Universidad de Guadalajara*, février 1994.
3. -----, *Con el agua hasta los aparejos*, Ciesas, México, 1999.
4. Alvarez, José Rogelio, *Jalisco: nueve ensayos*, Ediciones Tlacuilo, Guadalajara, 1964.
5. -----, *Guadalajara y sus caminos al mar*, Everest, León, 1984.
6. Bedell Smith, Sally, "Billionaire with a Cause", *Vanity Fair*, mai 1997.
7. Brand, Donald D., *Coastal Study of Southwest Mexico*, Universidad de Texas, Austin, 1958.
8. Carrasco, Manoel, *Simón I. Patiño: o magnata do estanho*, Edições Bloch, Rio de Janeiro, 1972.
9. Carrillo, Jorge Aurelio, "El caso Patiño-Borbón ante el derecho internacional privado", *El Foro*, abril-junio de 1961.
10. Castañeda, Jorge, *Somos muchos: ideas para el mañana*, Planeta, México, 2004.
11. Ceballos, Gerardo, Alberto Székely, et al., *Programa de manejo de la Reserva de la Biosfera Chamela-Cuixmala*, Semarnap, México, 1999.
12. Céspedes, Augusto, *Metal del diablo*, Casa de las Américas, Havane, 1965.
13. *Constitución Política de los Estados Unidos Mexicanos*, Cámara de Diputados, México, 2005.
14. Dau, Alfonso (coordinador), *Jalisco: estrategia de desarrollo*, Gobierno del Estado de Jalisco, Guadalajara, 1973.
15. Ezquerria de la Colina, José Luis, *Historia y futuro del desarrollo turístico y portuario del litoral en Manzanillo*, Gobierno del Estado de Colima, Colima, 2006.
16. Fallon, Ivan, *Billionaire: The Life and Times of Sir James Goldsmith*, Arrow Books, Londres, 1992.
17. Febvre, Lucien, *La terre et l'évolution humaine: introduction géographique à l'histoire*, La Renaissance du Livre, Paris, 1922.
18. Fregoso Valencia, Humberto, *Cihuatlán: datos para su historia*, Edition privée, Barra de Navidad, 2005.
19. Goldsmith, James, *La Trampa*, Plaza & Janés, México, 1995.
20. Mayer, Pierre, *Droit International Privé*, Editions Montchrestien, Paris, 1977.
21. Murià, José María, *Breve historia de Jalisco*, FCE, México, 2005.
22. Note biographique de Sir James Goldsmith publiée dans la presse du Mexique.
23. Secretaría de Agricultura y Recursos Hidráulicos, "Decreto que por causa de interés público se establece zona de protección forestal, y refugio de la fauna silvestre, la región conocida como El Jabalí, localizada en el Municipio de Comala, Colima, dentro de

una superficie aproximada de 5,178-56-00 hectáreas”, *Diario Oficial*, 14 août 1981.

24. Secretaría de Desarrollo Social, “Decreto por el que se declara área natural protegida, con carácter de reserva de la biosfera, la región conocida como Chamela-Cuixmala, ubicada en el municipio de La Huerta, Jalisco”, *Diario Oficial*, 30 décembre 1993.
25. Secretaría de Gobernación, “Ley para Promover la Inversión Mexicana y Regular la Inversión Extranjera”, *Diario Oficial*, 9 mars 1973.
26. Wansell, Geoffrey, *Tycoon: The Life of James Goldsmith*, Grafton Books, Londres, 1987.
27. Yáñez, Agustín, “Multiplicación de Jalisco”, *Barra de Navidad: estudio de un área*, OFFSET Diana, México, 1958.



Scan to know paper details and
author's profile

Sino-American Cultural Conflicts in the Joy Luck Club from the Perspective of Cultural Identity

Xiaolin Guo & Dr. Ruifeng Lyu

ABSTRACT

The Joy Luck Club is the masterpiece of Chinese American author Amy Tan that tells the stories of four pairs of mothers and daughters in Chinese American families. In the novel, conflicts between mothers and daughters develop with the collision and integration of two cultures. In recent years, plenty of scholars have conducted research on this novel from various perspectives, such as Orientalism, mother-daughter relationships, and Sino-American culture. This article applies the theory of cultural identity to analyze the manifestations and causes of conflicts between two generations and two cultures. Instead of merely comparing the pairs of conflicts, the article combines the conflicts with the establishment of cultural identity and aims to promote awareness of identifying one's cultural identity and standing firm when experiencing two or more types of culture.

Keywords: the joy luck club, cultural conflicts, cultural identity.

Classification: LCC Code: PS3570.A48 J69

Language: English



Great Britain
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573353
Print ISSN: 2515-5785
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



© 2023 Xiaolin Guo & Dr. Ruifeng Lyu. This is a research/review paper, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncom-mercial 4.0 Unported License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>), permitting all noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Sino-American Cultural Conflicts in the Joy Luck Club from the Perspective of Cultural Identity

Xiaolin Guo^α & Dr. Ruifeng Lyu^σ

ABSTRACT

The Joy Luck Club is the masterpiece of Chinese American author Amy Tan that tells the stories of four pairs of mothers and daughters in Chinese American families. In the novel, conflicts between mothers and daughters develop with the collision and integration of two cultures. In recent years, plenty of scholars have conducted research on this novel from various perspectives, such as Orientalism, mother-daughter relationships, and Sino-American culture. This article applies the theory of cultural identity to analyze the manifestations and causes of conflicts between two generations and two cultures. Instead of merely comparing the pairs of conflicts, the article combines the conflicts with the establishment of cultural identity and aims to promote awareness of identifying one's cultural identity and standing firm when experiencing two or more types of culture.

Keywords: the joy luck club, cultural conflicts, cultural identity.

Author α σ: School of Foreign Studies, Guangdong University of Finance and Economics, Haizhu, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China.

I. INTRODUCTION

In the 1950s, the African American Civil Rights Movement sprung up in America, which successfully aroused awareness of the ethnic identity of ethnic minorities. Against this background, Chinese Americans also started to become aware of their negative situations in a foreign land. Chinese American writers, among this minority group, entered the American literary world and gave a voice to their marginal group in order to explore their own identity.

As an offspring of emigrants, Amy Tan spent her whole childhood and youth in America and immersed herself in American culture. *The Joy Luck Club*, her first novel, was published in 1989. Based on the development of mother-daughter relationships, the novel shows the conflicts between two cultures and finally how the conflicts are resolved through the efforts of two generations.

Nowadays, we have a growing population emigrating to other nations, from youngsters who accept higher education admissions offers to businessmen who operate international companies in overseas markets. Each of these emigrants is supposed to become accustomed to a new culture while also maintaining their cultural identity. *The Joy Luck Club* provides a kind of reference for appropriately dealing with cultural identity when two types of cultures collide with each other. This novel will serve as a typical case for this article. This study will help people to understand the respective characteristics and commonalities of Chinese and American cultures and to explore the possibilities of diversified development of Chinese and American cultures through retaining confidence in one's own culture.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

Since the publication of *The Joy Luck Club*, plenty of scholars in related fields both at home and abroad have researched this book from various aspects such as orientalism, mother-daughter relationships, and Sino-American culture.

Edward Said wrote in his work *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* that the east is completely absent when being discussed; what is present are orientalists and their remarks. *The Joy Luck Club* reflects Amy Tan's tendency

towards Orientalism and also reveals her desire to be accepted and recognized by the Western literary world. In terms of her mode of thinking and literary creation, she deliberately uses the perspective of Orientalism to examine past generations and show the negative image of Easterners, as “the other,” to the readers (Said, 1979: 3).

The contradictions and conflicts between mothers and daughters actually result from the considerable differences between Chinese culture and American culture. The mothers come from the Confucian culture, which attaches great importance to loyalty, filial piety, introversion, authority, family, and blood relationships, while the daughters immerse themselves in the Western culture, which emphasizes freedom, individuality, and extroversion (Zhang, 2018: 81-87).

As for Sino-American culture, most scholars who have researched this topic have summarized that the two cultures mainly differ in terms of family values, language expression, and also religious views. In terms of family values, Chinese culture stresses the importance of collectivism, which weighs group interests over individuals', while American culture pays more attention to expressing one's own ideas, which is the essence of individualism. Therefore, the mothers in *The Joy Luck Club* think highly of family bonds, and they consider all the family members as a whole, but the daughters are accustomed to the American lifestyle and mode of thinking that encourages children to be independent, express themselves, and fight for their rights in the family. In regard to language expression, American anthropologist Edward Hall has constructively divided cultures based on their use of context into high-context cultures and low-context cultures, and he pointed out that cultures that use context differently follow different ways of language expression (1976). In *The Joy Luck Club*, the mothers grew up in the high-context Chinese culture, while the daughters have come of age in the low-context American culture, and different rules about context in these two cultures lead to unpleasant misunderstandings in communication. The daughters get used to calling a spade a spade, so it is not an easy task for them to understand the

indirect euphemisms in Chinese culture. Besides, religion also plays an indispensable role in cultural life. The Chinese mothers believe in Buddhism, and the American daughters believe in Christianity, and these different religious views can hardly coexist with each other.

On the one hand, the studies on *The Joy Luck Club* in the past decade have their advantages and have provided much enlightenment for later researchers. On the other hand, most of these studies have simply analyzed the pairs of conflicts in the book horizontally but have lacked a dynamic study of the cultural conflicts and the formation of the characters' cultural identity.

III. CULTURAL IDENTITY IN INTERNATIONAL COMMUNICATION

In the 1950s, the theory of cultural identity was first proposed by American psychoanalyst Erik Eriksson (1993: 168), and later it was widely applied in the field of humanities and social sciences. Cultural identity refers to people's positive identity with the most representative ideas of their nation, and this kind of identity proves to be gradually developed when people are influenced by their surroundings over the long term. As the spiritual ties that unite a nation, cultural identity has laid a foundation for the inheritance of national spirit from generation to generation. Individual cultural identity is closely related to national cultural identity (Zheng, 2008: 100-150). According to Phinney (1993: 61), the establishment of cultural identity includes three stages: unexamined cultural identity, cultural identity search, and cultural identity achievement.

3.1 Unexamined Cultural Identity

Unexamined cultural identity is the first stage, and just like the air people breathe in in daily life, in this stage cultural identity is easily ignored and taken for granted. During people's childhood, their access to information is limited, so they naturally believe what they are told. Due to children's vulnerable position in society, they receive information passively and uncritically from their parents, schools, friends, communities, and the mass media. Their lack of critical thinking

or an overall view prevents them from doubting or challenging the information they have been presented. Without the motivation to know other cultures objectively and spontaneously, they often fall into a blind zone and merely see things by focusing on their own culture.

In this stage, such an immature cultural identity frequently brings about cultural prejudice, cultural stereotypes, ethnocentrism, or parochialism, and it still exists even in modern society.

3.2 Cultural Identity Search

The second stage is cultural identity search. With the growth of age, people gradually gain mental maturity and start to ponder things happening around them. The results of these more complicated mental activities can be mainly divided into two categories. The first situation is that, after contacting other cultures, one can still recognize one's own culture and consider it acceptable and reasonable, which will result in a relatively stable culture identity. Another possible result is that one may generate doubt about the culture one used to believe in firmly after repeated critical thinking as well as careful introspection. The second situation is highly common in the process of cross-cultural adaptation, especially when people are encountering cultural shock (Chen, 2009: 172).

3.3 Cultural Identity Achievement

Cultural identity achievement is the last stage and also a more ideal state. After the first two stages of exploration, individuals are able to accept their culture confidently and abandon stereotypes and prejudice as well as discrimination towards other cultures, but also have the power to face stereotypes, prejudice, and discrimination from people of other cultures. Only by being able to do this can one be said to actually finish the formation of cultural identity and be tolerant and open.

The ability acquired in this stage is the foundation of biculturalism in cross-cultural adaptation. During this stage, a new ability to recognize self-identity and maintain the coexistence of multi

cultures is developed, so that one can become the multicultural person proposed by Adler (1998: 225).

Building cultural identity appropriately is conducive to interpreting our own and also others' behaviors and to promoting mutual understanding in the process of getting along with each other. All in all, there are four characteristics of cultural identity: [central to the self-sense, dynamicity, contrast, and multiplicity] (Belay, 1996; Kim, 1996; Lustig & Koester, 2000; Martin & Nakayama, 1997).

IV. ESTABLISHMENT OF CULTURAL IDENTITY IN THE JOY LUCK CLUB

In this examination of cultural identity in *The Joy Luck Club*, the mothers are grouped together, and the daughters form another group because they respectively represent two generations. Furthermore, by examining their gradual changes from one stage of cultural identity to the next, the formation process of their cultural identities will be much clearer.

4.1 Chinese Mothers' Unexamined Cultural Identity

The four mothers emigrated to the United States in 1949 when China was still experiencing social unrest. Having arrived in the new nation, they strained every nerve to dress, speak, eat, and act like Americans, only to find themselves still trapped by their Chinese appearance and spirit. The first generation of overseas Chinese did not really enter the mainstream society of the United States. Struggling on the edge of the dominant white society, like Black American women, they had no voice and no decision-making power at all (Paul & Fran et al., 1991: 148-152).

Suyuan Woo is the mother who has no chance to make her voice heard in *The Joy Luck Club*. What clearly shows Suyuan Woo's unexamined cultural identity is the way she educates and treats her daughter Jing-mei Woo. In China, most parents readily work hard to provide their offspring with a better life, which Chinese parents regard as their inescapable responsibility. Suyuan Woo offers to help her neighbor with cleaning work for free in

exchange for his guidance for Jing-mei Woo on how to play the piano. This is a typical type of mother-daughter relationship in which mothers are always giving while daughters are receiving. Nevertheless, she just makes the decision herself and arranges for the piano courses without asking for Jing-mei's opinions. In Suyuan's youth, she was in an old society where parents have the right to arrange their children's marriage and decide whom they are going to marry.

The habit of overlooking children's independent personalities and turning a deaf ear to children's voices can be seen in another detail. In a New Year celebration, Suyuan buys some crabs and invites her friends to have dinner. The number of crabs mismatches the number of people involved in the dinner because "to her way of thinking Shoshana was just a child and didn't count, at least not as far as crabs were concerned. She hadn't considered that Waverly might not think the same way" (Tan, 1989). On the one hand, Suyuan longs to raise and train her daughter to be a talent who is able to lead a decent life in the United States, and she has made great efforts to achieve her goal. On the other hand, she brings up Jing-mei in a Chinese style as well as an Eastern thinking mode, which naturally leads to Jing-mei's inadaptation and rebellion.

Lindo Jong is another typical Chinese mother in *The Joy Luck Club*, who is shown to have acted as a typical Chinese daughter when she was young. To fulfill the promise made by her parents, she sacrifices her childhood and youth to become a child bride. When she was very young, she learned the traditional ethics that hold that children should obey their parents. She is also aware of the significance of mastering the skills of carefully weighing up one's words and observing one's countenance. As she told Waverly, "Wise guy, he not go against wind. In Chinese we say, Come from South, blow with wind--poom! -- North will follow. Strongest wind cannot be seen" (Tan, 1989). For the purpose of protecting herself, Lindo is used to speaking and acting properly and catering to others, so she sees this as the rule for interaction with others and demands that Waverly suppress her personality.

Lindo Jong's unexamined cultural identity is revealed in her attitude towards tip culture. In the restaurant, after Waverly gives the waiter a tip, Lindo refuses to provide the tip and pulls back the dollar bills. Waverly has no idea what to do but can only slip the waiter a tip again when Lindo uses the restroom. Individuals in Western culture tend to be more individualistic, self-oriented, self-centered, and extroverted, and Western society is characterized by a sense of guilt. However, Chinese culture is collectivist, socially oriented, and situation-centered. It is an introverted culture and a society characterized by a sense of shame (Samovar & Porter, 1995). Lindo rejects giving the tip because it is never a tradition in China, and few Chinese have the habit of doing this. Chinese society is deeply influenced by Confucian culture, which regards money lightly but thinks highly of interpersonal ties, so Chinese people prefer to show their appreciation through actions or words rather than money given in return.

The third mother, An-mei Hsu, has also experienced a gloomy childhood and had contact with some negative sides of traditional Chinese culture. Her first stage of cultural identity is mainly related to feudal superstition, such as the idea of ghosts and gods as well as the five elements of Chinese philosophy: metal, wood, water, fire, and earth. Additionally, An-mei Hsu has witnessed the harm inflicted on women through "the three obediences and the four virtues." Her mother was driven away from home because she was raped by a rich man, but she was blame. An-mei's mother is dismissed as the disgrace of the family just because she disobeyed the so-called women's morality.

Furthermore, another vital element in An-mei Hsu's cultural identity is filial piety, which has been a traditional virtue for more than two thousand years in China. In the traditional Chinese cultural system, family values are the most basic values that advocate filial piety to parents and stress the interests of the family. The basic requirement of filial piety is to show respect and obedience to parents, and personal interests need to be sacrificed to make way for family interests when necessary. Despite outrageous

treatment from her family, An-mei's mother follows the tenets of filial piety and voluntarily cuts her flesh to feed her mother who is at her last gasp. Indubitably, for An-mei, filial piety is the bond tying family members together as well as maintaining orderly family relations.

As for Ying-ying St. Clair, her unexamined cultural identity mostly relates to women's plight as wives who are the victims of patriarchy. In a patriarchal society, men establish their dominant position by distinguishing themselves from women. Ying-ying is born in a rich family and such a background requires her to be quiet and obedient, but this endless tolerance lays the foundation for her first, unhappy marriage.

4.2 Chinese Mothers' Cultural Identity Search

Lindo Jong is wise enough to save herself from a suffocating family. As a newcomer, Lindo quickly realizes that she must obey the rules of the United States to make a living in a strange society. Such American rules generally include the culture, customs, living habits, ways of communication, and so on. Under this circumstance, nobody will tell one what one can or cannot do as well as why one can or cannot do it. What one can do is only explore the rules in person and then sum up experience from misunderstandings and mistakes. When her children are studying the rules of chess, Lindo tells them the rules of living in America deliberately. On the one hand, Lindo struggles a lot due to the American rules. On the other hand, she starts to reflect on what her own culture has taken from her and what the new culture will bring to her. The United States is called a melting pot, which is surprisingly inclusive. This young country encourages people to fight for their dreams, and citizens are able to enjoy growing social mobility through their hard work and diligence. This is why Lindo teaches her children to adapt to the American environment.

An-mei Hsu begins her cultural identity search when she starts to believe in God, goes to the church, and reads the Bible. On a vacation, their whole family go to the beach, but unfortunately An-mei's youngest son accidentally falls into the sea. At first, An-mei uses the traditional Chinese

way, throwing her valuable ring into the sea in the hope of salvaging her son from Coiling Dragon. Soon she finds that this once-effective ancient method does not work, and she resorts to the power of God. Her acceptance and dependence on a new religion witness that her cultural identity search is in process.

Ying-ying loses her cultural identity with the issuing of her immigration papers: Her name is changed from Ying-ying Gu to Betty St. Clair, and even her birthyear, Tiger, is mistaken as Dragon. What she is deprived of is not merely her name or birthyear but also her cultural identity as a Chinese person and her connection with her homeland. Chinese and English names are two different language symbols, representing different individualities. The two kinds of names have their own cultural characteristics, which are prominently reflected in the history, religious beliefs, national psychology, values, and changes of the times of the two different cultures (Chen, 2011: 52-55). The meaning of "Ying-ying" in Chinese may contain her parents' best wishes for her, while "Betty" is just a name. The changes of Ying-ying's representative identity symbols, to a large extent, bring serious crises to her own cultural identity.

4.3 Chinese Mothers' Cultural Identity Achievement

As time goes by, the mothers can make a clear distinction between the two cultures and also their respective advantages and disadvantages without holding strong cultural prejudices or falling into ethnocentrism. They are able to see the two cultures impartially and flexibly, showing their different cultural characteristics in various situations.

In Lindo's first marriage, her youthful affection is strangled by the old society and the decision made by her parents. Luckily, she later meets a boy who arouses the romantic feelings hidden in her heart, and they present each other with a happy marriage and family. After the totally different two marriages, she finally understands the true meaning of marriage and gradually agrees with some reasonable parts of American culture which

she used to blindly object to. It is also the harmonious coexistence of two cultures in her mind that allows her to let Waverly determine her own marriage. What she implies is not only her acceptance of Waverly's husband but also her affirmation of the free marriage choices in American culture.

An-mei has witnessed her mother's tragic experience resulting from polygamy and the inferior status of women in the old society, and she can also sharply detect and point out that her daughter's marriage has gone wrong. Rose plans to adopt the American method, seeing a psychiatrist to solve the problems in her marriage, while An-mei has the sober thought that a psychiatrist is not a person whom one can actually depend on. In the past, women like An-mei's mother in China indeed had no choice but to accept their fates. Although An-mei can correctly identify the past deficiencies of her own culture, she has the ability to confidently commend its progress with dignity. Having been struggling with the collision of two cultures, An-mei is able to recognize the cultural differences in a natural way and skillfully switch between the two cultures.

As for Ying-ying, although her cultural identity is not as evident as that of the other mothers, she can still jump out of the box and be profoundly introspective. By comparing the way couples get along with each other in the Chinese style with that of the American style, Ying-ying holds that women have to safeguard their equal status and make their voices heard in a marriage. Neither Chinese continuous forbearance nor American cold American strict equality is the perfect solution. Her world outlooks successfully transcend the limitations of her local culture and show a mentality of embracing and treating the two cultures openly and inclusively.

4.4 American Daughters' Unexamined Cultural Identity

Jing-mei Woo does not have a comprehensive understanding of her mother and what happened to her mother in China in the past. In her eyes, her mother is someone who always tries hard to

integrate into the mainstream of American life but can only speak a little, poor American English. Resulting from the lack of knowing her mother's stories and growth environment, Jing-mei even does not take it seriously when her mother tells her that she has twin sisters in China because China is a place very far away from her, and she has never been there. Later, she gets bored with her mother's intention to cultivate her into a prodigy and refuses to practice playing the piano. Jing-mei is born in American where individual freedom is highly advocated without restriction even by one's own parents. Motivated by a strong desire for freedom, American children are more independent from their parents and tend to have the courage to say no to their parents' unreasonable or excessive demands. For Jing-mei, it is ridiculous for children to completely accept whatever their parents impose on them.

The most distinct unexamined cultural identity in Waverly is her tendency towards individualism and avoidance of collectivism. From the discovery of the New World to the gold rush, we can see that the realization of the American dream is inseparable from personal struggle. Therefore, Americans have a strong sense of independence and a clear sense of distance between individuals. However, in Chinese traditional culture, people like to complete a task with the power of a group of individuals. A person's success or decline is often related to the honor and disgrace of the whole group (Larry, 2001: 80-81). Waverly feels annoyed that her champion status is shown off by her mother as if Waverly is a commodity to be advertised. In her eyes, she is an independent individual rather than her mother's personal honor.

Rose grows up in the United States, so most of the males around her are Americans, which affects her standard of spouse selection to some extent. In the stage of unexamined cultural identity, people always see things from the perspective of their own culture and treat foreigners unfairly with a strong sense of racial superiority. Rose is attracted by the boys with American faces, figures and characteristics that are different from her Chinese brothers'. Influenced by her education in

school and mass media in society, Rose believes that American boys are the best in the world, and she needs the husband of this kind.

Lena St. Clair's views on marriage early on are mainly formed by the impact of her husband. In the relationships between couples in the United States, husbands and wives are relatively more independent from each other, and they have clearly separated private space and personal interests. However, the overemphasis on self and equality is damaging their relationship.

4.5 American Daughters' Cultural Identity Search

The process of cultural identity search is also a process that allows Jing-mei to get closer to and know more about her mother and Chinese culture. During the process, she becomes willing to understand the Chinese cultural connotation of an event and to explain her mother's behaviors in a Chinese way. Jing-mei has received a jade pendant from her mother, but she just leaves it alone because she regards it as a simple ornament. It is not until her mother passes away that she realizes that the shapes and details of the jade have special meaning in Chinese and that the jade contains the best blessing and wishes from her mother. Their different opinions on things constantly challenged her cultural identity. At this stage, Jing-mei begins to strike a balance between her American characteristics and her mother's Chinese spirit.

If Waverly is forthright and candid in the first stage, she has become hesitant and far less decisive in the second stage for she has a deeper understanding of Chinese traditional values. On the one hand, Waverly thirsts for her freedom in marriage as an American. On the other hand, considering filial piety in China and her mother's feelings, she tries her best to persuade her mother into agreeing with her marriage to Rich. Waverly's friend advises her to ask her mother to shut up when Waverly complains about her mother, but Waverly is not a girl who dares to talk back to her mother anymore because it is clearly against filial piety in China. Furthermore, Chinese culture's growing influence on Waverly can be seen in another detail. In the Confucian ethical order, the

younger generation is often not allowed to directly use the elder's name. To do so would be regarded as uneducated and ignorant of the rules. In America, however, people can use names directly regardless of their seniority, which reflects their pursuit of equality (Gu, 2008: 95-98). In a farewell, Rich directly calls Waverly's parents by their names, which is considered disrespectful to the elders by Waverly.

It is Rose's marriage that marks a turning point in her cultural identity. Without the spirit of independence, Rose gradually loses herself in the relationship, which leads to the failure of their marriage. Over years, she realizes that both Chinese people and American people have their options from which she is able to choose the best from a personal standpoint. When still young, Rose would have chosen the American options without hesitation. Now, however, Rose discovers that the wide ranges of American options are so vast that she is easily confused and makes wrong decisions. The unsuccessful marriage urges her to think over her blind worship of American options.

The relationship between Lena and her husband is also challenged by the cultural identity search resulting from the influence of the Chinese culture presented by her parents. According to Hofstede, in the family of a collectivist country, people have economic obligations to their relatives, and men and women share property after forming a family. In individualistic countries, men and women still have to retain a large private space after they are married, including economic independence, which reflects "economic independence among relatives" (2008: 7-9). The hidden Chinese cultural factors in Lina's mind force her to question and think critically about the strict equality among American couples.

4.6 American Daughters' Cultural Identity Achievement

At the end of the story, Jing-mei takes a visit to China with her father, and she finally steps into her cultural identity achievement by staying in China for some days. Only when Jing-mei leaves for China and see how China has developed in person can she abandon stereotypes about China

based on a lack of objectivity and partial observation. Although Jing-mei always shows obvious preference for American culture in the process of her growth, her mother continually instills Chinese culture into her mind. The Chinese culture that Jing-mei used to look down upon will give her power and courage to continue her life in the future.

The conflicts between Waverly and her mother are successfully resolved, which is conducive to bridging the gap between the two cultures around Waverly. Waverly decides to go to China for her honeymoon with her mother in order to know more about her mother An-mei Hsu as well their homeland. What is more, Waverly even desires to look Chinese due to her growing acceptance of Chinese culture, Chinese people's increasing international status, and the fact that half of her identity is Chinese.

As for Rose and Lena, both of them reconstruct their cultural identity and resolve the crisis they are confronted with by allowing and acknowledging the harmonious coexistence of their two cultures. Thanks to their mothers' enlightenment and their stronger and stronger national consciousness, Rose and Lena bravely fight for their rights and status in their marriages.

In the last but most important phase, the four daughters correctly establish their identity as Chinese with totally new understandings of their two cultures. From their perspective, one of the two civilizations is not better than the other. The four mothers come from the same place and suffered similar experiences in China and America, and that is why they gather together and set up the Joy Luck Club. The four pairs of mothers and daughters are tortured by the big differences of two cultures and trapped in troubled mother-daughter relationships. Through the process of dealing with these challenges, the mothers' and daughters' puzzlement and dilemmas are vividly presented. Fortunately, they successfully achieve their cultural identity after bitter struggles. The process for cultural identity is painful but the outcome is desirable. Those are also the difficulties and hope for millions of individuals who live in today's globalized world.

V. CONCLUSION

The four pairs of mothers and daughters in the novel have experienced the process of pursuing their own cultural identity. Many factors also play crucial roles in the formation of their cultural identity such as their changes of attitudes, openness towards other cultures, rich life experience, and changing environment. Through the theory of cultural identity, this article analyzes the transformation of the characters' cultural identity in three stages, which is a step-by-step process. At the same time, this analysis also reflects the dynamic characteristics of cultural identity, because developing cultural identity is not a mechanical and simple cognitive change but a transition happening over time. For plenty of cross-cultural individuals, the establishment of cultural identity is a tortuous as well as an arduous journey full of confusion.

Nevertheless, this article has its limitations. Firstly, the article only discusses Chinese culture and American culture. Although the two countries represent two kinds of voices, there are countless excellent cultures all over the globe, and they also are worth studying. Secondly, variables are produced by changes since the time period in which the novel was set. The story in the novel took place in the middle and late 20th century when the gap in strength between China and America was still wide. However, China has made a great progress and enjoyed greater reputation in the 21st century. As a result, Chinese people's attitudes towards our own culture and American culture may differ from our past generations'.

Nowadays, there is a growing popularity among Chinese citizens of going abroad to explore the outside world. How they can maintain their cultural identity within the collision of two or more cultures is therefore an urgent problem to be solved. The 21st century has witnessed the rise of China, which has significantly improved both its international status and its economic, political, cultural, scientific, and technological strength. A strong sense of cultural confidence equips Chinese people with great courage and confidence no matter where they are. Chinese Americans and the youngest generation of Chinese are the two groups

most deeply impacted by foreign culture, so they should have a clear understanding of their cultural identity. When facing heterogeneous cultures, one should embrace them with a friendly attitude and open mind instead of excluding them blindly or absorbing them completely. Cultural exchanges in international communication should also be equal and harmonious. Following the unavoidable trend of globalization is the responsibility and task of the people all over the globe.

Funding

1. Higher education science project of Guangdong educational and scientific research for tertiary education in 2021 (No.2021GXJK397).
2. Higher Education Teaching Reform Project of the Quality Engineering Project at the school level of Guangdong University of Finance and Economics in 2022.

REFERENCES

1. Adler, P. S. (1998). *Beyond cultural identity: Reflections on multiculturalism*. Yarmouth: Intercultural Press.
2. Amy Tan. (1989). *The Joy Luck Club*. New York: Ivy Books.
3. Belay, G. (1996). The (re)construction and negotiation of cultural identities in the age of globalization. In H. B. Hokros (Ed.), *Interaction & identities*. New Brunswick: Transaction, 319-346.
4. Chan Jeffery Paul, Chin Frank, Inada Law son Fusao, et al. (1991). *The big aiiiiiii!: An anthology of Chinese American and Japanese American literature*. New York: Meridian.
5. Chen Guoming. (2009). *Foundations of Intercultural Communication*. Shanghai: East China Normal University Press.
6. Chen Yanwen. (2011). On Chinese Names and English Names and the Culture between China and Western Countries. *Journal of North China University of Science and Technology* (04),52-55.
7. Edward T. Hall. (1976). *The silent language*. New York: Dumbleday Dell Publishing.
8. Edward. W. Said. (1979). *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage.
9. Erik H. Erikson. (1993). *Childhood and Society*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
10. Gu Ping. (2008). Interpretation of Cultural Conflicts in *The Joy Luck Club* from the Perspective of Ethics. *Journal of Nanjing Forestry University* (02),95-98.
11. Hofstede, G. (2008). *Culture's consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions and organizations across nations*. Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
12. Kim. Y, Y. (1996). Identity development: From cultural to intercultural. In H. B. Hokros (Ed.), *Interaction & identities*. New Brunswick: Transaction, 369-479.
13. Larry A, S., & Richard E, P. (Eds.). (1995). *Communication between cultures*. California: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
14. Lustig, M. W. & Koester, J. (2000). The nature of cultural identity. In M. W. Lustig & J. Koester (Eds.), *Among us; Essays on identity, belonging, and intercultural competence*. New York: Longman, 3-8.
15. Martin, J. N. & Nakayama, T. K. (1997). *Intercultural communication in contexts*. California: Mayfield.
16. Phinney. (1993). *Ethnic identity: Formation and transmission among Hispanics and other minorities*. New York: State University of New York Press.
17. Samovar Larry. (2001). *Communication between cultures*. New York: Clark Baxter.
18. Zhang Jun. (2018). Approaches to the Deconstruction of "Orientalism" in *The Joy Luck Club* and Its Multiple Codes. *Foreign Languages Research* (01),81-87.
19. Zheng Xiaoyun. (2008). *On Cultural identity*. Beijing: China Social Sciences Press.

This page is intentionally left blank



Scan to know paper details and
author's profile

Reading of Reading Salman Rushdie's 'Midnight's Children through Reader Response Theory

Ritu Sharma

ABSTRACT

One of the techniques evident in *Midnight's Children* is reader response theory which is successful in creating enough suspense. The present paper will focus on Reader Response theory. It will also share some information about the writer and the novel *Midnight's Children*. It will elaborately discuss the character named Padma. She is a surrogate listener who represents the partial and but obvious behaviour of an ordinary audience of *Midnight's Children*. Salman Rushdie has intentionally depicted Padma's character so that she can become an audience to Saleem Sinai (protagonist) for his narration. Saleem Sinai is the lead character of the novel who is blessed with telepathy and also has an uncommon or unnatural severe sense of nose to find other midnight's children to form midnight conference. Another interesting thing in the story falls at the point when Saleem's birth is switched with another character named Shiva who later as the story develops becomes his rival. At times we find Padma as an impatient listener who is mainly interested in the main plot.

Keywords: reader response, reading, audience, Indian aesthetician, magical realism.

Classification: LCC Code: PR9499.3.R8 M525

Language: English



Great Britain
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573353
Print ISSN: 2515-5785
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



Reading of Reading Salman Rushdie's 'Midnight's Children through Reader Response Theory

Ritu Sharma

ABSTRACT

One of the techniques evident in Midnight's Children is reader response theory which is successful in creating enough suspense. The present paper will focus on Reader Response theory. It will also share some information about the writer and the novel Midnight's Children. It will elaborately discuss the character named Padma. She is a surrogate listener who represents the partial and but obvious behaviour of an ordinary audience of Midnight's Children. Salman Rushdie has intentionally depicted Padma's character so that she can become an audience to Saleem Sinai (protagonist) for his narration. Saleem Sinai is the lead character of the novel who is blessed with telepathy and also has an uncommon or unnatural severe sense of nose to find other midnight's children to form midnight conference. Another interesting thing in the story falls at the point when Saleem's birth is switched with another character named Shiva who later as the story develops becomes his rival. At times we find Padma as an impatient listener who is mainly interested in the main plot. Rushdie as a narrator raises question through Padma to which Saleem Sinai has to satisfy and likewise the chain of narration moves on.

Keywords: reader response, reading, audience, Indian aesthetician, magical realism.

I. INTRODUCTION

I A Richards is the influential figure in establishing Reader-response theory. He believed that "one is never the same before and after reading the text" (192.) Readers Response theory appeared and became prominent in 1960's. Basically this theory deals with reader's response towards particular text. This theory on the contrary with the other theories does not give attention primarily to author or to the content. It

is a study that analysis the interpretation of text done by the reader. The approach of the reader remains aesthetic in analyzing it that beautifies the understanding of the text for him/her. According to German critic Wolfgang Iser, text does not contain any meaning within it. The meaning is generated only through the reading process. It is the reader with whom the text comes in direct contact. Therefore before making an elaborative discussion about text and its interpretation readers identification is essential to support this theory. How a reader should be. And what should be assumed while a text is produced by the author. Both author and reader are never in a direct contact with each other.

Hence the reader is in a broad way divided in two categories: an ideal reader and second one the actual reader. Further Iser talks about the efficiency that implied reader i.e. the ideal reader possess who works in both ways in interpretation of text. He is the one who is connected with the text to analyze it with conscious mind. Second category of readers is the outside reader: the actual reader. The actual reader is rational, holds knowledge and has experience about the outside world. The actual reader analysis the text in context with his/her own personal understanding. To all it means that reader as per his/her age and emotional baggage interprets the text. Even sometimes the reader relates the text with them. The interpretation of the text changes as the age changes of the reader varies. It is not always the same interpretation that a reader will come up with. The same text can be understood differently by the same reader after repetitive study of the text. It demands active participation of a reader to construct meaning out of the words and phrases from paragraph to paragraph scene to scene and chapter to chapter. A reader is not mere reader but a writer as well during the activity of listening

because interpretation comes only after making some assumptions while reading.

The New Criticism theory ignores the reader's participation in the re creation of text. This theory does not believe in readers' involvement to make the text productive. It does not emphasize on author's intention or on readers psychology. It believes that the meaning of the text lies within the text itself. But on the contrary as Stanley Fish says, "Objectivity of the text is an illusion." A text is not an independent work reader plays significant role in developing text with its own understanding and interpretation towards it.

Louise Rosenblatt the prominent critic of transactional Reader Response theory says that literary work is the outcome of a business that occurs between a reader and the text. In a text gaps (that are far away from the facts in the text) would be produced which holds indeterminate meaning that forces a reader to create meaning with its own understanding. Meaning remains absent in the text until reader generates it. Production of the meaning is the evidence that proves the importance of reader to respond the text. Iser clarifies the process of concretization which is done by a reader in a text produced by the author. The category of Affective Stylistic in Reader Response theory is related with Stanley Fish who speaks on a closer observation in analyzing text. Text is produced by the formation of meaningful words that converts the reader's analysis into felt experience. For him every meaning is an event and it is an endless interaction through printing mode.

The observation of Reader Response theory with two complex readers in Salman Rushdie's *Midnight's Children* one reader that Rushdie has depicted: Padma the inside reader as an 'intended reader' whom he had in his mind when he produced the text. She is an uncritical audience or can also say that she is an ideal critical audience who accepts whatever Saleem Sinai (the protagonist) narrates in the novel to her. Saleem Sinai takes her in his confidence due to which she consistently listens to his tedious way of narration. Rushdie has not much shared about Padma's background therefore she being simple is

curious to know about Saleem's past life, especially his birth. When Saleem turns thirty-one years old he feels that soon he will be dead he discloses all that he has in his mind and heart about his life and people connect to him. Rushdie introduces Padma Mongroli as Saleem's dear companion, loving and sincere caretaker. She is one of the tools utilized by Rushdie to get loyal feedback for his narration. It is Padma only through which Rushdie introduces one of the oldest art form of storytelling performed in India. Padma does not give importance to Saleem's scribbling in comparison to outside readers because she is illiterate therefore Saleem detains to create interest in her until storytelling is done "... She can't read like all fish lovers..." (24).

Padma's behavior varies throughout the storytelling which, was quite expected because she as an individual possesses some characteristic in herself, some principles. As one of Newton's law proves that, 'To each and every action there is an equal and opposite reaction.' Probably this is one of the reasons behind her variety of reaction.

As a listener Padma is controlled and guided by Saleem narration in the listening process. Different adjectives have been used for Padma's queries at times she is passive listener and sometimes she participates actively in between the narration. Padma's criticism functions as guidance to Saleem as a narrator and Rushdie as writer to move in a sequential manner as she says, "... To me it's crazy way of telling your life story. 'She cries, if you can't even get to where your father met your mother ...'" (45).

Saleem confesses Padma's pressure on him that helps him to not to go off track from the main plot. "... Bowing to ineluctable Padma-pressures of what-happened-nextism... I leap forwards from *Mercurochrome* and land in 1942. (I am keen to get my parents together too)" (45)

Padma is a curious listener she tries to help herself to find out Saleem's father quickly reaching to the conclusion in between the narration. "... Is that him? Padma asks in some confusion. That fat soft cowardly plumpie? Is he going to be your father?" (62)

This is pity not only at Padma's part but also as a common reader who is forced to discover Saleem's father after showing some kind of disinterest in his tiresome and over exaggerated narration. Padma feels extremely disgusted after knowing the truth about Saleem's switch of birth and throws tantrum on him for befooling her. Saleem's real identity was beyond Padma's imagination. Padma gets furious and blames Saleem for everything that has happened with him. On the contrary she develops a soft corner for his biological parents. "...You don't care that you mother died giving your life? That your father may be still alive somewhere penniless, poor?" (158)

Padma's refusal and disinterest to listen further does not stop Rushdie as a writer to move on with other interesting events yet to happen. But poor Padma involves herself again to know what happens next. Padma is none the else Rushdie's depiction. Rushdie treats Padma as puppet for his narration through Saleem. Padma responds in full measure to the demands made by text. Padma works in two ways: she responds and constructs the meaning out of text. After an observation one may find Padma with variety of emotions at Saleem's honest narrative confession of his own life. Padma's love for Saleem Senai remains consistent and pure hence after listening to his narration she does not change and readily accepts him.

Another reader is the actual audience (I or You) in contrast with Padma the outside reader faces difficulty in analyzing text. The outside reader finds the novel more complex. The actual reader is a conscious reader. He/ she find many challenges in reading and understanding of the text. The story of *Midnight's Children* seems to open with vague and an informal description of narrator's birth, giving prominence to date and time of birth along with the official Independence of India. The narrator is successful in creating an aura for outside readers about Independence, Kashmir, Aadam Aziz and of course the narrator himself, the protagonist Saleem Sinai. The few lines of the beginning itself reminds of *Narcissism* the term originated from Greek mythology where a young Narcissus fell in love with his own image reflected

in the pool of water. This concept was introduced by Sigmund Freud *On Narcissism* who talks about their own self give importance to it. "...I was born in the city of Bombay... once upon a time...' '...I was born in Doctor Nallikar's nursing home..." (3)

The outside readers can sense the haste in which the narrator is due to shortage of life perhaps "... now however time is (having no future use for me) is running out. I'll soon be thirty one years... Perhaps. If my crumbling over used body permits." (3-4)

This unease is smoothly passed on to the readers. "... And there are so many story to tell... I have been a swallower of lives and to know me just one of me you'll have to swallow the lot as well..." (4) There are certain events in Rushdie's *Midnight's Children* that supports the complexity interweaved in the novel which fails to maintain the aesthetic joy that an outside reader would like to enjoy.

II. INDIAN AESTHETIC'S PERCEPTION

Indian aestheticians' formulates the term *sahrudaya* in which a reader is capable of identifying himself with the art. It is a path that leads to *paramananda*. To attain this *anada* which is transcendental state (neither painful nor pleasurable) a constant state in which both the subject and the object becomes one unit. Reader's interpretation is a kind of sublime act where a bridge between reader and text if formed and both of them meet and merge in such a way that the gap completes. Hence the reader reaches to the state of *anada*. When a reader analysis spiritual or romantic books (that has nothing to do with the determinate meanings) and evolves in the process of filling indeterminate meaning he/she reaches to the state of *ananda*. Other difficulty that comes in the journey of analyzing text is that the novel shares many voices which are not directly expressed and sometimes they are explicit. There is an analogy of several biographic details between Salman Rushdie and the narrator Saleem Sinai. There are several events common between both of them for instance religious and general family's back ground that it becomes difficult to segregate and confuses the reader in making character-

sketch. Saleem Sinai's life is knotted with the story of nation. (India, Pakistan and Bangladesh) The narration of the historical events through telepathic gift is at times complex in understanding and keeping hold with the narrator. There are different genres used in the novel that diverts mind as a reader for example fantasy, realism, post modernism and realism etc. There are series of endless surprises in the novel one after the other that makes the reader feel tired. This novel fails to maintain a single point of view or a single voice. Each division of chapter in itself consist of variety that sometimes a reader gets diverted and loses the grip over past events in the novel.

The complexity of novel with the historical political approach is also difficult to understand with the parallel with Saleem's life's history because of its vastness. Rushdie has introduced all the events that occurred before and after Independence for example 1) protest against British, under Mahatma Gandhi's guidance. 2) Massacre of peacefully protesting Indians in Amritsar by General Dyer. 3) Muslim League partition, 4) forced sterilization of poor youth of India etc.

It is difficult to calculate several symbolic references that Saleem and India suffer together for example Saleem's encounter with Zagallo when he was only ten years old left with bleeding in his head. The nation also suffers from natural disaster the Five year plan is damaged by storm and floods.

As a reader it is not easy to presume what next would be the event that is going to happen. Hence *Midnight's Children* displays through the Reader Response theory that the reader also participates in constructing the text with his/her level and growth of understanding. The understanding changes according to the social, political and historical events in context of reading. Therefore I would say that *Midnight's Children* is not a one time reading text due to its complex interwoven features.

III. CONCLUSION

In the end I would like to make an interesting analogy comparing Rushdie and the two eminent character of the novel named Padma and Saleem Sinai. It reminds of *Shree Mad Bhagawat Gita's* event 'Observing the armies in the battlefield of kurukshtras in text I' where *Dhrtarashtra* asks *Sanjay* to narrate the scene at the ground of *Kurukshtra* (the battle between Kaurvas and Pandvas.) This can be re-created with Rushdie as a Creator, Saleem working as Sanjay (as a conscious narrator) and Padma/we the blind (symbolic blindness) listener like that of Dhritrashtra depending on the narrator.

Dhrtarashtra uvaca
Dharma-ksetre kuru-ksetre
Samaveta yuyutsavah
Mamakah pandavas caiva
Kim akurvata sanjaya

All the three figures represent the mythological figure as discussed above. Rushdie's reasonable decision of Padma's depiction as a listener realizes a common reader that there is a Padma inside all the readers. Saleem's direct touch with Padma helps to make a creative progress in the story. This was essential at Rushdie's part otherwise who would attempt to raise doubts to make the ideal narration interestingly creative. Saleem never gets irritated by Padma's curiosity and skepticism for his narration. "... but perhaps our Padma will be useful, because it is impossible to stop her being critic..." (35.) The parenthetical sentences in the text are the example of Saleem's direct interaction with Padma.

WORKS CITED

1. Bhaktivedanta, A.C., and SwamiprsbhuPada. *Bhagavad-gita As It Is*. India: Thompson Press Limited. 2012. Print
2. Nagarajan, M S. "Reader-Response Criticism." *English Literary Criticism and Theory*. Hyderabad: Orient Longman Private Limited, 2006. Print
3. Rishdie, Salman. *Midnight's Children*. London: Vintage Books. 2013. Print.



Scan to know paper details and
author's profile

The Ernest Hemingway Theory of Composition

David Pendery

National Taipei University

ABSTRACT

In this paper I will introduce a theory of composition based on the work and interpretation of Ernest Hemingway. Although there has been some talk of a Hemingway theory of composition, and some of its aspects are well known, it has only partially been compiled into a whole before.

Hemingway's writing technique has a number of well-known qualities that will make their way into this theory, and thus some of this material and data is already well known. I will endeavor to situate these points into new relationships and theoretical positioning.

Keywords: Ernest Hemingway, journalism, composition theory.

Classification: LCC Code: PN147

Language: English



Great Britain
Journals Press

LJP Copyright ID: 573353
Print ISSN: 2515-5785
Online ISSN: 2515-5792

London Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Sciences

Volume 23 | Issue 17 | Compilation 1.0



The Ernest Hemingway Theory of Composition

David Pendery

ABSTRACT

In this paper I will introduce a theory of composition based on the work and interpretation of Ernest Hemingway. Although there has been some talk of a Hemingway theory of composition, and some of its aspects are well known, it has only partially been compiled into a whole before.

Hemingway's writing technique has a number of well-known qualities that will make their way into this theory, and thus some of this material and data is already well known. I will endeavor to situate these points into new relationships and theoretical positioning.

Keywords: Ernest Hemingway, journalism, composition theory .

Author: Associate professor, National Taipei University of Business Taipei, Taiwan.

I. INTRODUCTION

In this paper I will present a theory of composition based on the work and commentary of Ernest Hemingway. Although there has been some talk of a Hemingway theory of composition, and some of its aspects are well known, it has never been compiled into a whole before (though I'll give Joe Bunting credit, he has crafted a reasonable summary of a number of the points I will bring up [see the website in Sources Cited]; and I should mention *Ernest Hemingway on Writing* by Larry W. Phillips [1999]).¹ Hemingway's writing technique has a number of well-known qualities that will make their way into this theory, and thus some of this material and data is already well known. His work has been

¹ Phillips's book is in fact simply a compendium of the many comments and quotes that Hemingway wrote about writing, and does not include any additional analysis or theoretical positioning. I will refer to Phillips when I quote from his book, and he does indicate the actual Hemingway works that he used.

called "uncompromising," and the language is seen as short, direct, and to the point. No doubt true enough, but I hope to go a bit deeper in my examination. We might view Hemingway's talent, in the manner in which he once viewed the skills of his sometime-friend F. Scott Fitzgerald:

His talent was as natural as the pattern that was made by the dust of a butterfly's wings. At one time he understood it no more than the butterfly did and he did not know when it was brushed or marred. Later he became conscious of his damaged wings and of their construction and he learned to think and could not fly anymore because the love of flight was gone and he could only remember when it had been effortless (*A Moveable Feast* 129).

We will find that Hemingway thought much the same of his own writing, below.

A. E. Hotchner wrote in *Papa Hemingway* that as he was preparing to interview Papa in 1948, he was "struck with an affliction common to my generation: 'Hemingway Awe'" (3), which is a feeling that I know many people would agree with in terms of Hemingway's writing. When Hotchner was given a first draft of *The Old Man and the Sea* in Havana in the early 1950s, he experienced "one of the most overwhelming reading experiences of my life" (72), which many other readers have also had while consuming Hemingway's brilliant prose.

At one point, Phillips writes that "At some times [Hemingway] showed an almost superstitious reluctance to talk about writing, seeming fearful that saying too much might have an inhibiting effect on his muse" (Foreword). I have not found this to be true, and in fact Hem often wrote up his views on the theory and practice of writing and composition in substantial detail, and I will refer often to these words in this paper. (Admittedly, Phillips later says "Hemingway wrote often about writing" [Preface]).

Although this paper is not an overt analysis of Hemingway's "style," proper, I will endeavor to include some passages from his work to illustrate my points, and to highlight the methods that Hemingway believed led to best writing.

II. COMPOSITION THEORY

To give some initial shape to this discussion, following is a brief look at some of the terminology that has been used in terms of theories of composition in the past. Much of this is rather rigid and static, with focuses on areas that are not in fact related to writing much at all (the reader will have to use his imagination in terms of how these ideas might actually accord with writing and composition, not least Hemingway's). These theories employ declarations about "joining statements," "possibilistic information-flow" (Maclean) "spatial composition" (and similarly, "the theory of composition [tracing] how the impact of the image is achieved, of form and space in design, on human perception" [from Zheleva-Martins]), "theory of signs," "formation" (often in terms of industrial design, which in some respects has been connected with writing and composition), and somewhat high-flown conceptions of logic, principles, techniques, rules, and styles.

Much early theory of composition simply focused on mechanics, grammar, structure, and the like. Theory of late in actual terms of writing revolves around *process* (and *post-process*)—that is, writing as a process rather than a product—as well as generalized looks at writing classes in college and what they teach in terms of subject creation and invention, prewriting, drafting, thesis construction, essay structure, revision, parallelism, audience, general language usage, pedagogy, genre, voice, and assessment (what might be called "cognitive writing theory," or simply "academic writing," and these are also elements of Process Writing Theory, "viewed not just as a linear series of stages but rather as a hierarchical set of sub-processes" [Yao 188]).

"Cultural studies" theories of composition (social or socio-cultural theory) have come into vogue,

examining writing as an artifact of culture and what happens in writing when cultures come into contact with each other (from *Wikipedia*, "Cultural studies theory of composition"). Such social views have branched into a variety of possibilities—"social-cognitive" (accounting for the cognitive operations and representations that underlie the social process of communicating in a specific social context.), "social constructionism" (treating writing as the conversant activity of members of particular discourse communities), "social interactive theory" (a mutual frame of reference, a shared social reality between writer and reader), "social-historic theory" (words as dynamic, negotiable spaces within which particular personal and social significations converge, clash, and co-exist.), and "social-humanistic theory" (writing based on personal experience and interactivity) (all above from Yao). In all of the above, we see how writing is "simultaneously...a cognitive and social activity, and that these approaches may differ to a certain extent, but they are mutually reinforcing rather than incompatible" (Yao 197).

Edgar Allen Poe wrote his "The Philosophy of Composition," a relatively simplistic approach that focused on: 1. The length of works (he believed they should be short); 2. Method (he argued that writing is methodical and analytical, as opposed to spontaneous.), and 3. "Unity of effect" (emotional response to a work).

Vandenberg et. al. come up with a reasonable overall theory comprised of *Relations*, *Locations*, *Positions*, in which the authors look at: 1. Conversations and negotiations with others (relations); 2. Writing in terms of material places and intellectual spaces (locations); and 3. The contingency of our beliefs, values and identity (positions). This is a good look, and will have some usefulness in terms of our look at Hemingway, which I will now turn to.

III. HEMINGWAY'S JOURNALISM METHODOLOGY

To begin in earnest (pardon the linguistic aside), in some senses we might turn to journalism methods as core to the Hemingway Theory of

Composition. Needless to say, Hemingway was an enthusiastic journalist who worked for numerous newspapers and magazines during his life, even when he was principally a writer of literature, into the 1940s. This might be called the “who, what, when, where, why, how” approach to writing—and we see associations with what we have looked at so far: Who (social, cultural, relations) What (positions, method, corporeality), When (process, in the offing), Where (locations, discernment), Why and How (that which is cognitive, apperceptive).

Hemingway once wrote, seeming to reach into these depths, “I was trying to write then and I found the greatest difficulty, aside from knowing truly what you really felt, rather than what you were supposed to feel, and had been taught to feel, was to put down what *really happened* in action [italics added]; what the actual things were which produced the emotion that you experienced. In writing for a newspaper you told what happened and, with one trick and another, you communicated the emotion aided by the element of timeliness which gives a certain emotion to any account of something that has happened on that day; but the real thing, the sequence of motion and fact which made the emotion and which would be as valid in a year or in ten years or, with luck and if you stated it purely enough, always, was beyond me and I was working very hard to get it” (in Phillips, *Death in the Afternoon*, 2; and more on permanence and “always” below).

To be sure Hemingway considered these methods important to his own style, which generally meant that which is “economical and understated” (Wikipedia, “Ernest Hemingway”), refraining from excessive use of adjectives and adverbs, avoiding literary wandering and fanciful asides. Ezra Pound was “...the man who had taught me to distrust adjectives as I would later learn to distrust certain people in certain situations...” Papa wrote (*A Moveable Feast*, 134) Hemingway did not... “adorn his prose with extra words and poetic-sounding language” (Baldwin). Instead he used unpretentious, declarative sentences, short, simple words, a definite lack of superfluity, and a positive, vigorous approach. Hemingway wrote in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*, “The world is a fine

place and worth fighting for and I hate very much to leave it,” a sentence with 16 of 19 words one syllable in length, and the remaining two with two syllables. And there is the classic opening to *A Moveable Feast*: “Then there was the bad weather” (3). “Show the readers everything, tell them nothing,” he once said, indicating his refusal to “explain” to readers (*Goodreads*), and another time he said, in no uncertain terms, “My aim is to put down on paper what I see and what I feel in the best and simplest way” (*UP Journey*). He also said in a journalism way, “If I started to write elaborately, or like someone introducing or presenting something, I found that I could cut that scrollwork or ornament out and throw it away and start with the first true simple declarative sentence I had written” (Bunting). “Do not worry,” Hem went on in *A Moveable Feast*. “You have always written before and you will write now. All you have to do is write one true sentence. Write the truest sentence that you know” (12).

Newspaper writing was often the path to this simplified approach, and “On the [Kansas City] *Star* you were forced to learn to write a simple declarative sentence. This is useful to anyone. Newspaper work will not harm a young writer and could help him if he gets out of it in time” (in Phillips, “An Interview with Ernest Hemingway” *The Paris Review* 18, Spring 1958). He went on, indicating his preference for the short, direct and simple (and much more on this below), “There were many words that you could not stand to hear and finally only the names of places had dignity. Certain numbers were the same way and certain dates and these with the names of the places were all you could say and have them mean anything. Abstract words such as glory, honor, courage, or hallow were obscene beside the concrete names of villages, the numbers of roads, the names of rivers, the numbers of regiments and the dates” (*Goodreads*). In some ways we see here again the importance of “positions,” and “locations,” a la Vandenberg et. al.

Hemingway once told his friend F. Scott Fitzgerald, “Write the best story that you can and write it as straight as you can” (*A Moveable Feast* 160). Of his understated journalism style, he once wrote in a letter, “I am trying to make, before I get

through, a picture of the whole world—or as much of it as I have seen. Boiling it down always, rather than spreading it out thin” (to Mrs. Paul Pfeiffer, 1933, Baker, 397).

Simply put, Hemingway considered much of his literature to be based on journalism style and methods, and some of this work was even actual journalism (*The Green Hills of Africa*, *The Dangerous Summer*). Along these lines, and as noted, Papa avoided excessive “explanation”, interpretation and even overt description. Again, this is in essence journalism-style writing, and Hemingway once said, “Since I had started to break down all my writing and get rid of all facility and try to make instead of describe, writing had been wonderful to do” (*A Moveable Feast* 136). Any good journalist would understand what it means to “make” story, as opposed to neutral “description.” Hemingway went on in a letter to his father in 1925, “You see I am trying in all my stories to get the feeling of the actual life across - not to just depict life—or criticize it—but to actually make it alive. So that when you have read something by me you actually experience the thing” (Baker 153). Also, in *A Moveable Feast*, Hemingway wrote “...I’m trying to do it so it will make it without you knowing it, and so the more you read it, the more there will be” (138).

Another time he said, in a journalistic vein, and capturing his preference to always be observing and taking note of what he saw around him, “My aim is to put down on paper what I see and what I feel in the best and simplest way” (*UP Journey*). In terms of all the journalism methods and styles that Hemingway employed, we might say this was all an effort to “enter the story,” which he strongly endorsed. “Then I went back to writing,” he wrote in *A Moveable Feast*, “and I entered far into the story and was lost in it. I was writing it now and it was not writing itself and I did not look up nor know anything about the time nor think where I was” (5). There was a reverse to this as well, and once he found that “the story was writing itself and I was having a hard time keeping up with it” (*A Moveable Feast* 5). Similarly, in his unadorned and positive imagery brought to life on the page, “I was writing about up in Michigan, and since it was a wild, cold, blowing day it was that sort of day in the story” (*A Moveable Feast* 4).

IV. THE ICEBERG THEORY OF LITERATURE

A second of Hemingway’s key theoretical approaches has been commented on extensively: his “Iceberg Theory” of writing. In this approach, Hemingway said that only the tip of true meaning showed in fiction—readers see only the tops of the icebergs above the water—but the knowledge that you wish to convey about character and significance (much of which never even makes it into the story) is in fact the bulk of the iceberg beneath the surface. This is what gives your story weight and gravitas. Hotchner wrote how Hemingway “long ago explained to me that your stories gain strength in direct ratio to what you can leave out of them.... It’s only the important things you know about and omit that strengthen the story,” capturing the essence here (163). Hemingway once said of his story “The Killers,” “That story probably had more left out of it than anything I ever wrote. I left out all Chicago” (Tyler, 80). He went on about his story “Out of Season” that “I had omitted the real end of it which was that the old man hanged himself. This was omitted on my new theory that you could omit anything if you knew that you omitted and the omitted part would strengthen the story and make people feel something more than they understood” (*A Moveable Feast*, 75). Of one of his greatest stories he said, “I guess the story that tops them all for leave-out was ‘A Clean Well-Lighted Place.’ I left everything out of that one” (Hotchner 164).

Hemingway went on that, “If a writer of prose knows enough of what he is writing about he may omit things that he knows and the reader, if the writer is writing truly enough, will have a feeling of those things as strongly as though the writer had stated them. The dignity of movement of an ice-berg is due to only one-eighth of it being above water. A writer who omits things because he does not know them only makes hollow places in his writing” (*Death in the Afternoon*, 154). In one comment, Hemingway seems to be commenting on what can and cannot be discerned in each piece of writing, when he says, “Things may not be

immediately discernible in what a man writes, and in this sometimes he is fortunate; but eventually they are quite clear, and by these and the degree of alchemy that he possesses, he will endure or be forgotten" (*UP Journey*). And finally, Hemingway in *A Moveable Feast* wrote "The story was about coming back from the war but there was no mention of the war in it" (76).

Readers are left to decide how iceberg-like Hemingway's works actually are—what they believe may have been left out, and what they themselves believe is the bulk of meaning and significance that lies "beneath the surface" of the fictional waters.

4.1 *Le Mot Juste and Writing is Rewriting*

Another key theoretical point to consider—and Hemingway very much considered this stylistic approach just that, theoretical to the extreme—is his less-well-known skill at choosing what he called, *le mot juste*, the one and only best word to be used in any sentence. Hemingway said of Ezra Pound in *A Moveable Feast*, he was "the man I liked and trusted the most as a critic then, the man who believed in the *mot juste*—the one and only correct word to use..." (118). To be sure Hemingway believed exactly this, and his propensity to rewrite his work to the *n*th degree is associated with this—"I rewrote the ending to *A Farewell to Arms*, the last page of it, thirty-nine times before I was satisfied" (*UP Journey*) he said, and "I always rewrite each day up to the point where I stopped. When it is all finished, naturally you go over it. You get another chance to correct and rewrite when someone else types it, and you see it clean in type. The last chance is in the proofs. You're grateful for these different chances" (*BrainyQuote*). "The only kind of writing is rewriting," he said in *A Moveable Feast*, coining the classic phrase (from *Goodreads*), and Hemingway may have had this in mind when he once said "I am like a blind pig when I work" (*A Moveable Feast* 87). "Today I reread and rewrote four chapters," he told a group of high school students in 1958 (Hotchner 201). "You put down the words in hot blood, like an argument, and correct them when your temper has cooled" (201). Hemingway's propensity was to read every word

he had written the day before the following day, and carefully edit every word yet again (as with *A Farewell to Arms*). The absolute best writing method, he said, was "to read it all every day from the start, correcting as you go along, then go on from where you stopped the day before. When it gets so long that you can't do this every day read back two or three chapters each day; then each week read it all from the start. That's how you make it all of one piece" (*Farnam Street*). As noted here, rereading every word, every day, was critical. "After writing a story," Hem advised, "I was always empty and both sad and happy, as though I had made love, and I was sure this was a very good story although I would not know truly how good until I read it over the next day" (*A Moveable Feast* 5-6). Associated with this idea is the necessity of stopping writing when you know "what will happen next." The best method, Hemingway wrote in an October 1935 article in *Esquire*, was "always to stop when you are going good and when you know what will happen next. If you do that every day when you are writing a novel you will never be stuck. That is the most valuable thing I can tell you so try to remember it" (CWA).

He went on that, "It was in that room too that I learned not to think about anything that I was writing from the time I stopped writing until I started again the next day. That way my subconscious would be working on it and at the same time I would be listening to other people and noticing everything" (*A Moveable Feast*, 12, and here we see hints of Vandenberg's *Relations*). "What did I know best that I had not written about and lost?" Hemingway continued. "What did I know about truly and care for the most? There was no choice at all" (Bunting). More on these approaches below.

4.2 *The Well of Writing, and, Observe*

To continue, "Never empty yourself of what you have" was one of Hemingway's key approaches. "I had learned already never to empty the well of my writing, but always to stop when there was still something there in the deep part of the well, and let it refill at night from the springs that fed it" he wrote in *A Moveable Feast* (23). Hemingway

wrote of his love of writing in coffee shops in the morning (he never missed a sunrise, and rose at 5:00 am every day he once said, in order to quickly breakfast and be off to the shops) and how in these locations he sometimes filled his well—his principle method of always observing. “A girl came into the café and sat by herself at a table near the window,” he wrote in *A Moveable Feast* (5). “She was very pretty with a face fresh as a newly minted coin if they minted coins in smooth flesh. I’ve seen you, beauty, and you belong to me now, whoever you are waiting for and if I never see you again, I thought. You belong to me and all Paris belongs to me and I belong to this notebook and this pencil” (5). “If a writer stops observing he is finished,” Hemingway wrote. “Experience is communicated by small details intimately observed.” Papa went on that “When people talk listen completely. Don’t be thinking what you’re going to say. Most people never listen. Nor do they observe. You should be able to go into a room and when you come out know everything that you saw there and not only that. If that room gave you any feeling you should know exactly what it was that gave you that feeling. Try that for practice” (above from *Goodreads*). Here we see Vandenberg’s *Relations* at work.

4.3 Truth

Associated with these ideas is Hemingway’s focus on the truth (which can be associated with his effort to find the “one true and only word” in every sentence he wrote). Make your writing truer than real—write what you know and love, was Hemingway’s central aim.

“All good books are alike in that they are truer than if they had really happened,” he wrote, “and after you are finished reading one you will feel that all that happened to you, and afterwards it will all belong to you—the good and the bad, the ecstasy, the remorse, and sorrow, the people and the places and how the weather was. If you can get so that you can give that to people, then you are a writer” (*LibQuotes*). Imparting truth at every turn, was for Hemingway, taken “From things that have happened and from things as they exist and from all things that you know and all those you cannot know, you make something through your

invention that is not a representation but a whole new thing truer than anything true and alive, and you make it alive, and if you make it well enough, you give it immortality” (*UP Journey*). “True fiction must come from everything you’ve ever known, ever seen, ever felt, ever learned” he said to Hotchner in *Papa Hemingway* (103). He went on that the real challenge in writing is to “make the person who is reading [the prose] believe that the things happened to him too” (Gatzemeyer). Further in *A Moveable Feast*, Papa wrote “I decided that I would write one story about each thing that I knew about. I was trying to do this all the time I was writing, and it was good and severe discipline” (12). In his reading of Dostoyesky, referring to his own attachment to all things military, Hemingway wrote that “there were things believable and not to be believed, but some so true they changed you as you read them; frailty and madness, wickedness and saintliness, and the insanity gambling were there to know as you knew the landscape and toads in Turgenev, and the movement of troops, the terrain and the officers and the men and the fighting in Tolstoi” (*A Moveable Feast* 117). To sum up, Hemingway wrote that “I am trying in all my stories to get the feeling of the actual life across—not to just depict life—or criticize it—but to actually make it alive. So that when you have read something by me, you actually experience the thing. You can’t do this without putting in the bad and the ugly as well as what is beautiful” (*UP Journey*). Along these lines, he wrote, “You see I’m trying in all my stories to get the feeling of the actual life across—not to just depict life—or criticize it—but to actually make it alive. So that when you have read something by me you actually experience the thing. You can’t do this without putting in the bad and the ugly as well as what is beautiful. Because if it is all beautiful you can’t believe in it. Things aren’t that way. It is only by showing both sides—3 dimensions and if possible 4 that you can write the way I want to” (letter to Dr. C. E. Hemingway, 1925, Baker, 153).

Hemingway finally said, “I was trying to write then and I found the greatest difficulty, aside from knowing truly what you really felt, rather than what you were supposed to feel, and had been

taught to feel, was to put down what really happened; what the actual things were which produced the emotion that you experienced...the real thing, the sequence of motion and fact which made the emotion and which would be as valid in a year or in ten years or, with luck and if you stated it purely enough, always, was beyond me and I was working very hard to get it” (*Goodreads*).

Hemingway once commented that imagination “is the one thing beside honesty that a good writer must have.” He went on to link imagination and truth, in that “The more [one] learns from experience the more truly [one] can imagine. If [one] gets so [one] can imagine truly enough people will think that the things he relates all really happened...” (*By-Line*, no page number).

4.4 Art and Writing

In another theoretical turn, Hem wrote of the importance of bringing in visual and musical art into “one’s” writing. EH once said that his writing at the beginning of *A Farewell to Arms*, was a “conscious imitation of the way Mr. Johann Sebastian Bach used a note in music when he was emitting counterpoint” (Wells). He was referring to his use of the word “and,” which appears about 50 times in the first paragraph of the novel. In *A Moveable Feast* Hemingway wrote “I went [to the Musée du Luxembourg] nearly every day for the Cézannes and to see the Manets and the Monets and the other Impressionists...I was learning something from the painting of Cézanne that made writing simple true sentences far from enough to make the stories have the dimensions I was trying to put in them. I was learning very much from him but I was not articulate enough to explain it to anyone. Besides it was a secret” (12-13). He studied how painters helped him to see, to hear, and how to feel or not feel. They were part of his ability to present an image hard, clear, concentrated and as true as a painter’s color. “Ernest always tried to locate the heart of a painting, what he called ‘the pure emotion,’ the real thing the artist set out to achieve” wrote Hotchner (187). “...and he identified with the difficulty of the artist’s task, for he felt that as a writer he had the same struggle to achieve the

same pure emotion...” (187). ““Eschew the monumental. Shun the Epic,” Hemingway wrote. “All the guys who can paint great big pictures can paint great small ones” (letter to Maxwell Perkins, 1932, Baker, 352).

4.5 Read

In what might seem an obvious approach that is vital to good writing, Hemingway recommended that writers *read*. Hemingway was a prodigious reader, and “When I was writing,” he said in *A Moveable Feast*, “it was necessary for me to read after I had written. ...afterwards, when you were empty, it was necessary to read in order not to think or worry about your work until you could do it again...To keep my mind off writing sometimes after I had worked I would read writers who were writing then, such as Aldous Huxley, D.H. Lawrence...” (23-24). In a word, “There is no friend as loyal as a book” (*Goodreads*), and Hemingway wrote appreciatively of the great Russian novelist masters in *A Moveable Feast*—including, as noted, Dostoyevsky, and “I had read all of Turgenev, what had been published in English of Gogol...Tolstoi and...Chekov” (117).

In another amusing turn, Papa wrote “If the book is good, is about something that you know, and is truly written, and reading it over you see that this is so, you can let the boys yip and the noise will have that pleasant sound coyotes make on a very cold night when they are out in the snow and you are in your own cabin that you have built or paid for with your work” (*AZ Quotes*). Lucy Fuggle writes of how in 1934 a “young American with aspirations to become a writer hitched 2,000 miles across America. The reason? To find Ernest Hemingway and get some advice.” The advice asked for was which great books to read, and Hemingway provided a list of 16 including Crane, Twain, Hawthorne, Flaubert, Joyce and a number of the great Russians (see Fuggle, and Hemingway often spoke of writers he recommended in several of his books).

V. THE COMFORT ZONE, DON'T WORRY, DON'T SELL YOURSELF

Write at the same time every day in a comfortable location—advice any writer would probably enjoy

taking. “It was a pleasant café, warm and clean and friendly,” he wrote of favorite café on the Place St-Michel (*A Moveable Feast* 4). “I hung up my old waterproof on the coat rack to dry and put my worn and weathered felt hat on the rack above the bench and ordered a café au lait. The waiter brought it and I took out a notebook from the pocket of the coat and a pencil and started to write” (*A Moveable Feast* 4). It was most important “to write in tranquility” Hemingway once said, “trying to write as well as I can, with no eye on any market, nor any thought of what the stuff will bring, or even if it can ever be published” (letter to Grace Hall Hemingway, 1927, Baker 244).

A couple of final points in Hemingway’s theory include his advising readers to not worry too much— “For Christ sake write and don't worry about what the boys will say nor whether it will be a masterpiece nor what. I write one page of masterpiece to ninety one pages of shit. I try to put the shit in the wastebasket” (letter to F. Scott Fitzgerald, 1934, Baker, 408). and finally, “Don’t sell yourself.” “Write the best story that you can and write as straight as you can” he told F. Scott Fitzgerald (*A Moveable Feast* 160), and most of all, he told his friend, “don’t write slop” (*A Moveable Feast* 160).. The important thing was not to sell oneself out writing stories for magazines, much less anything like film scripts. “F. Scott Fitzgerald had told me how he wrote what he thought were good stories,” said Hemingway, “and which really were good stories” (*A Moveable Feast* 136). Fitzgerald, however, “changed them for submission, knowing exactly how he must make them into salable magazine stories. I had been shocked at this and I said I thought it was whoring.... I said that I did not believe anyone could write any way except the very best he could write without destroying his talent” (*A Moveable Feast* 136). Do not “trick” your writing “to conform to any formula” he told Fitzgerald (*A Moveable Feast* 160). About Fitzgerald, Hemingway went on, “Work would help him; noncommercial, honest work—a paragraph at a time. But he judged a paragraph by how much money it made him and ditched his juice into that channel because he got instant

satisfaction” (letter to Maxwell Perkins, 1936, Baker 438). About any given posterity in writing, Hemingway once wrote, “I only think about writing truly. Posterity can take care of herself...” (letter to Arthur Mizener, Baker, 698).

In Hemingway’s eyes, for a “true writer”—and few if any writers could have much more reached such status than Hemingway—to succeed, “each book should be a new beginning where he tries again for something that is beyond attainment. He should always try for something that has never been done or that others have tried and failed. Then sometimes, with great luck, he will succeed” (*UP Journey*)—that which is beyond attainment, that which has never been done, and finally, success—the veritable hallmarks of all that Hemingway achieved as a writer.

VI. CONCLUSION

Hemingway delved even deeper into his theory of writing when he wrote in the Preface to *A Moveable Feast*, exploring his own journalism suppositions and Iceberg theory, “For reasons sufficient to the writer, many places, people, observations and impressions have been left out of this book. Some were secrets and some were known by everyone and everyone has written about them and will doubtless write more.” He probed deeper, becoming yet more theoretical within a fiction/nonfiction postulate, “If the reader prefers, this book may be regarded as fiction. But there is always the chance that such a book of fiction may throw some light on what has been written as fact.”

This will conclude my look at Hemingway’s masterful technique, and how he did in fact have a “theory of composition”—although he probably would have laughed at the notion. I will let this all stand as I have proposed it, and go forward on my own, always with the Hemingway Theory of Composition guiding me. None other than Papa himself once wrote, “if [one’s] writing is good enough, it will last as long as there are human beings” (Cowley). That says it all about Hemingway and writing.

SOURCES CITED

1. *AZ Quotes*, located at https://www.azquotes.com/author/6539-Ernest_Hemingway/tag/re-ading.
2. Baker, Carlos, ed. 1981. *Ernest Hemingway, Selected Letters*, © 1981, The Ernest Hemingway Foundation, Inc. and Carlos Baker.
3. Baldwin, Emma. "Ernest Hemingway's Writing Style," accessed February 20, 2023 at <https://bookanalysis.com/ernest-hemingway/writing-style/>.
4. *BrainyQuote*, located at <http://brainyquote.com>.
5. Bunting, Joe, "23 Essential Quotes From Ernest Hemingway About Writing," in *The Write Practice*, accessed 1 March 2023 at <https://thewritepractice.com/hemingway-quotes/>.
6. Chicago Writer's Association (CWA), 2021. "Seven Tips From Ernest Hemingway on How to Write Fiction." Located at <https://www.chicagowrites.org/blog/entry/seven-tips-from-ernest-hemingway>.
7. Cowley, Malcolm, 1949. "A Portrait of Mr. Papa" *Life Magazine*, Jan. 10, 1949.
8. "Ernest Hemingway on listening and observing," unknown writer. Located at <https://bibliophilewannabe.wordpress.com/2015/07/22/ernest-hemingway-on-listening-and-observing/>.
9. *EL (English Literature)*, 2020. "Hemingway's Iceberg Theory." Located at <https://www.englishliterature.net/notes/hemingways-iceberg-theory>.
10. Farnam Street. "Ernest Hemingway: Three Tips on How to Write Fiction," located at <https://fs.blog/ernest-hemingway-three-tips-on-how-to-write-fiction/>.
11. Fuggle, Lucy, 2023. "The Hemingway List: 16 books we ought to read according to the literary great," located at <https://tolstoytherapy.com/ernest-hemingways-list-of-16-books-we/>.
12. Fulkerson, Richard, 1990. "Composition Theory in the Eighties: Axiological Consensus and Paradigmatic Diversity," *College Composition and Communication*, Vol. 41, No. 4 (Dec., 1990). Published By: National Council of Teachers of English. Located at <https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/357931.pdf>.
13. Gatzemeyer, Jace, 2020. "The Hemingway Writing Technique You've Never Heard Of." Located at <https://writingcooperative.com/the-hemingway-writing-technique-youve-never-heard-of-e7ee144b7d91>.
14. *Goodreads* located at <https://www.goodreads.com>.
15. Hemingway, Ernest 1996. *A Moveable Feast*. Arrow Books.
16. *Death in the Afternoon* 1932. Located at https://books.google.com.tw/books?id=Wn69QsdwDIQC&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q=eighth&f=false.
17. 2002. *By-Line Ernest Hemingway: Selected Articles and Dispatches of Four Decades*, Simon and Schuster. Located at https://books.google.com.tw/books?id=kRTxw4PaRGoC&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=snippet&q=can%20imagine&f=false.
18. Hotchner, A.E. 1955, 1959, 1966. *Papa Hemingway*. Random House, New York.
19. Leggette, Holli R, Tracy Rutherford, Deborah Dunsford, Lori Costello, 2015. "A Review and Evaluation of Prominent Theories of Writing," *Journal of Applied Communications*: Vol. 99: Issue 3. Located at <https://newprairiepress.org/jac/vol99/iss3/4/>.
20. LibQuotes, "Ernest Hemingway: Letter from Cuba (1934)", located at <https://libquotes.com/ernest-hemingway/quote/lbj6u7p>.
21. Mclean, John D. 1996. "A general theory of composition for a class of 'possibilistic' properties," *IEEE Transactions on Software Engineering*, 22 (1). Located at <https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/document/481534>.
22. Phillips, Larry W. (editor) 2019. *Ernest Hemingway on Writing*, Simon & Schuster, Blackstone Publishing. Located at <https://archive.org/details/LarryW.PhillipsErnestHemingwayOnWriting1999Scribner/page/n9/mode/1up>.
23. *Shmoop*, "Ernest Hemingway Quotes." Located at <https://www.shmoop.com/study-guides/biography/ernest-hemingway/quotes>.

24. Tyler, Lisa, 2001. *Student Companion to Ernest Hemingway*. Westport: Greenwood Publishing Group.
25. *UP Journey*, editors, 2019. "75 Best Ernest Hemingway Quotes (About Life, Writing, War...)." Located at <https://upjourney.com/ernest-hemingway-quotes#:~:text=Newspaper%20work%20will%20not%20harm,is%20always%20a%20bloody%20owl.%E2%80%9D>.
26. Vandenberg, Peter, Sue Hum, Jennifer Clary-Lemon (eds.), 2006. *Relations, Locations, Positions: Composition Theory for Writing*. National Council of Teachers of English.
27. Wells, Jeff, 2015. "13 Not-So-Depressing Facts About A Farewell to Arms," on *Mental Floss*, located at <https://www.mentalfloss.com/article/68221/13-not-so-depressing-facts-about-farewell-arms>.
28. Wikipedia, "The Killers (Hemingway short story)," located at [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Killers_\(Hemingway_short_story\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Killers_(Hemingway_short_story)).
29. "Iceberg theory," located at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Iceberg_theory.
30. "Ernest Hemingway," located at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ernest_Hemingway.
31. "Cultural studies theory of composition." located at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cultural_studies_theory_of_composition.
32. Yao, Lucy Chung-Kuen 1997. "An Overview of Writing Theory and Research: From Cognitive to Social-Cognitive View," *Journal of Taichung Evening School, NCHU*, Vol.3 (1997). Located at <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/41699256.pdf>.
33. Zheleva-Martins, Dobrina, 2006. "Theory of Form Formation/Theory of Composition: In Search of Differentia Specifica," *Engineering and Product Design Education Conference, Salzburg University Of Applied Sciences, Salzburg, Austria*. Located at https://www.designsociety.org/download-publication/28234/theory_of_form_formation-theory_of_composition_in_search_of_differentia_specifica.